Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
The National Assembly for Wales

Cofnod y Trafodion
The Record of Proceedings

Dydd Mawrth, 27 Tachwedd 2012
Tuesday, 27 November 2012

Cynnwys
Contents

3 Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog
Questions to the First Minister

32 Cwestiwn Brys: Rheoliadau Cynlluniau Gostyngiadau'r Dreth Gyngor
Urgent Question: The Council Tax Reduction Schemes Regulations

36 Cwestiwn Brys: Colli Swyddi yn Tata Steel
Urgent Question: Tata Steel Job Losses

39 Cwestiwn Brys: Cau Ffyrdd oherwydd Llifogydd yn y Gogledd
Urgent Question: Road Closures due to Flooding in North Wales

46 Datganiad a Chyhoeddiad Busnes
Business Statement and Announcement

50 Datganiad: Cyflwyno Bil Llywodraeth Leol (Democratiaeth) (Cymru)
Statement: Introduction of the Local Government (Democracy) (Wales) Bill

60 Adroddiad Blynyddol Datblygu Cynaliadwy
The Sustainable Development Annual Report

81 Cynnig i Atal Rheolau Sefydlog Rhifau 12.20(i) ac 11.16 i gynnal Trafodaeth ar Gomisiwn Silk
Motion to Suspend Standing Orders Nos. 12.20(i) and 11.16 to hold a Debate on the Silk Commission

81 Adroddiad gan Gomisiwn Llywodraeth y DU, Comisiwn Silk
The Report by the UK Government's Silk Commission

108 Cyfnod Pleidleisio
Voting Time

115 Dadl Fer: Asbestos Mewn Ysgolion—Datgelu'r Wybodaeth yn Hytrach nag Atal Hawl Rhieni i Gael Gwybod Amdani
Short Debate: Asbestos in Schools—Revealing not Concealing Parents' Right to Know

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynddi yn y Siambr. Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation has been included.

Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 1.30 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd (Rosemary Butler) yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 1.30 p.m.with the Presiding Officer (Rosemary Butler) in the Chair.

Y Llywydd: Galwaf Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru i drefn.

The Presiding Officer: I call the National Assembly for Wales to order.

Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog
Questions to the First Minister

Gwasanaethau Cynghori

Advisory Services

1. David Rees: *A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am y camau gweithredu a gymerwyd gan Lywodraeth Cymru i gefnogi gwasanaethau cynghori yng Nghymru. OAQ(4)0789(FM)*

1. David Rees: *Will the First Minister make a statement on the actions taken by the Welsh Government to support advisory services in Wales. OAQ(4)0789(FM)*

The First Minister (Carwyn Jones): The Minister for Local Government and Communities has commissioned a review of advisory services, in view of the changes to welfare and to Legal Aid funding.

Y Prif Weinidog (Carwyn Jones): Mae'r Gweinidog Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau wedi comisiynu adolygiad o wasanaethau cynghori, o ystyried y newidiadau i les ac i gyllid Cymorth Cyfreithiol.

David Rees: Thank you for that answer, First Minister. In the current economic climate, and with the prospect of impending welfare reform, as you have just mentioned, we are seeing more and more people seeking advice on a variety of social and financial issues. We only need to reflect on the recent news of the redundancies at Tata Steel to realise that we will need these services even more in coming months. Cuts in the UK Government, such as those to the Legal Services Commission, and funding for Legal Aid, only add to the pressures that are experienced by staff and volunteers at advice centres. What is the Welsh Government doing to support these advisory services, which provide for some of the most vulnerable in our society?

David Rees: Diolch i chi am yr ateb yna, Brif Weinidog. Yn yr hinsawdd economaidd bresennol, a chyda'r posibilrwydd o ddiwygio lles sydd ar ddod, fel yr ydych newydd ei grybwyll, rydym yn gweld mwy a mwy o bobl yn chwilio am gyngor ar amrywiaeth o faterion cymdeithasol ac ariannol. 'Does dim ond angen i ni ddwyn i gof y newyddion diweddar am y diswyddiadau yn Tata Steel i sylweddoli y bydd gennym hyd yn oed fwy o angen am y gwasanaethau hyn yn ystod y misoedd i ddod. Mae toriadau yn Llywodraeth y DU, megis y rhai i'r Comisiwn Gwasanaethau Cyfreithiol, a chyllid ar gyfer Cymorth Cyfreithiol, yn ychwanegu at y pwysau a wynebir gan staff a gwirfoddolwyr mewn canolfannau cynghori. Beth y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn ei wneud i gefnogi'r gwasanaethau cynghori hyn, sy'n darparu ar gyfer rhai o'r bobl fwyaf agored i niwed yn ein cymdeithas?

The First Minister: Among other things, we provide funding of £6.6 million, over three years, to Citizens Advice Cymru for the Better Advice, Better Lives benefit take-up campaign. We have also provided an additional £753,000 during this financial year to front-line advice services to mitigate the problems that have been caused by the changes.

Y Prif Weinidog: Ymysg pethau eraill, rydym yn darparu cyllid o £6.6 miliwn, dros dair blynedd, i Gyngor ar Bopeth Cymru ar gyfer ymgyrch Cyngor Gwell, Bywydau Gwell ar gyfer manteisio ar fudd-daliadau. Rydym hefyd wedi darparu £753,000 ychwanegol yn ystod y flwyddyn ariannol gyfredol i wasanaethau cynghori rheng flaen i liniaru'r problemau a achoswyd gan y newidiadau.

Suzy Davies: Good afternoon, First Minister. I wish to come back to a question that I raised last week regarding independent advocacy services for children and young people. I was not entirely clear from your reply to my question last week—or indeed from the Deputy Minister for Children and Social Services' reply—about where you stood on this. The Children's Commissioner for Wales may say that he does in his report, because his independence makes him powerful enough to say that, but do you agree that children and young people will only have the power to say what they need to say when they get a fully functioning independent advocacy service?

Suzy Davies: Prynhawn da, Brif Weinidog. Hoffwn ddod yn ôl at gwestiwn a godais yr wythnos diwethaf ynghylch gwasanaethau eiriolaeth annibynnol ar gyfer plant a phobl ifanc. Nid oeddwn yn gwbl glir o ran eich ateb i'm cwestiwn olaf yr wythnos diwethaf—nac ychwaith o ran ateb a gefais gan y Dirprwy Weinidog Plant a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol—am ble rydych yn sefyll ar hyn. Gall Comisiynydd Plant Cymru ddweud ei fod yn gwybod hynny yn ei adroddiad, oherwydd bod ei annibyniaeth yn ei wneud yn ddigon grymus i ddweud hynny, ond a ydych chi'n cytuno mai dim ond pan fyddant yn cael gwasanaeth eiriolaeth annibynnol sy'n gweithredu'n llawn y bydd gan blant a phobl ifanc y pŵer i ddweud beth y maent angen ei ddweud?

The First Minister: No, indeed not. The children's commissioner already has a role in acting as an advocate for children and young people, in terms of ensuring that he operates as an arm's-length commissioner, independent of Government. He performs that role well.

Y Prif Weinidog: Na, dim o gwbl. Mae gan y comisiynydd plant eisoes rôl mewn gweithredu fel eiriolwr ar gyfer plant a phobl ifanc, o ran sicrhau ei fod yn gweithredu fel comisiynydd hyd braich, yn annibynnol ar y Llywodraeth. Mae'n perfformio'n dda yn y rôl.

Llyr Huws Gruffydd: Onid yw hi'n anffodus y bydd y newidiadau i Gyrfa Cymru yn arwain at lai o wasanaethau megis cyfweliadau wyneb yn wyneb, ar yr union adeg pan fo angen mwy o wasanaethau o'r fath yn yr hinsawdd economaidd sydd ohoni?

Llyr Huws Gruffydd: Is it not unfortunate that the changes to Careers Wales will lead to fewer services such as face-to-face interviews, at the very time when more such services are required in the current economic climate?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydym eisiau sicrhau bod y gwasanaeth gyrfaoedd yn gwella. Wrth wneud hynny, mae'n bwysig dros ben bod gwasanaethau eang ar gael i bobl ifanc. Mae sawl ffordd y gallant gael help er mwyn iddynt fod mewn sefyllfa lle y gallant gael cyflogaeth.

The First Minister: We want to ensure that careers service improves. In doing that, it is exceptionally important that broad services are available to young people. There are a number of ways in which they can access help in order to be in a position to be employed.

Rhaglen Lywodraethu

Programme for Government

2. Lynne Neagle: *A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog amlinellu sut y mae'r Rhaglen Lywodraethu yn darparu ar gyfer pobl yn Nhor-faen. OAQ(4)0797(FM)*

2. Lynne Neagle: *Will the First Minister outline how the Programme for Government is delivering for people in Torfaen. OAQ(4)0797(FM)*

The First Minister: We are making good progress in delivering the programme in all parts of Wales.

Y Prif Weinidog: Rydym yn gwneud cynnydd da wrth gyflwyno'r rhaglen ym mhob rhan o Gymru.

Lynne Neagle: Today's announcement that only 3.5% of those who are enrolled on the

Lynne Neagle: Mae cyhoeddiad heddiw mai dim ond 3.5% o'r rhai sydd wedi cofrestru ar

Work Programme have found sustainable, long-term employment is yet another nail in the coffin for the UK's flagship back-to-work initiative. An e-mail that Members received this morning from Mark Hoban may talk of promising starts, but they know as well as we do that this has been a disaster from the start. Do you agree, First Minister, that these figures show that the Tories and Lib Dems were wrong to scrap the Future Jobs fund, and that Welsh Labour in Government has done the right thing in continuing to invest in our own Welsh jobs fund, when nothing was forthcoming from Westminster?

y Rhaglen Waith sydd wedi dod o hyd i gyflogaeth gynaliadwy, hirdymor yn hoelen arall yn arch menter flaenllaw'r DU ar gael cael pobl yn ôl i'r gwaith. Mae'n wir bod e-bost a dderbyniodd yr Aelodau oddi wrth Mark Hoban y bore yma yn sôn am ddechrau addawol, ond maent yn gwybod cystal â ninnau ei fod wedi bod yn drychineb o'r cychwyn cyntaf. A ydych chi'n cytuno, Brif Weinidog, fod y ffigyrau hyn yn dangos bod y Torïaid a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn anghywir i gael gwared ar gronfa Swyddi'r Dyfodol, a bod Llafur Cymru mewn Llywodraeth wedi gwneud y peth iawn wrth barhau i fuddsoddi yn ein cronfa swyddi ein hunain yng Nghymru, pan nad oedd dim yn dod o San Steffan?

The First Minister: Indeed. Jobs Growth Wales has been a great success. The target has already been reached, halfway through the year. There are now more than 2,000 young people who are either in employment, or who have training, as a direct result of Jobs Growth Wales.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yn wir. Mae Twf Swyddi Cymru wedi bod yn llwyddiant mawr. Mae'r targed eisoes wedi'i gyrraedd, hanner ffordd drwy'r flwyddyn. Erbyn hyn mae mwy na 2,000 o bobl ifanc sydd naill ai mewn cyflogaeth, neu mewn hyfforddiant, o ganlyniad uniongyrchol i Dwf Swyddi Cymru.

William Graham: First Minister, you will be aware that obesity in Wales has been described as being at epidemic levels in places, unfortunately, such as Torfaen. It has some of the highest United Kingdom rates of obesity, heart disease and type 2 diabetes. Could you outline how your Government's programme for government, in terms of healthier lifestyles, is likely to be achieved?

William Graham: Brif Weinidog, byddwch yn ymwybodol bod gordewdra yng Nghymru wedi ei ddisgrifio fel bod ar lefelau epidemig mewn mannau, yn anffodus, fel yn Nhorfaen. Ceir yno un o gyfraddau uchaf y Deyrnas Unedig o ordewdra, clefyd y galon a diabetes math 2. A allwch chi amlinellu sut mae rhaglen eich Llywodraeth ar gyfer llywodraethu, o ran ffordd o fyw iachach, yn debygol o gael ei chyflawni?

The First Minister: We believe that good progress is being achieved. If you look, for example, at the education plans that we have in place in terms of diabetes, we believe that they are delivering. These things take time, but we understand that obesity is a challenge in all parts of Wales.

Y Prif Weinidog: Rydym yn credu bod cynnydd da yn cael ei gyflawni. Os byddwch yn edrych, er enghraifft, ar y cynlluniau addysg sydd gennym ar waith o ran diabetes, rydym yn credu eu bod yn cyflawni. Mae'r pethau hyn yn cymryd amser, ond rydym yn deall bod gordewdra yn her ym mhob rhan o Gymru.

Lindsay Whittle: Making good progress, you say. The number of young people claiming jobseeker's allowance is up, the average wages in Torfaen are down and female unemployment is up at record levels. To borrow a phrase from Al Gore,

Lindsay Whittle: Gwneud cynnydd da, meddai chi. Mae nifer y bobl ifanc sy'n hawlio lwfans ceisio gwaith wedi codi, mae cyfartaledd cyflogau yn Nhorfaen wedi gostwng ac mae lefel diweithdra ymysg menywod wedi cynyddu i lefelau uwch nag erioed. I fenthyca ymadrodd gan Al Gore,

‘Everything that ought to be down is up and everything that should be up is down.’

‘Mae popeth a ddylai fod i lawr i fyny a phopeth a ddylai fod i fyny i lawr.’

Blaming the Westminster Government for every ill is just not good enough. First Minister, will you accept some responsibility and admit that your Government’s unambitious, lacklustre programme is failing the people of Torfaen?

Nid yw beio Llywodraeth San Steffan am bopeth gwael yn ddigon da. Brif Weinidog, a wnewch chi dderbyn rhywfaint o gyfrifoldeb a chyfaddef nad yw rhaglen diuchelgais a difflach eich Llywodraeth yn cyflawni ar gyfer pobl Torfaen?

The First Minister: If his party had anything else to add in its manifesto, I would take his criticism with a bit more seriousness than I do. I take full responsibility for Jobs Growth Wales—of course I do—because it has been a great help to young people. I take full responsibility for the fact that economic activity in Wales is higher than it has ever been and I take responsibility for the fact that, over the last two quarters, unemployment has been on the way down in Wales. That said, I am far from complacent; I know that we need to keep on ensuring that programmes deliver in terms of better employment prospects for our young people. As part of that, I very much welcome the agreement that has been reached between our parties on the budget.

Y Prif Weinidog: Pe byddai gan ei blaid ef unrhyw beth arall i’w ychwanegu yn ei maniffesto, byddwn yn cymryd ei feirniadaeth ychydig yn fwy o ddifrif nag yr wyf ar hyn o bryd. Rwy’n cymryd cyfrifoldeb llawn am Dwf Swyddi Cymru—wrth gwrs fy mod i—gan ei fod wedi bod o gymorth mawr i bobl ifanc. Rwyf yn cymryd cyfrifoldeb llawn am y ffaith fod gweithgarwch economaidd yng Nghymru yn uwch nag y bu erioed, ac yr wyf yn cymryd cyfrifoldeb am y ffaith fod diweithdra wedi bod ar y ffordd i lawr yng Nghymru dros y ddau chwarter diwethaf. Wedi dweud hynny, rwyf ymhell o fod yn hunanfodlon; gwn fod angen i ni barhau i sicrhau bod rhaglenni yn cyflawni o ran gwell rhagolygon ar gyfer cyflogaeth i’n pobl ifanc. Yn rhan o hynny, rwyf yn croesawu’n fawr y cytundeb sydd wedi ei gyrraedd rhwng ein pleidiau ar y gyllideb.

Cwestiynau Heb Rybudd gan Arweinwyr y Pleidiau

Questions Without Notice from the Party Leaders

The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrats (Kirsty Williams): First Minister, last week, the chief executive of the NHS said that he was increasingly confident that Wales’s health boards would balance their books. Days later, however, the Wales Audit Office said that most health boards are unlikely to break even. Since the Wales Audit Office report is based on Welsh Government figures, why did the Minister for Health and Social Services allow the chief executive of the health service to go on television to reassure the public of Wales that the health boards would balance their books, when the data supplied to the Wales Audit Office said something completely different?

Arweinydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Kirsty Williams): Brif Weinidog, yr wythnos diwethaf, dywedodd prif weithredwr y GIG ei fod yn fwyfwy hyderus y byddai byrddau iechyd Cymru yn mantoli eu cyfrifon. Ddyddiau yn ddiweddarach, fodd bynnag, dywedodd Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru ei bod yn annhebygol y byddai’r rhan fwyaf o fyrddau iechyd yn adennill eu costau. Gan fod adroddiad Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru yn seiliedig ar ffigurau Llywodraeth Cymru, pam wnaeth y Gweinidog Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ganiatáu i brif weithredwr y gwasanaeth iechyd fynd ar y teledu i dawelu meddwl y cyhoedd yng Nghymru y byddai’r byrddau iechyd yn mantoli eu cyfrifon, pan oedd y data a ddarparwyd i Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru yn dweud rhywbeth hollol wahanol?

The First Minister: The Wales Audit Office report says quite clearly that the NHS is in a better financial position than it was at the same time last year, and it confirms again the urgent need for reconfiguration of NHS services in order to deliver more sustainable and safer services in the future.

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae adroddiad Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru yn dweud yn eithaf clir bod y GIG mewn gwell sefyllfa ariannol nag yr oedd ar yr un adeg y llynedd, ac mae'n cadarnhau unwaith eto yr angen i ad-drefnu gwasanaethau'r GIG yn ddi-oed er mwyn darparu gwasanaethau mwy cynaliadwy a mwy diogel yn y dyfodol.

Kirsty Williams: First Minister, what the Wales Audit Office says is that, for instance, the position of Cardiff and Vale University Local Health Board is worse than it was last year; that most health boards are unlikely to break even within their current resource limits; and that the deficit could be as big as £130 million. The chief executive of NHS Wales, despite supplying those data to the Wales Audit Office, went on television to say that there is increasing confidence that they would break even to their targets, and that they would do so without, in any sense, compromising the quality of care. Yet, today, the same chief executive has told the Assembly's Public Accounts Committee that he expects the NHS in Wales to be £70 million in deficit. Given the guarantees that he has made, will you also guarantee that there will be no compromise in the quality of care to plug the funding gap that he now admits exists?

Kirsty Williams: Brif Weinidog, yr hyn y mae Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru yn ei ddweud yw, er enghraifft, bod sefyllfa Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Prifysgol Caerdydd a'r Fro yn waeth nag yr oedd y llynedd; bod y rhan fwyaf o fyrddau iechyd yn annhebygol o adennill costau o fewn terfynau eu hadnoddau presennol, ac y gallai'r diffyg fod cymaint â £130 miliwn. Aeth prif weithredwr GIG Cymru, er gwaethaf cyflenwi'r data hwnnw i Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru, ar y teledu i ddweud bod hyder cynyddol y byddant yn cyflawni eu targedau mantoli, ac y byddent yn gwneud hynny heb, mewn unrhyw fodd, beryglu ansawdd y gofal. Er hynny, heddiw, mae'r un prif weithredwr wedi dweud wrth Bwyllgor Cyfrifon Cyhoeddus y Cynulliad ei fod yn disgwyl i'r GIG yng Nghymru fod mewn diffyg ariannol o £70 miliwn. O ystyried y gwarantau y mae wedi'u gwneud, a wnewch chithau hefyd warantu na fydd unrhyw gyfaddawdu o ran ansawdd y gofal i lenwi'r bwlch cyllido y mae ef bellach yn cyfaddef sy'n bodoli?

The First Minister: No; we expect local health boards to ensure that they come in on target in terms of their budgets. That much has not changed. As far as the leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrats is concerned, I ask her now whether she will support reconfiguration in order to ensure better and more sustainable services, as the Wales Audit Office demands.

Y Prif Weinidog: Na, rydym yn disgwyl i fyrddau iechyd lleol sicrhau eu bod yn cyflawni eu targedau o ran eu cyllidebau. Nid yw hynny wedi newid. Cyn belled ag y mae arweinydd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn y cwestiwn, gofynnaf iddi yn awr a fydd hi'n cefnogi ad-drefnu er mwyn sicrhau gwasanaethau gwell a mwy cynaliadwy, fel y mae Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru yn ei fynnu.

Kirsty Williams: Your own Minister for health has said that the reconfiguration of services is not about resources. In fact, the reconfiguration of the services will not save any money; it is all about improving healthcare. I am asking you about the financial resilience of the NHS. The Wales Audit Office is telling you, First Minister, that health boards are unlikely to break even with their current

Kirsty Williams: Mae eich Gweinidog iechyd eich hunan wedi dweud nad yw ad-drefnu gwasanaethau yn ymwneud ag adnoddau. Mewn gwirionedd, ni fydd ad-drefnu'r gwasanaethau yn arbed unrhyw arian; mae'n ymwneud â gwella gofal iechyd. Gofyn yr wyf i chi am gadernid ariannol y GIG. Mae Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru yn dweud wrthych, Brif Weinidog, fod y

resources; they could be £130 million in debt. Your own chief executive said today that it could be £70 million. Your Minister for health and your Government have already ruled out further brokerage to Cardiff and Vale, Cwm Taf, Aneurin Bevan and Powys local health boards, even though their deficits alone are estimated to be around £60 million. That covers Nevill Hall Hospital, Royal Glamorgan Hospital, Prince Charles Hospital, Royal Gwent Hospital and the University Hospital of Wales. If there is to be no bail-out, which is what your Government has said, what services will close?

byrddau iechyd yn annhebygol o adennill eu costau gyda'u hadnoddau presennol; gallent fod £130 miliwn mewn dyled. Dywedodd eich prif weithredwr eich hun heddiw, y gallai fod yn £70 miliwn. Mae eich Gweinidog iechyd a'ch Llywodraeth eisoes wedi dweud na fydd broceriaeth bellach ar gyfer Caerdydd a'r Fro, Cwm Taf, Aneurin Bevan a byrddau iechyd lleol Powys, er yr amcangyfrifir bod eu diffygion hwy yn unig oddeutu £60 miliwn. Mae hynny'n cynnwys Ysbyty Nevill Hall, Ysbyty Brenhinol Morgannwg, Ysbyty'r Tywysog Siarl, Ysbyty Brenhinol Gwent ac Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru. Os nad oes unrhyw achub i fod, sef yr hyn y mae eich Llywodraeth wedi ei ddweud, pa wasanaethau fydd yn cau?

The First Minister: I thank the leader of the Liberal Democrats for that speech. As far as this Government is concerned, we will always ensure that the NHS is properly funded. She has failed to answer the question as to whether she agrees that reconfiguration should take place for more sustainable services. It is just not good enough for the Lib Dems to scaremonger when they resist every attempt to make our NHS better.

Y Prif Weinidog: Diolchaf i arweinydd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol am yr araith yna. Cyn belled ag y mae'r Llywodraeth hon yn y cwestiwn, byddwn bob amser yn sicrhau bod y GIG yn cael ei ariannu'n iawn. Mae hi wedi methu ag ateb y cwestiwn ynghylch a yw'n cytuno y dylai ad-drefnu ddigwydd er mwyn cael gwasanaethau mwy cynaliadwy. Nid yw'n ddigon da i'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol wneud dim ond codi bwganod pan eu bod yn gwrthwynebu pob ymgais i wneud ein GIG yn well.

The Leader of the Opposition (Andrew R.T. Davies): It is a bit rich, First Minister, for you to talk of scaremongering when, at the end of September, you talked of the budget for the Welsh NHS being 'slightly short'. Those were your words, used in Plenary, in response to my questioning about end-of-year outcomes for our LHBs. In the report, we have the Auditor General for Wales indicating a midpoint of £70 million, which your chief executive of the Welsh NHS agrees with, but an extreme position of £130 million. Where has it all gone wrong, First Minister?

Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Andrew R.T. Davies): Mae hi braidd yn ddigywilydd, Brif Weinidog, i chi sôn am godi bwganod, a chithau, ddiwedd mis Medi, wedi dweud bod y gyllideb ar gyfer y GIG yng Nghymru 'fymryn yn brin'. Dyna oedd eich geiriau, a ddefnyddiwyd yn y Cyfarfod Llawn, mewn ymateb i fy holi ynglŷn â chanlyniadau diwedd y flwyddyn ar gyfer ein Byrddau Iechyd Lleol. Yn yr adroddiad, mae gennym Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru yn dangos pwynt canol o £70 miliwn, y mae eich prif weithredwr ar gyfer GIG Cymru yn cytuno ag ef, ond gyda sefyllfa eithafol o £130 miliwn. Ble y mae pethau wedi mynd o chwith, Brif Weinidog?

The First Minister: As I have said before, we expect the LHBs to come in on target.

Y Prif Weinidog: Fel yr wyf wedi dweud o'r blaen, rydym yn disgwyl i'r Byrddau Iechyd Lleol gyflawni eu targedau.

Andrew R.T. Davies: You must be living in a parallel universe, First Minister. Everyone working in the NHS in Wales and the people who are in receipt of their healthcare from the NHS in Wales understand that there are real pressures within the Welsh NHS. It is identified that there is a financial shortfall within the NHS. Your own Minister for health has said that there will be no bail-outs for the second year. In one breath, you are saying that there will be a shortfall, of around £70 million, and then you say that there is no shortfall. Which is it? When will you grasp the reality of the situation that our Welsh NHS faces, that you are underfunding the NHS in Wales?

Andrew R.T. Davies: Mae'n rhaid eich bod yn byw mewn bydysawd cyfochrog, Brif Weinidog. Mae pawb sy'n gweithio yn y GIG yng Nghymru a'r bobl sydd yn derbyn eu gofal iechyd gan y GIG yng Nghymru yn deall bod pwysau gwirioneddol o fewn y GIG yng Nghymru. Mae wedi ei nodi bod diffyg ariannol o fewn y GIG. Mae eich Gweinidog iechyd eich hun wedi dweud na fydd unrhyw arian ychwanegol ar gael am yr ail flwyddyn. Yn yr un anadl, yr ydych yn dweud y bydd diffyg, o tua £70 miliwn, ac eto rydych yn dweud nad oes diffyg. Pa un sy'n wir? Pryd fyddwch chi'n deall y gwirionedd am y sefyllfa sy'n wynebu ein GIG yng Nghymru, sef eich bod yn tangyllido'r GIG yng Nghymru?

The First Minister: The word 'midpoint', of course, undermines his entire argument. The difference is that we are honest on this side of the house. Over on that side, the most dishonest position ever taken by any party rests with them and I will explain why now—[*Interruption*.]

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'r ymadrodd 'pwynt canol', wrth gwrs, yn tanseilio ei ddadl gyfan. Y gwahaniaeth yw ein bod ni'n onest ar yr ochr hon i'r tŷ. Drosodd ar yr ochr acw, y ceir y safbwynt mwyaf anonest a gymerwyd erioed gan unrhyw barti a byddaf yn egluro pam yn awr—*Torri ar draws.]*

The Presiding Officer: Order. You may not like what the First Minister is saying, but he has every right to say it.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Efallai nad ydych yn hoffi'r hyn y mae'r Prif Weinidog yn ei ddweud, ond mae ganddo bob hawl i'w ddweud.

The First Minister: The party opposite continuously claims that it can find some £500 million from thin air to spend on the NHS, despite the cuts that have taken place under the party opposite in Westminster. The smoke and mirrors that they have used to try to conceal the cuts that are taking place in the NHS there are there for all to see. Let us come back to the Welsh issue. They say that £500 million should be spent on the NHS, but never say where the money is coming from: a 20% cut in transport, a 30% cut in economic development, a 12.5% cut in local government, and a 20% cut, although it depends who you believe, in education. They know full well that their Government in London is taking money away from Wales and then they demand that money that does not exist is spent. That is fundamentally dishonest and the people of Wales found them out this year and last year.

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'r blaid gyferbyn yn honni'n barhaus y gall ddod o hyd i ryw £500 miliwn o unman i wario ar y GIG, er gwaethaf y toriadau sydd wedi digwydd o dan y blaid gyferbyn yn San Steffan. Mae'r dulliau celu y maent wedi eu defnyddio i geisio cuddio'r toriadau sy'n cael eu gwneud yn y GIG, yno i bawb eu gweld. Gadewch inni ddychwelyd at y mater yng Nghymru. Maent yn dweud y dylid gwario £500 miliwn ar y GIG, ond nid ydynt byth yn dweud o ble mae'r arian yn mynd i ddod: toriad o 20% mewn trafnidiaeth, toriad o 30% mewn datblygu economaidd, toriad o 12.5% mewn llywodraeth leol, a thoriad o 20%, er ei bod yn dibynnu pwy rydych yn ei gredu, mewn addysg. Maent yn gwybod yn iawn fod eu Llywodraeth yn Llundain yn mynd ag arian oddi ar Gymru ac yna maent yn mynnu bod arian nad yw'n bodoli yn cael ei wario. Mae hynny'n sylfaenol anonest ac mae pobl Cymru wedi gweld y gwir amdanynt eleni a'r llynedd.

Andrew R.T. Davies: It was interesting that the First Minister chose not to answer a single point that I put to him. Last week, I noticed during questions to the First Minister that he was busy pruning himself and pulling his suit together and pulling his cuffs together. If you take the suit off, there is very little substance there. There is a real issue in the Welsh NHS— [*Interruption*.]

Andrew R.T. Davies: Roedd yn ddiddorol fod y Prif Weinidog wedi dewis peidio ag ateb unrhyw bwynt a ofynnais iddo. Yr wythnos diwethaf, sylwais yn ystod cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog ei fod yn brysur yn twtio ei hun gan dynnu ei siwt at ei gilydd a thynnu ei gyffiau at ei gilydd. Pe byddech yn tynnu'r siwt i ffwrdd, prin iawn yw'r sylwedd sydd ar ôl. Mae problem wirioneddol yn GIG Cymru— [*Torri ar draws.*]

The Presiding Officer: Order.

Y Llywydd: Trefn.

Andrew R.T. Davies: There is a real issue in the NHS in Wales and with the lack of substance that emanates from the Government benches and, in particular, the Welsh Minister for health. It is about time that you addressed the real financial difficulties that the Welsh NHS faces and the £70 million shortfall that your own chief executive has identified. When are you going to face up to the reality of the situation, so that clinicians and patients can have confidence that you have their best wishes at heart, and so that we have a health service that is fit for the twenty-first century, rather than the posturing, week-in week-out, that you make as First Minister?

Andrew R.T. Davies: Mae problem wirioneddol yn y GIG yng Nghymru a chyda'r diffyg sylwedd sy'n deillio o feinciau'r Llywodraeth ac, yn enwedig, oddi wrth y Gweinidog iechyd. Mae'n hen bryd i chi fynd i'r afael â'r anawsterau ariannol gwirioneddol sy'n wynebu GIG Cymru a'r diffyg o £70 miliwn mae eich prif weithredwr eich hunan wedi ei nodi. Pryd ydych chi'n mynd i wynebu gwirionedd y sefyllfa, fel y gall clinigwyr a chleifion fod yn hyderus eich bod yn eu rhoi hwy yn gyntaf, ac fel bod gennym wasanaeth iechyd sy'n addas ar gyfer yr unfed ganrif ar hugain, yn hytrach na'r ymhonni, wythnos ar ôl wythnos, yr ydych yn ei wneud fel Prif Weinidog?

talks about posturing. He comes in, he bumbles in here every week and asks these questions and bumbles back out again. He accuses us of trivialising the issue and he goes on about playing with cuffs and suits. That is a weak joke at the very most. The reality is that we care about the NHS; we are honest with the people of Wales about the NHS. His party never explains where this phantom money is coming from. He knows the cuts that have come from his own party in London. At the end of the day, we stand up for the NHS; his party spins dishonesty to the people of Wales on this issue.

Y Llywydd: Mae'n sôn am ymhonni. Mae'n dod i mewn, mae'n ymlwybro yma bob wythnos ac yn gofyn y cwestiynau hyn ac yn ymlwybro'n ôl allan eto. Mae'n ein cyhuddo o fychanu'r mater ac mae'n mynd ymlaen am chwarae gyda chyffiau a siwtiau. Jôc wan yw honno ar y gorau. Y gwirionedd yw ein bod yn ystyriol o'r GIG; rydym yn onest gyda phobl Cymru am y GIG. Nid yw ei blaid ef byth yn egluro o ble mae'r arian rhith hwn yn mynd i ddod. Mae'n gwybod am y toriadau sydd wedi dod oddi wrth ei blaid ei hun yn Llundain. Yn y pen draw, rydym yn sefyll i fyny dros y GIG; mae ei blaid ef yn cyflwyno anonestrwydd i bobl Cymru ar y mater hwn.

The Leader of Plaid Cymru (Leanne Wood): Thank you, Presiding Officer; perhaps we can get back to some serious business. On 3 October, the Minister for Business, Enterprise, Technology and Science said that she had been asked to approve to cease funding

Mae Arweinydd Plaid Cymru (Leanne Wood): Diolch, Lywydd; efallai y gallwn fynd yn ôl at fusnes pwysig. Ar 3 Hydref, dywedodd y Gweinidog Busnes, Menter, Technoleg a Gwyddoniaeth ei bod wedi cael cais i gymeradwyo rhoi'r gorau i gyllid ar

for the Welsh social enterprise coalition beyond 2012-13. Will you tell us at whose request and with what evidence base was that decision made?

gyfer cynghrair menter cymdeithasol Cymru y tu hwnt i 2012-13. A wnewch chi ddweud wrthym pwy wnaeth y cais ac ar sail ba dystiolaeth y gwnaed y penderfyniad hwnnw?

The First Minister: The value-for-money review undertaken on the Welsh social enterprise coalition concluded that it had not provided the value for money that could be reasonably expected considering the funding and support that it received between 2009/10 and 2012/13.'

Y Prif Weinidog: Daeth yr adolygiad gwerth am arian a wnaed ar gynghrair mentrau cymdeithasol Cymru i'r casgliad nad oedd wedi darparu'r gwerth am arian y gellid ei ddisgwyl yn rhesymol o ystyried y cyllid a'r cymorth a dderbyniodd rhwng 2009/10 a 2012/13. '

1.45 p.m.

In reviewing its performance against agreed targets and indicators, the report stated that

Wrth adolygu ei pherfformiad yn erbyn targedau y cytunwyd arnynt a dangosyddion, nododd yr adroddiad hyn:

'although progress had been made in a number of areas, most notably increasing membership, overall the activities delivered to date have fallen below expectation. No final decisions have yet been made on the amended functions or the new arm of a host organisation.'

'er bod cynnydd wedi'i wneud mewn nifer o feysydd, cynyddu aelodaeth yn fwyaf nodedig, ar y cyfan, mae'r gweithgareddau a ddarparwyd hyd yn hyn wedi bod yn is na'r disgwyl. Nid oes unrhyw benderfyniadau terfynol wedi eu gwneud eto ar y swyddogaethau diwygiedig nac ar gangen newydd o sefydliad llywyddol.'

Leanne Wood: A review of such significance should be shared with Assembly Members before decisions are made. The Minister's statement said that the Government will continue to support the social enterprise sector within a new host organisation. First Minister, given that the 2012-14 funding amounts to around £200,000, can you tell us what tendering process has been put in place to determine who will take over the new role, please?

Leanne Wood: Dylid rhannu adolygiad mor bwysig â hyn gydag Aelodau'r Cynulliad cyn i benderfyniadau gael eu gwneud. Roedd datganiad y Gweinidog yn dweud y bydd y Llywodraeth yn parhau i gefnogi'r sector mentrau cymdeithasol o fewn sefydliad llywyddol newydd. Brif Weinidog, o gofio bod y cyllid 2012-14 yn dod i tua £200,000, a allwch chi ddweud wrthym pa broses dendro sydd wedi ei rhoi ar waith i benderfynu pwy fydd yn cyflawni'r rôl newydd, os gwelwch yn dda?

The First Minister: That is something that is in hand. However, it is clear that things could not carry on as before, given the value-for-money review that had taken place.

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae hynny'n rhywbeth sydd ar y gweill. Fodd bynnag, mae'n amlwg na allai pethau barhau fel ag o'r blaen, o ystyried yr adolygiad gwerth am arian a gynhaliwyd.

Leanne Wood: First Minister, I find this a strange set of affairs. This was meant to be the body that your Government consulted on social enterprises. Who are you consulting now? For years, the Welsh social enterprise coalition has been promoted as a flagship for social enterprise, yet, within two and a half years of its formation, it has been ditched with

Leanne Wood: Brif Weinidog, rwyf yn gweld hon yn sefyllfa ryfedd iawn. Dyma'r corff yr oedd eich Llywodraeth i fod i ymgynghori ag ef ar fentrau cymdeithasol. Pwy ydych chi'n ymgynghori â hwy nawr? Am flynyddoedd, mae cynghrair menter gymdeithasol Cymru wedi cael ei hyrwyddo fel sefydliad blaenllaw ar gyfer menter

no explanation to its members or to Assembly Members and with hundreds of thousands of pounds outstanding. Given your refusal to lead by example last week over the ministerial code, what are you doing to ensure transparency in these decisions? How can the social enterprise sector have faith that your decision-making process is the right one?

gymdeithasol, ond eto, o fewn dwy flynedd a hanner ar ôl ei sefydlu, mae wedi ei thaflu o'r neilltu heb unrhyw esboniad i'w haelodau nac i Aelodau'r Cynulliad a gyda channoedd o filoedd o bunnoedd heb eu talu. O ystyried eich penderfyniad i wrthod arwain drwy esiampl yr wythnos diwethaf ynglŷn â'r cod gweinidogol, beth ydych chi'n ei wneud i sicrhau tryloywder yn y penderfyniadau hyn? Sut gall y sector menter cymdeithasol fod yn ffyddiog mai eich proses gwneud penderfyniadau yw'r un gywir?

The First Minister: A value-for-money review has taken place. We cannot ignore it and carry on as if it had never existed. The Minister is looking at the situation at the moment with a view to resolving this as quickly as possible and in order to ensure that the new arm of a host organisation is in place as quickly as possible. However, the Government certainly cannot ignore value-for-money reviews when they are conducted.

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae adolygiad gwerth am arian wedi ei gynnal. Ni allwn ei anwybyddu a pharhau fel pe nad oedd erioed wedi digwydd. Mae'r Gweinidog yn edrych ar y sefyllfa ar hyn o bryd gyda'r bwriad o ddatrys hyn cyn gynted ag y bo modd ac er mwyn sicrhau bod cangen newydd o sefydliad llywyddol wedi ei sefydlu cyn gynted ag y bo modd. Fodd bynnag, mae'n sicr nad yw'r Llywodraeth yn gallu anwybyddu adolygiadau gwerth am arian pan eu bod yn cael eu cynnal.

Blaenoriaethau

Priorities

3. Jocelyn Davies: *A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am flaenoriaethau Llywodraeth Cymru ar gyfer y flwyddyn newydd. OAQ(4)0793(FM)*

3. Jocelyn Davies: *Will the First Minister make a statement on the Welsh Government's priorities for the new year. OAQ(4)0793(FM)*

The First Minister: Yes. They are to be found in the programme for government.

Y Prif Weinidog: Gwnaf. Maent i'w gweld yn ein rhaglen lywodraethu.

Jocelyn Davies: What a surprising answer. [*Laughter*.] I am sure, First Minister, that the implementation of the Silk commission recommendations will be a priority for you. Do you have a date in mind for the referendum on tax-varying powers?

Jocelyn Davies: Dyna ateb sy'n peri syndod.[Chwerthin.] Rwyf yn siŵr, Brif Weinidog, y bydd gweithredu argymhellion comisiwn Silk yn flaenoriaeth i chi. A oes gennych ddyddiad mewn golwg ar gyfer y refferendwm ar bwerau amrywio trethi?

The First Minister: There will not be a referendum before 2015 and, certainly in the term of this Assembly, 2016, as Silk recommended. It is very difficult to give an estimate on what the timetable might be, because there is a need to ensure that Barnett is dealt with first. Once that is done, more thought can be given to what a timetable might look like.

Y Prif Weinidog: Ni fydd refferendwm yn cael ei gynnal cyn 2015 ac, yn sicr yn ystod tymor y Cynulliad hwn, 2016, fel yr argymhellodd Silk. Mae'n anodd iawn rhoi amcan o'r hyn y gallai'r amserlen fod, oherwydd bod angen sicrhau ymdrin â Barnett yn gyntaf. Ar ôl gwneud hynny, gellir meddwl mwy am sut y gallai'r amserlen edrych.

Mohammad Asghar: First Minister, the

Mohammad Asghar: Brif Weinidog, mae

chairman of the biggest house-building company in Wales, Redrow, has said that parts of the country will become no-go areas if tougher building regulations are introduced. Steve Morgan went on to say that the plans to make new homes more energy efficient would add £11,000 to the costs of building a basic three-bedroomed house and would lead to affordable housing not being viable in areas such as the south-east Wales Valleys. What studies has the Welsh Government undertaken regarding the impact of more regulations on the building of affordable housing in Wales? Does the First Minister agree that new houses will not be built in cheaper areas in future without a subsidy?

cadeirydd y cwmni adeiladu tai mwyaf yng Nghymru, Redrow, wedi dweud y bydd rhannau o'r wlad yn dod yn ardaloedd na ellir gweithredu ynddynt os cyflwynir rheoliadau adeiladu llymach. Aeth Steve Morgan ymlaen i ddweud y byddai cynlluniau i wneud cartrefi newydd yn fwy ynni effeithlon yn ychwanegu £11,000 at gostau adeiladu tŷ tair ystafell wely sylfaenol ac yn arwain at dai fforddiadwy i beidio â bod yn hyfyw mewn ardaloedd fel Cymoedd de-ddwyrain Cymru .Pa astudiaethau y mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi eu cynnal ar effaith mwy o reoliadau ar adeiladu tai fforddiadwy yng Nghymru? A yw'r Prif Weinidog yn cytuno na fydd tai newydd yn cael eu hadeiladu mewn ardaloedd rhatach yn y dyfodol heb gymhorthdal?

The First Minister: Well, yes, we are paying for affordable houses. That is the whole point of having affordable houses and being able to provide them. The £11,000 figure is not one that has been backed up by any evidence, and I hope that the Member is not suggesting that somehow energy efficiency is a bad thing, or, indeed, that fire sprinklers are a bad thing. We know that has been a live issue between one Member in this Chamber, and others, and the building industry. I do not think that we should take lightly the need to protect people in fires. We have seen some of the unfortunate consequences in that regard over the past few months.

Y Prif Weinidog: Wel, ie, yr ydym yn talu am dai fforddiadwy. Dyna'r holl bwynt o gael tai fforddiadwy a gallu eu darparu. Nid yw'r ffigwr o £11,000 yn un sydd wedi ei gefnogi gan unrhyw dystiolaeth, ac rwyf yn gobeithio nad yw'r Aelod yn awgrymu bod effeithlonrwydd ynni yn beth drwg mewn rhyw ffordd, neu, yn wir, bod chwistrellwyr rhag tân yn beth drwg. Gwyddom fod hynny wedi bod yn fater gwirioneddol rhwng un Aelod yn y Siambr hon, ac eraill, a'r diwydiant adeiladu. Nid wyf yn credu y dylem danbwysleisio'r angen i ddiogelu pobl mewn tanau. Rydym wedi gweld rhai o ganlyniadau anffodus hynny yn ystod y misoedd diwethaf.

Eluned Parrott: First Minister, last week, you told me that your priorities for transport were outlined in the national transport plan, but when I asked your Minister for transport about a possible new station in the east of Cardiff, I was told that it is not in the national transport plan and there is no recent or ongoing feasibility study. However, in the recent Cardiff South and Penarth by-election, a Labour Party leaflet said that you had announced that you will look at the feasibility of an east of Cardiff railway station. First Minister, is it now Government policy to launch a feasibility study into a new station in the east of Cardiff? If so, why does your Minister for transport know nothing about it?

Eluned Parrott: Brif Weinidog, yr wythnos diwethaf, dywedasoch wrthyf fod eich blaenoriaethau ar gyfer trafnidiaeth wedi'u hamlinellu yn y cynllun trafnidiaeth cenedlaethol, ond pan ofynnais i'ch Gweinidog dros drafnidiaeth ynglŷn â gorsaf newydd bosibl yn nwyrain Caerdydd, dywedwyd wrthyf nad yw hynny yn y cynllun trafnidiaeth cenedlaethol ac nad oes unrhyw astudiaeth o ddichonoldeb diweddar na pharhaus yn bodoli. Fodd bynnag, yn isetholiad diweddar De Caerdydd a Phenarth, roedd taflen y Blaid Lafur yn dweud eich bod wedi cyhoeddi y byddwch yn edrych ar ddichonoldeb gorsaf reilffordd yn nwyrain Caerdydd. Brif Weinidog, a yw bellach yn bolisi'r Llywodraeth i lansio astudiaeth o ddichonoldeb gorsaf newydd yn nwyrain Caerdydd? Os felly, pam nad yw eich

Gweinidog trafnidiaeth yn gwybod dim am y peth?

The First Minister: We always keep under review the need to improve rail connections in the eastern part of the city, but inaccurate leaflets from the Lib Dems are something that we are very much used to on this side of the Chamber—there was a dubious opinion poll attached to it as well, which is standard Lib Dem practice. As far as eastern Cardiff is concerned, we will consider any potential options in the future as to how connectivity can be improved between that part of the city and the centre.

Y Prif Weinidog: Rydym bob amser yn cadw dan adolygiad yr angen i wella cysylltiadau rheilffordd yn rhan ddwyreiniol y ddinas, ond mae taflenni anghywir gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn rhywbeth yr ydym yn gyfarwydd iawn â hwy ar yr ochr hon i'r Siambr—roedd arolwg barn amheus ynghlwm wrtho hefyd, sef arfer arferol y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Cyn belled ag y mae dwyrain Caerdydd yn y cwestiwn, byddwn yn ystyried unrhyw opsiynau posibl yn y dyfodol o ran sut y gellir gwella cysylltedd rhwng y rhan honno o'r ddinas a'r canol.

Trais Domestig

Domestic Violence

4. Gwyn R. Price: *A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am yr hyn y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn ei wneud i fynd i'r afael â thrais domestig yng Nghymru. OAQ(4)0790(FM)*

4. Gwyn R. Price: *Will the First Minister make a statement on what the Welsh Government is doing to tackle domestic violence in Wales. OAQ(4)0790(FM)*

The First Minister: Yes. Yesterday saw the launch of the formal consultation on a White Paper seeking views on the legislative proposals aimed at ending violence against women, domestic abuse and sexual violence.

Y Prif Weinidog: Gwnaf. Ddoe gwelwyd lansio'r ymgynghoriad ffurfiol ar Bapur Gwyn yn ceisio barn ar y cynigion deddfwriaethol sydd â'r bwriad o roi terfyn ar drais yn erbyn menywod, cam-drin domestig a thrais rhywiol.

Gwyn R. Price: Thank you for that answer. Does the First Minister agree that domestic abuse is the most common form of violence against women, and that tackling it should be at the heart of any Government's agenda? With that in mind, will you join me in congratulating Welsh Women's Aid and the work that it does, and in welcoming its 16 days of action from 25 November onwards?

Gwyn R. Price: Diolch am yr ateb yna. A yw'r Prif Weinidog yn cytuno mai cam-drin domestig yw'r ffurf fwyaf cyffredin o drais yn erbyn menywod, ac y dylai mynd i'r afael â hynny fod yn ganolog i agenda unrhyw Lywodraeth? Gyda hynny mewn golwg, a wnewch chi ymuno â mi i longyfarch Cymorth i Fenywod Cymru a'r gwaith y mae'n ei wneud, ac i groesawu ei 16 diwrnod o weithredu o 25 Tachwedd ymlaen?

The First Minister: Yes, indeed I will. Welsh Women's Aid and the work that it does is not always appreciated by all parties in Wales, as we know from previous experience. We want to ensure that taking the White Paper forward into legislation will enable organisations such as Welsh Women's Aid to strengthen their work in the future.

Y Prif Weinidog: Gwnaf, Mi wnaf yn wir. Nid yw Cymorth i Fenywod Cymru a'r gwaith y mae'n ei wneud yn cael ei werthfawrogi bob amser gan bob plaid yng Nghymru, fel y gwyddom o brofiad blaenorol. Rydym eisiau sicrhau y bydd dwyn y Papur Gwyn ymlaen i ddeddfwriaeth yn galluogi sefydliadau fel Cymorth i Fenywod Cymru i gryfhau eu gwaith yn y dyfodol.

Antoinette Sandbach: The Welsh

Antoinette Sandbach: Mae llawer i'w

Government's White Paper on violence against women has much to commend it and it has been welcomed by many organisations, including the White Ribbon Campaign and the National Federation of Women's Institutes, which have campaigned on these issues for many years. First Minister, while legislation has a role to play, what steps have you taken in the last year to encourage the reporting of domestic violence?

gymeradwyo ym Mhapur Gwyn Llywodraeth Cymru ar drais yn erbyn menywod ac mae wedi ei groesawu gan lawer o sefydliadau, gan gynnwys yr Ymgyrch Rhuban Gwyn a Ffederasiwn Cenedlaethol Sefydliad y Merched, sydd wedi bod yn ymgyrchu ar y materion hyn ers blynyddoedd lawer. Brif Weinidog, er bod gan ddeddfwriaeth ran i'w chwarae, pa gamau a gymerwyd gennych chi yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf i annog hysbysu am drais yn y cartref?

The First Minister: We always seek to work with the police and other agencies to make sure that domestic violence is reported to the appropriate authorities. For example, the 10,000 Safer Lives project paves the way for the proposals set out in the White Paper. Taken together, all these things are aimed at encouraging people to report domestic abuse so that action can be taken.

Y Prif Weinidog: Rydym bob amser yn ceisio gweithio gyda'r heddlu ac asiantaethau eraill i wneud yn siŵr yr hysbysir am drais yn y cartref i'r awdurdodau priodol. Er enghraifft, mae'r prosiect 10,000 o Fywydau Diogelach yn paratoi'r ffordd ar gyfer y cynigion a nodir yn y Papur Gwyn. Gyda'i gilydd, mae'r holl bethau hyn â'r nod o annog pobl i hysbysu am gam-drin domestig fel y gellir cymryd camau.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Mae'n rhaid llongyfarch Gwyn Price ar amseru ei gwestiwn i gydfynd yn union â'r datganiad a gyhoeddwyd gan Lywodraeth Cymru; mae gan Aelodau main cefn Llafur rhyw allu rhyfeddol i amseru'r cwestiynau hyn i gydfynd â datganiadau. Fodd bynnag, mae'n ddatganiad o bwys mawr ac rydym ninnau hefyd yn ei groesawu. Mae trais yn y cartref yn ymwneud gan fwyaf â thrais i fenywod, ond a fyddech hefyd yn cydnabod, Brif Weinidog, fod problem o ran trais i ddynion a phlant yn y cartref, a bod yn rhaid edrych ar y cyfan? Er ein bod yn cydnabod mai trais i fenywod sydd yn digwydd fwyaf aml, mae elfennau eraill o drais maent rhaid i ni fynd i'r afael â nhw hefyd.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Gwyn Price is to be congratulated on the timing of his question to coincide exactly with the statement published by the Welsh Government; Labour Party backbenchers have a wondrous ability to time these questions to coincide with statements. However, it is a statement of great import and we also welcome it. Domestic violence relates mostly to violence against women, but will you also acknowledge, First Minister, that there is a problem in relation to domestic violence against men and children, and that we must look at this holistically? Although we acknowledge that violence against women happens most often, there are other elements of violence that we must address also.

Y Prif Weinidog: Camdrin yw camdrin; rydym yn deall hynny. Mae'r rhan fwyaf ohono yn digwydd yn erbyn menywod a phlant, ond y nod yw sicrhau ein bod yn symud i sefyllfa lle mae camdriniaeth domestig yn rhywbeth o'r gorffennol, ac nad yw'n rhywbeth mae pobl yn gorfod byw gydag ef yn y dyfodol.

The First Minister: Abuse is abuse; we understand that. Most of it is against women and children, but the aim is to ensure that we move to a situation where domestic abuse is a thing of the past, and not something that people will have to live with in future.

Rebecca Evans: First Minister, domestic violence is experienced by women of all ages. However, older women are often overlooked. How is the Welsh Government working to

Rebecca Evans: Brif Weinidog, mae menywod o bob oed yn profi trais yn y cartref. Fodd bynnag, mae menywod hŷn yn cael eu hanwybyddu'n aml. Ym mha ffordd y

ensure that appropriate information, services and support are available for older women who are experiencing domestic violence?

mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn gweithio i sicrhau bod gwybodaeth, gwasanaethau a chefnogaeth briodol ar gael i fenywod hŷn sy'n dioddef trais yn y cartref?

The First Minister: The proposals in the White Paper will include prevention, protection and support for all victims, regardless of age. Our proposal is to ensure that local authorities and other public service partners work together to develop and implement strategies to reduce violence against women of all ages.

Y Prif Weinidog: Bydd y cynigion yn y Papur Gwyn yn cynnwys atal, diogelu a chefnogaeth i'r holl ddioddefwyr, waeth beth fo'u hoedran. Ein cynnig ni yw sicrhau bod awdurdodau lleol a phartneriaid gwasanaeth cyhoeddus eraill yn gweithio gyda'i gilydd i ddatblygu a gweithredu strategaethau i leihau trais yn erbyn menywod o bob oed.

Buddsoddi Cyfalaf mewn Seilwaith

Capital Infrastructure Investment

5. Kenneth Skates: *A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog amlinellu cynlluniau Llywodraeth Cymru ar gyfer cefnogi buddsoddi cyfalaf mewn seilwaith yng ngogledd Cymru. OAQ(4)0792(FM)*

5. Kenneth Skates: *Will the First Minister outline the Welsh Government's plans to support capital infrastructure investment in north Wales. OAQ(4)0792(FM)*

The First Minister: Yes. The Wales infrastructure investment plan sets out how we will invest £15 billion over the next decade.

Y Prif Weinidog: Gwnaf. Mae'r cynllun buddsoddi yn seilwaith Cymru yn nodi sut y byddwn yn buddsoddi £15 biliwn dros y degawd nesaf.

Kenneth Skates: First Minister, given the enormous potential of electrification of the north Wales main line, what steps are being taken by the Welsh Government to develop a robust and detailed case for this project?

Kenneth Skates: Brif Weinidog, o ystyried y potensial enfawr o drydaneiddio prif reilffordd gogledd Cymru, pa gamau sy'n cael eu cymryd gan Lywodraeth Cymru i ddatblygu achos cadarn a manwl ar gyfer y prosiect hwn?

The First Minister: The Minister for Local Government and Communities has instructed his officials to work with the Department for Transport to take forward an assessment of the case for investing in the north Wales main line.

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'r Gweinidog Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau wedi cyfarwyddo ei swyddogion i weithio gyda'r Adran Drafnidiaeth i ddatblygu asesiad o'r achos dros fuddsoddi ym mhrif reilffordd y gogledd.

Mark Isherwood: When I questioned you last month, First Minister, regarding the potential of capital infrastructure investment in the regeneration of the Dee and Ceiriog Valleys in Clwyd South and reaching areas of need in those communities, referring to the Llangollen railway extension, Brymbo Heritage Group, Cefn Mawr Plas Kynaston Canal Group and Dee Valley Tramway Trust, you replied by referring to Tourism Partnership North Wales and local authorities working on a new brand for the three north-east Wales counties. What role do you feel capital infrastructure could play in tackling those problems, first to protect the iron and steel heritage and the exposed

Mark Isherwood: Pan holais i chi y mis diwethaf, Brif Weinidog, ynghylch y posibilrwydd o fuddsoddi mewn seilwaith cyfalaf yn y gwaith o adfywio Cymoedd Dyfrdwy a Cheiriog yn Ne Clwyd a chyrraedd ardaloedd anghenus yn y cymunedau hynny, gan gyfeirio at estyniad rheilffordd Llangollen, Grŵp Treftadaeth Brymbo, Grŵp Camlas Cefn Mawr Plas Kynaston ac Ymddiriedolaeth Tramffordd Dyffryn Dyfrdwy, ateboch drwy gyfeirio at Bartneriaeth Twristiaeth Gogledd Cymru ac awdurdodau lleol yn gweithio ar frand newydd ar gyfer tair sir gogledd-ddwyrain Cymru. Pa swyddogaeth ydych chi'n ei

fossil forest in Brymbo, but secondly with regard to the extension of the railway from Llangollen to Corwen? I understand that you visited the railway this summer to discuss the challenges and opportunities they face.

deimlo y gallai seilwaith cyfalaf chwarae wrth fynd i'r afael â'r problemau hynny, yn gyntaf i ddiogelu'r dreftadaeth haearn a dur a'r goedwig ffosil agored ym Mrymbo, ond yn ail, o ran ymestyn y rheilffordd o Langollen i Gorwen? Yr wyf yn deall eich bod wedi ymweld â'r rheilffordd yn ystod yr haf i drafod yr heriau a'r cyfleoedd y maent yn eu hwynebu

The First Minister: Yes, I much enjoyed the visit. Any schemes that can provide opportunities via apprenticeships or that can create jobs, directly or indirectly, are candidates for infrastructure investment. Of course, the point is to ensure that the capital investment leads to jobs. However, where it also helps to preserve Wales's heritage, that is also very welcome.

Y Prif Weinidog: Do, mi fwynheais yr ymweliad. Mae unrhyw gynlluniau a all ddarparu cyfleoedd drwy brentisiaethau neu a all greu swyddi, yn uniongyrchol neu'n anuniongyrchol, yn addas ar gyfer buddsoddi mewn seilwaith. Wrth gwrs, y pwynt yw sicrhau bod y buddsoddiad cyfalaf yn arwain at swyddi. Fodd bynnag, pan ei fod hefyd yn helpu i ddiogelu treftadaeth Cymru, croesewir hynny hefyd.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: A yw dal yn rhan o bolisi'r Llywodraeth i adeiladu pont newydd ar draws y Fenai?

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Is it still part of Government policy to build a new bridge across the Menai straits?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae hynny'n rhywbeth rydym yn ei ystyried ar hyn o bryd. Rydym yn deall, wrth gwrs, y pwysau sydd ar yr A55 yn yr ardal honno o'r Gogledd. Y cwestiwn yw o ble byddai'r arian yn dod. Mae hynny'n rhywbeth byddai'n rhaid i ni ystyried, ond mae'n wir i ddweud bod hyn yn rhywbeth sydd yn cael ei ystyried, wrth gofio'r sefyllfa ariannol.

The First Minister: This is something we are considering at present. We understand the pressure on the A55 in that area of north Wales. The question is where the money would come from. That is something we need to consider, but it is true to say that this is under consideration, bearing in mind the financial situation.

Aled Roberts: Brif Weinidog, wythnos diwethaf cyfaddefoch mai dim ond 13% o wariant cyfalaf y llynedd a wariwyd yn y gogledd, er bod 20% o boblogaeth Cymru yn byw yno. Mae strategaeth digwyddiadau mawr y Llywodraeth hefyd yn cyfaddef mai ond 11% o'r gwariant a wariwyd yn y gogledd. Pa gamau rydych yn eu cymryd, felly, i sicrhau bod pob rhan o Gymru yn elwa, yn ôl ei haeddiant, ar y strategaeth hon, sydd yn rhan o'ch cyllideb, i'r dyfodol?

Aled Roberts: First Minister, last week, you admitted that only 13% of capital expenditure last year was spent in north Wales, despite 20% of the population of Wales living in the area. The major events unit within Government also admits that only 11% of expenditure was spent in north Wales. Therefore, what steps are you taking to ensure that all parts of Wales benefit, as they deserve, from this strategy, which is part of your budget, in the future?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ynghylch yr arian a wariwyd yn y Gogledd, mae enghreifftiau ym Maes yr Helmau, Gelligemlyn, a Glandyfi. Mae enghreifftiau ym maes iechyd, os edrychwch ar hyn sydd yn digwydd yn Ysbyty Glan Clwyd. Felly, mae enghreifftiau o arian cyfalaf yn cael ei wario yn y Gogledd—mae enghreifftiau eraill hefyd. Wrth gwrs, rydym

The First Minister: With regard to the money that has been spent in north Wales, there are examples in Maes yr Helmau, Gelligemlyn, Glandyfi. There are examples in the health sector, if you look at what happened at Ysbyty Glan Clwyd. So, there are examples of capital funds being spent in north Wales—there are other examples as well. Of

eisiau sicrhau bod pob rhan o Gymru yn elwa ar yr arian cyfalaf fydd ar gael.

course, we want to ensure that every part of Wales benefits from the capital funding available.

Medal Ushakov

Ushakov Medal

6. Vaughan Gething: *A yw Llywodraeth Cymru wedi cyflwyno unrhyw sylwadau i Lywodraeth y DU ynghylch cyflwyno medal Ushakov i gyn-filwyr o Gymru a oedd yn rhan o'r confois i Rwsia. OAQ(4)0788(FM)*

6. Vaughan Gething: *Has the Welsh Government made any representations to the UK Government about the awarding of the Ushakov medal to Welsh veterans of the Russian convoys. OAQ(4)0788(FM)*

The First Minister: As a Government, we have not made any representations. However, if specific examples of deserving cases can be provided, I would be happy to make representations to the Foreign and Commonwealth Office.

Y Prif Weinidog: Fel Llywodraeth, nid ydym wedi gwneud unrhyw sylwadau. Fodd bynnag, pe gellid darparu enghreifftiau penodol o achosion teilwng, byddwn yn hapus i gyflwyno sylwadau i'r Swyddfa Dramor a Chymanwlad.

Vaughan Gething: Thank you for that offer, First Minister. I will certainly write to you to make you aware of four of my constituents who have been offered the Ushakov medal by the Russian Federation but who have not been allowed to accept the medal by the UK Government. The rules outlined by the Foreign and Commonwealth Office prevent any veterans from the second world war accepting this particular award from another Government. This is not a party political issue; I know that there are Members from every party in this Chamber who feel the same way as I do. Unfortunately, one veteran died on Remembrance Sunday and would therefore not be able to accept this medal even if the Government does see sense. Do you agree that this is a victory of bureaucracy over common sense and the continuing debt of gratitude we owe to our veterans?

Vaughan Gething: Diolch i chi am y cynnig yna, Brif Weinidog. Byddaf yn sicr yn ysgrifennu atoch er mwyn eich gwneud yn ymwybodol o bedwar o fy etholwyr sydd wedi cael cynnig y fedal Ushakov gan Ffederasiwn Rwsia, ond nad ydynt wedi cael caniatâd i dderbyn y fedal gan Lywodraeth y DU. Mae'r rheolau a amlinellir gan y Swyddfa Dramor a Chymanwlad yn atal unrhyw gyn-filwyr o'r ail ryfel byd rhag derbyn y wobr benodol hon oddi wrth Lywodraeth arall. Nid mater yn ymwneud â phleidiau gwleidyddol yw hwn; gwn fod Aelodau o bob plaid yn y Siambr hon sy'n teimlo yr un ffordd ag yr wyf innau. Yn anffodus, bu farw un cyn-filwr ar Sul y Cofio, ac felly ni fyddai'n gallu derbyn y fedal hon hyd yn oed pe byddai'r Llywodraeth yn gweld synnwyr. A ydych chi'n cytuno bod hon yn fuddugoliaeth i fiwrocratiaeth dros synnwyr cyffredin a'r ddyled barhaus o ddiolchgarwch sydd arnom i'n cyn-filwyr?

The First Minister: The Member is right to say that it is not clear why there has been this delay. However, as I said, if he provides me with examples, I would be more than happy to make representations on their behalf.

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'r Aelod yn iawn i ddweud nad yw'n glir pam y bu'r oedi hwn. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedais, pe byddai e'n rhoi enghreifftiau i mi, byddwn yn fwy na pharod i wneud sylwadau ar eu rhan.

Andrew R.T. Davies: First Minister, as I understand it, there is a time constraint on the ability of veterans to receive this medal of some five years from the event. The Prime Minister has set up a review under Sir John Holmes to look into this very issue and other awards that could be made by other

Andrew R.T. Davies: Brif Weinidog, fel yr wyf yn deall, mae cyfyngiad amser ar allu cyn-filwyr i dderbyn y fedal hon, sef tua phum mlynedd ar ôl y digwyddiad. Mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi sefydlu adolygiad dan Syr John Holmes i edrych ar yr union fater hwn a gwobrau eraill y gellid eu cyflwyno gan

Governments relating to foreign battles and conflicts. It is disappointing to hear that the Welsh Government has not made any representations to that review. Could you rectify that after today's proceedings so that, with a united voice, we can ensure that this bureaucracy is put to one side so that veterans who have served this country with passion and diligence to safeguard the interests we hold dear receive the recognition they deserve?

Lywodraethau eraill yn ymwneud â brwydrau a gwrthdaro dramor. Mae'n siomedig i glywed nad yw Llywodraeth Cymru wedi cyflwyno unrhyw sylwadau i'r adolygiad hwnnw. A allech chi wneud iawn am hynny ar ôl trafodion heddiw fel ein bod yn gallu sicrhau bod y fiwrocratiaeth hon yn cael ei rhoi o'r neilltu fel bod cyn-filwyr sydd wedi gwasanaethu'r wlad hon gydag angerdd a diwydrwydd i ddiogelu'r buddiannau sy'n bwysig i ni, yn cael derbyn y gydnabyddiaeth y maent yn ei haeddu?

The First Minister: I believe that I have answered that question. However, the time constraint, if it exists, must surely exist at the behest of the UK Government. Therefore, the ball is very much in its court. If it changes the rules, I am sure that all Members would welcome that.

Y Prif Weinidog: Rwyf yn credu fy mod wedi ateb y cwestiwn yna. Fodd bynnag, mae'n rhaid bod y cyfyngiad amser, os yw'n bodoli, ar orchymyn Llywodraeth y DU. Felly, dyna ble y dylid gwneud penderfyniad. Pe byddai'r rheolau'n cael eu newid, rwyf yn sicr y byddai pob Aelod yn croesawu hynny.

Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwasanaethau Ambiwlans Cymru

Welsh Ambulance Services NHS Trust

7. Peter Black: *A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am y berthynas rhwng Ymddiriedolaeth Ambiwlans Cymru a'r byrddau iechyd lleol. OAQ(4)0785(FM)*

7. Peter Black: *Will the First Minister make a statement on the relationship between the Welsh Ambulance Trust and local health boards. OAQ(4)0785(FM)*

The First Minister: Yes. They are committed to working together to deliver the best possible clinical outcomes for patients.

Y Prif Weinidog: Gwnaf. Maent wedi ymrwymo i weithio gyda'i gilydd i sicrhau'r canlyniadau clinigol gorau posibl i gleifion.

Peter Black: Thank you for that answer, First Minister. On 7 November, when we had a debate on the Welsh Ambulance Services NHS Trust, the Minister for Health and Social Services stated that:

Peter Black: Diolch i chi am yr ateb yna, Brif Weinidog. Ar 7 Tachwedd, pan gawsom ddadl ar Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwasanaethau Ambiwlans Cymru, dywedodd y Gweinidog Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol:

'in recent months there has been a 47% reduction in lost hours—those times when ambulances are held up at hospitals.' However, when the Welsh Ambulance Services NHS Trust met on 18 October, less than three weeks before that, it was reported that the number of hours' delay each month had risen from 3,000 per month the previous year to 5,000 per month this year. Which is correct and what are you doing about it?

'Yn ystod y misoedd diwethaf, bu gostyngiad o 47% yn yr oriau a gollwyd—yr adegau hynny pan fydd ambiwlansiau yn cael eu cadw i oedi mewn ysbytai.' Fodd bynnag, pan gyfarfu Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwasanaethau Ambiwlans Cymru ar 18 Hydref, llai na thair wythnos cyn hynny, adroddwyd bod nifer yr oriau o oedi bob mis wedi codi o 3,000 y mis yn ystod y flwyddyn flaenorol i 5,000 y mis eleni. Pa un sy'n gywir a beth yr ydych chi'n ei wneud am y peth?

2.00 p.m.

The First Minister: The Minister for health

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'r Gweinidog iechyd

has made her comments and those comments are, I believe, correct. I have to remind the Member that we announced plans on 7 November to conduct a review of the ambulance service, and the terms of reference for that review are being drafted.

wedi gwneud ei sylwadau ac mae’r sylwadau hynny, mi gredaf, yn gywir. Mae’n rhaid i mi atgoffa’r Aelod ein bod wedi cyhoeddi cynlluniau ar 7 Tachwedd i gynnal adolygiad o’r gwasanaeth ambiwlans, ac mae’r cylch gorchwyl ar gyfer yr adolygiad hwnnw yn cael ei ddrafftio.

David Rees: The new role of advanced practitioner paramedic has been introduced by the Welsh ambulance service trust to provide care closer to people’s homes and to reduce the number of patients being taken to hospital unnecessarily. The role was identified to me as being important following the change to services in Neath Port Talbot Hospital. Are you aware of the support provided by the LHBs for these posts?

David Rees: Mae rôl newydd ymarferydd uwch parafeddygol wedi ei chyflwyno gan ymddiriedolaeth gwasanaeth ambiwlans Cymru i ddarparu gofal yn nes at gartrefi pobl ac i leihau nifer y cleifion sy’n cael eu cludo i’r ysbyty yn ddiangen. Nodwyd wrthyf fod y swyddogaeth hon yn bwysig yn dilyn y newidiadau i wasanaethau yn ysbyty Castell-nedd Port Talbot. A ydych chi’n ymwybodol o’r gefnogaeth a ddarperir gan y BILl ar gyfer y swyddi hyn?

The First Minister: Yes. In the ambulance service, there are 12 operational APPs in post and a further 11 are currently undergoing their training at the University of Glamorgan. Five of those posts have been supported financially as part of the LHB’s service change plans relating to Neath Port Talbot Hospital.

Y Prif Weinidog: Ydw. Yn y gwasanaeth ambiwlans, mae 12 ymarferydd uwch parafeddygol yn gweithredu mewn swydd ac mae 11 arall wrthi’n cael eu hyfforddi ym Mhrifysgol Morgannwg. Mae pump o’r swyddi hynny wedi eu cefnogi’n ariannol yn rhan o gynlluniau newid yng ngwasanaeth y BILl sy’n ymwneud ag Ysbyty Castell-nedd Port Talbot.

Suzy Davies: First Minister, in the Welsh Conservatives’ debate on winter resilience last week, I mentioned that the Mid and West Wales Fire and Rescue Service, which covers part of my region, has acquired 17 smaller 4x4 vehicles, which can provide an agile emergency response. What indication have you had from the ambulance trust as to whether it would benefit from having a 4x4 capacity, and is there any scope to share these particular vehicles for certain types of emergency response?

Suzy Davies: Brif Weinidog, yn nadl y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig ar wytnwch gaeaf yr wythnos diwethaf, soniais fod Gwasanaeth Tân ac Achub Canolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru, sy’n gwasanaethu rhan o fy rhanbarth i, wedi caffael 17 o gerbydau 4x4 llai, sy’n gallu darparu ymateb brys hyblyg. Pa arwydd ydych chi wedi’i gael gan yr ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans ynghylch pa un a fyddai’n elwa o gael cyfleuster 4x4, ac a oes unrhyw bosibilrwydd o rannu’r cerbydau arbennig hyn ar gyfer mathau penodol o ymateb brys?

The First Minister: Bearing in mind that the fire services are trained—

Y Prif Weinidog: O gadw mewn cof bod y gwasanaethau tân wedi eu hyfforddi—

Suzy Davies: Hello? I have not finished.

Suzy Davies: Helo? Nid wyf wedi gorffen.

The First Minister: Sorry—

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae’n ddrwg gennyf—

The Presiding Officer: Order. I think that you have already asked two questions.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Rwyf yn meddwl eich bod eisoes wedi gofyn dau gwestiwn.

Suzy Davies: No.

Suzy Davies: Nac ydw

The Presiding Officer: Well, it seems like it. Will you hurry up and come to the point? Quickly, come to the point.

Y Llywydd: Wel, mae'n ymddangos eich bod. A wnewch chi frysio a dod at y pwynt? Nawr, dewch at y pwynt.

Nick Ramsay: It was much shorter than others.

Nick Ramsay: Roedd yn llawer byrrach nag eraill.

The Presiding Officer: Excuse me. Have you finished your point, Suzy Davies?

Y Llywydd: Esgusodwch fi. Ydych chi wedi gorffen eich pwynt, Suzy Davies?

Suzy Davies: I have one more sentence, that is all.

Suzy Davies: Mae gennyf un frawddeg arall, dyna i gyd.

The Presiding Officer: Finish your question quickly, but I remind people that they are to ask one question, not three or four.

Y Llywydd: Gorffennwch eich cwestiwn yn gyflym, ond rwyf yn atgoffa pobl eu bod yn cael gofyn un cwestiwn, nid tri neu bedwar.

Suzy Davies: It is the same question.

Suzy Davies: Yr un cwestiwn ydyw.

The Presiding Officer: I know, but it is a very long one.

Y Llywydd: Rwyf yn gwybod hynny, ond mae'n un hir iawn.

Suzy Davies: All I wanted to ask the First Minister was this. What role does his Government have in facilitating collaboration in the use of capital resources between emergency services?

Suzy Davies: Y cyfan yr oeddwn eisiau ei ofyn i'r Prif Weinidog oedd hyn. Pa rôl sydd gan ei Lywodraeth o ran hwyluso cydweithio yn y defnydd o adnoddau cyfalaf rhwng gwasanaethau brys?

The First Minister: We expect there to be collaboration, of course. Response fire service crews have an element of training in first aid, and quite often they will be the first on the scene when dealing with an accident or a fire. Therefore, they will be the first to respond in those circumstances. Then, of course, they will liaise with the ambulance service, if it is next to arrive, to ensure that the patient gets the best clinical outcome.

Y Prif Weinidog: Rydym yn disgwyl y bydd cydweithio'n digwydd, wrth gwrs. Mae criwiau ymateb y gwasanaeth tân yn cael elfen o hyfforddiant mewn cymorth cyntaf, ac yn aml iawn nhw fydd y cyntaf i gyrraedd wrth ymdrin â damwain neu dân. Felly, nhw fydd y cyntaf i ymateb dan yr amgylchiadau hynny. Yna, wrth gwrs, byddant yn cydgysylltu â'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans, os mai nhw yw'r nesaf i gyrraedd, er mwyn sicrhau bod y claf yn cael y canlyniad clinigol gorau.

Elin Jones: Brif Weinidog, mae pwysau ariannol difrifol yn y gwasanaeth ambiwlans, fel yr ydym wedi'i drafod yn y Siambr sawl gwaith. Gan fod £50 miliwn o arian wrth gefn bellach wedi'i ddatgelu yn y gyllideb iechyd, a fyddwch yn ystyried lleddfu'r pwysau ariannol sydd yn y gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn ogystal ag yn y byrddau iechyd wrth ichi ystyried sut i ddosrannu'r arian hwn?

Elin Jones: First Minister, as we have discussed in the Chamber many times, the ambulance services is under severe financial pressure. Given that £50 million of funds in reserve have now been revealed in the health budget, will you consider alleviating the financial pressures on the ambulance service as well as on health boards when you consider how you intend to distribute that money?

Y Prif Weinidog: Rhoddwyd £1 miliwn i'r ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans yn ddiweddar i

The First Minister: A sum of £1 million was given to the ambulance trust recently to

sicrhau gwelliannau yn y gwasanaeth ac i ddelio â'r pwysau newydd sydd ganddo.

secure service improvements and to cope with the new pressures that it is under.

Darparu Gwasanaethau ar draws y Ffin

Cross-border Service Provision

8. William Powell: *A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am ddull gweithredu Llywodraeth Cymru yng nghyswllt cydgysylltu darparu gwasanaethau ar draws y ffin rhwng Cymru a Lloegr. OAQ(4)0798(FM)*

8. William Powell: *Will the First Minister make a statement on the Welsh Government's approach to coordination of service provision across the Welsh-English Border. OAQ(4)0798(FM)*

The First Minister: Yes, we continue to work with service providers in Wales and beyond to deliver the best service for the people of Wales.

Y Prif Weinidog: Gwnaf, rydym yn parhau i weithio gyda darparwyr gwasanaethau yng Nghymru a thu hwnt i ddarparu'r gwasanaeth gorau i bobl Cymru.

William Powell: I thank the First Minister for that answer. Cross-border arrangements are particularly important when it comes to ambulance provision, as changes to service delivery across Offa's Dyke can have a real impact on our results and experience here in Wales. Shropshire, for instance, has decided to place a greater focus recently on Make Ready paramedic vehicles, rather than traditional ambulances, with those that are left operating out of a central Shrewsbury depot. What assessment has your Government made of the potential impact of this service change on the people of Montgomeryshire and Radnorshire?

William Powell: Diolchaf i'r Prif Weinidog am yr ateb yna. Mae trefniadau traws-ffiniol yn arbennig o bwysig pan ddaw'n fater o ddarparu ambiwlans, gan y gall newidiadau i ddarpariaeth gwasanaethau ar draws Clawdd Offa gael effaith wirioneddol ar ein canlyniadau a'n profiad yma yng Nghymru. Mae Swydd Amwythig, er enghraifft, wedi penderfynu rhoi mwy o bwyslais yn ddiweddar ar gerbydau parafeddygol Ymbaratoi, yn hytrach nag ambiwlansiau traddodiadol, gyda'r rhai sydd ar ôl yn gweithredu allan o ddepo canolog yn Amwythig. Pa asesiad y mae eich Llywodraeth wedi'i wneud o effaith bosibl y newid hwn yn y gwasanaeth ar bobl Sir Drefaldwyn a Sir Faesyfed?

The First Minister: There is a cross-border protocol in place, and officials from both sides of the border will be reviewing whether the current protocol needs to be enhanced. Of course, the effect on those people living in border areas will be taken into account as part of that review.

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae protocol traws-ffiniol ar waith, a bydd swyddogion o'r ddwy ochr i'r ffin yn adolygu a oes angen gwella'r protocol presennol. Wrth gwrs, bydd yr effaith ar y bobl hynny sy'n byw mewn ardaloedd ar y ffin yn cael ei hystyried yn rhan o'r adolygiad hwnnw.

Darren Millar: First Minister, you will know that it is appropriate to provide some services on a cross-border basis, particularly for the NHS, where the scale of population et cetera might demand that a service be provided for a large population. That is especially important in north Wales. However, there are some services that need to be provided locally for people to be able to access them, and I talk specifically about the neonatal services currently under review in north Wales. Can you assure people in my constituency that the neonatal services

Darren Millar: Brif Weinidog, byddwch yn gwybod ei bod yn briodol i ddarparu rhai gwasanaethau ar sail draws-ffiniol, yn enwedig ar gyfer y GIG, lle y gallai maint y boblogaeth ayb fynnu bod gwasanaeth yn cael ei ddarparu ar gyfer poblogaeth fawr. Mae hynny'n arbennig o bwysig yng ngogledd Cymru. Fodd bynnag, mae rhai gwasanaethau y mae angen eu darparu yn lleol er mwyn i bobl allu cael mynediad atynt, ac rwyf yn siarad yn benodol am y gwasanaethau newyddenedigol sydd dan

that they have access to will always be accessible to them and will always be safe, no matter where they are provided? Can you also comment on whether you would like to see them provided in north Wales or elsewhere?

adolygiad yng ngogledd Cymru ar hyn o bryd. A allwch chi sicrhau pobl yn fy etholaeth i y bydd y gwasanaethau newyddenedigol y mae ganddynt fynediad atynt, bob amser yn ddiogel, ni waeth ble y maent yn cael eu darparu? A allwch hefyd wneud sylw ar ba un a fyddech yn hoffi eu gweld yn cael eu darparu yng ngogledd Cymru neu yn rhywle arall?

The First Minister: I want them to be safe, sustainable and accessible, and, in that, I can agree with the Member. However, the further detail that he mentioned is a matter for the review.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf am iddynt fod yn ddiogel, yn gynaliadwy ac yn hygyrch, ac, yn hynny o beth, gallaf gytuno â'r Aelod. Fodd bynnag, mae'r manylion ychwanegol a grybwyllodd yn fater ar gyfer yr adolygiad.

Lindsay Whittle: First Minister, can you please investigate why Welsh medical device manufacturing companies are being prevented from competing on a level playing field with their English counterparts because the Welsh health informatics service is not proactive in helping Welsh manufacturers via the dispensing alliance contractors? In short, First Minister, the Spine, the Welsh computer system, cannot talk to its equivalent in England, which is giving English competitors the edge and could mean Welsh-based manufacturing companies relocating to England. There are 250 jobs in Cardiff.

Lindsay Whittle: Brif Weinidog, a allwch chi ymchwilio i'r rheswm pam mae cwmnïau gweithgynhyrchu dyfeisiau meddygol yng Nghymru yn cael eu hatal rhag cael cystadlu'n deg â'u cystadleuwyr yn Lloegr oherwydd nad yw gwasanaeth gwybodeg iechyd Cymru yn rhagweithiol o ran helpu gweithgynhyrchwyr Cymru drwy gyfrwng contractwyr y gynghrair dosbarthu? Yn gryno, Brif Weinidog, ni all 'Spine', y system gyfrifiadurol yng Nghymru, gyfathrebu â'r system gyfatebol yn Lloegr, sy'n rhoi mantais i gystadleuwyr o Loegr, a gallai olygu y bydd cwmnïau gweithgynhyrchu sy'n seiliedig yng Nghymru yn adleoli i Loegr. Mae 250 o swyddi yng Nghaerdydd.

The First Minister: That is a detailed question that deserves a detailed answer. I will write to the Member with the answer to his question.

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae hwnnw'n gwestiwn manwl sy'n haeddu ateb manwl. Byddaf yn ysgrifennu at yr Aelod gyda'r ateb i'w gwestiwn.

Cefnogi'r GIG

Supporting the NHS

9. Elin Jones: *Sut y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn bwriadu cefnogi'r GIG yng Nghymru dros y chwe mis nesaf. OAQ(4)0787(FM)*

9. Elin Jones: *How does the Welsh Government intend to support the NHS in Wales over the next six months. OAQ(4)0787(FM)*

Y Prif Weinidog: Rydym eisiau sicrhau bod gwasanaeth sy'n gynaliadwy ac yn ddiogel.

The First Minister: We wish to ensure that there is a sustainable and safe service.

Elin Jones: Brif Weinidog, wrth ddatgelu'r angen am arian ychwanegol yn y GIG y bore yma yn y Pwyllgor Cyfrifon Cyhoeddus, dywedodd prif weithredwr y GIG fod y pwysau ariannol ychwanegol hyn yn deillio yn rhannol o fewnfudo henoed i Gymru. A ydych yn

Elin Jones: First Minister, in divulging the NHS's need for additional funding at the Public Accounts Committee this morning, the chief executive of the NHS stated that the additional financial pressure is partly as a result of the inward migration of older people

rhannu'r dadansoddiad hwn ac, os ydych, a oes mewnfudo annisgwyl o henoed wedi digwydd ers gosod y gyllideb iechyd 12 mis yn ôl?

to Wales. Do you agree with that analysis and, if so, has this unexpected inward migration of older people occurred since the health budget was set 12 months ago?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'n wir dweud bod poblogaeth Cymru dipyn bach yn hŷn na'r arfer, a bod hwnnw'n rhoi tipyn bach mwy o bwysau ar y gwasanaeth iechyd. Bu hynny'n wir ers blynyddoedd mawr.

The First Minister: It is true to say that the population of Wales is slightly older than is the norm and that that has put a little more pressure on the health service. That has been true for many years.

Julie Morgan: What can the Welsh Government do to support the NHS in ensuring that the treatment and support that is available for haemophiliacs in Wales is adequate, particularly in getting access to specialist haemophilia physiotherapy, as there is still only one specialist haemophilia therapist based in Cardiff?

Julie Morgan: Beth all Llywodraeth Cymru ei wneud i gefnogi'r GIG i sicrhau bod y driniaeth a'r cymorth sydd ar gael ar gyfer hemoffiligion yng Nghymru yn ddigonol, yn enwedig o ran cael mynediad at ffisiotherapi haemoffilia arbenigol, gan nad oes dim ond un therapydd haemoffilia arbenigol yn gweithio yng Nghaerdydd?

The First Minister: We all are sympathetic to the needs of people who have haemophilia. Given the limited budgets that exist at the moment, the Minister wished to direct the funding towards the provision of more counselling services rather than therapy services, but, in the future, we hope to make sure that therapy services can be taken forward and more therapists appointed.

Y Prif Weinidog: Rydym i gyd yn cydymdeimlo ag anghenion pobl sydd â haemoffilia. O ystyried y cyllidebau cyfyngedig sy'n bodoli ar hyn o bryd, roedd y Gweinidog yn dymuno cyfeirio'r arian tuag at ddarparu mwy o wasanaethau cwnsela yn hytrach na gwasanaethau therapi, ond, yn y dyfodol, rydym yn gobeithio gwneud yn siŵr y gellir datblygu gwasanaethau therapi a phenodi mwy o therapyddion.

Paul Davies: Rwy'n siŵr, Brif Weinidog, y byddwch yn ymwybodol bod y nifer sy'n cael brechiad rhag y ffliw yn is yng Nghymru nag ydyw mewn rhannau eraill o'r Deyrnas Unedig ac, ar hyn o bryd, rydym ar ei hôl hi wrth gyrraedd targedau o ran brechu gweithwyr iechyd ar y rheng flaen, yr henoed a phobl fregus. A allwch ddweud wrthym beth mae eich Llywodraeth yn ei wneud i gynyddu'r nifer sy'n cael brechiad rhag y ffliw, gan sicrhau nad yw'r gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru yn cael ei roi o dan bwysau dros y misoedd nesaf?

Paul Davies: I am certain, First Minister, that you will be aware that the number of people receiving a flu vaccination in Wales is lower than it is in other parts of the United Kingdom and that, at the moment, we are lagging behind in respect of hitting the targets for the immunisation of front-line health workers, older people and vulnerable people. Can you tell us what your Government is doing to increase the number of people receiving the flu jab to ensure that the health service in Wales is not put under pressure over the coming months?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae ymgyrch ar waith fel bod pobl yn gweld y posteri ac yn y blaen er mwyn iddynt wybod, yn gyntaf, fod y brechiad ar gael—ac nid yw hynny wastad yn wir—ac yn ail, nad oes rhaid iddynt fynd at eu doctor lleol i gael y brechiad gan ei fod yn bosibl ei gael mewn sawl fferyllfa.

The First Minister: There is a campaign under way so that people see the posters and so on and know, first of all, that the flu jab is available—as that is not always the case—and, secondly, that they do not have to go to their local GP surgery, as it is possible to get the jab in a number of pharmacies.

Tocynnau Teithio Rhatach

Concessionary Fares

***10. Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am effaith y fenter tocynnau teithio rhatach ar drafnidiaeth gymunedol. OAQ(4)0799(FM)*

***10. Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Will the First Minister provide an update on the impact of the concessionary fares initiative on community transport. OAQ(4)0799(FM)*

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'r Gweinidog yn ystyried adroddiad, yn dilyn cynnal gwerthusiad o'r fenter.

The First Minister: The Minister is considering a report, following an evaluation of the initiative.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Yn 2008, gwnaeth Gweinidog trafnidiaeth Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un asesiad o docynnau rhatach, ac ar y sail honno, bu iddo ymestyn y cynllun tan 2012. Cyhoeddodd y Gweinidog trafnidiaeth presennol ym mis Rhagfyr y llynedd y byddai'n dod â'r cynllun hwnnw i ben ym mis Mawrth eleni, ond wedi imi ofyn iddo ar ba sail y gwnaeth hynny a pha asesiad a wnaed ohono, penderfynwyd gohirio hynny. Rydych yn dweud wrthyf yn awr fod asesiad pellach yn cael ei gynnal chwe mis a mwy wedi i'r Gweinidog benderfynu bod y cynllun yn dod i ben. Pa effaith y mae hynny'n ei chael ar drafnidiaeth gymunedol, a faint o'r cynlluniau hyn sydd wedi dod i ben oherwydd yr ansicrwydd hwn, wedi'i greu gan eich Llywodraeth?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: In 2008, the One Wales Government's Minister for transport carried out an assessment of concessionary fares and, on that basis, extended the scheme until 2012. The current Minister for transport announced last December that he would be bringing the scheme to an end in March of this year, but after I asked him about the basis on which he took that decision and what analysis had been undertaken, he decided to defer that. You are now telling me that a further assessment is being carried out six months and more after the Minister decided to bring the scheme to an end. What impact is that having on community transport, and how many of these schemes have been closed because of this uncertainty, created by your Government?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'r adroddiad wedi cael ei wneud, ac nid yw'n cael ei ddechrau ar hyn o bryd. Felly, bydd y Gweinidog yn ei ystyried yn fanwl, gan sicrhau y bydd penderfyniad yn cael ei wneud maes o law.

The First Minister: The report has been written, and it is not being implemented at the moment. Therefore, the Minister will give it careful consideration, ensuring that a decision is made in due course.

Byron Davies: First Minister, no-one in the Chamber would disagree that the all-Wales concessionary fares scheme has resulted in significant social benefits since its creation. In relation to people who have a severe disability, there have been pilot schemes across Wales to tackle this issue. Could you address what lessons have been learned through those pilots and what direct action you have taken since to open up access to people who have severe disabilities?

Byron Davies: Brif Weinidog, ni fyddai unrhyw un yn y Siambr yn anghytuno bod cynllun prisiau rhatach Cymru gyfan wedi arwain at fanteision cymdeithasol sylweddol ers iddo gael ei lunio. O ran pobl sydd ag anabledd difrifol, cynhaliwyd cynlluniau arbrofol ledled Cymru i fynd i'r afael â'r mater hwn. A allech chi roi sylw i'r gwersi a ddysgwyd drwy'r cynlluniau arbrofol hyn a pha gamau uniongyrchol yr ydych wedi eu cymryd ers hynny i hwyluso mynediad i bobl sydd ag anableddau difrifol?

The First Minister: As I have mentioned, these matters are being considered by the Minister at the moment, and an announcement will be made in due course.

Y Prif Weinidog: Fel yr wyf wedi crybwyll, mae'r materion hyn yn cael eu hystyried gan y Gweinidog ar hyn o bryd, a bydd cyhoeddiad yn cael ei wneud maes o law.

Cynlluniau Prentisiaeth

Apprenticeship Schemes

***11. Nick Ramsay:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog*

***11. Nick Ramsay:** Will the First Minister*

amlinellu ei gynlluniau ar gyfer cynlluniau prentisiaeth dros y 12 mis nesaf. OAQ(4)0791(FM)

outline his plans for apprenticeship schemes over the next 12 months. OAQ(4)0791(FM)

The First Minister: In addition to what the Government already had planned, there will be an additional £20 million to support apprenticeships in Wales. That additional investment will support our aim to see progression at all levels of apprenticeships and will specifically support 16 to 24-year-olds.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yn ychwanegol at yr hyn yr oedd y Llywodraeth eisoes wedi ei gynllunio, bydd swm ychwanegol o £20 miliwn i gefnogi prentisiaethau yng Nghymru. Bydd y buddsoddiad ychwanegol yn cefnogi ein nod o weld cynnydd ar bob lefel o brentisiaethau ac yn cefnogi pobl ifanc sydd rhwng 16 a 24 mlwydd oed yn benodol.

Nick Ramsay: First Minister, the Enterprise and Business Committee found that apprenticeship numbers have fallen over the years because some companies see them as a cost rather than a benefit, and many small and medium-sized enterprises in Wales find the whole process of taking on apprentices ‘complicated and confusing’. What assistance do you propose to give companies over the next 12 months to help them to see the benefits rather than the drawbacks of apprenticeship schemes?

Nick Ramsay: Brif Weinidog, canfu’r Pwyllgor Menter a Busnes fod nifer y prentisiaethau wedi gostwng dros y blynyddoedd oherwydd bod rhai cwmnïau yn eu hystyried yn gost yn hytrach na budd, ac mae mentrau bach a chanolig eu maint yng Nghymru yn gweld yr holl broses o gyflogi prentisiaid yn ‘gymhleth a dryslyd’. Pa gymorth yr ydych yn bwriadu ei roi i gwmnïau dros y 12 mis nesaf er mwyn eu helpu i weld manteision yn hytrach nag anfanteision y cynlluniau prentisiaeth?

The First Minister: The problems that were identified are the reasons why Jobs Growth Wales exists, why Pathways to Apprenticeships exists, why Skills Growth Wales exists, and why the Young Recruits programme exists. They are there to ensure that young people have the best possible access to apprenticeships in the future.

Y Prif Weinidog: Y problemau a nodwyd yw’r rhesymau pam mae Twf Swyddi Cymru yn bodoli, pam mae Llwybrau at Brentisiaethau yn bodoli, pam mae Twf Sgiliau Cymru yn bodoli, a pham y mae’r rhaglen Recriwtiaid Ifanc yn bodoli. Maent yno i sicrhau bod pobl ifanc yn cael y mynediad gorau posibl at brentisiaethau yn y dyfodol.

David Rees: The Enterprise and Business Committee also found that one barrier to the uptake of apprenticeships is the lack of awareness among school leavers of the opportunities available if they pursue an apprenticeship. What is the Welsh Government doing to increase awareness in schools at an early age, so that pupils can make informed decisions about careers and the subjects to be studied at an appropriate time?

David Rees: Canfu’r Pwyllgor Menter a Busnes hefyd mai un rhwystr i nifer y prentisiaethau yw’r diffyg ymwybyddiaeth ymhlith y rhai sy’n gadael yr ysgol o’r cyfleoedd sydd ar gael os ydynt yn dilyn prentisiaeth. Beth mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn ei wneud i gynyddu ymwybyddiaeth mewn ysgolion ar gam cynnar, fel y gall disgyblion wneud penderfyniadau gwybodus am yrfaoedd ac am y pynciau i’w hastudio ar adeg briodol?

The First Minister: This is schools’ responsibility, but we are working with schools to improve their performance in this area. For example, Careers Wales is launching an enhanced website in December this year to provide more information, and that is among

Y Prif Weinidog: Cyfrifoldeb ysgolion yw hyn, ond rydym yn gweithio gydag ysgolion i wella eu perfformiad yn y maes hwn. Er enghraifft, mae Gyrfa Cymru yn lansio gwefan well ym mis Rhagfyr eleni i ddarparu mwy o wybodaeth, ac mae hynny ymhlith

other steps being taken to ensure that young people are fully aware of the opportunities available to them.

camau eraill sy'n cael eu cymryd i sicrhau bod pobl ifanc yn gwbl ymwybodol o'r cyfleoedd sydd ar gael iddynt.

Alun Ffred Jones: Rydych wedi cyfeirio at yr arian ychwanegol, sy'n dderbyniol iawn. Er hynny, nid wyf yn siŵr a fydd y rhestr honno o gynlluniau y cyfeiriasoch atynt ond yn ychwanegu at y cymhlethdod sy'n bodoli, mewn gwirionedd. A ydych yn cytuno y bydd yr arian ychwanegol hwn yn rhoi cyfle inni ehangu cynlluniau prentisiaethau uwch yng Nghymru? Yn sicr, gallai hynny godi statws cyrsiau prentisiaeth yn gyffredinol, a gallai hefyd ddarparu sgiliau uwch i weithwyr a chwmnïau.

Alun Ffred Jones: You have referred to the additional funding, which is most welcome. However, I am not sure whether that list of schemes that you referred to serve only to add to the complexity, truth be told. Do you agree that that additional funding will give us an opportunity to expand higher-level apprenticeship schemes in Wales? That could definitely improve the standing of apprenticeship courses generally, and it could also provide staff and companies with higher-level skills.

Y Prif Weinidog: Wrth gwrs, rydym yn fodlon ystyried unrhyw gynllun sy'n ychwanegu at y cynlluniau sy'n bodoli ar hyn o bryd. Rydym yn gwneud hynny, o gofio'r cytundeb a wnaed rhwng y pleidiau sawl wythnos yn ôl. Mae'r cynlluniau hyn wedi'u targedu at grwpiau o bobl, a'r tric yw sicrhau nad oes gormod ohonynt ac nad yw pethau'n mynd yn rhy gymhleth, gan sicrhau hefyd y gall pob rhan o'r boblogaeth gael mynediad at gynllun. Dyna pam mae'r cynlluniau hyn yn bodoli ar hyn o bryd, ac rydym yn awr yn ystyried sut y dylid gwario'r £20 miliwn ychwanegol.

The First Minister: Of course, we would be willing to consider any scheme that enhances those schemes already in place at the moment. We are doing that, bearing in mind the agreement made between the parties several weeks ago. These schemes are targeted at certain groups of people, and the trick is to ensure that there are not too many of them and that they do not get too complex, while also ensuring that all parts of the population can access a scheme. That is why these schemes exist currently, and we are also now considering how the additional £20 million should be spent.

Diogelwch Cymunedol yng Nghwm Cynon

Community Safety in the Cynon Valley

12. Christine Chapman: *A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am ddull gweithredu Llywodraeth Cymru i wella diogelwch cymunedol yng Nghwm Cynon. OAQ(4)0795(FM)*

12. Christine Chapman: *Will the First Minister make a statement on the Welsh Government's approach to improving community safety in the Cynon Valley. OAQ(4)0795(FM)*

The First Minister: Yes. One of the achievements of the Government is that 369 of our 500 community support officers are already deployed or are in training. Forty-five of those will be deployed in Rhondda Cynon Taf.

Y Prif Weinidog: Gwnaf. Un o lwyddiannau'r Llywodraeth yw bod 369 o'n 500 o swyddogion cymorth cymunedol eisoes yn cael eu defnyddio neu maent mewn hyfforddiant. Bydd pump a deugain o'r rheiny yn cael eu defnyddio yn Rhondda Cynon Taf.

Christine Chapman: That is very welcome. It will make a tremendous contribution towards making communities across Wales feel safer. However, tackling the root causes of issues such as anti-social behaviour often requires the adoption of close partnership working across a

Christine Chapman: Mae hynny'n galonogol iawn. Bydd yn gwneud cyfraniad aruthrol tuag at wneud cymunedau ledled Cymru i deimlo'n fwy diogel. Fodd bynnag, mae mynd i'r afael ag achosion sylfaenol problemau fel ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol

range of agencies, such as housing associations, with their obligations to their tenants. We have Police and Communities Together meetings, but by what other means can we ensure that effective co-operation is sustained to help to ensure that our communities feel safe and secure?

yn aml yn gofyn am fabwysiadu partneriaeth gweithio agos ar draws ystod o asiantaethau, megis cymdeithasau tai, â’u rhwymedigaethau i’w tenantiaid. Rydym yn cynnal cyfarfodydd Heddlu a Chymunedau Gyda’i Gilydd, ond pa ffordd arall sydd gennym o sicrhau bod cydweithio effeithiol yn cael ei gynnal er mwyn helpu i sicrhau bod ein cymunedau yn teimlo’n ddiogel ac yn saff?

The First Minister: We work closely with the policing and community safety partnerships in Wales to ensure a joined-up approach. That needs to be done because crime prevention is equally important as the detection of crime and the resolution of criminal acts, if not more so. In addition, our officials work with the Home Office and ASB co-ordinators in Wales to ensure that the UK’s new ASB proposals will work for Wales.

Y Prif Weinidog: Rydym yn gweithio’n agos gyda’r partneriaethau heddlu a diogelwch cymunedol yng Nghymru i sicrhau dull cydgysylltiedig. Mae angen gwneud hynny gan fod atal troseddu yr un mor bwysig â datrys troseddau a datrys gweithredoedd troseddol, os nad yn bwysicach. Yn ogystal, mae ein swyddogion yn gweithio gyda’r Swyddfa Gartref a chydgysylltwyr ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol yng Nghymru i sicrhau y bydd cynigion ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol newydd y DU yn gweithio ar gyfer Cymru.

2.15 p.m.

Andrew R.T. Davies: First Minister, the Welsh Government figures released last week indicated that there is a higher degree of road traffic accidents in Wales because of drink-driving. Sadly, that has a real impact in South Wales Central. Are you confident that the messages that the Welsh Government puts out via its public health and road safety messages, working with other agencies, mean that we are getting the right message out to people that drink-driving is completely unacceptable and that it is something that deserves to be left in the annals of history as we go forward?

Andrew R.T. Davies: Brif Weinidog, mae ffigurau Llywodraeth Cymru a gyhoeddwyd yr wythnos diwethaf yn dangos bod lefel uwch o ddamweiniau traffig ar y ffyrdd yng Nghymru oherwydd yfed a gyrru. Yn anffodus, mae hynny’n cael effaith wirioneddol yng Nghanol De Cymru. A ydych chi’n ffyddiog bod y negeseuon y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn eu rhoi allan drwy ei negeseuon iechyd y cyhoedd a diogelwch ar y ffyrdd, gan weithio gydag asiantaethau eraill, yn golygu ein bod yn cyfathrebu’r neges gywir i bobl fod yfed a gyrru yn gwbl annerbyniol, a’i fod yn rhywbeth sy’n haeddu cael ei adael yn y llyfrau hanes wrth i ni symud ymlaen?

The First Minister: The leader of the opposition is right. For a number of years now, we have run campaigns in order to eliminate drink-driving. It is right to say that there has been a trend of reduction over the years, but we know that more needs to be done, which is why we will be redoubling our efforts to reduce drink-driving, particularly over the festive period.

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae arweinydd yr wrthblaid yn iawn. Am nifer o flynyddoedd bellach, rydym wedi cynnal ymgyrchoedd er mwyn dileu yfed a gyrru. Mae’n iawn i ddweud y bu tuedd o ostyngiad dros y blynyddoedd, ond rydym yn gwybod bod angen gwneud mwy, a dyna pam y byddwn yn dyblu ein hymdrechion i leihau yfed a gyrru, yn enwedig dros gyfnod y Nadolig.

Leanne Wood: First Minister, the turnout for the police commissioner elections in Rhondda Cynon Taf was 13.4%, and we know that the cost to the taxpayer for those elections was £100 million. Do you think that the low turnout supports the argument that the Welsh Government should now demand the power to scrap these unnecessary and costly commissioners by devolving criminal justice powers, including the police, to Wales, and will you be prepared to put that in your submission to part 2 of the Silk commission?

Leanne Wood: Brif Weinidog, y ganran a bleidleisiodd ar gyfer yr etholiadau comisiynydd heddlu yn Rhondda Cynon Taf oedd 13.4%, ac rydym yn gwybod bod y gost i'r trethdalwr ar gyfer yr etholiadau hynny yn £100 miliwn. A ydych chi'n meddwl bod y nifer isel yn cefnogi'r ddadl y dylai Llywodraeth Cymru bellach fynnu'r pŵer i gael gwared ar y comisiynwyr diangen a chostus hyn drwy ddatganoli pwerau cyfiawnder troseddol, gan gynnwys yr heddlu, i Gymru, ac a ydych chi'n barod i roi hynny yn eich cyflwyniad i ran 2 o gomisiwn Silk?

The First Minister: The issue of the devolution of policing is an interesting one. I am sure that all parties will be formulating their proposals for Silk part 2. It is right to say, of course, that the police are the only emergency service that is yet to be devolved.

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'r mater o ddatganoli plismona yn un diddorol. Rwyf yn siŵr y bydd pob plaid yn llunio eu cynigion ar gyfer rhan 2 Silk. Mae'n iawn i ddweud, wrth gwrs, mai'r heddlu yw'r unig wasanaeth brys sydd eto i gael ei ddatganoli.

Blaenoriaethau

Priorities

13. Andrew R.T. Davies: *A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am ei flaenoriaethau ar gyfer rhanbarth Canol De Cymru. OAQ(4)0784(FM)*

13. Andrew R.T. Davies: *Will the First Minister make a statement on his priorities for the South Wales Central region. OAQ(4)0784(FM)*

The First Minister: Yes; they are in the programme for government.

Y Prif Weinidog: Gwnaf, maent yn y rhaglen ar gyfer llywodraethu.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Thank you for that answer, First Minister. IVF services in South Wales Central are facing a particularly challenging time at the moment. Figures that I recently had from your Minister for health indicated that 150 women have been transferred to Bristol for IVF treatment, as opposed to two in the previous year. There really is pressure on IVF services in south Wales. Will you commit the Government to addressing the problem of staff shortfall and, above all, capacity shortfall, so that people who seek IVF services can have the treatment in Wales rather than have to travel great distances to seek treatment?

Andrew R.T. Davies: Diolch i chi am yr ateb yna, Brif Weinidog. Mae gwasanaethau IVF yng Nghanol De Cymru yn wynebu cyfnod arbennig o heriol ar hyn o bryd. Mae'r ffigurau a gefais yn ddiweddar gan eich Gweinidog iechyd yn dangos bod 150 o ferched wedi eu trosglwyddo i Fryste am driniaeth IVF, o'i gymharu â dwy yn y flwyddyn flaenorol. Mae pwysau gwirioneddol ar wasanaethau IVF yn ne Cymru. A wnewch chi ymrwymo'r Llywodraeth i fynd i'r afael â'r broblem o ddiffyg staff ac, yn anad dim, diffyg lleoedd, fel y gall pobl sy'n ceisio gwasanaethau IVF gael y driniaeth yng Nghymru yn hytrach na gorfod teithio'n bell iawn i gael triniaeth?

The First Minister: Yes. The leader of the opposition and I seem to be dancing somewhat of a duet in the course of this afternoon. He has asked an important question. One thing to remember, of course, is that all eligible couples

Y Prif Weinidog: Gwnaf. Mae arweinydd yr wrthblaid, a minnau yn ymddangos i fod yn dipyn o ddeuawd y prynhawn yma. Mae wedi gofyn cwestiwn pwysig. Un peth i'w gofio, wrth gwrs, yw mai dau gylchdro o driniaeth

in Wales are able to receive two cycles of IVF treatment on the national health service. There is variation in England. In terms of being offered treatment, it is true to say that some are being offered treatment in Bristol at the moment, but the intention is to improve and increase the NHS capacity in Wales in this regard.

IVF y mae'r holl barau cymwys yng Nghymru yn gallu eu cael ar y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol. Ceir amrywiaeth yn Lloegr. O ran cael cynnig triniaeth, mae'n wir i ddweud bod rhai yn cael cynnig triniaeth ym Mryste ar hyn o bryd, ond y bwriad yw gwella a chynyddu gallu'r GIG yng Nghymru yn hyn o beth.

Leanne Wood: Cardiff Council is proposing that workers will not receive sick pay for the first three days of absence. The worst affected by this are the staff of the cleansing department, who are out in all weather every day shifting 30 tonnes of our rubbish. Given that council staff have already faced three years of a pay freeze which, in real terms, is a cut, do you agree that workers should not be punished for being sick? Will you speak out against Cardiff Council's proposals, and indeed any other Labour council that may look to introduce this damaging policy?

Leanne Wood: Mae Cyngor Caerdydd yn cynnig na fydd gweithwyr yn derbyn tâl salwch ar gyfer y tri diwrnod cyntaf o absenoldeb. Y rhai yr effeithir waethaf arnynt oherwydd hyn yw staff yr adran glanhau, sydd allan ym mhob tywydd bob dydd yn symud 30 tunnell o'n sbwriel. O gofio bod staff y cyngor eisoes wedi wynebu tair blynedd o rewi cyflogau sydd, mewn termau real, yn ostyngiad, a ydych chi'n cytuno na ddylai gweithwyr gael eu cosbi am fod yn sâl? A wnewch chi siarad yn gyhoeddus yn erbyn cynigion Cyngor Caerdydd, ac yn wir unrhyw gyngor Llafur arall a allai ystyried cyflwyno'r polisi niweidiol hwn?

The First Minister: These are matters for Cardiff Council, of course, but generally, we as a Government are supportive of ensuring that people have the best terms and conditions as they work.

Y Prif Weinidog: Materion i Gyngor Caerdydd yw'r rhain, wrth gwrs, ond yn gyffredinol, rydym ni fel Llywodraeth yn gefnogol o ran sicrhau bod pobl yn cael y telerau ac amodau gorau pan eu bod yn gweithio.

Llyfr Gweddïau 1662

The 1662 Prayer Book

14. William Graham: *A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog amlinellu cynlluniau Llywodraeth Cymru i nodi 350 mlynedd ers cyhoeddi llyfr gweddïau 1662. OAQ(4)0796(FM)*

14. William Graham: *Will the First Minister outline the Welsh Government's plans to commemorate the 350th anniversary of the 1662 prayer book. OAQ(4)0796(FM)*

The First Minister: I understand that the National Library of Wales has indicated that it will be willing to exhibit a small display on the *Book of Common Prayer* to mark the anniversary.

Y Prif Weinidog: Deallaf fod y Llyfrgell Genedlaethol Cymru wedi nodi y bydd yn barod i arddangos arddangosfa fechan ar y *Llyfr Gweddi Gyffredin* i nodi'r pen-blwydd.

William Graham: Thank you for your answer, First Minister. Putting aside, perhaps, the religious and historical significance, would you not acknowledge that the consequences—perhaps unintended at the time—of the 1662 prayer book, and the subsequent objections of so many nonconformist Ministers, led to the growth of nonconformity in Wales substantially, and that that, of itself, led to an

William Graham: Diolch i chi am eich ateb Brif Weinidog. Gan roi o'r neilltu, efallai, yr arwyddocâd crefyddol a hanesyddol, oni fyddech yn cydnabod bod canlyniadau—yn anfwriadol efallai, ar y pryd—llyfr gweddi 1662 a gwrthwynebiadau dilynol cymaint o Weinidogion anghydffurfiol, wedi arwain at dwf sylweddol mewn anghydffurfiaeth yng Nghymru, a bod hynny, ynddo'i hun, wedi

enormous democratic impetus in terms of congregational government and the concept of one person one vote?

arwain at hwb democrataidd enfawr o ran llywodraeth gynulleidfaol a'r cysyniad o un person un bleidlais?

The First Minister: This takes me back to the post-restoration religious settlement. Of course, the Member will be aware that much more relevant to Wales was the publication of *Y Llyfr Gweddi Cyffredin*, which, at that time, would have been the book that most people would have understood in Wales. However, he is right to say—and there are others in the Chamber more learned in this field who will also say this—that we saw, from that time, the growth of a particular form of Anglicanism that, in turn, led to nonconformism in its many varieties.

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae hyn yn mynd â mi'n ôl at y sefydlogi crefyddol yn dilyn yr Adferiad. Wrth gwrs, bydd yr Aelod yn ymwybodol bod cyhoeddi *Y Llyfr Gweddi Cyffredin* yn llawer mwy perthnasol i Gymru, gan mai hwnnw fyddai'r llyfr yr oedd y rhan fwyaf o bobl Cymru yn ei ddeall ar y pryd. Fodd bynnag, mae'n iawn i ddweud—a bydd eraill yn y Siambr sy'n fwy dysgedig yn y maes hwn hefyd yn dweud hyn—ein bod wedi gweld, o'r adeg honno, twf math arbennig o Anglicaniaeth, a arweiniodd, yn ei dro, at anghydffurfiaeth yn ei holl amrywiaeth..

Polisïau

Policies

***15. Mohammad Asghar**: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am sut y mae polisïau Llywodraeth Cymru o fudd i bobl yn Nwyrain De Cymru. OAQ(4)0786(FM)*

***15. Mohammad Asghar:** Will the First Minister make a statement on how the Welsh Government's policies are benefiting people in South Wales East. OAQ(4)0786(FM)*

The First Minister: Yes; they are to be found in the programme for government.

Y Prif Weinidog: Gwnaf, maent i'w gweld yn y rhaglen ar gyfer llywodraethu.

Mohammad Ashgar: Thank you again for the short reply, First Minister. Your Government has set a target for 75% of people in the at-risk groups to be immunised with the flu vaccine. People aged over 65 are one of the at-risk groups. According to the latest figures, fewer than 53% of such people who live in the Aneurin Bevan Local Health Board area have been vaccinated. What is your Government doing to raise awareness of the benefits of the flu vaccination among these at-risk groups before the onset of severe winter weather?

Mohammad Ashgar: Diolch i chi unwaith eto am yr ateb byr, Brif Weinidog. Mae eich Llywodraeth wedi gosod targed, sef bod 75% o bobl yn y grwpiau sydd mewn perygl yn cael eu himiwneiddio â'r brechlyn ffliw. Mae pobl dros 65 oed yn un o'r grwpiau sydd mewn perygl. Yn ôl y ffigurau diweddaraf, mae llai na 53% o bobl o'r fath sy'n byw yn ardal Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Aneurin Bevan wedi eu brechu. Beth mae eich Llywodraeth yn ei wneud i godi ymwybyddiaeth o fanteision y brechiad rhag y ffliw ymysg y grwpiau hyn sydd mewn perygl cyn y daw tywydd caled y gaeaf?

The First Minister: I refer the Member to the answer I gave to the Member for Preseli Pembrokeshire.

Y Prif Weinidog: Cyfeiriaf yr Aelod at yr ateb a roddais i'r Aelod dros Breseli Sir Benfro.

Cwestiwn Brys
Urgent Question

Rheoliadau Cynlluniau Gostyngiadau'r Dreth Gyngor
The Council Tax Reduction Schemes Regulations

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am yr oedi cyn cyflwyno Rheoliadau Cynlluniau Gostyngiadau'r Dreth Gyngor, a'r goblygiadau posibl i bobl sy'n derbyn budd-dal y Dreth Gyngor. EAQ(4)0222(LGC)*

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: *Will the Minister make a statement on the delay in bringing forward the Council Tax Reduction Schemes Regulations, and the implications this may have for those in receipt of Council Tax benefit. EAQ(4)0222(LGC)*

The Minister for Local Government and Communities (Carl Sargeant): I issued a written statement on this matter today.

Y Gweinidog Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau (Carl Sargeant): Cyhoeddais ddatganiad ysgrifenedig ar y mater hwn heddiw.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Weinidog, rhaid imi ddweud fy mod wedi darllen eich datganiad, ac nid yw'n dweud fawr ddim wrthym.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Minister, I must say that I have read your statement, and it tells us hardly anything.

Will you accept the fact that this situation is totally unacceptable? I warned you of this situation in the spring. I told you that this was about to happen and you took no notice at that time. You have taken no steps to defend the most vulnerable and the poorest people in our communities. You are quite happy to have a stand-off with Westminster, but the people who will suffer are those who are totally dependent on these benefits. Do you accept that it is totally unacceptable for these regulations to be pushed through without the Constitutional and Legislative Affairs Committee having an opportunity to scrutinise them? Without Plenary having the opportunity to scrutinise them, how can you ensure that these regulations go through the proper, democratic process and proper scrutiny, to ensure that they are in place by 1 April?

A wnewch chi dderbyn y ffaith bod y sefyllfa hon yn gwbl annerbyniol? Fe'ch rhybuddiais am y sefyllfa hon yn y gwanwyn. Dywedais wrthych fod hyn ar fin digwydd ac ni wnaethoch gymryd dim sylw ar y pryd. Nid ydych wedi cymryd dim camau i amddiffyn y bobl dlotaf a'r rhai mwyaf agored i niwed yn ein cymunedau. Rydych yn eithaf hapus i gael anghytundeb llwyr â San Steffan, ond y bobl a fydd yn dioddef yw'r rheini sy'n gwbl ddibynnol ar y budd-daliadau hyn. A ydych yn derbyn ei bod yn gwbl annerbyniol bod y rheoliadau hyn yn cael eu gwthio drwodd heb i'r Pwyllgor Materion Cyfansoddiadol a Deddfwriaethol gael cyfle i graffu arnynt? Heb i'r Cyfarfod Llawn gael cyfle i graffu arnynt, sut y gallwch sicrhau bod y rheoliadau hyn yn mynd drwy'r broses ddemocrataidd briodol a'r craffu priodol i sicrhau eu bod yn eu lle erbyn 1 Ebrill?

Carl Sargeant: I am grateful for the Member's question. However, it is clear that the Member has no idea about the complexities of this issue at all. I am not quite sure which statement he chose to read this morning, but I believe that the statement that I placed before the Assembly is clear and concise about the issues we face in this process.

Carl Sargeant: Rwyf yn ddiolchgar am gwestiwn yr Aelod. Fodd bynnag, mae'n amlwg nad oes gan yr Aelod ddim syniad am gymhlethdodau'r mater hwn o gwbl. Nid wyf yn hollol siŵr pa ddatganiad y dewisodd ei ddarllen fore heddiw, ond credaf fod y datganiad a osodais gerbron y Cynulliad yn glir a chryno am y materion yr ydym yn eu hwynebu yn y broses hon.

Let me explain to the Member the position as

Gadewch i mi egluro i'r Aelod yr union

to exactly where we are. Over many months, the Minister for Education and Skills, the Minister for Finance and Leader of the House and I have had meetings and exchanged correspondence with Ministers from Westminster to point out the very fact that we need the financial implications, according to the reduction in the scheme, for us to place the two sets of regulations before the Assembly.

sefyllfa. Dros fisoedd lawer, mae'r Gweinidog Addysg a Sgiliau, y Gweinidog Cyllid ac Arweinydd y Tŷ a minnau wedi cael cyfarfodydd a chyfnewid gohebiaeth â Gweinidogion o San Steffan i dynnu sylw at y ffaith bod angen y goblygiadau ariannol arnom, yn unol â'r gostyngiad yn y cynllun, er mwyn i ni osod y ddwy set o reoliadau gerbron y Cynulliad.

The issue that the Member raised about the process is a matter for the Commission, and I shall comply with the Commission's request by laying the regulations when they are complete. We cannot complete or lay them until the Treasury has released the figures. Let me make it very clear for the Member: the Treasury has not informed us of the figures for the regulations.

Mater i'r Comisiwn yw'r hyn a gododd yr Aelod ynghylch y broses, a byddaf yn cydymffurfio â chais y Comisiwn drwy osod y rheoliadau pan fyddant wedi'u cwblhau'n derfynol. Ni allwn eu cwblhau na'u gosod nes bod y Trysorlys wedi rhyddhau'r ffigurau. Gadewch imi ei gwneud yn glir iawn i'r Aelod: nid yw'r Trysorlys wedi rhoi gwybod i ni am y ffigurau ar gyfer y rheoliadau.

In addition, it is clear that the Assembly has due processes in place to scrutinise the regulations, and they will be laid on 5 December, subject to our getting the finances announced in the autumn statement, albeit in the winter schedule, from the UK Government. For us to comply with that, I will issue the regulations on 5 December, subject to the timing of the announcement in Westminster. If the Assembly wishes to scrutinise the regulations between that time and Christmas, then I believe that we should recall the Assembly for us to do that.

Yn ogystal, mae'n amlwg bod gan y Cynulliad brosesau priodol ar waith i graffu ar y rheoliadau, a byddant yn cael eu gosod ar 5 Rhagfyr, yn amodol ar i ni gael y cyllid a gyhoeddwyd yn natganiad yr hydref, er mai yn amserlen y gaeaf y daw, gan Lywodraeth y DU. Er mwyn i ni gydymffurfio â hynny, byddaf yn cyhoeddi'r rheoliadau ar 5 Rhagfyr, yn amodol ar amseriad y cyhoeddiad yn San Steffan. Os bydd y Cynulliad yn dymuno craffu ar y rheoliadau rhwng yr amser hwnnw a'r Nadolig, yna credaf y dylem alw'r Cynulliad yn ôl i wneud hynny.

The Presiding Officer: I am sure, Minister, that you meant the Business Committee, and not the Commission.

Y Llywydd: Rwyf yn siŵr, Weinidog, mai'r Pwyllgor Busnes oedd gennych mewn golwg, ac nid y Comisiwn.

Carl Sargenat: Yes.

Carl Sargenat: Ie.

Janet Finch-Saunders: I welcome this urgent question. In your statement, Minister, which is quite contradictory, you talk about your disappointment with the UK Government, and yet, by your own admission, you make it clear in your statement that there has been lots of dialogue. Also, in your statement, you refer to correspondence taking place that provided you with indicative figures for Wales in May 2012.

Janet Finch-Saunders: Croesawaf y cwestiwn brys hwn. Yn eich datganiad, Weinidog, sy'n eithaf anghyson, soniwch am eich siom gyda Llywodraeth y DU, ac eto, rydych chi eich hun yn cyfaddef eich bod yn nodi'n glir yn eich datganiad y bu llawer o ddeialog. Hefyd, yn eich datganiad, rydych yn cyfeirio at ohebiaeth a ddarparodd ffigurau dangosol ichi ar gyfer Cymru ym mis Mai 2012.

The Presiding Officer: Order. Are you coming to the question? This is question time.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. A ydych yn dod at y cwestiwn? Amser cwestiynau yw hwn.

Janet Finch-Saunders: Is it not the case that this is because there has been a change in the funding, going from annually managed expenditure to the departmental expenditure limit? Would you be prepared to put a copy of the letter, which provided you with indicative figures in May of this year, in the library? Will you make that a matter of public record in the library?

Janet Finch-Saunders: Onid yw'n wir mai'r rheswm am hyn yw y bu newid yn y cyllid, yn mynd o wariant a reolir yn flynyddol i'r terfyn gwariant adrannol? A fyddech yn barod i roi copi o'r llythyr, a ddarparodd ffigurau dangosol ichi ym mis Mai eleni, yn y llyfrgell? A wnewch sicrhau bod hwnnw'n cael ei gadw fel cofnod cyhoeddus yn y llyfrgell?

Carl Sargeant: I am pleased that the Member has raised these issues. Of course, there is nothing contradictory in my statement. I was disappointed and remain disappointed that the Treasury has still not been able to announce these figures. I do not believe for a minute the Treasury does not have these numbers for us to use in the regulations. If it cared for the 330,000 families across Wales that will be relying on this funding, then the Treasury would see that it is its duty to release some figures to us today so that we can place them in regulations so that the Assembly can scrutinise these issues properly. As regards the numbers provided by the UK administration, I am hanging on to a little bit of hope because I do not believe that the UK Government could be so harsh in reducing the numbers—not to the 10% that it suggested in the first place, but the indicative numbers that it has provided us with look at a reduction of between 13% and 15%. I do not accept that and I do not think that you should either, as a responsible Member of this Assembly.

Carl Sargeant: Rwyf yn falch bod yr Aelod wedi codi'r materion hyn. Wrth gwrs, nid oes dim anghyson yn fy natganiad. Roeddwn yn siomedig ac rwyf yn siomedig o hyd bod y Trysorlys yn dal i fethu â chyhoeddi'r ffigurau hyn. Nid wyf yn credu am funud nad yw'r rhifau hyn gan y Trysorlys i ni eu defnyddio yn y rheoliadau. Pe bai'n hidio am y 330,000 o deuluoedd ledled Cymru a fydd yn dibynnu ar y cyllid hwn, byddai'r Trysorlys yn gweld bod ganddo ddyletswydd i ryddhau rhai ffigurau i ni heddiw fel y gallwn eu rhoi mewn rheoliadau fel y gall y Cynulliad graffu'n briodol ar y materion hyn. O ran y ffigurau a ddarparwyd gan weinyddiaeth y DU, mae gennyf rywfaint o obaith o hyd oherwydd nad wyf yn credu y gallai Llywodraeth y DU fod mor llym â lleihau'r ffigurau—nid i'r 10% a awgrymwyd ganddynt yn y lle cyntaf; mae'r ffigurau dangosol y maent wedi eu rhoi i ni'n awgrymu gostyngiad o rhwng 13% a 15%. Nid wyf yn derbyn hynny ac nid wyf yn meddwl y dylech chithau dderbyn hynny ychwaith, fel Aelod cyfrifol o'r Cynulliad hwn.

Peter Black: Minister, I confirm that the Welsh Liberal Democrats will do everything that we can to help you to get these regulations through. However, we do believe that they have to be properly scrutinised. Your statement today was fairly unclear as to what process you intend to use to ensure that they are in place before Christmas. Therefore, I thank you for your clarification that you are looking to have an additional meeting of the Assembly to do that. May I ask you to give some details as to when you envisage that

Peter Black: Weinidog, rwyf yn cadarnhau y bydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru'n gwneud popeth a allwn i'ch helpu i basio'r rheoliadau hyn. Fodd bynnag, rydym yn credu bod rhaid craffu'n briodol arnynt. Roedd eich datganiad heddiw'n eithaf aneglur ynghylch pa broses y bwriadwch ei defnyddio i sicrhau eu bod ar waith cyn y Nadolig. Felly, hoffwn ddiolch i chi am eich eglurhad eich bod yn gobeithio cael cyfarfod ychwanegol o'r Cynulliad i wneud hynny. A gaf ofyn i chi roi rhai manylion ynghylch pa

additional meeting taking place and whether you will be seeking to convene a meeting of the Constitutional and Legislative Affairs Committee to ensure that there is proper scrutiny of these regulations before they are passed?

bryd yr ydych yn rhagweld y cynhelir y cyfarfod ychwanegol hwnnw ac a ydych yn bwriadu cynnal cyfarfod o'r Pwyllgor Materion Cyfansoddiadol a Deddfwriaethol er mwyn sicrhau bod craffu priodol ar y rheoliadau hyn cyn iddynt gael eu pasio?

The Presiding Officer: Order. Any decision regarding a meeting of the Assembly is down to the Presiding Officer, not the Minister.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Lle'r Llywydd yw gwneud penderfyniadau ynglŷn â chynnal cyfarfod o'r Cynulliad, nid lle'r Gweinidog.

Carl Sargeant: I am grateful for the Member's contribution and his support as we try to clarify the issues of creating a scheme for those people who would be most at risk as a result of not passing the regulations and therefore not having a scheme in place. The Member may be aware that I have written to the chair of the Constitutional and Legislative Affairs Committee and the chair of the Communities, Equality and Local Government Committee in order to pursue this. The reality is that we never wanted this scheme, but it was passported—and the risk was passported—from the UK level to Wales. We have to deal with that accordingly. The recalling of the Assembly to scrutinise the regulations will be a matter for the Presiding Officer and the Business Committee. However, my department and I will do whatever we can to release the regulations—though the format will probably not include the numbers allocated for the reduction; the most important number—in order for the appropriate committees to scrutinise the general detail of the regulations.

Carl Sargeant: Rwyf yn ddiolchgar am gyfraniad yr Aelod a'i gefnogaeth, wrth i ni geisio sicrhau bod y materion dan sylw'n eglur er mwyn creu cynllun ar gyfer y bobl hynny a fyddai yn y perygl mwyaf o ganlyniad i beidio â phasio'r rheoliadau ac felly o fod mewn sefyllfa lle nad oes cynllun ar waith. Hwyrach fod yr Aelod yn ymwybodol fy mod wedi ysgrifennu at gadeirydd y Pwyllgor Materion Cyfansoddiadol a Deddfwriaethol a chadeirydd y Pwyllgor Cymunedau, Cydraddoldeb a Llywodraeth Leol er mwyn mynd ar drywydd hyn. Y realiti yw nad oedd arnom eisiau'r cynllun hwn o gwbl. Cafodd ei basio—a chafodd y risg ei phasio—o lefel y DU i Gymru. Mae'n rhaid i ni ymdrin â'r mater yn unol â hynny. Mater i'r Llywydd a'r Pwyllgor Busnes fydd galw'r Cynulliad yn ôl i graffu ar y rheoliadau. Fodd bynnag, bydd fy adran a minnau'n gwneud popeth yn ein gallu i ryddhau'r rheoliadau—er na fydd y fformat yn ôl pob tebyg yn cynnwys y ffigurau a ddyrannwyd ar gyfer y gostyngiad, sef y rhif pwysicaf—er mwyn i'r pwyllgorau priodol graffu ar fanylion cyffredinol y rheoliadau.

Simon Thomas: Minister, could you help me to answer an inquiry from one of my constituents, Graham Thompson of Newcastle Emlyn, who asks what is going to happen to his council tax benefit as he is in receipt of pensioner credit? If I represented that constituent in, say, Haringey, I would be able to give him an answer today that his benefit would not be affected because the English regulations are being consulted upon and Haringey council has consulted on its local regulations. If he lived in Scotland, I could give him an answer today. He lives in Wales and I cannot give him an answer today. Can you give him an answer today,

Simon Thomas: Weinidog, a allech fy helpu i ateb ymholiad gan un o'm hetholwyr, Graham Thompson o Gastellnewydd Emlyn, sy'n gofyn beth sy'n mynd i ddigwydd i'w fudd-dal treth gyngor gan ei fod yn derbyn credyd pensiwn? Pe bawn yn cynrychioli'r etholwr hwnnw yn Haringey, dyweder, gallwn roi ateb iddo heddiw na fyddai effaith ar ei fudd-dal oherwydd bod y rheoliadau yn Lloegr yn destun ymgynghoriad a bod cyngor Haringey wedi ymgynghori ar eu rheoliadau lleol. Pe bai'n byw yn yr Alban, gallwn roi ateb iddo heddiw. Mae'n byw yng Nghymru, ac ni allaf roi ateb iddo heddiw. A allwch chi roi ateb iddo heddiw, Weinidog? Pam yr

Minister? Why are you so tardy in bringing forward this legislation? Is it incompetence or do you just want to pick a fight with Westminster?

ydych mor araf wrth gyflwyno'r ddeddfwriaeth hon? Ai anallu ydyw, ynteu dim ond mater o fod am gael ffrae â San Steffan?

Carl Sargeant: To be fair, that was a poor attack as regards taking forward the proposal to protect 330,000 families across Wales. It is really important to this Government to ensure that wherever you are in Wales, this will not be a postcode lottery as it is in England. If you live in Herefordshire or Cheshire, you do not know whether you will be receiving council tax benefits with regard to your personal circumstances. The only people in England who are protected are pensioners. Any other protection, for any other vulnerable groups, is the councils' decision. In Wales, it will be consistent, and will deliver to the most vulnerable in our communities. What is important is that the regulations are being held up by the UK Government's failure to let us know about the reduction in the figures. I hope that the Member can put party-political points behind him and support the most important thing, namely the regulations, when we bring them forward in December.

Carl Sargeant: I fod yn deg, roedd hwnnw'n ymosodiad gwael o ran bwrw ymlaen â'r cynnig i ddiogelu 330,000 o deuluoedd ar draws Cymru. Mae'n wirioneddol bwysig i'r Llywodraeth hon i sicrhau, lle bynnag yr ydych yng Nghymru, na fydd hyn yn loteri cod post fel y mae yn Lloegr. Os ydych yn byw yn Swydd Henffordd neu Swydd Gaer, nid ydych yn gwybod a fyddwch yn derbyn budd-daliadau treth gyngor oherwydd eich amgylchiadau personol. Yr unig bobl yn Lloegr sydd wedi'u gwarchod yw pensiynwyr. Y cynghorau fydd yn penderfynu a ydynt am warchod unrhyw grwpiau eraill sy'n agored i niwed. Yng Nghymru, bydd yn gyson, a bydd yn cynorthwyo'r bobl fwyaf agored i niwed yn ein cymunedau. Y pwynt pwysig yw mai methiant Llywodraeth y DU i roi gwybod i ni am y gostyngiad yn y ffigurau sy'n dal y rheoliadau'n ôl. Rwy'n gobeithio y gall yr Aelod anghofio pwyntiau pleidiol a chefnogi'r peth pwysicaf, sef y rheoliadau, pan fyddwn yn eu cyflwyno ym mis Rhagfyr.

2.30 p.m.

Cwestiwn Brys
Urgent Question

Colli Swyddi yn Tata Steel
Tata Steel Job Losses

***Byron Davies:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am golli 580 o swyddi yn Tata Steel yn Ne Cymru. EAQ(4)00198(BET)*

***Byron Davies:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the 580 Tata steel job losses in South Wales. EAQ(4)0198(BET)*

The First Minister: This is clearly disappointing news, and is a great blow to those who will be losing their jobs. There is a hope that many of these redundancies, if not most of them, will be met through voluntary redundancy—that is the aim. We also know that Tata's investment plans for Wales remain on track. The fact that it is looking to relight blast furnace 4 at Port Talbot and to restart the hot mill at Llanwern illustrates the company's continued commitment to its

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae hyn yn amlwg yn newyddion siomedig, ac yn ergyd fawr i'r rhai a fydd yn colli eu swyddi. Mae gobaith y caiff llawer o'r diswyddiadau, os nad y rhan fwyaf ohonynt, eu cyflawni drwy ddiswyddo gwirfoddol—dyna'r nod. Rydym hefyd yn gwybod bod cynlluniau buddsoddi Tata ar gyfer Cymru yn parhau ar y trywydd iawn. Mae'r ffaith eu bod yn bwriadu ailgynnau ffwrnais chwyth 4 ym Mhort Talbot ac ailgychwyn y felin boeth yn Llanwern yn

Welsh workforce. It is difficult news, but, as far as Tata is concerned, it is still investing in Wales, and still sees a good future for the Welsh steel industry.

dangos ymrwymiad parhaus y cwmni i'w weithlu yng Nghymru. Mae'n newyddion anodd, ond o safbwynt Tata, maent yn dal i fuddsoddi yng Nghymru, ac yn dal i weld dyfodol da i ddiwydiant dur Cymru.

Byron Davies: I share your deep concern about the job losses, and sincerely hope that they can be met through voluntary arrangements. You said on 24 April, in response to Andrew R.T. Davies, that you welcomed the news of an investment of £800 million from the Tata board, and that Tata was extremely happy with the relationship that it has with you; indeed, you went to Mumbai to discuss the future of Tata Steel in Wales. Given this relationship, what discussions have you had with Tata since the announced job cuts, and were you pre-warned of these losses? Furthermore, are you able to, and will you, outline what exactly the £800 million will be spent on, and are you aware of any further job losses in Wales from Tata Steel?

Byron Davies: Rwyf yn rhannu eich pryder dwfn ynghylch y swyddi a gollwyd, ac yn mawr obeithio y gellir eu cyflawni drwy drefniadau gwirfoddol. Dywedoch ar 24 Ebrill, mewn ymateb i Andrew R.T. Davies, eich bod yn croesawu'r newyddion o fuddsoddiad o £800 miliwn gan fwrdd Tata, a bod Tata yn hapus iawn gyda'r berthynas sydd ganddynt gyda chi; yn wir, aethoch i Mumbai i drafod dyfodol Tata Steel yng Nghymru. O ystyried y berthynas hon, pa drafodaethau yr ydych wedi'u cael â Tata ers y cyhoeddiad y bydd y swyddi'n cael eu colli, ac a gawsoch eich rhybuddio ymlaen llaw am y colledion hyn? Ar ben hynny, a allwch, ac a wnewch, amlinellu beth yn union y caiff yr £800 ei wario arno, ac a ydych yn ymwybodol o unrhyw golledion swyddi pellach yng Nghymru o Tata Steel?

The First Minister: I was pre-warned of the job losses. I am not aware of any further job losses in Wales. I know that Tata has reiterated its commitment to the £800 million investment, and blast furnace 4 is part of that. The commitment to restarting the hot mill at Llanwern also forms part of its investment programme.

Y Prif Weinidog: Cefais fy rhybuddio ymlaen llaw am y colledion swyddi. Nid wyf yn ymwybodol o unrhyw swyddi eraill a fydd yn cael eu colli yng Nghymru. Gwn fod Tata wedi ailadrodd eu hymrwymiad i fuddsoddi £800 miliwn, a bod ffwrnais chwyth 4 yn rhan o hynny. Mae'r ymrwymiad i ailgychwyn y felin boeth yn Llanwern hefyd yn rhan o'u rhaglen fuddsoddi.

David Rees: As someone who has lived all his life in this steel town, and has seen the steelworks ever since I can remember, and have seen it develop, I am fully aware of the importance to this town, economically, of the wellbeing of Port Talbot steelworks. I know of the impact of the devastating news from Tata last week of these job losses, and its impact on people and families in our communities, who will suffer as a consequence. We might wish that many of these redundancies will be voluntary, but some, unfortunately, will not. What action has the Welsh Government taken to put support into place for those individuals, and how will ReAct and the third sector be used in that support?

David Rees: Fel rhywun sydd wedi byw ar hyd ei fywyd yn y dref ddur hon, ac sydd wedi gweld y gwaith dur ers y gallaf gofio, ac sydd wedi ei weld yn datblygu, rwyf yn llwyr ymwybodol o bwysigrwydd economaidd lles gwaith dur Port Talbot i'r dref hon. Gwn am effaith y newyddion trist a ddaeth yr wythnos diwethaf gan Tata y bydd y swyddi hyn yn cael eu colli, ac am ei effaith ar bobl a theuluoedd yn ein cymunedau, a fydd yn dioddef o ganlyniad. Gallwn obeithio y bydd llawer o'r diswyddiadau hyn yn wirfoddol, ond, yn anffodus, ni fydd hynny'n wir am bob un. Pa gamau y mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi'u cymryd i roi cymorth ar waith ar gyfer yr unigolion hynny, a sut y defnyddir ReAct a'r trydydd sector yn y gefnogaeth honno?

The First Minister: We are setting up a task and finish group with Tata, which, I must say, has always shown us an open hand with regard to its future plans. It is well known that there are difficulties in the European steel industry. Much of that is to do with the suppression of demand for steel in China; Chinese industry tends to consume so much steel that it affects the price. At present, China is not growing at the rate that it used to. However, I welcome Tata's commitment to the Welsh steel industry, notwithstanding the fact that these jobs are being lost. However, with the investment that Tata is providing, and is committed to providing in the future, I believe that the Welsh steel industry stands a good chance of turning the corner.

Y Prif Weinidog: Rydym yn sefydlu grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen gyda Tata. Rhaid i mi ddweud eu bod bob amser wedi bod yn agored gyda ni ynglŷn â'u cynlluniau i'r dyfodol. Mae'n hysbys iawn y ceir anawsterau yn y diwydiant dur Ewropeaidd. Mae llawer o hynny'n ymwneud â'r lleihad mewn galw am ddur yn Tsieina; mae diwydiant Tsieina'n tueddu i ddefnyddio cymaint o ddur nes ei fod yn effeithio ar y pris. Ar hyn o bryd, nid yw Tsieina yn tyfu ar y raddfa yr arferai wneud. Fodd bynnag, croesawaf ymrwymiad Tata i'r diwydiant dur yng Nghymru, er gwaethaf y ffaith bod y swyddi hyn yn cael eu colli. Fodd bynnag, gyda'r buddsoddiad y mae Tata yn ei ddarparu, ac y mae wedi ymrwymo i'w ddarparu yn y dyfodol, credaf fod gan ddiwydiant dur Cymru siawns dda o droi'r gornel.

Alun Ffred Jones: This is obviously disastrous news for those families that will be affected. You mentioned the situation in China affecting the whole marketplace. Has Tata indicated that, given the extra money that it proposes to invest in Wales, new jobs will be created as a result?

Alun Ffred Jones: Mae hyn yn amlwg yn newyddion trychinebus i'r teuluoedd hynny yr effeithir arnynt. Fe wnaethoch sôn am y sefyllfa yn Tsieina sy'n effeithio ar y farchnad gyfan. A yw Tata wedi dynodi y caiff swyddi newydd eu creu o ganlyniad i'r arian ychwanegol y maent yn bwriadu ei fuddsoddi yng Nghymru?

The First Minister: You must bear in mind that new jobs are being created, even on the back of this announcement. When we talk about the job losses, we are taking about net job losses. However, it is right to say that, when blast furnace 4 is up and running, that will greatly help Port Talbot in terms of making it competitive in the future. The company has indicated that much to me.

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'n rhaid i chi gofio bod swyddi newydd yn cael eu creu, er gwaethaf y cyhoeddiad hwn. Pan fyddwn yn sôn am y colledion swyddi, rydym yn sôn am nifer net y swyddi a gollir. Fodd bynnag, mae'n deg dweud, pan fydd ffwrnais chwyth 4 yn weithredol, y bydd hynny o gymorth mawr i wneud Port Talbot yn gystadleuol yn y dyfodol. Mae'r cwmni wedi dynodi cymaint â hynny wrthyf.

Peter Black: I join other Members in regretting the impact of these job losses on the families concerned. This is a huge body blow for Port Talbot in terms of the effect on the economy and the personal impact on those whose jobs will be lost. First Minister, you mentioned the taskforce that is being set up with the Government and Tata Steel; can you confirm that the local authority will be involved, as well as other agencies that might have a concern?

Peter Black: Ymunaf ag Aelodau eraill yn gresynu at effaith y colledion swyddi hyn ar y teuluoedd dan sylw. Mae hon yn ergyd enfawr i Bort Talbot o ran yr effaith ar yr economi a'r effaith bersonol ar y rhai a fydd yn colli eu swyddi. Brif Weinidog, fe wnaethoch sôn am y tasglu sy'n cael ei sefydlu gyda'r Llywodraeth a Tata Steel; a allwch gadarnhau y caiff yr awdurdod lleol ei gynnwys, yn ogystal ag asiantaethau eraill a allai fod â diddordeb?

The First Minister: Yes. We will seek to involve the local authority where we can. I

Y Prif Weinidog: Gallaf. Byddwn yn ceisio cynnwys yr awdurdod lleol lle y gallwn.

have to flag-up an issue that is flagged up not just by Tata but by other energy-intensive industries as well, namely the cost of energy in the UK. It is a continual, weekly issue in terms of what businesses are saying to me. I have made numerous representations to the UK Government so that this is dealt with. These are matters that I have discussed with Vince Cable, but, in the medium to long term, if energy costs persist as they are, the UK will simply become far less competitive when it comes to energy-intensive industries.

Rhaid i mi dynnu sylw at fater y rhoddwyd sylw iddo nid yn unig gan Tata, ond gan ddiwydiannau eraill sy'n defnyddio llawer o ynni hefyd, sef cost ynni yn y DU. Mae'n fater y mae busnesau yn ei godi gyda mi'n barhaus, bob wythnos. Rwyf wedi cyflwyno nifer o sylwadau i Lywodraeth y DU er mwyn iddynt ymdrin â hyn. Rwyf wedi trafod y materion hyn gyda Vince Cable, ond, yn y tymor canolig i'r tymor hir, os bydd costau ynni yn parhau fel y maent, bydd y DU yn dod yn llawer llai cystadleuol o ran diwydiannau sy'n defnyddio llawer o ynni.

Cwestiwn Brys
Urgent Question

Cau Ffyrdd oherwydd Llifogydd yn y Gogledd
Road Closures due to Flooding in North Wales

Aled Roberts: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ffyrdd sydd wedi'u cau yn ddiweddar oherwydd llifogydd yng Ngogledd Cymru. EAQ(4)0223(LGC)*

Aled Roberts: *Will the Minister make a statement on recent road closures caused by flooding in North Wales. EAQ(4)0223(LGC)*

Rwy'n siŵr ein bod i gyd yn cydymdeimlo â'r teuluoedd hynny sydd wedi dioddef oherwydd y llifogydd yn y gogledd.

I am sure that we all sympathise with those families that have suffered because of the flooding in north Wales.

The Minister for Local Government and Communities (Carl Sargeant): An extreme amount of rain has fallen in the last week, exceeding at times the capacity of the highway drainage system. My officials will review the issues and urgently investigate whether improved drainage on the A55 could prevent similar occurrences in the future.

Y Gweinidog Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau (Carl Sargeant): Mae swm eithafol o law wedi disgyn yn ystod yr wythnos ddiwethaf, a hynny ar adegau'n drech na gallu'r system draenio priffyrdd. Bydd fy swyddogion yn adolygu'r materion dan sylw ac yn ymchwilio ar frys i weld a allai gwell draenio ar yr A55 atal digwyddiadau tebyg yn y dyfodol.

Aled Roberts: I welcome the announcement that you made on Friday with regard to the A55, but other A roads, which were diversionary routes for the A55, were also closed. Are you confident that the resilience plans put in place following the floods in 2000 are modelled to deal with the level of sustained rainfall that we have experienced in recent weeks?

Aled Roberts: Croesawaf y cyhoeddiad a wnaethoch ddydd Gwener am yr A55, ond cafodd ffyrdd A eraill, a oedd yn ffyrdd dargyfeiriol ar gyfer yr A55, eu cau hefyd. A ydych yn ffyddiog bod y cynlluniau a roddwyd ar waith ar ôl llifogydd 2000 wedi'u modelu i ymdopi â lefel y glaw parhaus yr ydym wedi ei brofi yn ystod yr wythnosau diwethaf?

Carl Sargeant: The Member raises an important issue and I recognise his comments in terms of the families and businesses that have been affected by the recent flooding

Carl Sargeant: Mae'r Aelod yn codi mater pwysig, ac rwyf yn cydnabod ei sylwadau ynglŷn â'r teuluoedd a'r busnesau y mae'r llifogydd diweddar wedi effeithio arnynt.

activity. It is always a difficult exercise in terms of resilience and trying to understand what the weather is going to throw at us. We do various desk-top exercises with many agencies to try to keep abreast of what issues might be thrown up. As I said in the earlier contribution, the extreme rain that we have had has put pressure on the systems of the A55 and we believe that the having the A5 option open at the time was a right and appropriate measure for diverting traffic from the A55. Regrettably, an accident occurred on that road due to the rain, blocking the A5 and the A55. This is certainly not a position with which I am comfortable. That is why I have tasked my team to look at other options and opportunities in order to try to plan for future events that might occur. Of course, we are in the lap of the gods in terms of what weather conditions are sent to us, but we will do our best, working with emergency teams to ensure that we have continuity of business planning across the A55 and, in fact, across Wales.

Mae bob amser yn anodd gwrthsefyll yr hyn y mae'r tywydd yn mynd i'w daflu atom a cheisio ei ddeall. Rydym yn gwneud gwahanol ymarferion desg gyda nifer o asiantaethau i geisio bod yn ymwybodol o'r materion a allai godi. Fel y dywedais yn y cyfraniad cynharach, mae'r glaw eithafol a gawsom wedi rhoi pwysau ar systemau'r A55 ac rydym yn credu mai'r dewis o ddefnyddio'r A5 ar y pryd oedd y cam cywir a phriodol ar gyfer dargyfeirio traffig oddi ar yr A55. Yn anffodus, digwyddodd damwain ar y ffordd honno oherwydd y glaw, gan flocio'r A5 a'r A55. Yn sicr, nid wyf yn gyfforddus â'r sefyllfa hon. Dyna pam yr wyf wedi gofyn i'm tîm edrych ar opsiynau a chyfleoedd eraill er mwyn ceisio cynllunio ar gyfer digwyddiadau posibl yn y dyfodol. Wrth gwrs, rydym yn nwylo'r duwiau o ran pa dywydd a gawn, ond gwnawn ein gorau, gan gydweithio â thimau brys i sicrhau parhad ym maes cynllunio busnes ar draws yr A55, ac, yn wir, ar draws Cymru.

Ann Jones: May I also raise the issue of the terrible floods around St Asaph at the moment and the devastation that has been caused to the community there? We have just heard that somebody lost their life in St Asaph due to these floods, and I think that we would all want to send our condolences to the family concerned. I want to praise the dedication and professionalism of some of my former colleagues and those within the agencies that are working at St Asaph. If you look at the photographs being broadcast from St Asaph, you will see the devastation that has been caused. It will take a long time for those communities to recover. I believe that volunteers from charities such as the Royal National Lifeboat Institution and the British Red Cross are doing sterling work there. I seek an assurance from you today, Minister, that it will be possible to put the Bellwin scheme into practice now, so that the core funding of those agencies that have to put extensive resources into communities such as St Asaph will not suffer in future years. I seek an assurance that we will deal with this in the professional and dedicated manner that people will expect from us and that we will get those communities back working again. Can you assure me that the Bellwin scheme can be looked at?

Ann Jones: A gaf hefyd godi mater y llifogydd ofnadwy o amgylch Llanelwy ar hyn o bryd a'r dinistr a achoswyd i'r gymuned yno? Rydym newydd glywed bod rhywun wedi colli eu bywyd yn Llanelwy oherwydd y llifogydd, a chredaf y byddem i gyd yn awyddus i anfon ein cydymdeimlad at y teulu dan sylw. Hoffwn ganmol ymroddiad ac agwedd broffesiynol rhai o'm cyn-gydweithwyr a'r rhai yn yr asiantaethau sy'n gweithio yn Llanelwy. Os edrychwch ar y lluniau sy'n cael eu darlledu o Lanelwy, fe welwch y dinistr a achoswyd. Bydd yn cymryd amser maith i'r cymunedau hynny ddod atynt eu hunain. Credaf fod gwirfoddolwyr o elusennau megis Sefydliad Cenedlaethol Brenhinol y Badau Achub a'r Groes Goch Brydeinig yn gwneud gwaith ardderchog yno. Gofynnaf am sicrwydd gennych heddiw, Weinidog, y bydd modd rhoi'r cynllun Bellwin ar waith yn awr, fel na fydd arian craidd yr asiantaethau hynny sy'n gorfod rhoi adnoddau helaeth i gymunedau fel Llanelwy'n dioddef yn y dyfodol. Gofynnaf am sicrwydd y byddwn yn delio â hyn yn y modd proffesiynol ac ymroddedig y bydd pobl yn ei ddisgwyl gennym ac y byddwn yn codi'r cymunedau hynny'n ôl ar eu traed. A allwch fy sicrhau y gellir edrych ar gynllun Bellwin?

Carl Sargeant: I am grateful to the Member for her question and for updating me this morning on issues in her constituency and surrounding area. I also pay tribute to the personnel out there, both in the public sector and the voluntary sector. Members of the public have been extremely brave in their actions in tackling some of these issues. The key element of the Member's question was around the Bellwin scheme. That has been in operation in the past and I will give it some further consideration. There is no budget line for the Bellwin scheme; it has to be found within the current local government budget, but, subject to application and consideration, and in terms of the effects of the flooding in north Wales, it is something that my department will look at.

Carl Sargeant: Rwyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Aelod am ei chwestiwn ac am roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf imi fore heddiw am faterion yn ei hetholaeth a'r ardal gyfagos. Talaf deyrnged hefyd i'r personél yn yr ardaloedd hynny, yn y sector cyhoeddus a'r sector gwirfoddol. Mae aelodau'r cyhoedd wedi bod yn hynod ddewr wrth fynd i'r afael â rhai o'r materion hyn. Roedd elfen allweddol cwestiwn yr Aelod yn ymwneud â chynllun Bellwin. Mae hwnnw wedi bod ar waith yn y gorffennol a byddaf yn rhoi rhywfaint o ystyriaeth bellach iddo. Nid oes llinell gyllideb ar gyfer y cynllun Bellwin; rhaid dod o hyd i'r arian yn y gyllideb bresennol ar gyfer llywodraeth leol, ond, yn amodol ar gais ac ystyriaeth, ac o ran effaith y llifogydd yn y gogledd, mae'n rhywbeth y bydd fy adran yn edrych arno.

Antoinette Sandbach: Minister, I am sure that you will be aware that a great many communities were cut off as a result of the floods. Aled Roberts has already referred to A roads, other than the A55, that were affected by the recent floods. This causes particular problems in relation to the health service. I am sure that the Minister is aware of the letter from Mary Burrows in relation to access effectively being cut off, east and west. Clearly, in view of the proposal to move the neonatal unit over the border to England, that would have effectively denied anyone living in the west of the region access to those services. I want to ask about your contingency planning in relation to four-wheel-drive ambulances, because many of these roads were only passable in four-wheel-drive vehicles. What support has been given by the Welsh mountain rescue services, of which there are a number? There are concerns that a lot of communities were completely cut off and, without such vehicles, were not able to get help at the point that it was needed.

Antoinette Sandbach: Weinidog, rwyf yn siŵr y byddwch yn ymwybodol bod nifer fawr o gymunedau wedi'u hynysu o ganlyniad i'r llifogydd. Mae Aled Roberts eisoes wedi cyfeirio at ffyrdd A, heblaw am yr A55, yr effeithiodd y llifogydd diweddar arnynt. Mae hyn yn achosi problemau penodol o ran y gwasanaeth iechyd. Rwyf yn siŵr bod y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol o'r llythyr oddi wrth Mary Burrows ynglŷn â chael ei hynysu i bob diben, o'r dwyrain a'r gorllewin. Yn amlwg, o ystyried y cynnig i symud yr uned newydd-anedig dros y ffin i Loegr, byddai hynny i bob diben wedi atal unrhyw un sy'n byw yng ngorllewin y rhanbarth rhag defnyddio'r gwasanaethau hynny. Hoffwn ofyn am eich cynlluniau wrth gefn o ran ambiwlansys gyriant pedair olwyn, oherwydd bod angen cerbydau gyriant pedair olwyn i yrru ar lawer o'r ffyrdd hyn. Pa gefnogaeth a roddwyd gan wasanaethau achub mynydd Cymru? Ceir nifer ohonynt. Mae pryderon bod llawer o gymunedau wedi'u hynysu'n gyfan gwbl a, heb gerbydau o'r fath, nad oeddent yn gallu cael cymorth pan oedd ei angen.

Carl Sargeant: I share many Members' concerns about access around the trunk road network and also the A roads, but the responsibility for me lies with the trunk road agency. It goes without saying that I have to work very closely with local authorities to

Carl Sargeant: Rwyf yn rhannu pryderon llawer o Aelodau ynglŷn â mynediad at y rhwydwaith cefnffyrdd yn ogystal â'r ffyrdd A, ond i mi, cyfrifoldeb yr asiantaeth cefnffyrdd ydyw. Yn amlwg, rhaid i mi gydweithio'n agos iawn ag awdurdodau lleol

maintain resilience routes. I am aware of the letter sent by the health board with regard to continuity of service, and again, it is something on which I have had discussions with the Minister for Health and Social Services, to ensure that we tackle these issues head on and look at lessons learned. The Member will be aware that the demography of north Wales means that they are the only two routes currently available for traffic and we have to look very closely at what resilience means. As I said earlier to Aled Roberts, I have tasked my team with looking predominantly at the A55 and the pinch points of flooding. We set this in train before this weekend, during the last flooding event on the A55, when I asked my team to look at this very closely. We will do everything that we can to try to stop this happening again.

i gynnal llwybrau mynediad. Rwyf yn ymwybodol o'r llythyr a anfonwyd gan y bwrdd iechyd o ran parhad gwasanaeth, ac unwaith eto, mae'n rhywbeth yr wyf wedi ei drafod gyda'r Gweinidog Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, er mwyn sicrhau ein bod yn mynd i'r afael â'r materion hyn yn uniongyrchol ac yn edrych ar y gwersi a ddysgwyd. Bydd yr Aelod yn ymwybodol bod demograffeg y gogledd yn golygu mai dyma'r unig ddwy ffordd sydd ar gael i draffig ar hyn o bryd, a rhaid i ni edrych yn ofalus iawn ar yr hyn sydd ei angen er mwyn gallu gwrthsefyll llifogydd. Fel y dywedais yn gynharach wrth Aled Roberts, rwyf wedi gofyn i'm tîm edrych yn bennaf ar yr A55 a'r mannau lle y mae problemau'n debygol o godi pa fydd llifogydd. Dechreuwyd hyn cyn y penwythnos hwn, yn ystod y llifogydd diwethaf ar yr A55, pan ofynnais i'm tîm edrych yn ofalus iawn ar hyn. Byddwn yn gwneud popeth a allwn i geisio atal hyn rhag digwydd eto.

With regard to the need for joint working with 4x4 vehicles, as I mentioned to the Member last week, I chair the resilience forum and have asked the resilience team to look at all agencies across the public sector, including the armed forces, to see what vehicles may or may not be available for use in difficult weather conditions, including flooding. The use of 4x4 vehicles is key in that.

O ran yr angen i weithio ar y cyd gyda cherbydau 4x4, fel y soniais wrth yr Aelod yr wythnos ddiwethaf, fi yw cadeirydd y fforwm Cymru Gydnewrth ac rwyf wedi gofyn i'r tîm cydnerthedd edrych ar yr holl asiantaethau ar draws y sector cyhoeddus, gan gynnwys y lluoedd arfog, i weld pa gerbydau a all fod ar gael i'w defnyddio mewn tywydd garw, gan gynnwys llifogydd. Mae defnyddio cerbydau 4x4 yn allweddol yn hynny o beth.

Alun Ffred Jones: Roedd y glaw ddydd Iau diwethaf yn anarferol iawn, hyd yn oed i'r gogledd, ac ni allwch, er gwaethaf eich holl bwerau, Weinidog, wneud dim am y glaw. Fodd bynnag, mae'r sefyllfa ger y fynedfa i Dalybont ar yr A55 yn ddifrifol iawn, ac mae'r ffordd yn cau yn y fan honno nid unwaith y flwyddyn, ond tua dwy neu dair gwaith y flwyddyn. Mae hynny'n creu trafferthion i weithwyr sy'n teithio i'w gwaith ac yn ôl ac mae lle i gredu bod y dŵr sy'n crynhoi ger y fynedfa honno wedi effeithio'n uniongyrchol ar bentref Talybont, gan achosi llifogydd mewn tua 20 o adeiladau yn y pentref hwnnw. Gofynnaf i chi edrych yn fanwl, ac ar frys, ar yr union fan honno, gan gofio bod cynllun i

Alun Ffred Jones: The rain last Thursday was very unusual, even for north Wales, and, despite all your powers, Minister, you cannot do anything about the rain. However, the situation by the junction for Talybont on the A55 is very serious, and the road there closes not once a year but two or three times a year. That creates difficulties for those travelling to and from work and there is room to believe that the water that collected there had a direct impact on the village of Talybont, leading to flooding in about 20 buildings in the village. I ask you to look in detail, as a matter of urgency, at the situation there, bearing in mind that there is a scheme to upgrade the A55 along that stretch. Will you, therefore, consider bringing that scheme forward?

uwchraddio ffordd yr A55 ar hyd y rhan honno. A wnewch chi, felly, ystyried dod â'r cynllun hwnnw yn ei flaen?

2.45 p.m.

Carl Sargeant: I thank the Member for his question. Despite what many Members have said in their contributions, we are making significant investments in the A55 around resilience and safety, and we will continue to do that. I will look closely at the areas that the Member mentioned and, as I said earlier in my response to another Member, the flooding in certain areas is a cause for concern and I have tasked my team to look at this specifically in order to have continuity of service for the future.

Carl Sargeant: Diolch i'r Aelod am ei gwestiwn. Er gwaethaf yr hyn y mae llawer o Aelodau wedi'i ddweud yn eu cyfraniadau, rydym yn buddsoddi'n sylweddol yn yr A55 ym maes cydnerthedd a diogelwch, a byddwn yn parhau i wneud hynny. Byddaf yn edrych yn fanwl ar yr ardaloedd a enwodd yr Aelod., Fel y dywedais yn gynharach yn fy ymateb i Aelod arall, mae'r llifogydd mewn ardaloedd penodol yn destun pryder, ac rwyf wedi gofyn i'm tîm edrych ar hyn yn benodol er mwyn sicrhau parhad y gwasanaeth yn y dyfodol.

Darren Millar: I also want to take this opportunity to pay tribute to the response by the emergency services and to Environment Agency Wales, which provided me with a helpful briefing today about the flooding in my constituency, not to mention the hard work being undertaken by Denbighshire County Council and Conwy County Borough Council in my patch.

Darren Millar: Hoffwn hefyd gymryd y cyfle hwn i dalu teyrnged i ymateb y gwasanaethau brys ac i Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd Cymru, a roddodd friff defnyddiol i mi heddiw am y llifogydd yn fy etholaeth i, heb sôn am y gwaith caled sy'n cael ei wneud gan Gyngor Sir Ddinbych a Chyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Conwy yn fy ardal.

Minister, I have a number of issues to raise, some of which you may not be entirely responsible for, but with which you might be able to help me, regarding the flooding situation in north Wales. I am aware that the flood alert system has been working reasonably well across the region over the past few days, but it seems to have failed in providing an adequate warning for the residents of Glasdir in Ruthin. I am aware that this is not in your portfolio, but I just wonder whether that is something that you could look at as you prepare your formal response as a Welsh Government to this situation. Also, I am aware that the discussions with the insurance industry at a UK level appear to have gone awry. What discussions is the UK Government having with the Welsh Government about ensuring that there is affordable and adequate insurance protection for householders in north Wales?

Weinidog, mae gennyf nifer o faterion i'w codi ynghylch sefyllfa'r llifogydd yn y gogledd. Mae'n bosibl nad chi fydd yn gyfan gwbl gyfrifol am rai ohonynt, ond efallai y gallech fy helpu pa un bynnag. Rwyf yn ymwybodol bod y system rhybudd rhag llifogydd wedi bod yn gweithio'n rhesymol dda ar draws y rhanbarth dros y dyddiau diwethaf, ond mae'n ymddangos ei bod wedi methu â darparu rhybudd digonol ar gyfer trigolion Glasdir yn Rhuthun. Rwyf yn ymwybodol nad yw hyn yn rhan o'ch portffolio, ond tybed a yw hynny'n rhywbeth y gallech edrych arno wrth i chi baratoi eich ymateb ffurfiol fel Llywodraeth Cymru i'r sefyllfa hon? Hefyd, rwyf yn ymwybodol ei bod yn ymddangos bod y trafodaethau gyda'r diwydiant yswiriant ar lefel y DU wedi mynd o chwith. Pa drafodaethau y mae Llywodraeth y DU yn eu cynnal gyda Llywodraeth Cymru ynghylch sicrhau bod yswiriant fforddiadwy a digonol ar gael i ddeiliaid tai yn y gogledd?

In terms of the evacuation procedure in parts of north Wales, you will be aware that, for some people, evacuation from their homes will mean that they need to be able to access the trunk road network. I am very concerned that there are parts of north Wales that, fortunately, have not been flooded over the past 24 hours, but access to the trunk road network is extremely important and evacuation routes do not appear to be at the top of people's priority lists. Therefore, bearing in mind the awful suffering that is going on in north Wales at the moment, what assurances can you give in relation to those particular issues?

O ran y weithdrefn gwacáu mewn rhannau o ogledd Cymru, byddwch yn ymwybodol y bydd angen i rai pobl allu defnyddio'r rhwydwaith cefnffyrdd er mwyn gadael eu cartrefi. Rwyf yn bryderus iawn ynglŷn â rhai rhannau o'r gogledd sydd, yn ffodus, heb ddioddef llifogydd yn ystod y 24 awr ddiwethaf. Mae mynediad at y rhwydwaith cefnffyrdd yn hynod o bwysig ac nid yw'n ymddangos bod llwybrau gwacáu ar frig rhestri blaenoriaeth pobl. Felly, gan gofio'r dioddefaint ofnadwy sy'n digwydd yn y gogledd ar hyn o bryd, pa sicrwydd y gallwch ei roi am y materion penodol hynny?

Carl Sargeant: I thank the Member for his comments and questions. I associate myself with the majority of his comments today. The Minister for Environment and Sustainable Development is very conscious of the issues in relation to evacuation notifications and insurance. The Minister for environment will issue a statement, either jointly with me or individually, at the appropriate time on some of those issues.

Carl Sargeant: Diolch i'r Aelod am ei sylwadau a'i gwestiynau. Cysylltaf fy hun â'r rhan fwyaf o'i sylwadau heddiw. Mae Gweinidog yr Amgylchedd a Datblygu Cynaliadwy yn ymwybodol iawn o'r materion mewn perthynas â hysbysiadau gwacáu ac yswiriant. Bydd Gweinidog yr Amgylchedd yn cyhoeddi datganiad, naill ai ar y cyd gyda mi neu yn unigol, ar yr adeg briodol ar rai o'r materion hynny.

On the issue around emergency planning, I am sure that the Member appreciates that it is a difficult exercise to analyse the many different 'what if' scenarios. It is something that teams work very hard on, to establish together the passage routes from emergency situations. It goes without saying that the old adage that it will never happen to me is a belief of many, and when such situations occur, the Environment Agency and other agencies try to use the right communication techniques to say to people, 'You are in a flood-risk area and you should plan ahead your escape and evacuation routes, should the need arise'. Of course, that advice is heeded by some, but not heeded so well by others. What is important is that the people who are designated to enact the emergency plan know exactly what they need to do and to which places of safety they need to take people.

O ran cynllunio ar gyfer argyfyngau, rwyf yn sicr bod yr Aelod yn sylweddoli ei bod yn anodd dadansoddi'r holl wahanol sefyllfaoedd posibl. Mae'r timau'n gweithio'n galed iawn ar hyn, er mwyn sefydlu gyda'i gilydd y llwybrau ar gyfer gadael sefyllfaoedd o argyfwng. Mae'n amlwg bod llawer yn credu'r hen ddywediad na fydd byth yn digwydd i mi, a phan fydd sefyllfaoedd o'r fath yn digwydd, bydd Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd ac asiantaethau eraill yn ceisio defnyddio'r technegau cyfathrebu cywir i ddweud wrth bobl, 'Rydych chi mewn ardal â risg o lifogydd a dylech gynllunio ymlaen llaw eich llwybrau dianc a gwacáu, pe bai'r angen yn codi'. Wrth gwrs, bydd rhai'n gwrando ar y cyngor hwnnw, ond ni fydd eraill yn gwrando cystal. Yr hyn sy'n bwysig yw bod y bobl sydd wedi'u dynodi i roi'r cynllun brys ar waith yn gwybod yn union beth sydd angen iddynt ei wneud ac i ba fannau diogel y mae angen iddynt fynd â phobl.

The issue of insurance must come into people's thoughts and the Minister for environment has received some information

Rhaid i bobl feddwl am fater yswiriant ac mae Gweinidog yr Amgylchedd wedi cael rhywfaint o wybodaeth am y mater hwnnw

on that issue from the UK Government.

gan Lywodraeth y DU.

The Presiding Officer: May I remind Members that this is an urgent question, not a statement by the Minister? We have already had five speakers and each one of them has asked at least two, if not three, questions. The Minister has given full answers, therefore, I ask that the two remaining speakers ask questions that have not already been asked, please.

Y Llywydd: A gaf atgoffa'r Aelodau mai cwestiwn brys yw hwn, nid datganiad gan y Gweinidog? Rydym eisoes wedi cael pump o siaradwyr ac mae pob un ohonynt wedi gofyn o leiaf ddau, os nad tri, o gwestiynau. Mae'r Gweinidog wedi rhoi atebion llawn, felly, gofynnaf i'r ddau siaradwr sy'n weddill ofyn cwestiynau nad ydynt eisoes wedi cael eu gofyn, os gwelwch yn dda.

Llyr Huws Gruffydd: Mae'r Gweinidog amgylchedd wedi amlinellu cynlluniau gwariant Llywodraeth Cymru ynglŷn â rheoli llifogydd dros y blynyddoedd nesaf, a bydd hynny'n sicr o gymorth o safbwynt cadw ffyrdd yn agored ac yn rhydd o lifogydd. Pa drafodaethau a ydych chi wedi'u cael gyda Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig ac, yn wir, gydag Aelodau Seneddol Llafur ynglŷn â'r bygythiad i dorri cyllideb yr Undeb Ewropeaidd? Byddai gan hynny'r potensial i chwythu twll gwerth £50 miliwn yng nghynlluniau gwariant rheoli llifogydd Llywodraeth Cymru dros y tair blynedd nesaf.

Llyr Huws Gruffydd: The Minister for the environment has outlined the Welsh Government's expenditure plans in terms of flood management for the next few years, and that will certainly be of assistance in keeping roads open and free from floods. What discussions have you had with the UK Government and, indeed, with Labour Members of Parliament about the threat to cut the European Union budget? That has the potential to blow a £50 million hole in the Welsh Government's flood management expenditure plans over the next three years.

Carl Sargeant: Many discussions go on between Members of this party in Cardiff and in London and I am sure that those discussions will continue. The issue for me, predominantly, is how we look after the people affected by flooding now and prepare for the future. It is something that the Minister for the environment is keeping a close eye on in terms of financing and supporting flood alleviation schemes in the future.

Carl Sargeant: Cynhelir nifer o drafodaethau rhwng Aelodau'r blaid hon yng Nghaerdydd ac yn Llundain, ac rwy'n siŵr y bydd y trafodaethau hynny'n parhau. Y mater i mi, yn bennaf, yw sut yr ydym yn gofalu am y bobl y mae llifogydd yn effeithio arnynt nawr, a sut y dylem baratoi ar gyfer y dyfodol. Mae'n rhywbeth y mae Gweinidog yr Amgylchedd yn cadw llygad barcud arno o ran ariannu a chefnogi cynlluniau lliniaru llifogydd yn y dyfodol.

The Presiding Officer: The other speaker has now withdrawn. Thank you, Minister.

Y Llywydd: Mae'r siaradwr arall wedi tynnu'n ôl yn awr. Diolch, Weinidog.

Datganiad a Chyhoeddiad Busnes
Business Statement and Announcement

The Minister for Finance and Leader of the House (Jane Hutt): I have many amendments to the business statement to report. The statement by the First Minister on the Welsh Government's response to the Commission on Devolution in Wales has been replaced by a debate on the report by

Y Gweinidog Cyllid ac Arweinydd y Tŷ (Jane Hutt): Mae gennyf lawer o ddiwygiadau i'r datganiad busnes i hysbysu amdanynt. Mae'r datganiad gan y Prif Weinidog ar ymateb Llywodraeth Cymru i'r Comisiwn ar Ddatganoli yng Nghymru wedi cael ei ddisodli gan ddadl ar yr adroddiad gan

the UK Government's Silk commission. The associated motion to suspend Standing Orders has been scheduled to take place immediately before the debate. The oral statement on the update on enterprise zones has been converted into a written statement, as the Minister for Business, Enterprise, Technology and Science has to attend urgent Government business in London. The time allocated for questions for the Counsel General has been reduced from 45 minutes to 15 minutes to reflect the fact that only two questions have been tabled. Business for the next three weeks is as shown in the business statement and announcement, which can be found among the agenda papers available to Members electronically.

gomisiwn Silk Llywodraeth y DU. Mae'r cynnig cysylltiedig i atal Rheolau Sefydlog wedi ei drefnu i'w gynnal yn union cyn y ddadl. Mae'r datganiad llafar ar y diweddaraf ar ardaloedd menter wedi cael ei drosi'n ddatganiad ysgrifenedig, gan fod rhaid i'r Gweinidog Busnes, Menter, Technoleg a Gwyddoniaeth ofalu am fusnes brys yn y Llywodraeth yn Llundain. Mae'r amser a neilltuwyd ar gyfer cwestiynau i'r Cwnsler Cyffredinol wedi cael ei leihau o 45 munud i 15 munud i adlewyrchu'r ffaith mai dim ond dau gwestiwn a gyflwynwyd. Bydd busnes y tair wythnos nesaf fel y'i dangosir yn y datganiad a chyhoeddiad busnes, sydd ymhlith papurau'r agenda sydd ar gael i Aelodau yn electronig.

Antoinette Sandbach: Minister, I have raised with you previously the possibility of being updated on Glastir. I think that the Deputy Minister promised a statement on that, but that does not seem to be included in the forward work programme for the Chamber. Therefore, I wonder whether you could comment on that.

Antoinette Sandbach: Weinidog, rwyf wedi codi gyda chi o'r blaen y posibilrwydd o gael y wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am Glastir. Credaf i'r Dirprwy Weinidog addo datganiad ar hynny, ond nid yw'n ymddangos ei fod wedi'i gynnwys ym mlaenraglen waith y Siambr. Felly, tybed a allech roi sylwadau ar hynny.

In light of the recent, well, current, floods in north Wales, we have just heard from the Minister for Local Government and Communities that the Minister for the environment will be making a statement. There is useful advice from the Environment Agency on having a flood pack that you can prepare, which can be available in your property so that you can access it. It has basic equipment in it. I wonder whether the statement will promote five easy steps that householders could take in preparation for when a flood warning, as opposed to an alert, is issued. A flood warning, of course, means that a flood is very likely to happen. Will that statement address those sorts of issues?

Yng ngoleuni'r llifogydd diweddar, wel, y llifogydd sy'n digwydd ar hyn o bryd, yng ngogledd Cymru, rydym newydd glywed gan y Gweinidog Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau y bydd Gweinidog yr Amgylchedd yn gwneud datganiad. Mae gan Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd gyngor defnyddiol ynglŷn â chael pecyn llifogydd y gallwch ei baratoi, i fod ar gael i'w ddefnyddio yn eich eiddo. Mae'n cynnwys offer sylfaenol. Tybed a fydd y datganiad yn hyrwyddo pum cam hawdd y gallai deiliaid tai eu cymryd i baratoi ar gyfer adeg pan gyhoeddir rhybudd llifogydd, yn hytrach na hysbysiad. Mae rhybudd llifogydd, wrth gwrs, yn golygu bod llifogydd yn debygol iawn o ddigwydd. A fydd y datganiad hwnnw'n rhoi sylw i'r mathau hynny o faterion?

Jane Hutt: I thank the Member for North Wales Antoinette Sandbach for her questions. I will ask the Deputy Minister to consider an update on Glastir. The Minister for Environment and Sustainable Development will now be considering an appropriate statement on the impact of the flooding issue,

Jane Hutt: Diolch i'r Aelod dros Ogledd Cymru, Antoinette Sandbach, am ei chwestiynau. Gofynnaf i'r Dirprwy Weinidog ystyried rhoi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am Glastir. Bydd Gweinidog yr Amgylchedd a Datblygu Cynaliadwy nawr yn ystyried datganiad priodol ar effaith y llifogydd, ond o

but in terms of prevention, I am sure that that has been very useful information to brief him.

ran atal problemau, rwyf yn sicr y bu hynny'n wybodaeth ddefnyddiol iawn iddo.

Jocelyn Davies: Minister, I have two matters to raise with you. First, I am sure that you would agree that discrimination against women cannot be tolerated, and organisations that do so should not receive Government support or resources. Therefore, will you make the appropriate arrangements to issue a written statement, following an audit of your grants system, to assure us that no Welsh Government resources will end up in the hands of organisations that view women as inferior creatures—

Jocelyn Davies: Weinidog, mae gennyf ddau fater i'w codi gyda chi. Yn gyntaf, rwyf yn siŵr y byddech yn cytuno na allwn oddef gwahaniaethu yn erbyn menywod, ac na ddylai sefydliadau sy'n gwneud hynny gael cefnogaeth nac adnoddau gan y Llywodraeth. Felly, a wnewch chi'r trefniadau priodol i gyhoeddi datganiad ysgrifenedig, yn dilyn archwiliad o'ch system grantiau, i roi sicrwydd i ni na fydd unrhyw adnoddau gan Lywodraeth Cymru yn y pen draw yn mynd i ddwylo sefydliadau sy'n gweld merched yn greaduriaid israddol—

Simon Thomas: Such as churches?

Simon Thomas: Fel eglwysi?

Jocelyn Davies: Yes, such as churches.

Jocelyn Davies: Ie, fel eglwysi.

Secondly, following the answers given by your Minister for local government earlier, will you tell us if you intend to lodge a request with the Presiding Officer for an extra sitting week to consider the council tax regulations, so that Members can make suitable diary changes? Also, can you tell us why your Government has not bothered to discuss the contents of those regulations with any of the opposition parties when this is an extremely important issue?

Yn ail, yn dilyn yr atebion a roddwyd gan eich Gweinidog Llywodraeth Leol yn gynharach, a ddywedwch wrthym pa un a ydych yn bwriadu cyflwyno cais i'r Llywydd am wythnos ychwanegol i ystyried rheoliadau'r dreth gyngor, fel y gall Aelodau wneud newidiadau addas i'w dyddiaduron? Hefyd, a allwch ddweud wrthym pam nad yw eich Llywodraeth wedi trafferthu i drafod cynnwys y rheoliadau hynny gydag unrhyw un o'r gwrthbleidiau, a hyn yn fater eithriadol o bwysig?

Jane Hutt: I thank Jocelyn Davies for her first question. In terms of the awards that we make, we have a standard grant-award letter and under 'equal opportunities' it states that Welsh Ministers require all recipients of grant aid to ensure that they apply a policy of equal opportunities. I am sure that we wish Barry Morgan, the Archbishop of Wales, well in his mission—and I think it is a mission—to ensure that we have women bishops in Wales, even if the outdated Church of England turned down that important opportunity in terms of equal representation for women last week.

Jane Hutt: Diolchaf i Jocelyn Davies am ei chwestiwn cyntaf. O ran y dyfarniadau a wnawn, mae gennym lythyr safonol ar gyfer dyfarnu grantiau ac o dan 'cyfle cyfartal' mae'n dweud bod Gweinidogion Cymru yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i bawb sy'n cael cymorth grant sicrhau eu bod yn gweithredu polisi cyfle cyfartal. Rwyf yn siŵr ein bod yn dymuno'n dda i Barry Morgan, Archesgob Cymru, yn ei genhadaeth—ac rwy'n credu mai cenhadaeth ydyw—i sicrhau bod gennym ferched yn esgobion yng Nghymru, hyd yn oed os gwrthododd yr Eglwys Loegr hen-ffasiwn y cyfle pwysig hwnnw i roi cynrychiolaeth gyfartal i fenywod yr wythnos ddiwethaf.

Your second point was discussed in response to the urgent question and the Minister has put out a statement on the council tax benefit

Trafodwyd eich ail bwynt fel ymateb i'r cwestiwn brys ac mae'r Gweinidog wedi cyhoeddi datganiad ar reoliadau budd-

regulations and has explained the position we are in. A way forward was discussed at the Business Committee this morning, and it is now up to us to progress this in terms of the opportunity and the importance of ensuring that those regulations go through. Retrospective scrutiny is important in terms of those regulations, and that is available to Members and to the appropriate committees. However, I would also say that briefings have been and are being offered to any opposition spokespeople on this matter.

daliadau'r dreth gyngor ac wedi egluro'r sefyllfa yr ydym ynddi. Trafodwyd ffordd ymlaen yn y Pwyllgor Busnes fore heddiw, a'n cyfrifoldeb ni yw hi nawr i symud ymlaen â hyn o ran y cyfle a phwysigrwydd sicrhau bod y rheoliadau'n pasio. Mae craffu ôl-weithredol yn bwysig o ran y rheoliadau hynny, ac mae hynny ar gael i Aelodau ac i'r pwyllgorau priodol. Fodd bynnag, byddwn hefyd yn dweud bod sesiynau briffio wedi cael eu cynnig, ac yn dal i gael eu cynnig i lefarwyr y gwrthbleidiau ar y mater hwn.

Kirsty Williams: Minister, the regulations relating to the Learner Travel (Wales) Measure 2008 state that the Welsh Government would not expect children to travel an unreasonable distance to school, yet they go on to say that they regard a 45-minute journey for primary school pupils to be reasonable. Minister, would you expect a four-year-old child to travel without a carer on a school transport bus for 45 minutes to attend primary school? Are you concerned, as I am, and as are parents in the Teme valley, that such a long journey to primary school will impact negatively on a child's ability to learn during the school day?

Kirsty Williams: Weinidog, mae'r rheoliadau sy'n ymwneud â Mesur Teithio gan Ddysgwyr (Cymru) 2008 yn datgan na fyddai Llywodraeth Cymru yn disgwyl i blant deithio pellter afresymol i'r ysgol, ac eto ânt yn eu blaenau i ddweud eu bod yn ystyried taith 45 munud i ddisgyblion ysgolion cynradd yn rhesymol. Weinidog, a fyddech yn disgwyl i blentyn pedair blwydd oed deithio heb ofalwr ar gludiant bws ysgol am 45 munud i fynd i'r ysgol gynradd? A ydych yn pryderu, fel minnau, ac fel y mae rhieni yn y dyffryn Tefeidiad, y bydd y fath daith hir i'r ysgol gynradd yn cael effaith anffafriol ar allu plentyn i ddysgu yn ystod y diwrnod ysgol?

Jane Hutt: The Member for Brecon and Radnorshire raises an important point in terms of the underpinning principles of that important Measure. I will raise this with the Minister for transport to clarify the point.

Jane Hutt: Mae'r Aelod dros Frycheiniog a Sir Faesyfed yn codi pwynt pwysig o ran egwyddorion sylfaenol y Mesur pwysig hwnnw. Fe wnaf godi'r mater hwn gyda'r Gweinidog Trafnidiaeth i egluro'r pwynt.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Leader of the House, it is always appreciated when briefing sessions are arranged on particular Government policy, but I would like to draw your attention to a briefing session being held by the chair of the review of qualifications for 14 to 19-year-olds in Wales, which is due to take place tomorrow afternoon at 4.45 p.m. at the Future Inns in Cardiff bay. Wednesday is a Plenary day and 4.45 p.m. is very close to voting time. Indeed, the information states specifically that opposition leaders and education spokespeople will be at this briefing. Therefore, I would be grateful if the Government could look into this, because the briefing sessions are worthwhile and we would welcome the opportunity to attend. However, in this case, it seems that there

Andrew R.T. Davies: Arweinydd y Tŷ, gwerthfawrogir unrhyw sesiynau briffio a drefnir ar bolisi penodol gan y Llywodraeth, ond hoffwn dynnu eich sylw at sesiwn briffio a gynhelir gan gadeirydd yr adolygiad o gymwysterau i fyfyrwyr 14 i 19 mlwydd oed yng Nghymru. Mae wedi ei drefnu ar gyfer prynhawn yfory am 4.45 pm yn y Future Inns ym mae Caerdydd. Mae dydd Mercher yn ddiwrnod Cyfarfod Llawn ac mae 4:45p.m. yn agos iawn at y cyfnod pleidleisio. Yn wir, mae'r wybodaeth yn datgan yn benodol y bydd arweinwyr y gwrthbleidiau a llefarwyr addysg yn bresennol yn y sesiwn hon. Felly, byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallai'r Llywodraeth edrych ar hyn, oherwydd bod y sesiynau briffio yn werth chweil ac y byddem yn croesawu'r cyfle i fod yn bresennol. Fodd

have been crossed wires and maybe double-booking.

bynnag, yn yr achos hwn, mae'n ymddangos y bu camddealltwriaeth a dau beth wedi'u trefnu ar gyfer yr un pryd o bosibl.

Jane Hutt: Andrew R.T. Davies raises an important point and we will certainly look at the timing of that review.

Jane Hutt: Mae Andrew R.T. Davies yn codi pwynt pwysig a byddwn yn sicr yn edrych ar amseriad yr adolygiad hwnnw.

Aled Roberts: Weinidog, mae nifer o gwestiynau wedi codi heddiw ynglŷn â darpariaeth y gwasanaeth ambiwlans yng Nghymru. Dywedodd y Gweinidog Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol rai wythnosau yn ôl y byddai datganiad pellach erbyn diwedd mis Tachwedd. Ai'r bwriad yw cael datganiad ysgrifenedig, neu a fydd y Llywodraeth yn gwneud amser i ni glywed y datganiad cyn gwyliau'r Nadolig?

Aled Roberts: Minister, a number of questions have been raised today about ambulance service provision in Wales. The Minister for Health and Social Services said some weeks ago that there would be a further statement by the end of November. Is it the intention to issue a written statement, or will the Government make time for us to hear the statement before the Christmas recess?

Jane Hutt: I can assure Aled Roberts that the Minister is committed to undertaking a review of the ambulance service. She announced those plans on 7 November. The Minister will conduct a comprehensive review. Indeed, she is preparing the terms of reference with her officials and we will then be able to bring this forward in a statement to the Assembly.

Jane Hutt: Gallaf sicrhau Aled Roberts bod y Gweinidog wedi ymrwymo i gynnal adolygiad o'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans. Cyhoeddodd y cynlluniau hynny ar 7 Tachwedd. Bydd y Gweinidog yn cynnal adolygiad cynhwysfawr. Yn wir, mae hi'n paratoi cylch gorchwyl gyda'i swyddogion a byddwn wedyn yn gallu cyflwyno hyn mewn datganiad i'r Cynulliad.

Darren Millar: Minister, can we have an update on the national clinical forum from the Minister for Health and Social Services? You will be aware that concerns have been raised about the actions of the chair of that particular forum, and I understand that the Minister was seeking to discuss those concerns with the chair. I think that an update on those discussions ought to be provided by the Minister to Members of the National Assembly.

Darren Millar: Weinidog, a gawn y wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am y fforwm clinigol cenedlaethol gan y Gweinidog Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol? Byddwch yn ymwybodol bod pryderon wedi'u codi ynghylch ymddygiad cadeirydd y fforwm penodol hwnnw, a deallaf fod y Gweinidog yn bwriadu trafod y pryderon hynny gyda'r cadeirydd. Credaf y dylai'r Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am y trafodaethau hynny i Aelodau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol.

Jane Hutt: This was discussed during questions last week, and I know that the Minister responded appropriately and will feed back to Members in due course.

Jane Hutt: Trafodwyd hyn yn ystod cwestiynau'r wythnos diwethaf, a gwn fod y Gweinidog wedi ymateb yn briodol ac y bydd yn rhoi adborth i'r Aelodau maes o law.

3.00 p.m.

Mohammad Asghar: Minister, may I request a debate on business rates in Wales, because my patch, south-east Wales, has hundreds of empty shops? On Commercial Street and High Street in Newport not a

Mohammad Asghar: Weinidog, a gaf ofyn am ddadl ar ardrethi busnes yng Nghymru, oherwydd bod cannoedd o siopau gwag yn fy ardal i, sef y de-ddwyrain? Ar Commercial Street a'r Stryd Fawr yng Nghasnewydd nid

single shop has a rateable value below £12,000, and therefore there is no financial help through small business rate relief to any business that would like to set up in Newport. Will you consider these areas, because the council will definitely not look into it, so that this place makes a strong move for financial assistance to new businesses to set up in south-east Wales? Setting the ceiling at £12,000 is a barrier, because the council cannot help any business. Would you consider having a debate in this Chamber on increasing the rate ceiling?

oes gan yr un siop werth trethiannol is na £12,000, ac felly nid oes dim cymorth ariannol drwy ryddhad ardrethi busnesau bach ar gael i unrhyw fusnes a hoffai sefydlu yng Nghasnewydd. A wnewch chi ystyried y meysydd hyn, oherwydd yn sicr ni fydd y cyngor yn edrych ar y mater, fel bod y lle hwn yn cymryd camau pendant i roi cymorth ariannol i fusnesau newydd i sefydlu yn ne-ddwyrain Cymru? Mae terfyn uchaf o £12,000 yn rhwystr, gan na all y cyngor helpu unrhyw fusnes. A fyddech yn ystyried cael dadl yn y Siambr hon ar gynyddu terfyn uchaf y gyfradd?

Jane Hutt: The Member is aware that the Minister for Business, Enterprise, Technology and Science appointed Professor Brian Morgan to undertake a review of business rates in Wales, and she has brought back an update and a progress report on that review to this Chamber. I am sure that you will take the opportunity to raise it with her again in due course.

Jane Hutt: Mae’r Aelod yn ymwybodol bod y Gweinidog Busnes, Menter, Technoleg a Gwyddoniaeth wedi penodi’r Athro Brian Morgan i gynnal adolygiad o ardrethi busnes yng Nghymru, ac mae wedi dod â’r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf ac adroddiad cynnydd ar yr adolygiad hwnnw i’r Siambr hon. Rwyf yn siŵr y cymerwch y cyfle i godi’r mater gyda hi eto maes o law.

Datganiad: Cyflwyno Bil Llywodraeth Leol (Democratiaeth) (Cymru)
Statement: Introduction of the Local Government (Democracy) (Wales) Bill

The Minister for Local Government and Communities (Carl Sargeant): Yesterday, I laid the Local Government (Democracy) (Wales) Bill, together with the explanatory memorandum, before the National Assembly for Wales. I also issued a written statement and I am pleased to introduce the Bill for Assembly Members’ consideration today.

Y Gweinidog Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau (Carl Sargeant): Ddoe, gosodais Fil Llywodraeth Leol (Democratiaeth) (Cymru), ynghyd â’r memorandwm esboniadol, gerbron Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru. Rwyf hefyd wedi cyhoeddi datganiad ysgrifenedig ac rwyf yn falch o gyflwyno’r Bil i Aelodau’r Cynulliad ei ystyried heddiw.

To a large extent, the Bill takes forward and develops recommendations made by the Mathias report of last year, which investigated the electoral review programme being carried out by the Local Government Boundary Commission for Wales. As well as revealing a number of organisational and strategic weaknesses in the work of the commission, Mathias also identified areas in which the primary legislative framework governing the commission’s methods, enshrined in the Local Government Act 1972, were overly restrictive and were at least partially to blame for the problems that surrounded these reviews.

I raddau helaeth, mae’r Bil yn datblygu argymhellion a wnaed gan adroddiad Mathias y llynedd, a oedd yn ymchwilio i’r rhaglen adolygu etholiadol yn cael ei chynnal gan y Comisiwn Ffiniau Llywodraeth Leol i Gymru. Yn ogystal â datgelu nifer o wendidau sefydliadol a strategol yng ngwaith y comisiwn, roedd Mathias hefyd yn nodi meysydd lle’r oedd y fframwaith deddfwriaethol sylfaenol sy’n rheoli dulliau gwaith y comisiwn, sydd wedi’i ymgorffori yn Neddf Llywodraeth Leol 1972, yn rhy gyfyngol ac o leiaf yn rhannol ar fai am y problemau sydd ynghlwm wrth yr adolygiadau hyn.

The Bill will provide a new start for the commission, including a change of its name to the local democracy and boundary commission for Wales, reflecting the fact that its work is about far more than boundaries and is intrinsic to the process of ensuring a representative and democratic base for local government in Wales.

Bydd y Bil yn rhoi dechreuad newydd i'r comisiwn, gan gynnwys newid ei enw i gomisiwn ffiniau a democratiaeth leol Cymru. Bydd hyn yn adlewyrchu'r ffaith bod ei waith yn ymwneud â llawer mwy na ffiniau a'i fod yn rhan annatod o'r broses o sicrhau sylfaen gynrychiadol a democrataidd i lywodraeth leol yng Nghymru.

I propose, as recommended by Mathias, to enable the commission to recommend changes to community boundaries in the process of conducting county and county borough electoral reviews, if that is in the best interests of effective and convenient local government. The Bill also proposes that recognising local community ties shall be as important an aim as that of seeking electoral parity when proposing new electoral divisions.

Cynigiaf, fel yr argymhellwyd gan Mathias, y dylid galluogi'r comisiwn i argymell newidiadau i ffiniau cymunedau yn y broses o gynnal adolygiadau etholiadol siroedd a bwrdeistrefi sirol, os yw er budd gorau llywodraeth leol effeithiol a chyfleus. Mae'r Bil hefyd yn cynnig y bydd cydnabod cysylltiadau cymunedol lleol yn nod yr un mor bwysig â cheisio cydraddoldeb etholiadol wrth gynnig adrannau etholiadol newydd.

I also propose that the commission, for the first time, be granted Order-making powers in cases where they are in agreement with reviews of communities carried out by principal councils. This will end the current practice whereby the commission's role is akin to that of a postman, delivering unchanged proposals from principal councils to Welsh Ministers.

Rwyf hefyd yn cynnig y dylai'r comisiwn, am y tro cyntaf, gael pwerau i wneud Gorchmynion mewn achosion lle maent yn cytuno ag adolygiadau o gymunedau a gynhaliwyd gan brif gynghorau. Bydd hyn yn diweddu'r arfer presennol lle mae swyddogaeth y comisiwn yn debyg i un postmon, gan ddanfon cynigion gan brif gynghorau i Weinidogion Cymru heb eu newid.

The Bill proposes to enable Welsh Ministers to direct the commission to review the membership of certain public bodies, including, for example, the number of members, the required attributes and skills. I am taking the opportunity, as part of the construction of the Welsh statute book, to revisit all the existing provisions surrounding the commission, revoking and replacing them as necessary. That is why you will find provisions on such unexpected areas as the extent of seaward boundaries and the alteration of watercourses.

Mae'r Bil yn cynnig y dylid galluogi Gweinidogion Cymru i roi cyfarwyddiadau i'r comisiwn i adolygu aelodaeth cyrff cyhoeddus penodol, gan gynnwys, er enghraifft, nifer yr aelodau, a'r nodweddion a'r sgiliau gofynnol. Rwyf yn manteisio ar y cyfle, fel rhan o'r gwaith o adeiladu llyfr statud Cymru, i ailystyried yr holl ddarpariaethau presennol sy'n ymwneud â'r comisiwn, gan eu diddymu a'u disodli yn ôl yr angen. Dyna pam y gwelwch ddarpariaethau ar feysydd annisgwyl megis ffiniau tua'r môr ac addasu cyrsiau dŵr.

However, the Bill is not confined only to matters relating to the commission. It makes provisions that would allow principal councils, if they so wish, to appoint presiding members to chair their meetings, allowing their civic chair, mayor or lord mayor to concentrate on their civic and ceremonial

Fodd bynnag, nid yw'r Bil wedi'i gyfyngu'n unig i faterion sy'n ymwneud â'r comisiwn. Mae'n gwneud darpariaethau a fyddai'n caniatáu i brif gynghorau, pe dymunant wneud hynny, benodi aelodau llywyddu i gadeirio eu cyfarfodydd, gan ganiatáu i'w cadeirydd dinesig, eu maer neu eu harglwydd

functions. This would enable the development of skilled chairing of meetings in local authorities without disturbing the normal practice of appointing civic heads on an annual basis.

faer ganolbwyntio ar eu swyddogaethau dinesig a seremonïol. Byddai hyn yn golygu y gellid datblygu cadeiryddion cyfarfodydd medrus mewn awdurdodau lleol heb amharu ar y drefn arferol o benodi penaethiaid dinesig yn flynyddol.

I want to raise the profile of town and community councils by ensuring that the public can more easily find out about them, their members and their business. The Bill proposes that each council should publish this information electronically and be contactable electronically. Many do this already and therefore no change will be required. For others, people must currently locate public notice boards to find out what is happening. This is not good enough for a layer of local government in the twenty-first century. The Bill further provides for some modifications to the Local Government (Wales) Measure 2011, which introduced democratic service committees in order to protect the interests of backbench councillors. It has become clear that the functions can be interpreted too narrowly. I want them to be able to consider any issue that falls within the general area of support and services for members.

Hoffwn godi proffil cynghorau tref a chymuned drwy ei gwneud yn haws i’r cyhoedd ddod o hyd i wybodaeth amdanynt, ac am eu haelodau a’u busnes. Mae’r Bil yn cynnig y dylai pob cyngor gyhoeddi’r wybodaeth hon yn electronig ac y dylai pobl allu cysylltu â hwy’n electronig. Mae llawer yn gwneud hyn yn barod ac felly ni fydd angen newid. Mewn achosion eraill, mae’n rhaid i bobl ganfod hysbysfyrddau cyhoeddus i ddarganfod beth sy’n digwydd ar hyn o bryd. Nid yw hyn yn ddigon da i haen o lywodraeth leol yn yr unfed ganrif ar hugain. Mae’r Bil hefyd yn darparu ar gyfer rhai addasiadau i Fesur Llywodraeth Leol (Cymru) 2011, a gyflwynodd bwyllgorau gwasanaeth democrataidd er mwyn diogelu buddiannau cynghorwyr meinciau cefn. Mae wedi dod yn amlwg y gellir dehongli’r swyddogaethau mewn modd rhy gyfyng. Hoffwn iddynt allu ystyried unrhyw fater sy’n dod o fewn maes cyffredinol cefnogaeth a gwasanaethau i aelodau.

Similarly, the provisions in the Measure that strengthened the position of the Independent Remuneration Panel for Wales need some flexibility built into them. The Bill proposes that the panel will be able to respond more quickly to specific requests from individual local authorities and also to backdate its decisions if it feels this is justified. Finally, I am including proposals that will enable two or more local authorities to establish joint standards committees. Standards committees have the same basic responsibility for monitoring ethical conduct in each council and are therefore suitable for such collaborative reform.

Yn yr un modd, bydd angen rhywfaint o hyblygrwydd yn y darpariaethau yn y Mesur sy’n cryfhau sefyllfa Panel Annibynnol Cymru ar Gydnabyddiaeth Ariannol. Mae’r Bil yn cynnig y bydd y panel yn gallu ymateb yn gyflymach i geisiadau penodol gan awdurdodau lleol unigol ynghyd ag ôl-ddyddio ei benderfyniadau os yw’n teimlo bod hyn wedi’i gyfiawnhau. Yn olaf, rwyf yn cynnwys cynigion a fydd yn galluogi dau neu fwy o awdurdodau lleol i sefydlu pwyllgorau safonau ar y cyd. Mae gan bwyllgorau Safonau yr un cyfrifoldeb sylfaenol i fonitro ymddygiad moesegol ym mhob cyngor ac felly mae’n addas iddynt ddiwygio trwy gydweithio fel hyn.

To conclude, I look forward to working with Assembly Members and others with an interest, including local government and the Welsh Local Government Association, during the scrutiny of this Bill.

I gloi, edrychaf ymlaen at gydweithio ag Aelodau’r Cynulliad ac eraill sydd â diddordeb, gan gynnwys llywodraeth leol a Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, yn ystod y broses o graffu ar y Bil hwn.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Minister. I remind Members that this is an opportunity to question the Minister; it is not an opportunity to make long speeches.

Y Llywydd: Diolch ichi, Weinidog. Atgoffaf yr Aelodau mai cyfle i holi'r Gweinidog yw hwn; nid yw'n gyfle i wneud areithiau hir.

Janet Finch-Saunders: I really welcome your statement today. We look forward to working together constructively, particularly on the areas where we have common agreement in principle. As a group, we wish to see a local government network from the community level up in order to deliver effectively for everyone in Wales. To that end, reforms to local government passed by the National Assembly for Wales must seek to have absolute transparency, democracy and accountability as their overriding principles.

Janet Finch-Saunders: Croesawaf eich datganiad heddiw'n fawr. Rydym yn edrych ymlaen at weithio gyda'n gilydd yn adeiladol, yn enwedig yn y meysydd lle'r ydym yn cytuno mewn egwyddor. Fel grŵp, hoffem weld rhwydwaith llywodraeth leol o lefel gymunedol i fyny er mwyn cyflawni'n effeithiol ar gyfer pawb yng Nghymru. I'r perwyl hwnnw, rhaid ceisio sicrhau mai eglurder, democratiaeth ac atebolrwydd llwyr yw prif egwyddorion diwygiadau i lywodraeth leol a gânt eu pasio gan Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru.

There is a great deal to be welcomed in the Minister's proposals. The positives include provisions relating to the boundary commission. Reforms to the constitution and organisation of the Local Government Boundary Commission for Wales will, we hope, ensure that the decisions made by the commission will be more democratic, thus enhancing its legitimacy. Provisions relating to town and community councils are to be welcomed. In particular, boosting the ability of individuals and communities to access information should be welcomed. I am pleased to see that the Minister has embraced the principle and spirit of our amendments to the Local Government Byelaws (Wales) Bill in this legislative proposal.

Mae llawer iawn i'w groesawu yng nghynigion y Gweinidog. Mae'r pwyntiau cadarnhaol yn cynnwys darpariaethau sy'n ymwneud â'r comisiwn ffiniau. Bydd y diwygiadau i gyfansoddiad a threfniadaeth y Comisiwn Ffiniau Llywodraeth Leol i Gymru, gobeithiwn, yn sicrhau y bydd penderfyniadau'r comisiwn yn fwy democrataidd, a thrwy hynny ei wneud yn fwy dilys. Caiff darpariaethau'n ymwneud â chynghorau tref a chymuned eu croesawu. Yn benodol, dylid croesawu'r ffaith y rhoddid hwb i allu unigolion a chymunedau i gael gafael ar wybodaeth. Rwyf yn falch o weld bod y Gweinidog wedi croesawu egwyddor ac ysbryd ein diwygiadau i'r Bil Is-ddeddfau Llywodraeth Leol (Cymru) yn y cynnig deddfwriaethol hwn.

It is fundamental that we have scrutiny at all levels. We have five layers of governance in Wales and it is fundamental that the appropriate level of scrutiny accompanies that. We share the belief that, for our democracy to work, elected representatives must be allowed to scrutinise effectively. I believe that the proposals in this legislation will go some way towards enhancing that. I welcome the inclusion of this on the face of the Bill rather than in guidance because there is a requirement that audit committees must reflect the political balance of an authority. We support the greater flexibility for democratic services committees. We have raised this in the Chamber and I thank you

Mae'n hanfodol inni gael craffu ar bob lefel. Mae gennym bum haen o lywodraethu yng Nghymru ac mae'n hanfodol cael craffu ar y lefel briodol i gyd-fynd â hynny. Rydym yn rhannu'r gred bod rhaid i gynrychiolwyr etholedig gael craffu'n effeithiol, er mwyn i'n democratiaeth weithio. Credaf y bydd y cynigion yn y ddeddfwriaeth hon yn mynd rywfaint o'r ffordd tuag at wella hynny. Rwyf yn croesawu'r ffaith y caiff hyn ei gynnwys ar wyneb y Bil yn hytrach nag mewn canllawiau oherwydd y gofyniad bod rhaid i bwyllgorau archwilio adlewyrchu cydbwysedd gwleidyddol yr awdurdod. Rydym yn cefnogi mwy o hyblygrwydd i bwyllgorau gwasanaethau democrataidd.

for your response. I have asked you how councils are now working with the democratic services committees, because that was a requirement in your Local Government (Wales) Measure—

Rydym wedi codi hyn yn y Siambr a diolchaf ichi am eich ymateb. Rwyf wedi gofyn i chi sut y mae cynghorau'n awr yn gweithio gyda'r pwyllgorau gwasanaethau democrataidd, gan fod hynny'n ofyniad yn eich Mesur Llywodraeth Leol (Cymru)—

The Presiding Officer: Order. Are you coming to a series of questions on the statement?

Y Llywydd: Trefn. A ydych yn cyrraedd cyfres o gwestiynau ar y datganiad?

Janet Finch-Saunders: Right—

Janet Finch-Saunders: Iawn—

The Presiding Officer: I mean it. This is your opportunity to question the Minister on his statement this afternoon.

Y Llywydd: Rwyf o ddifrif. Dyma eich cyfle i holi'r Gweinidog am ei ddatganiad brynhawn heddiw.

Janet Finch-Saunders: Right, okay. Well, we have met to discuss many aspects of this. We will scrutinise it when it comes to committee. I just want to welcome the statement and say that we will take our opportunity to scrutinise it. I have mentioned some of the positives and some of our concerns, but those will come to the fore during the committee stages.

Janet Finch-Saunders: Ie, iawn. Wel, rydym wedi cwrdd i drafod sawl agwedd ar hyn. Byddwn yn craffu arno pan ddaw gerbron y pwyllgor. Hoffwn groesawu'r datganiad a dweud y byddwn yn manteisio ar ein cyfle i graffu arno. Rwyf wedi crybwyll rhai o'r pwyntiau cadarnhaol a rhai o'n pryderon, ond daw'r rhain i'r amlwg yn ystod y camau pwyllgor.

Carl Sargeant: I am grateful for the Member's support. I did not pick out any questions, but I am grateful for the Member's contribution and look forward to her support during the committee stages.

Carl Sargeant: Rwyf yn ddiolchgar am gefnogaeth yr Aelodau. Ni sylwais ar unrhyw gwestiynau, ond rwyf yn ddiolchgar am gyfraniad yr Aelod ac yn edrych ymlaen at ei chefnogaeth yn ystod y camau pwyllgor.

Mike Hedges: I also welcome the Minister's statement. I have three distinct questions. Would it be possible to promote the principal councils engaging in a review of community boundaries when new developments take place? I can think of a case between my constituency and Swansea West where there was a nicely delineated boundary, which was a stream. However, then an estate was built across it, which means that you change constituencies halfway along the estate and, because the stream has now been taken underground, you do not know when you are crossing the boundary. Therefore, can you suggest that people look at that? Secondly, I welcome the idea of appointing presiding members. As someone who was behind the appointment of the first local authority presiding officer in Wales, I think that it worked well and I think that it will work well. People who hold civic office have an

Mike Hedges: Rwyf innau hefyd yn croesawu datganiad y Gweinidog. Mae gennyf dri chwestiwn penodol. A fyddai'n bosibl hybu'r prif gynghorau gymryd rhan mewn adolygiad o ffiniau cymunedol pan gynhelir datblygiadau newydd? Gallaf feddwl am achos rhwng fy etholaeth i a Gorllewin Abertawe lle'r oedd ffin wedi'i nodi'n daclus gan nant. Fodd bynnag, adeiladwyd stad ar ei thraws, sy'n golygu eich bod yn newid etholaethau hanner ffordd ar hyd y stad, a gan fod y nant bellach yn mynd o dan y ddaear, nid ydych yn gwybod pan fyddwch yn croesi'r ffin. Felly, a allwch awgrymu bod pobl yn edrych ar hynny? Yn ail, rwyf yn croesawu'r syniad o benodi aelodau llywyddu. Fel rhywun a oedd y tu ôl i benodi'r swyddog llywyddu cyntaf ar gyfer awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru, rwyf yn meddwl ei fod wedi gweithio'n dda, ac rwyf yn meddwl y bydd yn gweithio'n dda. Mae

awful lot of things to do and sometimes they are not the people most suited to chairing meetings. I think that it is very important that everyone who gets the chance to hold office has the opportunity to do so without having to chair council meetings.

gan bobl sydd mewn swyddi dinesig lawer iawn o bethau i'w gwneud ac weithiau nid nhw yw'r bobl fwyaf addas i gadeirio cyfarfodydd. Credaf ei bod yn bwysig iawn bod pawb sy'n cael y cyfle i ddal swydd yn gallu gwneud hynny heb orfod cadeirio cyfarfodydd y cyngor.

Thirdly, would it be possible to set basic support levels for individual backbench councillors in local authorities—the minimum standard that you would expect?

Yn drydydd, a fyddai modd gosod lefelau cymorth sylfaenol i gynghorwyr unigol y meinciau cefn mewn awdurdodau lleol—y safon isaf y byddech yn ei disgwyl?

Carl Sargeant: I thank the Member for his knowledge and contribution. Of course, I would expect the new boundary commission to consider the local development plans of local authorities in order to assist in the construction of new boundaries. I mentioned watercourses and river boundaries as being part of that too; if development is to continue beyond the natural community boundary, that would need to be considered in the plans. I am grateful for the Member's support for flexibility for local authorities to consider their position regarding the civic elements of the proposals and whether they should be incorporated within the main structure of the council. On the elements for democratic service reform, we made provision in the Local Government (Wales) Measure 2011 for democratic services to have support for backbench members. I have not considered in particular measuring the amount of support to which a member would be entitled, but I would expect the whole service to be flexible enough to react to members requiring and requesting further information that would support them in being a councillor. It is something that I will look at very closely.

Carl Sargeant: Diolch i'r Aelod am ei wybodaeth a'i gyfraniad. Wrth gwrs, byddwn yn disgwyl i'r comisiwn ffiniau newydd ystyried cynlluniau datblygu lleol awdurdodau lleol er mwyn eu cynorthwyo i lunio ffiniau newydd. Soniais fod cyrsiau dŵr a ffiniau afon yn rhan o hynny hefyd; os bwriedir i ddatblygiadau ymestyn y tu hwnt i ffin y gymuned naturiol, bydd angen ystyried hynny yn y cynlluniau. Rwyf yn ddiolchgar am gefnogaeth yr Aelod i roi hyblygrwydd i awdurdodau lleol ystyried eu sefyllfa o ran elfennau dinesig y cynigion a pha un a ddylent gael eu hymgorffori o fewn prif strwythur y cyngor. O ran yr elfennau ar gyfer diwygio gwasanaethau democrataidd, gwnaethom ddarpariaeth ym Mesur Llywodraeth Leol (Cymru) 2011 i wasanaethau democrataidd roi cefnogaeth i aelodau meinciau cefn. Nid wyf wedi rhoi ystyriaeth benodol i fesur swm y cymorth y byddai gan aelod hawl i'w gael, ond byddwn yn disgwyl i'r gwasanaeth cyfan fod yn ddigon hyblyg i ymateb i aelodau sy'n mynnu ac yn gofyn am ragor o wybodaeth a fyddai'n eu cynorthwyo yn eu gwaith fel cynghorydd. Mae'n rhywbeth y byddaf yn edrych arno'n ofalus iawn.

Lindsay Whittle: Plaid Cymru has always been a party rooted in Welsh communities and we strongly support local decision making and local government. I am passionate about local government, as I have said in the Chamber before. Devolution should not stop at Cardiff and I welcome more powers for democratically-elected local authorities at all levels. In Wales, we are very fond of local choirs and this Bill is about the local government choir—hitting the right notes and ensuring that we have the best

Lindsay Whittle: Mae Plaid Cymru erioed wedi bod yn blaid sydd wedi'i gwreiddio yng nghymunedau Cymru ac rydym yn cefnogi llywodraeth leol yn gryf, yn ogystal â'r egwyddor y dylid gwneud penderfyniadau'n lleol. Rwyf yn angerddol ynglŷn â llywodraeth leol, fel yr wyf wedi ei ddweud yn y Siambr o'r blaen. Ni ddylai datganoli orffen yng Nghaerdydd a chroesawaf fwy o bwerau i awdurdodau lleol a etholwyd yn ddemocrataidd ar bob lefel. Yng Nghymru, rydym yn hoff iawn o gorau lleol ac mae'r

choristers.

Bil yn ymwneud â chôr llywodraeth leol—taro'r nodau cywir a sicrhau bod y cantorion gorau gennym.

Minister, will you be seeking more power and legislative competence over the conduct of local and Assembly elections? There is no control, for example, over the individual voter registration that will be with us shortly. I believe that that will disenfranchise many people in Wales. We already have too many homes in Wales that are not registered. Why do we not consider same-day voter registration?

Weinidog, a fyddwch yn ceisio mwy o rym a chymhwysedd deddfwriaethol dros y modd y cynhelir etholiadau lleol ac etholiadau'r Cynulliad? Nid oes rheolaeth, er enghraifft, dros y drefn a sefydlir cyn bo hir o gofrestru pleidleiswyr unigol. Credaf y bydd hynny'n difreinio llawer o bobl yng Nghymru. Mae gennym eisoes ormod o gartrefi yng Nghymru nad ydynt wedi'u cofrestru. Pam nad ydym yn ystyried cofrestru pleidleiswyr ar yr un diwrnod?

I am very disappointed that it is not a legal requirement that the chairs of scrutiny committees should be politically balanced. I would support any efforts to obtain that. Why have you not done that, please, Minister?

Rwyf yn siomedig iawn nad yw'n ofyniad cyfreithiol y dylai cadeiryddion pwyllgorau craffu fod yn wleidyddol gytbwys. Byddwn yn cefnogi unrhyw ymdrechion i sicrhau hynny. Pam nad ydych wedi gwneud hynny, os gwelwch yn dda, Weinidog?

So I am not too critical, I welcome the constant review of community boundaries, because that recognises the fact that Wales is changing, which is important. It also addresses Mike Hedges's issue. Minister, will you also recognise that the best way of tackling the lack of democracy in Wales is to move to a system of proportional representation, based on the single transferrable vote? Will you also examine the issue of multi-member wards? When the boundary commission begins its next review, perhaps you could ask it to revisit that issue.

Felly, nid wyf yn rhy feirniadol. Rwyf yn croesawu'r adolygiad cyson o ffiniau cymunedol, gan fod hynny'n cydnabod y ffaith bod Cymru yn newid, sy'n bwysig. Mae hefyd yn ymdrin â mater Mike Hedges. Weinidog, a wnewch gydnabod hefyd mai'r ffordd orau o fynd i'r afael â'r diffyg democratiaeth yng Nghymru yw symud at system o gynrychiolaeth gyfrannol, yn seiliedig ar y bleidlais sengl drosglwyddadwy? A wnewch chi hefyd edrych ar fater wardiau â sawl aelod? Pan fydd y comisiwn ffiniau yn dechrau ei adolygiad nesaf, efallai y gallech ofyn iddo ailedrych ar y mater hwnnw.

Carl Sargeant: I share some of the Member's concerns around the political franchise and ownership of the decision-making process here in Wales. I would be grateful for his support with regard to the competence issue and the right and powers to decide on issues relating to the democratic process and voting systems here in Wales. It will no doubt come as no surprise to the Member with regard to the PR voting system that we do not agree on that. However, we should not shy away from having that discussion. The Member raises a very important issue around the political balance in committees. I would certainly be interested

Carl Sargeant: Rwyf yn rhannu rhai o bryderon yr Aelod ynglŷn ag etholfraint wleidyddol a pherchnogaeth y broses o wneud penderfyniadau yma yng Nghymru. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar am ei gefnogaeth o ran cymhwysedd a'r hawl a'r pwerau i benderfynu ar faterion sy'n ymwneud â'r broses ddemocrataidd a systemau pleidleisio yma yng Nghymru. Diau na fydd yn syndod i'r Aelod nad ydym yn cytuno ynglŷn â'r system cynrychiolaeth gyfrannol. Fodd bynnag, ni ddylem osgoi'r drafodaeth honno. Mae'r Aelod yn codi mater pwysig iawn ynghylch cydbwysedd gwleidyddol mewn pwyllgorau. Yn sicr, byddai gennyf

in hearing more from his party in terms of the process when this Bill goes through the committee stages. I want to seek as much consensus on that as possible.

ddiddordeb mewn clywed mwy gan ei blaid ynglŷn â'r broses pan fydd y Bil hwn yn mynd drwy'r camau pwyllgor. Rwyf am geisio cymaint o gonsensws ar hynny ag y bo modd.

3.15 p.m.

I do not have competence over direction for choirs in Wales, but we should embrace the local government family in giving powers to the most appropriate level of governance. That is why, in this Bill, I am seeking to support and enhance provision on the accountability of local, town and community councils.

Nid oes gennyf gymhwysedd dros gyfarwyddo corau yng Nghymru, ond dylem groesawu'r teulu llywodraeth leol trwy roi pwerau i'r lefel lywodraethu fwyaf priodol. Dyna pam, yn y Bil hwn, yr wyf yn ceisio cefnogi a gwella'r ddarpariaeth o ran atebolrwydd cynghorau lleol, cynghorau tref a chynghorau cymuned.

Peter Black: Although this Bill is fairly comprehensive, and I very much welcome the provisions within it, I ask the Minister to consider being a bit more ambitious about what he wants to do with it. In particular, to pick up on the Minister's last point in relation to town and community councils, would he consider introducing a power of general competence for those councils to enable them to be true champions of the local community that they represent?

Peter Black: Er bod y Bil hwn yn weddol gynhwysfawr, a'm bod yn croesawu'r darpariaethau sydd ynddo'n fawr, gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog ystyried bod ychydig yn fwy uchelgeisiol yn yr hyn y mae am ei gyflawni. Yn benodol, gan gyfeirio at bwynt olaf y Gweinidog mewn perthynas â chynghorau tref a chymuned, a fyddai'n ystyried cyflwyno pŵer cymhwysedd cyffredinol i'r cynghorau hynny er mwyn eu galluogi i weithio mewn gwirionedd o blaid y gymuned leol y maent yn ei chynrychioli?

In relation to the previous contribution about proportional representation for local government, could the Minister confirm that, in his view, the Assembly does not have the legislative competence to alter the voting system for local government? Will he confirm that he will press the UK Government to obtain that competence even if he does not necessarily agree with me on the possible outcomes of having that power?

Ynglŷn â'r cyfraniad blaenorol am gynrychiolaeth gyfrannol i lywodraeth leol, a allai'r Gweinidog gadarnhau, yn ei farn ef, nad oes gan y Cynulliad gymhwysedd deddfwriaethol i newid y system bleidleisio ar gyfer llywodraeth leol? A wnaiff gadarnhau y bydd yn pwyso ar Lywodraeth y DU i gael y cymhwysedd hwnnw, hyd yn oed os nad yw o reidrwydd yn cytuno â mi ar ganlyniadau posibl cael y grym hwnnw?

The Bill does not include a legal requirement that the chairs of scrutiny committees be politically balanced, as has been pointed out by the previous contributor. Will the Minister reconsider that particular aspect?

Nid yw'r Mesur yn cynnwys gofyniad cyfreithiol i gael cydbwysedd gwleidyddol o ran cadeiryddion pwyllgorau craffu, fel y nododd y cyfrannwr blaenorol. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ailystyried yr agwedd benodol honno?

Will the Minister also look at the fact that the Bill contains no requirement for town and community councils to promote elections or publish information regarding the results of elections? In particular, although there is a long list of matters that a town and

A wnaiff y Gweinidog hefyd edrych ar y ffaith nad yw'r Bil yn cynnwys dim gofyniad i gynghorau tref a chymuned hyrwyddo etholiadau na chyhoeddi gwybodaeth am ganlyniadau etholiadau? Yn benodol, er bod rhestr hir o faterion y mae'n rhaid i gyngor

community council must publicise electronically, there is no reference to the declarations of interest of its own members. Will the Minister consider incorporating that in the Bill and maybe making it a provision in relation to principal councils as well? Some councils put that information on the net, but, with others, you have to traipse over to some dark corner of a town hall, miles from where you live, to find out what your local councillor has an interest in, in order to hold them to account.

tref a chymuned eu cyhoeddi'n electronig, ni chyfeirir at ddatganiadau buddiannau ei aelodau ei hun. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ystyried cynnwys hynny yn y Bil ac efallai ei wneud yn ddarpariaeth ar gyfer prif gynghorau hefyd? Mae rhai cynghorau yn rhoi'r wybodaeth ar y we, ond, gydag eraill, rhaid i chi ymlwybro i ryw gornel dywyll o neuadd y dref, filltiroedd o'r man lle'r ydych yn byw, i gael gwybod beth yw buddiannau eich cynghorydd lleol, er mwyn ei ddal i gyfrif.

Carl Sargeant: The Member also raises some important issues. The power of wellbeing for town and community councils has been introduced, but enabling those councils to do more for the democratic process, in agreement with local authorities and the Welsh Government, is something that I am keen to explore further to find the most appropriate route for the delivery of services.

Carl Sargeant: Mae'r Aelod hefyd yn codi rhai materion pwysig. Cyflwynwyd pŵer llesiant i gynghorau tref a chymuned, ond rwyf yn awyddus i archwilio ymhellach i'r posibilrwydd o alluogi'r cynghorau hynny i wneud mwy ar gyfer y broses ddemocrataidd, drwy gytundeb ag awdurdodau lleol a Llywodraeth Cymru, er mwyn dod o hyd i'r llwybr mwyaf priodol ar gyfer darparu gwasanaethau.

The issue of town and community councils being web-enabled is ambitious, I believe. It is not the fault of town and community councils or that they do not want to be more open and transparent, but sometimes it is about capacity. We have some very small councils, and I hope that we can enable their IT provision to come into the twenty-first century. Alongside that, we may be able to issue guidance on what is expected of town and community councils in respect of IT provision and content.

Credaf ei fod yn syniad uchelgeisiol i roi gwybodaeth cynghorau tref a chymuned ar y We. Nid oes bai ar gynghorau tref a chymuned ac nid ydynt yn erbyn bod yn fwy agored a thryloyw. Weithiau mae'n ymwneud â'r ffaith nad oes digon o bobl ganddynt. Mae gennym rai cynghorau bach iawn, a gobeithiaf y gallwn eu galluogi i ddod â'u darpariaeth TG i'r unfed ganrif ar hugain. Ochr yn ochr â hynny, mae'n bosibl y gallwn gyhoeddi canllawiau ar yr hyn a ddisgwylir gan gynghorau tref a chymuned mewn perthynas â darpariaeth a chynnwys TG.

I share the Member's concern about declarations of interest. It is extremely important that members of the public fully understand what their elected members stand for and what they are involved in, by way of a declaration. Of course, when a candidate stands and serves as an independent member, it would be much better if they were to provide the full details of their political affiliation through a declaration of interest, as appropriate.

Rwyf yn rhannu pryder yr Aelod ynglŷn â datganiadau buddiannau. Mae'n eithriadol o bwysig bod aelodau'r cyhoedd yn deall yn llawn yr hyn y mae eu haelodau etholedig yn ei gefnogi a'r hyn y maent yn cymryd rhan ynddo, drwy gyfrwng datganiad. Wrth gwrs, pan fydd ymgeisydd yn sefyll ac yn gwasanaethu fel aelod annibynnol, byddai'n llawer gwell pe byddai'n darparu manylion llawn ei ymlyniad gwleidyddol drwy ddatganiad buddiannau, fel y bo'n briodol.

Julie Morgan: I have two questions. This Bill will improve democratic processes and give additional skills and more opportunities to councillors. Is there any chance of using it

Julie Morgan: Mae gennyf ddau gwestiwn. Bydd y Mesur hwn yn gwella prosesau democrataidd ac yn rhoi sgiliau ychwanegol a mwy o gyfleoedd i gynghorwyr. A oes

as an opportunity to improve the diversity of candidates, so that councillors better represent the communities where they stand? Has the Minister given any consideration to the democratic and accountability issues related to the city regions?

unrhyw obaith o'i ddefnyddio fel cyfle i wella amrywiaeth ymgeiswyr, er mwyn i gynghorwyr gynrychioli'r cymunedau lle maent yn sefyll yn well? A yw'r Gweinidog wedi rhoi unrhyw ystyriaeth i'r materion democrataidd ac atebolrwydd sy'n gysylltiedig â'r dinas-ranbarthau?

Carl Sargeant: I thank the Member for her questions. It is important to recognise that, while this Bill does not have much content as a means of exploring opportunities for diversity, the Local Government (Wales) Measure 2011 did. That is why this is a tidying-up exercise for the local government Measure. The issue of encouraging and enabling different types of people to become councillors is a really important part of the Measure, as is the ability to change meeting times, the ability to hold meetings using web links, and the importance of childcare provision, et cetera. That is all part of the landscape. We know that the majority of councils within Wales—and, I would go as far as to say the majority of those within the UK—are made up of white, retired males over the age of 60. I hope that we can help to change that whole dimension by taking this issue forward.

Carl Sargeant: Diolch i'r Aelod am ei chwestiynau. Mae'n bwysig cydnabod nad yw'r Bil hwn yn cynnwys llawer o ddarpariaethau i archwilio cyfleoedd ar gyfer amrywiaeth, ond bod Deddf Llywodraeth Leol (Cymru) 2011 yn cynnwys hynny. Dyna pam mai mater o dacluso'r Mesur llywodraeth leol yw hyn. Mae'r mater o annog a galluogi gwahanol fathau o bobl i ddod yn gynghorwyr yn rhan bwysig iawn o'r Mesur, yn ogystal â'r gallu i newid amseroedd cyfarfodydd, y gallu i ddefnyddio dolenni ar y we i gynnal cyfarfodydd, a phwysigrwydd darpariaeth gofal plant ac ati. Mae hynny i gyd yn rhan o'r drafodaeth. Rydym yn gwybod mai dynion gwyn wedi ymddeol dros 60 oed yw aelodau'r rhan fwyaf o gynghorau yng Nghymru—a, byddwn yn mynd cyn belled â dweud y rhan fwyaf o'r rheini yn y DU. Gobeithiaf y gallwn helpu i newid y dimensiwn cyfan drwy fwrw ymlaen â'r mater hwn.

The second point that the Member raised was about—?

Yr ail bwynt a gododd yr Aelod oedd—?

Julie Morgan: City regions.

Julie Morgan: Dinas-ranbarthau.

Carl Sargeant: I am grateful for that reminder. The governance arrangements for city regions are still very unclear, and we are trying to fully understand the role of the city region. I am working very closely on this with the Minister for Business, Enterprise, Technology and Science. There is no statutory function within the Welsh Government currently in relation to city regions, but I hope that they will be able to complement the current structures of regional operation. Therefore, there is still work to be done on the governance arrangements for that. However, I would not want to get lost in the issue of governance arrangements for city regions, because my view is that elected members are currently within the governance structure that exists for local government.

Carl Sargeant: Diolch am fy atgoffa. Mae trefniadau llywodraethu dinas-ranbarthau'n dal i fod yn aneglur iawn, ac rydym yn ceisio deall yn llawn beth yw swyddogaeth y ddinas-ranbarth. Rwyf yn gweithio'n agos iawn ar hyn gyda'r Gweinidog Busnes, Menter, Technoleg a Gwyddoniaeth. Nid oes unrhyw swyddogaeth statudol o fewn Llywodraeth Cymru ar hyn o bryd mewn perthynas â dinas-ranbarthau, ond gobeithiaf y gallant ategu'r strwythurau rhanbarthol presennol. Felly, mae gwaith i'w wneud ar y trefniadau llywodraethu yn hynny o beth. Fodd bynnag, ni hoffwn fynd ar goll yn y trefniadau llywodraethu ar gyfer dinas-ranbarthau, oherwydd bod y strwythur llywodraethu sy'n bodoli ar gyfer llywodraeth leol, yn fy marn i, yn berthnasol i

aelodau etholedig ar hyn o bryd.

The Presiding Officer: Item 4, a statement by the Minister for Business, Enterprise, Technology and Science giving an update on enterprise zones, and item 5, a statement by the First Minister on the Welsh Government's response to the Commission on Devolution in Wales, have been withdrawn.

Y Llywydd: Mae eitem 4, datganiad gan y Gweinidog Busnes, Menter, Technoleg a Gwyddoniaeth yn rhoi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am ardaloedd menter, ac eitem 5, datganiad gan y Prif Weinidog ar ymateb Llywodraeth Cymru i'r Comisiwn ar Ddatganoli yng Nghymru, wedi cael eu tynnu'n ôl.

Adroddiad Blynyddol Datblygu Cynaliadwy
The Sustainable Development Annual Report

Y Llywydd: Rwyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 2, 3, 4 a 5 yn enw Aled Roberts, a gwelliannau 6, 7, 8, 9, 10 ac 11 yn enw William Graham.

The Presiding Officer: I have selected amendments 1, 2, 3, 4 and 5 in the name of Aled Roberts, and amendments 6, 7, 8, 9, 10 and 11 in the name of William Graham.

Cynnig NDM5102 Jane Hutt

Motion NDM5102 Jane Hutt

Cynnig bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales:

Yn nodi cynnydd a wnaed mewn perthynas â datblygu cynaliadwy yn 2011-12, fel yr amlinellir yn Adroddiad Blynyddol Llywodraeth Cymru ar y Cynllun Datblygu Cynaliadwy, a osodwyd gerbron Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru ar 20 Tachwedd 2012.

Notes the progress made on sustainable development in 2011-12, as set out in the Welsh Government's Annual Report of the Sustainable Development Scheme, which was laid before the National Assembly for Wales on 20 November 2012.

The Minister for Environment and Sustainable Development (John Griffiths): I move the motion

Y Gweinidog Amgylchedd a Datblygu Cynaliadwy (John Griffiths): Cynigiaf y cynnig

Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 3.22 p.m.
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 3.22 p.m.

Since the Government of Wales Act 1998, which established the National Assembly for Wales, put in place a duty to have a scheme setting out how it proposed to promote sustainable development, it has become an integral part of our governance in Wales. The duty, which since the subsequent Government of Wales Act 2006 falls to the Welsh Ministers, is one that we as a Welsh Government have fully embraced. In doing so, we have committed to going further than the current duty, by aiming to have sustainable development as our central organising principle at the heart of everything that we do. I am grateful that the report, including the commentary from the commissioner for sustainable futures, has

Ers i Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, a sefydlodd Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, sefydlu dyletswydd i gael cynllun sy'n nodi sut yr oedd yn bwriadu hyrwyddo datblygu cynaliadwy, mae wedi dod yn rhan annatod o'n llywodraethu yng Nghymru. Mae'r ddyletswydd, sydd ers Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 2006 yn perthyn i Weinidogion Cymru, yn un yr ydym fel Llywodraeth Cymru wedi ei chroesawu'n llawn. Wrth wneud hynny, rydym wedi ymrwymo i fynd ymhellach na'r ddyletswydd bresennol, drwy anelu at sicrhau bod datblygu cynaliadwy'n egwyddor drefnu ganolog wrth wraidd popeth a wnawn. Rwy'n ddiolchgar bod yr adroddiad, gan gynnwys y sylwadau gan y comisiynydd ar gyfer dyfodol cynaliadwy,

been welcomed by Members, and I accept amendment 1 to the motion.

wedi ei groesawu gan Aelodau, ac rwy'n derbyn gwelliant 1 i'r cynnig.

This report summarises how, in the financial year 2011-12, the proposals of the sustainable development scheme have been implemented. I therefore present it to Members. In doing so, I wish to draw Members' attention to the key elements of the report. It has been structured to reflect the contents of the current sustainable development scheme, 'One Wales: One Planet'. Since 2009, when the scheme was published, our aims as a Government have, of course, had to adapt to the tough times that we are now facing. However, the challenges that we face also emphasise more strongly the opportunities and the importance of planning for the long term. Delivering against our priorities with tighter budgets also emphasises the need to take an integrated approach. Both, of course, are key sustainable development principles.

Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn crynhoi sut, yn y flwyddyn ariannol 2011-12, mae cynigion y cynllun datblygu cynaliadwy wedi cael eu gweithredu. Rwyf felly'n ei gyflwyno i Aelodau. Wrth wneud hynny, hoffwn dynnu sylw'r Aelodau at elfennau allweddol yr adroddiad. Mae wedi ei strwythuro i adlewyrchu cynnwys y cynllun datblygu cynaliadwy presennol, 'Cymru'n Un: Cenedl Un Blaned'. Ers 2009, pan gyhoeddwyd y cynllun, mae ein hamcanion fel Llywodraeth, wrth gwrs, wedi gorfod addasu i'r dyddiau dyrys sy'n ein hwynebu yn awr. Fodd bynnag, mae'r heriau sy'n ein hwynebu hefyd yn pwysleisio'n gryfach y cyfleoedd a phwysigrwydd cynllunio ar gyfer y tymor hir. Mae cyflawni yn erbyn ein blaenoriaethau gyda chyllidebau tynnach hefyd yn pwysleisio'r angen i fabwysiadu dulliau integredig. Mae'r rhain ill dau, wrth gwrs, yn egwyddorion datblygu cynaliadwy allweddol.

As a Government, we remain committed to taking a long-term approach and to finding the best development path for Wales that will improve the lives of the Welsh people. That is a key reason why we are fully committed to sustainable development as our central organising principle, and why we will use it as a framework through which we drive and ensure delivery against our priorities. This year's report updates on progress from across the Welsh Government with respect to the sustainable development scheme. There is much that we are doing and continue to do to promote sustainable development. The report does not feature every example that we could have included—a point made by Peter Davies, the commissioner for sustainable futures—but it does reflect the range of activities and summarises progress within the time frame. We are always happy to improve its content and provide more detail where necessary, and therefore have no objection to amendment 2. It is important to highlight that, given our commitment to SD as our central organising principle, this report should be seen in tandem with our programme for government reporting.

Fel Llywodraeth, rydym yn parhau'n ymrwymedig i gymryd ymagwedd hirdymor ac i ddod o hyd i'r llwybr datblygu gorau i Gymru a fydd yn gwella bywydau pobl Cymru. Mae hynny'n rheswm allweddol pam yr ydym wedi ymrwymo'n llwyr i ddatblygu cynaliadwy fel egwyddor drefnu ganolog, a pham y byddwn yn ei ddefnyddio fel fframwaith i sbarduno a sicrhau cyflawniad yn erbyn ein blaenoriaethau. Mae adroddiad eleni'n rhoi diweddariadau ar gynnydd ar draws Llywodraeth Cymru o ran y cynllun datblygu cynaliadwy. Mae llawer yr ydym yn ei wneud ac yn parhau i'w wneud i hyrwyddo datblygu cynaliadwy. Nid yw'r adroddiad yn cynnwys pob enghraifft y gallem fod wedi'i chynnwys—pwynt a wnaethpwyd gan Peter Davies, y comisiynydd dyfodol cynaliadwy—ond mae'n adlewyrchu'r ystod o weithgareddau ac mae'n crynhoi'r cynnydd o fewn y ffrâm amser. Rydym bob amser yn hapus i wella ei gynnwys a rhoi mwy o fanylion lle bo eu hangen, ac felly nid oes gwrthwynebiad i welliant 2. Mae'n bwysig tynnu sylw at y ffaith, ac ystyried ein hymrwymiad i ddatblygu cynaliadwy fel ein hegwyddor drefnu ganolog, y dylai'r adroddiad hwn gael ei ystyried ar y cyd â'n rhaglen ar gyfer adrodd llywodraeth.

I mentioned the views of Peter Davies, the commissioner for sustainable futures, who has provided his independent views against the progress of Welsh Government. I am grateful to Peter for his insights and recommendations to improve our work and the reporting process itself. We have taken on board much of his advice in this year's report and will look for ways to improve this process on an ongoing basis. I hope that Members recognise the value of the commentary and the suggestions that he has made to strengthen our current commitment to SD. We will continue to pay close attention to the commissioner's commentary and look for ways to build on his recommendations, where possible. The commissioner has highlighted that, in some instances, we have not put enough emphasis on the sustainable outcomes resulting from Welsh Government initiatives. I am keen to champion this good practice and therefore welcome amendment 3.

Soniais am farn Peter Davies, comisiynydd dyfodol cynaliadwy, sydd wedi rhoi ei farn annibynnol yn erbyn cynnydd Llywodraeth Cymru. Rwy'n ddiolchgar i Peter am ei dreiddgarwch a'i argymhellion i wella ein gwaith a'r broses adrodd ei hun. Rydym wedi ystyried llawer o'i gyngor yn adroddiad eleni, a byddwn yn chwilio am ffyrdd i wella'r broses hon yn barhaus. Rwy'n gobeithio bod yr Aelodau'n cydnabod gwerth y sylwadau a'r awgrymiadau y mae wedi eu gwneud i gryfhau ein hymrwymiad presennol i ddatblygu cynaliadwy. Byddwn yn parhau i roi sylw agos i sylwadau'r comisiynydd a chwilio am ffyrdd i adeiladu ar ei argymhellion, lle bo hynny'n bosibl. Mae'r comisiynydd wedi tynnu sylw at y ffaith nad ydym, mewn rhai achosion, wedi rhoi digon o bwyslais ar ganlyniadau cynaliadwy sy'n deillio o fentrau Llywodraeth Cymru. Rwy'n awyddus i hyrwyddo'r arfer da hwn ac felly rwyf yn croesawu gwelliant 3.

We are putting in place a range of measures that will help us to increase action towards a more sustainable Wales. Amendments 4 and 5 recognise much of the good work done through the Arbed programme, our support of small-scale renewable energy projects, integrated public transport and the electrification of the Great Western main line and Valleys lines. I am happy to support these amendments.

Rydym yn sefydlu ystod o fesurau a fydd yn ein helpu i wneud mwy i sicrhau Cymru fwy cynaliadwy. Mae gwelliannau 4 a 5 yn cydnabod llawer o'r gwaith da a wnaed drwy'r rhaglen Arbed, ein cefnogaeth i brosiectau ynni adnewyddadwy ar raddfa fach, trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus integredig a thrydanu prif lein y Great Western a rheilffyrdd y Cymoedd. Rwyf yn hapus i gefnogi'r gwelliannau hyn.

Members may recall our debate earlier this year on the independent review of the SD scheme carried out by PricewaterhouseCoopers. I promised to provide an update in this year's report on how we are responding to its recommendations. A number of the steps that PwC has suggested are ones that we have been able to progress quickly, such as the strengthening of the alignment of sustainable development with the programme for government, the design of the delivering results principles used by policies and programmes, reinforcing good practice, including sustainable development as a central organising principle, and the work of the Welsh Government with the public engagement Wales group to improve the standards and extent of public engagement

Efallai y bydd aelodau'n cofio ein dadl yn gynharach eleni ar yr adolygiad annibynnol o'r cynllun Datblygu Cynaliadwy a gynhaliwyd gan PricewaterhouseCoopers. Addewais roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf yn adroddiad eleni ar sut yr ydym yn ymateb i'w argymhellion. Mae nifer o'r camau y mae PwC wedi'u hawgrymu yn rhai yr ydym wedi gallu eu rhoi ar waith yn gyflym, megis sicrhau bod datblygu cynaliadwy'n cyd-fynd yn well â'r rhaglen lywodraethu, dylunio'r egwyddorion o ran cyflwyno canlyniadau a ddefnyddir gan bolisïau a rhaglenni, atgyfnerthu arfer da, cynnwys datblygu cynaliadwy fel egwyddor drefnu ganolog, a gwaith Llywodraeth Cymru â grŵp ymgysylltu â'r cyhoedd Cymru i wella safonau ymgysylltu â'r cyhoedd, ac i ba raddau y'i gwneir, drwy ddatblygu polisïau a

through policy development and service delivery.

chyflenwi gwasanaethau.

Other recommendations will lead to changes, but over a longer period of time. This will focus on a continued process of improvement that can be implemented at a more gradual pace.

Bydd argymhellion eraill yn arwain at newidiadau, ond dros gyfnod hwy. Bydd hyn yn canolbwyntio ar broses barhaus o welliant y gellir ei gweithredu'n fwy graddol.

I am pleased that we have been able to take significant action in this short period of time, as highlighted by the commissioner for sustainable futures. The annual report provides an important opportunity to take stock and assess the performance of the Welsh Government in relation to SD. Having the right long-term measures of progress is crucial to this. Our SD indicators feature throughout the report and show the key trends in Wales. When using indicators, it is important to look at the overall picture that is emerging rather than hone in on a particular aspect. For Wales, that picture is undeniably positive, but I appreciate that we need to monitor carefully the indicators that are not moving in the direction that we would want.

Rwy'n falch ein bod wedi gallu cymryd camau sylweddol yn y cyfnod byr hwn, fel yr amlygwyd gan y comisiynydd dyfodol cynaliadwy. Mae'r adroddiad blynyddol yn rhoi cyfle pwysig i bwyso a mesur ac asesu perfformiad Llywodraeth Cymru mewn perthynas â datblygu cynaliadwy. Mae cael y mesurau cynnydd hirdymor cywir yn hanfodol i hyn. Mae ein dangosyddion datblygu cynaliadwy yn amlwg drwy gydol yr adroddiad ac yn dangos y tueddiadau allweddol yng Nghymru. Wrth ddefnyddio dangosyddion, mae'n bwysig edrych ar y darlun cyffredinol sy'n dod i'r amlwg yn hytrach na chanolbwyntio ar un agwedd benodol. Yng Nghymru, mae'r llun yn ddiamheuaeth yn un cadarnhaol, ond gwerthfawrogaf fod angen inni fonitro'n ofalus y dangosyddion nad ydynt yn symud i'r cyfeiriad y byddem yn ei ddymuno.

The current set of SD indicators that we use has been in the same format since 2008. I am happy with many of the indicators that we use, but I think that it is right that we take stock of what is appropriate in providing a clear sense of progress. They should also be able to take into account our future plans for legislation on sustainable development. As a result, we will be consulting on our indicators next year. For those reasons, I do not believe that it is appropriate to accept amendments 6, 7, 8 and 9.

Mae'r set gyfredol o ddangosyddion datblygu cynaliadwy yr ydym yn ei defnyddio wedi bod ar yr un fformat ers 2008. Rwy'n hapus gyda llawer o'r dangosyddion yr ydym yn eu defnyddio, ond credaf ei bod yn briodol i ni bwyso a mesur yr hyn sy'n briodol o ran darparu ymdeimlad clir o gynnydd. Dylent hefyd allu ystyried ein cynlluniau i'r dyfodol ar gyfer deddfwriaeth ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy. O ganlyniad, byddwn yn ymgynghori ar ein dangosyddion y flwyddyn nesaf. Am y rhesymau hynny, ni chredaf ei bod yn briodol derbyn gwelliannau 6, 7, 8 a 9.

Much of the report focuses on how the Welsh Government is implementing sustainable development in its external activities. We can look to the programme for government in demonstrating how we are looking to the longer term in the decisions that we make now. However, it is equally important that we show that we are delivering sustainable development in our everyday activities.

Mae llawer o'r adroddiad yn canolbwyntio ar sut y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn gweithredu datblygu cynaliadwy yn eu gweithgareddau allanol. Gallwn droi at y rhaglen lywodraethu i ddangos sut yr ydym yn edrych at y tymor hwy yn y penderfyniadau a wnawn yn awr. Fodd bynnag, mae'r un mor bwysig ein bod yn dangos ein bod yn sicrhau datblygu cynaliadwy yn ein gweithgareddau bob dydd.

3.30 p.m.

We started this type of integrated reporting last year, looking just at the environmental performance and energy efficiency of the Welsh Government's estate. A separate report on the state of the estate was published earlier this month, and it goes into more detail, which I know that Members will find interesting. Our own update highlights a broader range of activities, reflecting the other key elements of sustainable development. This approach reflected earlier suggestions from the commissioner, and we are happy to look at how we can improve this process. The commissioner has this year made several helpful recommendations, and we will work with colleagues to see how these can be taken on. On that basis, I support amendments 10 and 11.

Dechreusom y math hwn o adrodd integredig y llynedd, gan edrych ar berfformiad amgylcheddol ac effeithlonrwydd ynni ystâd Llywodraeth Cymru yn unig. Cyhoeddwyd adroddiad ar wahân ar gyflwr yr ystâd yn gynharach y mis hwn, ac mae'n rhoi mwy o fanylion; gwn y bydd Aelodau'n ei gael yn ddiddorol. Mae ein diweddariad yn tynnu sylw at ystod ehangach o weithgareddau, gan adlewyrchu'r elfennau allweddol eraill ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy. Roedd y dulliau hyn yn adlewyrchu awgrymiadau cynharach gan y comisiynydd, ac rydym yn hapus i edrych ar sut y gallwn wella'r broses hon. Mae'r comisiynydd eleni wedi gwneud llawer o argymhellion defnyddiol, a byddwn yn gweithio gyda chydweithwyr i weld sut y gellir ystyried y rhain. Ar y sail honno, rwyf yn cefnogi gwelliannau 10 a 11.

I started this afternoon by highlighting the importance that we place on our sustainable development duty and our commitment to seeing it progressed in the work of the Welsh Government. I am grateful that Members from all sides of the Assembly have shared that commitment. This year's report builds on the good work that we have demonstrated in fulfilling our sustainable development duty. We remain committed to sustainable development as a principle that drives all our work. The report attempts to capture this, and I very much look forward to hearing Members' views.

Dechreuais brynhawn heddiw trwy dynnu sylw at y pwysigrwydd a rown i'n dyletswydd ym maes datblygu cynaliadwy a'n hymrwymiad i'w weithredu yng ngwaith Llywodraeth Cymru. Rwy'n ddiolchgar bod Aelodau o bob ochr i'r Cynulliad wedi rhannu'r ymrwymiad hwnnw. Mae adroddiad eleni'n adeiladu ar y gwaith da yr ydym wedi'i ddangos wrth gyflawni ein dyletswydd datblygu cynaliadwy. Rydym yn dal i fod yn ymrwymedig i ddatblygu cynaliadwy fel egwyddor sy'n sail i'n holl waith. Mae'r adroddiad yn ceisio crynhoi hyn, ac rwyf yn edrych ymlaen yn fawr at glywed barn yr Aelodau.

Gwelliant 1—Aled Roberts

Amendment 1—Aled Roberts

Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

Add as a new point at the end of motion:

Yn croesawu'r ffaith bod Adroddiad Blynyddol y Cynllun Datblygu Cynaliadwy wedi'i gyhoeddi, ac yn arbennig sylwadau'r Comisiynydd Dyfodol Cynaliadwy.

Welcomes the publication of the Annual Report of the Sustainable Development Scheme, in particular the commentary by the Sustainable Futures Commissioner.

Gwelliant 2—Aled Roberts

Amendment 2—Aled Roberts

Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

Add as a new point at the end of motion:

Yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i roi argymhellion y Comisiynydd Dyfodol Cynaliadwy ar waith, er mwyn sicrhau y rhoddir digon o sylw i feysydd fel amaethyddiaeth, diogelu'r cyflenwad bwyd a thwristiaeth yn y dyfodol.

Calls on the Welsh Government to enact the recommendations of the Sustainable Futures Commissioner to ensure that sufficient attention is given to areas such as agriculture, food security and tourism in the future.

Gwelliant 3—Aled Roberts

Amendment 3—Aled Roberts

Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

Add as a new point at the end of motion:

Yn nodi beirniadaeth y Comisiynydd Dyfodol Cynaliadwy fod 'rhai rhannau o'r adroddiad i'w gweld yn hyrwyddo arian a ddyrennir ac a werir ar gynlluniau yn hytrach na hyrwyddo'r canlyniadau a'r manteision i gynaliadwyedd sy'n deillio o'r cynlluniau hynny', ac yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i ailystyried y modd y mae'n asesu llwyddiant rhaglenni Llywodraeth Cymru ar draws pob adran, yn seiliedig ar ganlyniadau yn hytrach nag ar fewnbwn.

Notes the criticism of the Sustainable Futures Commissioner 'that the report, seems to be championing money allocated and spent on initiatives, rather than championing the sustainable outcomes and benefits derived from those initiatives' and calls on the Welsh Government to reconsider the way it assesses the success of Welsh Government programmes across all departments, based on outcomes rather than inputs.

Gwelliant 4—Aled Roberts

Amendment 4—Aled Roberts

Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

Add as a new point at the end of motion:

Yn credu y bydd Llywodraeth Cymru yn gwneud mwy o gynnydd at Gymru gynaliadwy os gwnaiff sicrhau bod mwy o'r canlynol ar gael:

a) rhaglenni effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref fel Arbed;

b) rhaglenni sy'n annog cymunedau i fuddsoddi mewn prosiectau ynni adnewyddadwy graddfa fach fel trydan dŵr; ac

c) trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus integredig.

Believes the Welsh Government will make further progress towards a sustainable Wales if it increases the availability of:

a) home energy efficiency programmes such as Arbed;

b) programmes to encourage communities to invest in small-scale renewable energy projects such as hydro-electricity; and

c) integrated public transport.

Gwelliant 5—Aled Roberts

Amendment 5—Aled Roberts

Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

Add as a new point at the end of motion:

Yn croesawu ymrwymiad Llywodraeth y DU i drydanu, a'r effaith gadarnhaol y bydd hyn yn ei chael ar leihau allyriadau CO2 Cymru.

Welcomes the UK Government's commitment to electrification and the positive effect this will have on reducing Wales' CO2 emissions.

William Powell: I move amendments 1, 2, 3, 4 and 5 in the name of Aled Roberts. I thank

William Powell: Cynigiaf welliannau 1, 2, 3, 4 a 5 yn enw Aled Roberts. Diolchaf i'r

the Minister for Environment and Sustainable Development for showing himself to be in listening mode by embracing all those amendments.

Gweinidog Amgylchedd a Datblygu Cynaliadwy am ddangos ei fod yn barod i wrando drwy groesawu pob un o'r gwelliannau hynny.

How Wales intends to develop sustainability is a critical question, which we must all address if we are to build a successful and long-term economy that makes the most of our strengths, but is also not too dependent on variables that are beyond our immediate control. For sustainable development to take root as the central organising principle through which families plan, companies operate and legislatures govern, we need to bring about a sea change in how we engage with our environment and in how we behave with one another. This is not the kind of change that we can expect to see overnight, but the kind that we continue to make in small, incremental steps as we improve our situation year on year. It is for this reason that I welcome the report and the steps that are shown to have gone in the right direction this year, although, as the Minister has conceded, in some cases, there is room for us to accelerate and to do more.

Mae sut y mae Cymru yn bwriadu datblygu cynaliadwyedd yn gwestiwn allweddol, y mae'n rhaid i ni i gyd ei ateb os ydym am adeiladu economi lwyddiannus a hirdymor sy'n gwneud y mwyaf o'n cryfderau, ond heb fod yn rhy ddibynnol ar newidynnau sydd y tu hwnt i'n rheolaeth uniongyrchol. Er mwyn i ddatblygu cynaliadwy wreiddio fel yr egwyddor drefnu ganolog a ddefnyddir gan deuluoedd i gynllunio, gan gwmnïau i weithredu a gan ddeddfwrfeydd i lywodraethu, mae angen i ni sicrhau newid mawr yn y ffordd yr ydym yn ymgysylltu â'n hamgylchedd ac yn ein hymddygiad gyda'n gilydd. Nid yw hwn y math o newid y gallwn ddisgwyl ei weld dros nos, ond y math yr ydym yn parhau i'w wneud mewn camau bach, cynyddol wrth i ni wella ein sefyllfa flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn. Dyma pam yr wyf yn croesawu'r adroddiad a'r camau y dangosir eu bod wedi mynd i'r cyfeiriad cywir eleni, er bod lle i ni gyflymu a gwneud mwy mewn rhai achosion, fel y mae'r Gweinidog eisoes wedi cyfaddef.

For this to be successful, the Welsh Government must be fully honest and fully transparent as to what progress, if any, has been made in any particular indicated area. While all parties here will act to ensure that the Welsh Government is held to account, I wish to pay particular tribute to Peter Davies, our Commissioner for Sustainable Futures, for the fine work that he has already undertaken as the Government's critical friend, and for the important commentary that was referred to in the Minister's address. In doing this, Peter Davies highlights what has been a success, as well as those areas that have been a disappointment over the past year. He makes several valuable suggestions as to how future reports can be further improved. In particular, he draws attention to the Government's apparent tendencies to cherry-pick data for best results, and also to the apparent disconnect between the focus on money spent and outcomes achieved. When dealing with such issues, there is always a tendency to think that the more money we

Er mwyn i hyn fod yn llwyddiannus, rhaid i Lywodraeth Cymru fod yn gwbl onest a thryloyw ynghylch pa gynnydd, os oes cynnydd o gwbl, sydd wedi'i wneud mewn unrhyw faes penodol a nodir. Er y bydd pob plaid yma'n gweithredu i sicrhau bod Llywodraeth Cymru yn cael ei dwyn i gyfrif, hoffwn dalu teyrnged arbennig i Peter Davies, ein Comisiynydd Dyfodol Cynaliadwy, am y gwaith gwych y mae eisoes wedi'i wneud fel cyfaill beirniadol y Llywodraeth, ac am y sylwadau pwysig y cyfeiriwyd atynt yn anerchiad y Gweinidog. Wrth wneud hyn, mae Peter Davies yn tynnu sylw at yr hyn sydd wedi bod yn llwyddiant, yn ogystal â'r meysydd hynny sydd wedi bod yn siom dros y flwyddyn ddiwethaf. Mae'n gwneud llawer o awgrymiadau gwerthfawr ar sut y gellir gwella ymhellach adroddiadau yn y dyfodol. Yn benodol, mae'n tynnu sylw at dueddiadau ymddangosiadol y Llywodraeth i ddewis a dethol data i roi'r canlyniadau gorau, a hefyd at y diffyg cysylltiad ymddangosiadol rhwng y ffocws ar yr arian a

spend, the better results we get. Unfortunately, this is often not the case when it comes to sustainable development.

wariwyd a’r canlyniadau a gyflawnwyd. Wrth ddelio â materion o’r fath, ceir tuedd bob amser i feddwl mai po fwyaf o arian a wariwn, y gorau fydd y canlyniadau a gawn. Yn anffodus, yn aml ni fydd hyn yn wir ym maes datblygu cynaliadwy.

Our focus when measuring accomplishments should be placed more on outcomes. We must pin down precisely what has been achieved and what specific gains we expect to make. Simply throwing money at the problem cannot work in isolation. I would be grateful if the Minister could outline what specific changes he envisages for future reports, to ensure that sufficient attention is given to areas such as agriculture and food security, which is flagged up in one of the amendments that he has kindly supported. Both these areas are noted to be lacking in the report as it stands. Linked to this, I want to touch on the importance of effective indicators to ensure that outcomes are measured in a meaningful way, that productive comparisons can be made across regions and that account is taken of international standards.

Dylem ganolbwyntio mwy ar ganlyniadau wrth fesur cyflawniadau. Rhaid inni nodi’n union yr hyn a gyflawnwyd a pha enillion penodol yr ydym yn disgwyl eu gwneud. Ni allwn lwyddo drwy daflu arian yn unig at y broblem. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallai’r Gweinidog amlinellu pa newidiadau penodol y mae’n eu rhagweld i adroddiadau yn y dyfodol, er mwyn sicrhau bod sylw digonol yn cael ei roi i feysydd megis amaethyddiaeth a diogelwch bwyd, y nodir yn un o’r gwelliannau y mae wedi’u cefnogi yn garedig. Mae’r adroddiad fel y mae’n nodi bod y ddau faes hyn yn ddiffygiol. Yn gysylltiedig â hyn, hoffwn grybwyll pwysigrwydd dangosyddion effeithiol i sicrhau bod canlyniadau’n cael eu mesur mewn ffordd ystyrlon, y gallwn wneud cymariaethau cynhyrchiol ar draws rhanbarthau a’n bod yn ystyried safonau rhyngwladol.

While I believe that our sustainable development indicators are due to be looked at again—this was confirmed today—I am keen to hear more from the Minister regarding the improvements that he feels can be made and to which international case studies he intends to look to ensure that Wales is not left behind other parts of the European Union and the wider world.

Er fy mod yn credu bod ein dangosyddion datblygu cynaliadwy am gael eu hadolygu eto—cadarnhawyd hyn heddiw—rwyf yn awyddus i glywed mwy gan y Gweinidog ynghylch y gwelliannau y mae’n teimlo y gellir eu gwneud a pha astudiaethau achos rhyngwladol y mae’n bwriadu edrych arnynt i sicrhau na chaiff Cymru ei gadael ar ôl rhannau eraill o’r Undeb Ewropeaidd a’r byd ehangach.

On education, I previously raised the issue of the reduced focus on the education of sustainability in Welsh schools. Now that this report has also cited this deficiency, it is essential that this is addressed by the Welsh Government as a matter of urgency. Education plays a critical role in our transition towards a more sustainable society, and I would be grateful if the Minister, in his reply to this debate, could respond to the commissioner’s recommendation to involve Estyn proactively in an updated remit study.

O ran addysg, rwyf eisoes wedi codi mater y ffocws llai ar addysg cynaliadwyedd yn ysgolion Cymru. Gan fod yr adroddiad hwn nawr hefyd wedi nodi’r diffyg hwn, mae’n hanfodol bod Llywodraeth Cymru’n rhoi sylw i hyn fel mater brys. Mae gan addysg swyddogaeth hollbwysig wrth inni symud tuag at gymdeithas fwy cynaliadwy, a byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallai’r Gweinidog, yn ei ymateb i’r ddadl hon, ymateb i argymhelliad y comisiynydd i gynnwys Estyn yn rhagweithiol mewn astudiaeth cylch gwaith wedi’i diweddaru.

Finally, I want to touch on the subject of energy. How we choose to generate our power is the elephant in the room when it comes to sustainable development. Recent years have shown the cost of our fossil fuels continuing to rise and our energy bills along with them. Our only effective solution is to move away from these damaging and insecure fuel sources. While they will still have a part to play for some decades, we must commit ourselves to ensuring that this is an ever decreasing proportion of our overall energy mix. This movement, combined with the improved efficiencies made possible by the Green Deal and other smaller programmes, is the only way in which we can ever get close to being truly sustainable. This report makes small but important steps and I urge you to strengthen it by supporting the amendments, which have already been accepted. It is our intention to support the Conservative party's amendments.

Yn olaf, hoffwn grybwyll pwnc ynni. Pan godir pwnc datblygu cynaliadwy, nid oes neb am sôn am sut y dewiswn gynhyrchu ein pŵer. Mae'r blynyddoedd diwethaf wedi dangos bod cost ein tanwydd ffosil yn parhau i gynyddu, ynghyd â'n biliau ynni. Ein hunig ateb effeithiol yw symud i ffwrdd oddi wrth y ffynonellau tanwydd niweidiol ac ansicr hyn. Er y bydd ganddynt ran i'w chwarae am ddegawdau eto, rhaid i ni ymrwymo ein hunain i sicrhau bod y gyfran hon o gyfanswm yr ynni a ddefnyddiwn yn parhau i leihau. Y symudiad hwn, ynghyd â'r effeithlonrwydd gwell a wnaethpwyd yn bosibl gan y Fargen Werdd a rhaglenni llai eraill, yw'r unig ffordd y gallwn fyth ddod yn agos at fod yn wirioneddol gynaliadwy. Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn gwneud camau bach ond pwysig, ac rwy'n eich annog i'w gryfhau drwy gefnogi'r gwelliannau, sydd eisoes wedi cael eu derbyn. Ein bwriad yw cefnogi gwelliannau'r blaid Geidwadol.

Gwelliant 6—William Graham

Amendment 6—William Graham

Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

Add as a new point at the end of motion:

Yn mynegi pryder nad yw Llywodraeth Cymru wedi gwneud llawer o gynnydd at wella ei Dangosyddion Datblygu Cynaliadwy yn 2012.

Expresses concern that the Welsh Government has made little progress in improving its Sustainable Development Indicators in 2012.

Gwelliant 7—William Graham

Amendment 7—William Graham

Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

Add as a new point at the end of motion:

Yn galw ar y Llywodraeth i ddod â chamau unioni ymlaen ar frys i adfer y 22 Dangosydd Datblygu Cynaliadwy ar gyfer 2012 sydd wedi dirywio neu nad ydynt wedi gwella.

Calls on the Government to bring forward urgent remedial actions to resolve the 22 Sustainable Development Indicators for 2012 that have deteriorated or shown no improvement.

Gwelliant 8—William Graham

Amendment 8—William Graham

Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

Add as a new point at the end of motion:

Yn gresynu bod y prif ddangosydd Gwerth Ychwanegol Crynswth, fel yr amlinellir yn yr adroddiad, yn cyfateb i 74% o gyfartaledd y DU yn 2010, yr isaf o blith y gwledydd datganoledig a rhanbarthau Lloegr.

Regrets that the headline indicator of Gross Value Added (GVA), as outlined in the report, was 74% of the UK average in 2010, the lowest amongst the devolved countries and English regions.

Gwelliant 9—William Graham

Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

Yn gresynu na ddefnyddir llawer ar ddangosyddion economaidd yn yr adroddiad i ystyried llwyddiant polisi Datblygu Cynaliadwy Llywodraeth Cymru.

Amendment 9—William Graham

Add as a new point at the end of motion:

Regrets the limited use of economic indicators within the report to judge the success of the Welsh Government Sustainable Development policy.

Gwelliant 10—William Graham

Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

Yn nodi pryderon parhaus y Comisiynydd Dyfodol Cynaliadwy ynghylch elfennau o strwythur a chynnwys yr adroddiad.

Amendment 10—William Graham

Add as a new point at the end of motion:

Notes the continued concerns from the Sustainable Futures Commissioner regarding aspects of the structure and content of the report.

Gwelliant 11—William Graham

Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

Yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i roi'r argymhellion a wneir yn yr adroddiad gan y Comisiynydd Dyfodol Cynaliadwy ar waith yn llawn.

Amendment 11—William Graham

Add as a new point at the end of motion:

Calls on the Welsh Government to implement fully the recommendations made in the report by the Sustainable Futures Commissioner.

Russell George: I move amendments 6, 7, 8, 9, 10 and 11 in the name of William Graham.

I should say at the outset that we will be supporting the amendments put forward by the Welsh Liberal Democrats, as there is a clear cross-over in what we have set out in our amendments. I would like to pay tribute—as William Powell did in his comments—to the work of Peter Davies, the Government's critical friend. I am disappointed that the Government will not be supporting the majority of our amendments.

I am sure that many Members would agree that, in reading this report, a little over a year since we debated the 2010-11 report, it has very much a feeling of groundhog day about it. So much so that we, as a party group, have put forward a number of the same amendments this year as we did last year. That speaks volumes about the progress that the Government has made on implementing last year's recommendations. However, there

Russell George: Cynigiaf welliannau 6, 7, 8, 9, 10 ac 11 yn enw William Graham.

Dylwn ddweud ar y dechrau y byddwn yn cefnogi'r gwelliannau a gyflwynwyd gan Ddemocratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru, gan fod gorgyffwrdd clir yn yr hyn yr ydym wedi'i nodi yn ein gwelliannau. Hoffwn dalu teyrnged—fel y gwnaeth William Powell yn ei sylwadau—i waith Peter Davies, cyfaill beirniadol y Llywodraeth. Rwy'n siomedig na fydd y Llywodraeth yn cefnogi'r rhan fwyaf o'n gwelliannau.

Rwy'n siŵr y byddai llawer o Aelodau'n cytuno, wrth ddarllen yr adroddiad hwn, ychydig dros flwyddyn ers inni drafod yr adroddiad 2010-11, bod teimlad cryf o *groundhog day* am y peth. Cymaint felly nes ein bod ni, fel grŵp plaid, wedi cyflwyno nifer o'r un gwelliannau eleni ag y gwnaethom y llynedd. Mae hynny'n dweud cyfrolau am y cynnydd y mae'r Llywodraeth wedi'i wneud o ran rhoi argymhellion y

is one difference: the Commissioner for Sustainable Futures has been far more pointed in his criticism this year than he was last year. While the commissioner has tried to remain positive where he can, this report, in reality, is a stinging critique of the fact that this Government has still not got to grips with embedding sustainable development at the heart of what it does.

llynedd ar waith. Fodd bynnag, mae un gwahaniaeth: mae beirniadaeth y Comisiynydd Dyfodol Cynaliadwy wedi bod yn llawer mwy llym eleni nag yr oedd y llynedd. Er bod y comisiynydd wedi ceisio aros yn gadarnhaol lle y gall, mae'r adroddiad hwn, mewn gwirionedd, yn feirniadaeth lem o'r ffaith nad yw'r Llywodraeth hon o hyd wedi llwyddo i gynnwys datblygu cynaliadwy wrth wraidd yr hyn y mae'n ei wneud.

The commissioner has again highlighted concerns about the structure and content of this report; he highlights the fact that content has been cherry-picked rather than actively tested. He is critical about the sectors that receive little attention in the report, particularly the economy, food, tourism and agriculture, which raises the question as to whether these departments are failing to prioritise sustainable development in the way that Government rhetoric suggests that they should.

Mae'r comisiynydd wedi tynnu sylw unwaith eto at bryderon am strwythur a chynnwys yr adroddiad hwn; mae'n tynnu sylw at y ffaith bod y cynnwys wedi'i ddewis a'i ddethol yn hytrach na'i brofi'n weithredol. Mae'n feirniadol am y sectorau nad ydynt yn cael llawer o sylw yn yr adroddiad, yn enwedig yr economi, bwyd, twristiaeth ac amaethyddiaeth, sy'n codi'r cwestiwn a yw'r adrannau'n methu â blaenoriaethu datblygu cynaliadwy yn y ffordd y mae rhethreg y Llywodraeth yn awgrymu y dylent.

Again, there is a distinct lack of narrative in the report, with the commissioner highlighting the lack of connection between reporting of progress on sustainable development indicators and the narrative content related to it. What we see from the sustainable development indicators published in the summer is that very little has changed from what was reported last year. I accept that a time lag exists on recording the data sets, but the way that the information is recorded is not telling us what is really happening: greenhouse gases are on the rise; there is an erosion of key wildlife habitats; and Government policy on mobility is failing.

Unwaith eto, ceir diffyg naratif amlwg yn yr adroddiad, ac mae'r comisiynydd yn tynnu sylw at y diffyg cysylltiad rhwng adrodd ar gynnydd o ran dangosyddion datblygu cynaliadwy a'r cynnwys naratif sy'n gysylltiedig â hynny. Yr hyn a welwn gan y dangosyddion datblygu cynaliadwy a gyhoeddwyd yn yr haf yw nad oes fawr ddim wedi newid oddi ar yr hyn a adroddwyd y llynedd. Rwy'n derbyn bod oedi'n bodoli wrth gofnodi'r setiau data, ond nid yw'r ffordd y mae'r wybodaeth yn cael ei chofnodi'n dweud wrthym beth sy'n digwydd mewn gwirionedd: cynnydd mewn nwyon tŷ gwydr; erydu cynefinoedd bywyd gwyllt allweddol; a methiant polisi'r Llywodraeth ar symudedd.

I appreciate that the Minister is reviewing the indicators to see if they are fit for purpose, but I will say that he cannot afford to wait until the implementation of the sustainable development Bill to improve the monitoring and measuring of what are key performance indicators for this Government. This must be acted upon and changed ahead of next year's report because the principal function of this report is to be a scorecard for your programme for government with respect to its

Rwy'n deall bod y Gweinidog yn adolygu'r dangosyddion i weld a ydynt yn addas at eu diben, ond dywedaf na all fforddio aros i'r Bil datblygu cynaliadwy gael ei roi ar waith cyn gwella prosesau monitro a mesur y dangosyddion perfformiad allweddol i'r Llywodraeth hon. Rhaid gweithredu ar hyn a newid pethau cyn adroddiad y flwyddyn nesaf oherwydd prif swyddogaeth yr adroddiad hwn yw bod yn gerdyn sgorio i'ch rhaglen lywodraethu o ran ei chyfraniad at

contribution to sustainable development. It still has the feeling of a collection of reports from different departments pulled together and labelled 'The Sustainable Development Annual Report'.

ddatblygiad cynaliadwy. Mae'n dal i deimlo fel casgliad o adroddiadau gan wahanol adrannau wedi'u tynnu at ei gilydd a'i labelu'n 'Adroddiad Blynyddol ar Ddatblygu Cynaliadwy'.

It does therefore raise the question as to whether there is still a lack of policy coherence on sustainable development. I say that because I felt the comments that the Government made in response to the effectiveness review undertaken by PricewaterhouseCoopers were telling. The first telling point was the fact that the Government knows that there are still significant weaknesses in embedding sustainable development as its central organising principle and it refers to the sustainable development Bill as the solution to those identified weaknesses. That is fine, but it means that it is absolutely critical that the Welsh Government gets the Bill right; it has to be strong from its inception and the wording has to be clear and watertight.

Mae felly yn codi'r cwestiwn a oes diffyg cydlyniad polisi o hyd ym maes datblygu cynaliadwy. Dywedaf hynny oherwydd teimlais fod y sylwadau a wnaeth y Llywodraeth mewn ymateb i'r adolygiad effeithiolrwydd a gynhaliwyd gan PricewaterhouseCoopers yn dweud y cyfan. Y pwynt trawiadol cyntaf oedd y ffaith bod y Llywodraeth yn gwybod y ceir gwendidau sylweddol o hyd o ran ymgorffori datblygu cynaliadwy fel egwyddor drefnu ganolog ac mae'n cyfeirio at y Bil datblygu cynaliadwy fel ateb i'r gwendidau hynny a nodwyd. Mae hynny'n iawn, ond mae'n golygu ei bod yn gwbl hanfodol bod Llywodraeth Cymru yn cael y Bil yn gywir; rhaid iddo fod yn gryf o'r cychwyn cyntaf a rhaid i'r geiriad fod yn glir ac yn gynhwysfawr.

That brings me on to the next point, which is that I am still not convinced that the Government has a command of the concept, or least a definition of the concept, of sustainable development. If it does not have this command and it leaves the wording of the Bill open to interpretation, or fails to cover the full spectrum of policy responsibility—economic, environmental and social—then it is going to fail. Minister, I hope you fully take on board this year what the commissioner has said in his commentary and that, this time, you act on his recommendations because the template he envisages for the future reporting of sustainable development progress and success is going to be a vital component to capture the imagination of other sectors and the wider Welsh public beyond the delivery of the Bill. I still share your view that Wales can be an exemplar, but it is going to take leadership from the Welsh Government to make that happen.

Mae hynny'n dod â mi at y pwynt nesaf, sef nad wyf wedi fy argyhoeddi o hyd bod y Llywodraeth wedi meistroli cysyniad datblygu cynaliadwy, neu o leiaf wedi llwyddo i'w ddiffinio. Os nad yw'n cael y feistrolaeth hon a'i bod yn gadael geiriad y Bil yn agored i'w ddehongli, neu'n methu ag ymdrin â'r sbectrwm llawn o gyfrifoldeb polisi—economaidd, amgylcheddol a chymdeithasol—bydd yn methu. Weinidog, gobeithiaf y gwnewch ystyried eleni yr hyn y dywedodd y comisiynydd yn ei sylwadau, ac, y tro hwn, y gweithredwch ar ei argymhellion oherwydd bydd y templed y mae'n ei ragweld ar gyfer adrodd yn y dyfodol am gynnydd a llwyddiant datblygu cynaliadwy yn elfen hanfodol i danio dychymyg sectorau eraill a'r cyhoedd ehangach yng Nghymru y tu hwnt i gyflwyno'r Bil. Rwy'n dal i rannu eich barn y gall Cymru fod yn esiampl, ond bydd angen arweiniad gan Lywodraeth Cymru er mwyn i hynny ddigwydd.

Jenny Rathbone: It is a little rich for the previous speaker to say that it is all the fault of the Government when, clearly, something as major as 'One Wales: One Planet' is something that concerns us all and all the

Jenny Rathbone: Mae braidd yn eironig bod y siaradwr blaenorol yn dweud mai bai'r Llywodraeth yw hyn i gyd pan, yn amlwg, mae rhywbeth mor bwysig â 'Cymru'n Un: Cenedl Un Blaned' yn rhywbeth sydd o bwys

agencies in our society, not just the Government. Clearly, the Government has a leadership role, but the Government is doing many good things to address this agenda.

i ni i gyd ac i'r holl asiantaethau yn ein cymdeithas, nid dim ond i'r Llywodraeth. Yn amlwg, mae gan y Llywodraeth rôl arweiniol, ond mae'r Llywodraeth yn gwneud llawer o bethau da i ymdrin â'r agenda hon.

I was concerned to read in the introduction by Peter Davies, the Commissioner for Sustainable Futures, that curriculum education for sustainable development and global citizenship has lost focus. I would be keen to hear a little bit more about that from the Minister. It is crucial that young people understand the choices that we as adults need to make now to ensure that they have a future worth inheriting. I was very interested to read a letter from the Minister for Education and Skills to the Children and Young People Committee recently about the number of green technologies installed in Ysgol y Bont, the new special school in Ynys Môn. It is really fantastic: the walls are made of off-site constructed structural panels, thereby minimising site waste and reducing the construction period; and there are green sedum roofs on almost half the roof areas, solar voltaic panels to generate heat and light, energy saving LED lighting throughout and natural ventilation in all internal spaces. This is the sort of example that we need to follow wherever we build new schools, any new public building or any new building where public money is involved.

Roeddwn yn bryderus wrth ddarllen yn y cyflwyniad gan Peter Davies, Comisiynydd Dyfodol Cynaliadwy, fod addysg y cwricwlwm ar gyfer datblygu cynaliadwy a dinasyddiaeth fyd-eang wedi colli ffocws. Byddwn yn awyddus i glywed ychydig mwy am hynny gan y Gweinidog. Mae'n hanfodol bod pobl ifanc yn deall y dewisiadau y mae angen i ni fel oedolion eu gwneud yn awr i sicrhau bod ganddynt ddyfodol gwerth ei etifeddu. Roedd yn ddiddorol iawn darllen llythyr gan y Gweinidog Addysg a Sgiliau i'r Pwyllgor Plant a Phobl Ifanc yn ddiweddar am y nifer o dechnolegau gwyrdd sydd wedi'u gosod yn Ysgol y Bont, yr ysgol arbennig newydd ar Ynys Môn. Mae'n wirioneddol wych: mae'r waliau wedi'u gwneud o baneli strwythurol wedi'u hadeiladu oddi ar y safle, sy'n lleihau gwastraff ar y safle ac yn lleihau'r cyfnod adeiladu; ac mae toeau bywlys gwyrdd ar bron i hanner arwynebedd y to, paneli foltäig solar i gynhyrchu gwres a golau, goleuadau LED arbed ynni drwyddi i gyd ac awyru naturiol yn yr holl fannau mewnol. Dyma'r math o esiampl y mae angen inni ei dilyn lle bynnag yr ydym yn adeiladu ysgolion newydd, unrhyw adeilad cyhoeddus newydd neu unrhyw adeilad newydd y mae arian cyhoeddus yn cyfrannu ato.

I note in the sustainable development report that another school, Greenhill Primary School in Caerphilly, is the first school throughout England and Wales to get an A+ for energy performance standards. The Government, through its powers, is doing a great deal on this very important subject. It is essential that we do not create sick buildings for the future, but ensure that such exciting buildings create huge learning opportunities for pupils and the community at large. It is tragic that George Osborne, living and working in Westminster, has no such learning opportunities. Despite the terrible floods that have hit parts of the UK in the last few days, including the residents of St Asaph, who have been affected by the River Elwy flooding, as Ann

Nodaf yn yr adroddiad datblygu cynaliadwy mai ysgol arall, Ysgol Gynradd Greenhill yng Nghaerffili, yw'r ysgol gyntaf ledled Cymru a Lloegr i gael A+ am safonau perfformiad ynni. Mae'r Llywodraeth, drwy ei phwerau, yn gwneud llawer iawn ar y pwnc pwysig iawn hwn. Mae'n hanfodol nad ydym yn creu adeiladau sâl ar gyfer y dyfodol, ond yn sicrhau bod adeiladau cyffrous o'r fath yn creu cyfleoedd dysgu enfawr ar gyfer disgyblion a'r gymuned yn gyffredinol. Mae'n drist nad yw George Osborne, sy'n byw ac yn gweithio yn San Steffan, yn cael cyfleoedd dysgu o'r fath. Er gwaethaf y llifogydd ofnadwy sydd wedi taro rhannau o'r DU yn ystod y dyddiau diwethaf, gan gynnwys trigolion Llanelwy, sydd wedi cael

Jones and others have already mentioned, the Chancellor of the Exchequer continues to be a climate-change denier. Osborne's refusal to allow his Minister for energy to pursue a sustainable energy policy has grave consequences for us all. His refusal to set zero carbon energy generation targets by 2030 means that there is a growing, serious danger that the green technologies industry, which is one of the growth sectors in Wales and throughout the UK, will simply up sticks and move to Bavaria, Belgium or whenever people have a clearer idea of the climate change challenges ahead and the policies that Government actually follows.

eu heffeithio gan lifogydd afon Elwy, fel y mae Ann Jones ac eraill eisoes wedi sôn, mae Canghellor y Trysorlys yn parhau i wadu newid yn yr hinsawdd. Mae gwrthodiad Osborne i ganiatáu i'w Weinidog ynni ddilyn polisi ynni cynaliadwy yn creu canlyniadau difrifol i ni i gyd. Mae'r ffaith ei fod wedi gwrthod gosod targedau cynhyrchu ynni di-garbon erbyn 2030 yn golygu y ceir perygl cynyddol a difrifol y bydd y diwydiant technoleg werdd, sy'n un o'r sectorau twf yng Nghymru a ledled y DU, yn dewis gadael a symud i Bafaria, Gwlad Belg neu ble bynnag y mae gan bobl syniad cliriach o'r heriau newid yn yr hinsawdd sy'n ein hwynebu ac o'r polisïau y mae'r Llywodraeth yn eu dilyn mewn gwirionedd.

3.45 p.m.

The position taken by George Osborne is, of course, absolutely contrary to what over 40 Conservative MPs, including the chair of the Parliamentary Energy and Climate Change Committee, Tim Yeo, are saying he should be doing. I do not know the position of Conservative Members in this Chamber, but if they have any influence over George Osborne, I would urge them to persuade him to rethink the failure to set a date for achieving zero carbon emissions, because his £200 billion dash-for-gas gamble is something that we will all end up paying for, unless everything goes right for him on the international front.

Mae'r safbwynt y mae George Osborne wedi'i gymryd, wrth gwrs, yn gwbl groes i'r hyn y mae dros 40 o Aelodau Seneddol Ceidwadol, gan gynnwys cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Seneddol Ynni a Newid yn yr Hinsawdd, Tim Yeo, yn dweud y dylai fod yn ei wneud. Nid wyf yn gwybod beth yw safbwynt Aelodau Ceidwadol yn y Siambr hon, ond os oes ganddynt unrhyw ddylanwad dros George Osborne, byddwn yn eu hannog i'w berswadio i ailystyried y methiant i bennu dyddiad ar gyfer cyrraedd allyriadau di-garbon, oherwydd mae ei gambl rhuthro-am-nwy gwerth £200 biliwn yn rhywbeth y bydd pawb ohonom yn talu amdano yn y pen draw, oni bai bod popeth yn mynd yn iawn iddo ef ar y llwyfan rhyngwladol.

I have two questions for the Minister. Has the Welsh Government asked Estyn to review the delivery of education for sustainable development and global citizenship in schools? If so, could it include some explanation as to why girls are outperforming boys by between seven and 10 percentage points in key stage 2 assessments of sustainable development? Secondly, what is the likely impact on our Welsh green technology industries of the disastrous rowing back by the UK Government on its renewable energy and zero carbon commitments?

Mae gennyf ddau gwestiwn i'r Gweinidog. A yw Llywodraeth Cymru wedi gofyn i Estyn adolygu darpariaeth addysg datblygu cynaliadwy a dinasyddiaeth fyd-eang mewn ysgolion? Os ydyw, a allai gynnwys rhywfaint o eglurhad pam mae merched yn perfformio rhwng saith a 10 pwynt canran yn well na bechgyn yn asesiadau datblygu cynaliadwy cyfnod allweddol 2? Yn ail, beth yw'r effaith debygol ar ein diwydiannau technoleg werdd yng Nghymru o ganlyniad i'r troi'n ôl trychinebus gan Lywodraeth y DU ar ei hymrwymiadau ynni adnewyddadwy a di-garbon?

Llyr Huws Gruffydd: Hoffwn innau

Llyr Huws Gruffydd: I, too, would like to

groesawu'r adroddiad, neu'r ffaith iddo gael ei gyhoeddi beth bynnag, a chroesawu sylwadau gwrthrychol y comisiynydd.

welcome this report, or the fact that it has been published, and welcome the commissioner's objective comments.

Mae patrwm cyffredinol allyriadau nwyon tŷ gwydr Cymru wedi gostwng 15% ers y flwyddyn sail, sy'n cymharu'n ffafriol â nifer o wledydd yr Undeb Ewropeaidd, megis Ffrainc, yr Eidal, Gwlad Belg ac Iwerddon, ac mae hynny yn sicr yn rhywbeth i'w groesawu. Er hynny, mae lefel bresennol ein hallyriadau yr uchaf o holl wledydd y Deyrnas Unedig. Yn wir, tair o wledydd yr Undeb Ewropeaidd yn unig, hyd y gwelaf i, sydd â record waeth. Felly, er bod elfennau positif, mae realiti hefyd y mae angen mynd i'r afael ag ef.

The general pattern of greenhouse gas emissions in Wales has reduced by 15% since the base year, which compares favourably with a number of European Union countries, such as France, Italy, Belgium and Ireland, and that is certainly to be welcomed. However, the current level of emissions is still the highest of all the nations of the United Kingdom. Indeed, only three European Union nations, as far as I can tell, have a poorer record. Therefore, even though there are positive elements, we need to take a reality check.

Tai sy'n gyfrifol am gynhyrchu un rhan o bump o allyriadau nwyon tŷ gwydr Cymru, ac mae'r adroddiad yn cyfeirio at Arbed. Rydym yn darllen am gynlluniau'r Llywodraeth i wario £45 miliwn yn ail ran Arbed, sy'n llai na'r hyn a wariwyd yn y cyfnod cyntaf, ac mae'r targed hefyd yn is, yn anffodus, a hynny er gwaethaf y ffaith i Gomisiwn Cymru ar Newid yn yr Hinsawdd yn gynharach eleni alw am dyfu'r cynllun hwn yn sylweddol i hwyluso'r rhaglen ôl-ffitio ar raddfa lawer mwy uchelgeisiol. Mae Cyfeillion y Ddaear ac eraill wedi dangos bod angen ailwampio 400,000 o dai, sef traean o stoc tai Cymru, dros y 10 mlynedd nesaf os yw Llywodraeth Cymru am gyrraedd ei tharged o dorri allyriadau nwyon tŷ gwydr 40% erbyn 2020. Felly, mae'n amlwg bod tipyn mwy y gellid ei wneud ar y ffrynt hwnnw.

Housing accounts for around a fifth of greenhouse gas emissions in Wales, and the report refers to Arbed. We read about the Government's plans to spend £45 million in the second part of Arbed, which is less than the sum spent in the first part, and the target has also been reduced, unfortunately, despite the fact that, earlier this year, the Climate Change Commission for Wales asked for the scheme to be grown significantly in order to facilitate a much more ambitious retrofit programme. Friends of the Earth and others have also demonstrated that we need to retrofit 400,000 homes, which is a third of Wales's housing stock, over the next 10 years if the Welsh Government is to achieve its target of cutting greenhouse gas emissions by 40% by 2020. So, it is clear that there is a lot more that could be done on that front.

Mae gan y drefn gynllunio hefyd ddylanwad cwbl allweddol o safbwynt hwyluso datblygu cynaliadwy, ac rwyf wedi mynegi consýrn difrifol yn gyson am y lefel afresymol o uchel o dai sy'n cael eu gorfodi ar nifer o awdurdodau lleol Cymru drwy'r cynlluniau datblygu lleol. Nid yw'n adlewyrchu twf organig y cymunedau hynny. Nid yw codi 2,000 o dai, a thrwy hynny dreblu maint un pentref yn sir Ddinbych, yn ddatblygu cynaliadwy, yn fy marn i. Mae'r un peth yn wir am fynnu codi 45,000 o dai newydd yng Nghaerdydd, a fyddai'n golygu codi mwy o dai bob blwyddyn am y 10 mlynedd nesaf nag a godwyd yn yr un o'r 10 mlynedd diwethaf, pan oedd y farchnad dai ar ei

The planning system also has a key influence in terms of facilitating sustainable development, and I have regularly expressed serious concerns about the unreasonably high level of homes being forced upon a number of Welsh local authorities by way of local development plans. That does not reflect the organic growth of those communities. Building 2,000 houses, thereby trebling the size of one village in Denbighshire, is not sustainable development, in my view. The same is true of insisting on the building of 45,000 new homes in Cardiff, which would mean building more homes every year for the next 10 years than were built in any of the last 10 years, when the housing market was at

hanterth. Nid yw hynny'n ddatblygu cynaliadwy.

its height. That is not sustainable development.

Mae rhifyn diweddaraf 'Planning Policy Wales' yn sôn am wella'r amgylchedd naturiol a'r amgylchedd diwylliannol a pharchu eu terfynau. Mae'r adroddiad blynyddol hwn yn dweud bod Llywodraeth Cymru am gryfhau safle'r Gymraeg yn ein cymunedau dros y pum mlynedd nesaf, ond mae ymchwil gan Fenter Iaith Conwy yn dangos y bydd polisïau cynllunio presennol y Llywodraeth hon yn cael effaith negyddol ar iechyd y Gymraeg fel iaith gymunedol yn y sir honno. Ble mae'r datblygu cynaliadwy yn y fan honno?

The latest edition of 'Planning Policy Wales' talks of improving the natural environment and the cultural environment, respecting their boundaries. This annual report states that the Welsh Government wants to strengthen the position of the Welsh language in our communities over the next five years, but research done by Menter Iaith Conwy shows that this Government's current planning policies will have a negative impact on the Welsh language as a community language in that county. Where is sustainable development there?

The annual report requires—and I would agree—that public procurement plays a key role in creating a sustainable economy. The report tells us of Government commitments to improving access to public sector contracts for small and medium-sized enterprises and ensuring that Wales gets maximum economic, social and environmental outcomes from procurement activities. However, the reality on the ground is very different, as demonstrated in representations that I have had from the north Wales construction group. It tells me that the Welsh Government's approach to collaborative procurement agreements for the north Wales schools and public buildings contractor framework agreement heralds a black day for indigenous north-Wales-based contractors, which rely so heavily on school and other public sector work from the six north Wales local authorities. The proposed framework solution not only poses a major threat to these contractors' livelihoods and future existence, but also to the long-term outlook for the north Wales economy. These seven companies alone have a combined turnover in excess of £300 million and, between them, employ 2,800 people. They estimate that, if they are not included in the framework, a minimum of 1,200 people will lose their jobs. While the annual report extols the Government's virtues on procurement—as it does on planning, energy efficiency and the Welsh language—the reality on the ground can be quite different. Peter Davies has put his finger on the key weakness of the report: it focuses too much on money allocated and spent on initiatives and programmes rather than on the

Mae'r adroddiad blynyddol yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol—a byddwn yn cytuno—bod caffael cyhoeddus yn chwarae rhan allweddol wrth greu economi gynaliadwy. Dywed yr adroddiad wrthym am ymrwymiadau Llywodraeth i wella mynediad at gontractau sector cyhoeddus i fentrau bach a chanolig a sicrhau bod Cymru'n cael y canlyniadau economaidd, cymdeithasol ac amgylcheddol gorau posibl o weithgareddau caffael. Fodd bynnag, mae'r realiti ar lawr gwlad yn wahanol iawn, fel y dangosir yn y sylwadau yr wyf wedi'u cael gan y grŵp adeiladu o'r gogledd. Mae'n dweud wrthyf fod dulliau Llywodraeth Cymru o ymdrin â chytundebau caffael cydweithredol ar gyfer cytundeb fframwaith contractwyr ysgolion ac adeiladau cyhoeddus y gogledd yn arwydd o ddiwrnod du i gontractwyr brodorol y gogledd, sy'n dibynnu cymaint ar ysgolion a gwaith sector cyhoeddus arall gan chwe awdurdod lleol y gogledd. Yn ogystal â bod yn fygythiad mawr i fywoliaeth y contractwyr hyn a'u bodolaeth yn y dyfodol, mae'r datrysiad fframwaith arfaethedig hefyd yn bygwth y rhagolygon hirdymor ar gyfer economi'r gogledd. Mae gan y saith cwmni hyn yn unig gyfanswm o dros £300 miliwn o drosiant, a rhyngddynt, maent yn cyflogi 2,800 o bobl. Maent yn amcangyfrif, os na chânt eu cynnwys yn y fframwaith, y bydd o leiaf 1,200 o bobl yn colli eu swyddi. Er bod yr adroddiad blynyddol yn canmol rhinweddau'r Llywodraeth o ran caffael—fel y mae o ran cynllunio, effeithlonrwydd ynni a'r iaith Gymraeg—gall y realiti ar lawr gwlad fod yn eithaf gwahanol. Mae Peter Davies wedi rhoi ei fys ar wendid allweddol yr adroddiad:

sustainable outcomes and benefits derived from them. Minister, as you know, sustainable development is not just about Government policies and strategies: real and meaningful sustainable development is about effecting real and meaningful change in communities across Wales.

mae'n canolbwyntio gormod ar arian a gaiff ei ddyrannu a'i wario ar fentrau a rhaglenni yn hytrach nag ar ganlyniadau cynaliadwy a'r buddion sy'n deillio ohonynt. Weinidog, fel y gwyddoch, nid dim ond mater o bolisïau a strategaethau Llywodraeth yw datblygu cynaliadwy: mae datblygu cynaliadwy real ac ystyrlon yn ymwneud â sicrhau newid real ac ystyrlon mewn cymunedau ledled Cymru.

Antoinette Sandbach: I am grateful for the opportunity to speak in this debate. First, I will address some of the issues that Jenny Rathbone raised. When looking at a zero-carbon technology, the UK Government's commitment to nuclear power, particularly in Wales, addresses that issue very effectively. Green campaigners, such as George Monbiot, have called for that in order to address the lack of energy planning over the last 13 years.

Antoinette Sandbach: Rwy'n ddiolchgar am y cyfle i siarad yn y ddadl hon. Yn gyntaf, ymdriniaf â rhai o'r materion a gododd Jenny Rathbone. Wrth edrych ar dechnoleg ddi-garbon, mae ymrwymiad Llywodraeth y DU i ynni niwclear, yn enwedig yng Nghymru, yn ymdrin â'r mater hwnnw'n effeithiol iawn. Mae ymgyrchwyr gwyrdd, megis George Monbiot, wedi galw am hynny er mwyn rhoi sylw i'r diffyg cynllunio ynni dros y 13 mlynedd diwethaf.

I would rather concentrate on the Welsh Government's progress and its report. One of the valuable aspects of the sustainable development annual report should be the breadth of its coverage. It should allow a member of the public to see how well the Welsh Government is performing on a whole range of areas—from environmental factors, such as bird populations and air quality, through to economic and social factors and, as Llyr Huws Gruffydd mentioned, the Welsh language. While there have been some limited improvements since 2011, the fact that 22 indicators show a clear deterioration or no improvement is troubling. I would highlight the fact that there have been declining populations of farmland birds, which is one of the examples of failing indicators.

Byddai'n well gennyf ganolbwyntio ar gynnydd Llywodraeth Cymru a'i hadroddiad. Un agwedd werthfawr ar yr adroddiad blynyddol ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy ddylai fod ehangder ei sylw. Dylai ganiatáu i aelod o'r cyhoedd weld pa mor dda y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn perfformio ar amrywiaeth eang o feysydd—o ffactorau amgylcheddol, megis poblogaethau adar ac ansawdd aer, i ffactorau economaidd a chymdeithasol, ac fel y dywedodd Llyr Huws Gruffydd, yr iaith Gymraeg. Er y bu rhai gwelliannau bach ers 2011, mae'r ffaith bod 22 o ddangosyddion yn dangos dirywiad clir neu ddiffyg gwelliant yn destun pryder. Byddwn yn tynnu sylw at y ffaith bod poblogaethau adar tir amaeth wedi bod yn gostwng, sy'n un o'r enghreifftiau o ddangosyddion yn methu.

The reason behind the Welsh Conservatives' amendments 6 and 7 is to look at the causes of that poor performance. Again, I would like to raise the comments of the Commissioner for Sustainable Futures, Peter Davies, who said that there are shortcomings in the report's structure and content, and that there is a tendency to cherry-pick results. More importantly, he says that critical sectors, such as food, tourism and agriculture, receive little attention. In terms of sustainable economic development, it is regrettable that Wales's

Y rheswm y tu ôl i welliannau 6 a 7 Ceidwadwyr Cymru yw edrych ar yr hyn sy'n achosi'r perfformiad gwael hwnnw. Unwaith eto, hoffwn godi sylwadau'r Comisiynydd Dyfodol Cynaliadwy, Peter Davies, a ddywedodd bod diffygion yn strwythur a chynnwys yr adroddiad, ac y ceir tuedd i ddewis a dethol canlyniadau. Yn bwysicach, mae'n dweud nad yw rhai sectorau allweddol, megis bwyd, twristiaeth ac amaethyddiaeth, yn cael prin ddim sylw. O ran datblygu economaidd cynaliadwy, mae'n

GVA remains the lowest of the devolved countries and English regions, making it all the more concerning that, despite the large number of indicators that the Welsh Government could have used to highlight progress, they are notably absent from the report.

anffodus bod GVA Cymru yn parhau i fod yr isaf o'r gwledydd a rhanbarthau Lloegr sydd wedi'u datganoli, gan ei gwneud yn fwy fyth o destun pryder, er gwaethaf y nifer mawr o ddangosyddion y gallai Llywodraeth Cymru fod wedi eu defnyddio i dynnu sylw at gynnydd, eu bod yn amlwg yn absennol o'r adroddiad.

Amendment 3 from the Liberal Democrats also notes the commissioner's comments and that the Welsh Government appears to be more concerned with how much money it is spending on its various initiatives than with measurable outcomes and benefits being delivered. Given the huge pressure on budgets, it is concerning that this attitude is still the focus of the present Welsh Government.

Mae gwelliant 3 gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol hefyd yn nodi sylwadau'r comisiynydd a'i bod yn ymddangos bod Llywodraeth Cymru'n poeni mwy am faint o arian y mae'n ei wario ar ei mentrau amrywiol nag am gyflawni canlyniadau a buddion mesuradwy. O ystyried y pwysau enfawr ar gyllidebau, mae'n destun pryder mai'r agwedd hon yw ffocws Llywodraeth bresennol Cymru o hyd.

I echo Russell George's concerns about the legal definition of sustainable development. Certainly, at the Policy Forum for Wales seminar this week, there were representations that the current definition is not tight enough and it was commented that it is too fuzzy. I know that the commissioner raised concerns about the sustainable development charter and whether or not there has been enough support to take that forward. There are only 136 signatories to the charter, 58% of which are from the private sector—interestingly enough—and only 15% from the public sector. Perhaps the Welsh Minister would like to comment on the lack of commitment towards the sustainable development charter.

Adleisiaf bryderon Russell George am y diffiniad cyfreithiol o ddatblygu cynaliadwy. Yn sicr, yn seminar Fforwm Polisi Cymru yr wythnos hon, cafwyd sylwadau nad yw'r diffiniad presennol yn ddigon tynn a nodwyd ei fod yn rhy niwlog. Gwn fod y comisiynydd wedi codi pryderon am y siarter datblygu cynaliadwy ac a fu digon o gefnogaeth i fwrw ymlaen â hynny ai peidio. Dim ond 136 sydd wedi llofnodi'r siarter, a 58% ohonynt o'r sector preifat— yn ddiddorol ddigon—a dim ond 15% o'r sector cyhoeddus. Efallai yr hoffai'r Gweinidog roi sylwadau am y diffyg ymrwymiad i'r siarter datblygu cynaliadwy.

It is important that the Welsh Government focuses on outcomes rather than spending, and perhaps the Minister could indicate what feedback he has received from the delivery unit on this issue. The Commissioner for Sustainable Futures has offered the Welsh Government constructive criticism, and I hope that the Minister and his colleagues are prepared to listen, to implement his recommendations in full and to commit to substantially improving the current shortcomings by next year's report.

Mae'n bwysig bod Llywodraeth Cymru yn canolbwyntio ar ganlyniadau yn hytrach na gwario, ac efallai y gallai'r Gweinidog nodi pa adborth a gafodd gan yr uned gyflawni ar y mater hwn. Mae'r Comisiynydd Dyfodol Cynaliadwy wedi cynnig beirniadaeth adeiladol i Lywodraeth Cymru, a gobeithiaf fod y Gweinidog a'i gydweithwyr yn barod i wrando, i weithredu ei argymhellion yn llawn ac i ymrwymo i wella'r diffygion cyfredol yn sylweddol erbyn adroddiad y flwyddyn nesaf.

The Minister for Environment and Sustainable Development (John Griffiths): I begin by thanking Members for their contributions today. Members have raised a

Y Gweinidog Amgylchedd a Datblygu Cynaliadwy (John Griffiths): Dechreuaf drwy ddiolch i'r Aelodau am eu cyfraniadau heddiw. Mae'r Aelodau wedi codi nifer o

number of points and I will respond to as many as I can within the time available to me.

bwyntiau ac ymatebaf i gymaint ag y gallaf o fewn yr amser sydd ar gael imi.

There is general support for sustainable development as our central organising principle across the Chamber, and a shared understanding of its importance and the need to further develop and build upon it and strengthen it. That is encouraging for all of those in Wales and beyond who want to see us make progress on these important matters. Therefore, I very much thank Members for their many positive and helpful contributions on taking forward our work.

Ceir cefnogaeth gyffredinol i ddatblygu cynaliadwy fel ein hegwyddor drefnu ganolog ar draws y Siambr, a chyd-ddealltwriaeth o'i bwysigrwydd ac o'r ffaith bod angen ei ddatblygu ymhellach ac adeiladu arno a'i gryfhau. Mae hynny'n galonogol i bawb o'r rheini yng Nghymru a thu hwnt sydd am ein gweld yn gwneud cynnydd ar y materion pwysig hyn. Felly, rwy'n diolch yn fawr i'r Aelodau am eu llawer o gyfraniadau cadarnhaol a defnyddiol am symud ymlaen â'n gwaith.

Many Members concentrated upon driving and making progress, and one important thing to say is that, very soon, we will be publishing our White Paper on our sustainable development Bill. That is the major development in building on progress and making sustainable development that central organising principle for Welsh Government and for the devolved public sector. Therefore, that is a crucial step forward. We will also place a sustainable development body on a statutory footing. It will be about a strong governance framework embedding SD at a high level of decision-making, so that it informs everything that organisations do. I am sure that all Members here, from their contributions today, would welcome that approach. I very much hope, and I am sure that it will be the case, that we achieve good engagement with our White Paper, as we did with our initial consultation. There is a great deal of interest out there in Wales, thankfully, and we know that the more we engage, the more likely we are to get this right.

Mae llawer o Aelodau yn canolbwyntio ar ysgogi a gwneud cynnydd, ac un peth pwysig i'w ddweud yw y byddwn, yn fuan iawn, yn cyhoeddi ein Papur Gwyn ar ein Mesur datblygu cynaliadwy. Dyna'r datblygiad mawr o ran adeiladu ar y cynnydd a gwneud datblygu cynaliadwy'n egwyddor drefnu ganolog i Lywodraeth Cymru ac i'r sector cyhoeddus datganoledig. Felly, mae hynny'n gam hanfodol ymlaen. Byddwn hefyd yn sefydlu corff datblygu cynaliadwy statudol. Bydd yn ymwneud â chael fframwaith llywodraethu cryf sy'n ymgorffori datblygu cynaliadwy ar lefel uchel o wneud penderfyniadau, fel ei fod yn rhoi sail i bopeth y bydd sefydliadau'n ei wneud. Rwy'n siŵr y bydd yr holl Aelodau yma, yn ôl eu cyfraniadau heddiw, yn croesawu'r ymagwedd honno. Gobeithiaf yn fawr iawn, ac rwy'n siŵr y bydd yn digwydd, y cawn ymgysylltu da gyda'n Papur Gwyn, fel y gwnaethom gyda'n hymgynghoriad cychwynnol. Mae llawer iawn o ddiddordeb i'w gael yng Nghymru, diolch byth, ac rydym yn gwybod po fwyaf y byddwn yn ymgysylltu, y mwyaf tebygol yr ydym o gael hyn yn iawn.

Many specific points were raised by Members. In relation to education for sustainable development and global citizenship, I know that the Minister for Education and Skills is planning to review key stage 2, and these matters will be considered as part of that in terms of the curriculum. The commissioner has requested that the Minister considers his annual remit

Cododd yr Aelodau lawer o bwyntiau penodol. O ran addysg datblygu cynaliadwy a dinasyddiaeth fyd-eang, gwn fod y Gweinidog Addysg a Sgiliau yn bwriadu adolygu cyfnod allweddol 2, a chaiff y materion hyn eu hystyried fel rhan o hynny o ran y cwricwlwm. Mae'r comisiynydd wedi gofyn i'r Gweinidog ystyried ei gylch gwaith blynyddol ar gyfer Estyn yn 2013-14 mewn

for Estyn in 2013-14 in relation to these matters. I am sure that the Minister will give careful thought to that, as we, as a Welsh Government, will to our future reporting on our sustainable development scheme, for example in terms of agriculture and food security, as requested by the commissioner and Members here today.

cysylltiad â'r materion hyn. Rwy'n siŵr y bydd y Gweinidog yn rhoi ystyriaeth ofalus i hynny, fel y gwnawn ninnau, fel Llywodraeth Cymru, i'n hadrodd yn y dyfodol ar ein cynllun datblygu cynaliadwy, er enghraifft o ran amaethyddiaeth a diogelwch bwyd, yn unol â chais y comisiynydd a'r Aelodau yma heddiw.

When it comes to procurement, which is vital, our Value Wales policy team has been recognised with a procurement award, which is one of the civil service awards. Therefore, there is good practice there. Community benefit is key to that, and that very much delivers in rounded sustainable development terms, in terms of the economy, social benefit and environmental benefit. Therefore, there is a good record there, but we are always looking to improve.

O ran caffael, sy'n hanfodol, mae ein tîm polisi Gwerth Cymru wedi cael ei gydnabod gyda gwobr caffael, sy'n un o'r gwobrau gwasanaeth sifil. Felly, ceir arfer da yno. Mae budd cymunedol yn allweddol i hynny, ac mae hynny'n sicr yn cyflawni datblygu cynaliadwy cyflawn, o ran yr economi, budd cymdeithasol a budd amgylcheddol. Felly, mae hanes da yno, ond rydym yn ceisio gwella drwy'r amser.

4.00 p.m.

Members mentioned indicators, but, in fact, only one indicator has declined. That one was with regard to bird populations. Others are either stable or improving. Therefore, we need to look at that picture in terms of the facts around the indicators. We are looking to improve our indicators generally, as a Welsh Government. They are continually reviewed to make sure that they are as effective a measure of progress as possible.

Soniodd Aelodau am ddangosyddion, ond, mewn gwirionedd, dim ond un dangosydd sydd wedi gostwng. Yr un yn ymwneud â phoblogaethau adar oedd hwnnw. Mae'r lleill naill ai'n sefydlog neu'n gwella. Felly, mae angen inni edrych ar y darlun hwnnw yn nhermau'r ffeithiau am y dangosyddion. Rydym yn ceisio gwella ein dangosyddion yn gyffredinol, fel Llywodraeth Cymru. Cânt eu hadolygu'n barhaus i wneud yn siŵr eu bod yn mesur cynnydd mewn modd mor effeithiol â phosibl.

When it comes to the commission and the commissioner's views, let me make the point that we decided to retain a Commissioner for Sustainable Futures when other parts of the UK were doing very different things. Therefore, we do value the views of our commissioner. If it was not for that action, we would not have the commentary or the points that have been made. Therefore, we value the commissioner, and we will make sure that we carefully consider all the points that he makes.

O ran y comisiwn a barn y comisiynydd, gadewch imi wneud y pwynt ein bod wedi penderfynu cadw Comisiynydd Dyfodol Cynaliadwy pan oedd rhannau eraill o'r DU yn gwneud pethau gwahanol iawn. Felly, rydym yn gwerthfawrogi barn ein comisiynydd. Heblaw am y camau hynny, ni fyddai gennym y sylwadau na'r pwyntiau sydd wedi cael eu gwneud. Felly, rydym yn gwerthfawrogi'r comisiynydd, a byddwn yn sicrhau ein bod yn ystyried yn ofalus yr holl bwyntiau a wnaiff.

In conclusion, it is good to see a continuance of the cross-party commitment to sustainable development. That will stand us in very good stead as we embark on what I think is the next very exiting step on our journey, taking

I gloi, mae'n dda gweld parhad o'r ymrwymiad trawsbleidiol i ddatblygu cynaliadwy. Bydd hynny'n ein rhoi mewn sefyllfa fanteisiol iawn wrth inni ddechrau ar yr hyn yr wyf yn meddwl a fydd y cam nesaf

forward the White Paper and the sustainable development Bill.

cyffrous iawn ar ein taith, sef bwrw ymlaen â'r Papur Gwyn a'r Bil datblygu cynaliadwy.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The proposal is to agree amendment 1. Does any Member object? I see that there is no objection. Amendment 1 is therefore agreed in accordance with Standing Order No. 12.36.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Y cynnig yw cytuno gwelliant 1. A oes unrhyw Aelod yn gwrthwynebu? Gwelaf nad oes gwrthwynebiad. Felly, derbynnir gwelliant 1 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 12.36.

Derbyniwyd gwelliant 1.

Amendment 1 agreed.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The proposal is to agree amendment 2. Does any Member object? I see that there is no objection. Amendment 2 is therefore agreed in accordance with Standing Order No. 12.36.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Y cynnig yw derbyn gwelliant 2. A oes unrhyw Aelod yn gwrthwynebu? Gwelaf nad oes gwrthwynebiad. Felly, derbynnir gwelliant 2 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 12.36.

Derbyniwyd gwelliant 2.

Amendment 2 agreed.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The proposal is to agree amendment 3. Does any Member object? I see that there is no objection. Amendment 3 is therefore agreed in accordance with Standing Order No. 12.36.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Y cynnig yw cytuno ar welliant 3. A oes unrhyw Aelod yn gwrthwynebu? Gwelaf nad oes gwrthwynebiad. Felly, derbynnir gwelliant 3 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 12.36.

Derbyniwyd gwelliant 3.

Amendment 3 agreed.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The proposal is to agree amendment 4. Does any Member object? I see that there is no objection. Amendment 4 is therefore agreed in accordance with Standing Order No. 12.36.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Y cynnig yw derbyn gwelliant 4. A oes unrhyw Aelod yn gwrthwynebu? Gwelaf nad oes gwrthwynebiad. Felly, derbynnir gwelliant 4 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 12.36.

Derbyniwyd gwelliant 4.

Amendment 4 agreed.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The proposal is to agree amendment 5. Does any Member object? I see that there is no objection. Amendment 5 is therefore agreed in accordance with Standing Order No. 12.36.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Y cynnig yw derbyn gwelliant 5. A oes unrhyw Aelod yn gwrthwynebu? Gwelaf nad oes gwrthwynebiad. Felly, derbynnir gwelliant 5 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 12.36.

Derbyniwyd gwelliant 5.

Amendment 5 agreed.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The proposal is to agree amendment 6. Does any Member object? I see that there is an objection. Therefore, I defer all further voting under this item until voting time.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Y cynnig yw cytuno ar welliant 6. A oes unrhyw Aelod yn gwrthwynebu? Gwelaf fod gwrthwynebiad. Felly, rwy'n gohirio'r bleidlais ar y cynnig hwn tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.

Gohiriwyd y pleidleisio tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.
Voting deferred until voting time.

Cynnig i Atal Rheolau Sefydlog Rhifau 12.20(i) ac 11.16 i gynnal Trafodaeth ar Gomisiwn Silk
Motion to Suspend Standing Orders Nos. 12.20(i) and 11.16 to hold a Debate on the Silk Commission

Cynnig NDM5107 Jane Hutt

Cynnig bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, yn unol â Rheolau Sefydlog 33.6 a 33.8:

Yn atal Rheol Sefydlog 12.20(i) a'r rhan honno o Reol Sefydlog 11.16 sy'n ei gwneud yn ofynnol bod y datganiad a'r cyhoeddiad wythnosol yn darparu'r amserlen ar gyfer busnes yn y Cyfarfod Llawn yr wythnos ganlynol, er mwyn caniatáu i NNDM5108 gael ei ystyried yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ddydd Mawrth 27 Tachwedd 2012.

Motion NDM5107 Jane Hutt

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Orders 33.6 and 33.8:

Suspends Standing Order 12.20(i) and that part of Standing Order 11.16 that requires the weekly statement and announcement to constitute the timetable for business in Plenary for the following week, to allow NNDM5108 to be considered in Plenary on Tuesday 27 November 2012.

The Minister for Finance and Leader of the House (Jane Hutt): I move the motion.

Y Gweinidog Cyllid ac Arweinydd y Tŷ (Jane Hutt): Cynigiaf y cynnig.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The proposal is to agree the motion. Does any Member object? I see that there is no objection. The motion is therefore agreed in accordance with Standing Order No. 12.36. Standing Orders have been suspended and we can now move to the next item on the agenda.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Y cynnig yw derbyn y cynnig. A oes unrhyw Aelod yn gwrthwynebu? Gwelaf nad oes gwrthwynebiad. Mae'r cynnig, felly, wedi'i dderbyn, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 12.36. Mae'r Rheolau Sefydlog wedi cael eu hatal a gallwn yn awr symud at yr eitem nesaf ar yr agenda.

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.

Motion agreed.

Adroddiad gan Gomisiwn Llywodraeth y DU, Comisiwn Silk
The Report by the UK Government's Silk Commission

Cynnig NDM5108 Jane Hutt

Mae Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

Yn croesawu cyhoeddi'r adroddiad gan Gomisiwn Llywodraeth y DU, Comisiwn Silk, y cafwyd cytundeb unfrydol arno, ac mae'n edrych ymlaen at ei roi ar waith.

Motion NDM5108 Jane Hutt

The National Assembly for Wales:

Welcomes the publication of the unanimously agreed report by the UK Government's Silk Commission and looks forward to its implementation.

The First Minister: I move the motion.

Y Prif Weinidog: Cynigiaf y cynnig.

Last week, the Commission on Devolution in Wales, chaired by Paul Silk and reporting to the UK Government, published its report on

Yr wythnos diwethaf, cyhoeddodd y Comisiwn ar Ddatganoli yng Nghymru, dan gadeiryddiaeth Paul Silk ac oedd yn adrodd i

financial reform for Wales. I would like to begin by placing on record my appreciation for the commitment of the commissioners, who have produced what is clearly a very substantial and thorough piece of work. It is a very specific report, it is some 200 pages in length, and it contains 33 specific recommendations. I will not attempt to address each and every proposal in the time available today, but I would like to set out our response as a Government in broad terms and to say how I see this agenda moving forward over the coming months.

Lywodraeth y DU, ei adroddiad ar ddiwygio ariannol i Gymru. Hoffwn ddechrau drwy roi ar gofnod fy ngwerthfawrogiad am ymrwymiad y comisiynwyr, sydd wedi cynhyrchu'r hyn sy'n amlwg yn ddarn sylweddol a thrylwyr iawn o waith. Mae'n adroddiad penodol iawn, mae'n rhyw 200 o dudalennau o hyd, ac mae'n cynnwys 33 o argymhellion penodol. Ni fyddaf yn ceisio mynd i'r afael â phob cynnig yn yr amser sydd ar gael heddiw, ond hoffwn nodi ein hymateb fel Llywodraeth yn fras a dweud sut yr wyf yn gweld yr agenda hon yn symud ymlaen dros y misoedd nesaf.

The first thing to note and to welcome is that the report is unanimous. Both the independent experts on the commission and the nominees from all four parties in the Assembly have come to a common position on the way forward. No doubt, the process of reaching agreement would not have been straightforward, given our parties' different outlooks and goals. I am sure that it involved trade-offs and compromises on all sides. However, now that the commission has achieved a shared cross-party view on the future path of reform, it cannot be dismissed, and all of us in this Chamber, I trust, will seek to build on the emerging consensus that the commission has established.

Y peth cyntaf i'w nodi ac i'w groesawu yw bod yr adroddiad yn unfrydol. Mae'r arbenigwyr annibynnol ar y comisiwn a'r enwebeion o bob un o'r pedair plaid yn y Cynulliad wedi dod i safbwynt cyffredin ar y ffordd ymlaen. Yn sicr, ni fyddai'r broses o ddod i gytundeb wedi bod yn syml, o ystyried agweddau ac amcanion gwahanol ein pleidiau. Rwy'n siŵr ei fod yn ymwneud â bargeinio a chyfaddawdu ar bob ochr. Fodd bynnag, nawr bod y comisiwn wedi cyflawni barn drawsbleidiol gyffredin ar y llwybr diwygio yn y dyfodol, ni ellir ei ddiystyru, a bydd pob un ohonom yn y Siambr hon, rwy'n siŵr, yn ceisio adeiladu ar y consensws sy'n dod i'r amlwg y mae'r comisiwn wedi'i sefydlu.

I will now address the main proposals that the commission has made. Members are well aware of the high priority that I have placed on gaining access to borrowing powers to finance capital investment. We know that these powers are already available to local authorities across Great Britain and they are also available, or being made available, to the other devolved administrations, yet, as things stand, these powers are not available in a practical sense to Welsh Ministers, with implications, as we know, for the Welsh economy.

Byddaf yn awr yn mynd i'r afael â'r prif gynigion y mae'r comisiwn wedi'u gwneud. Mae'r Aelodau yn ymwybodol iawn o'r flaenoriaeth uchel yr wyf wedi'i rhoi ar gael mynediad at bwerau benthyca i ariannu buddsoddiad cyfalaf. Rydym yn gwybod bod y pwerau eisoes ar gael i awdurdodau lleol ar draws Prydain Fawr ac maent hefyd ar gael, neu trefnir y byddant ar gael, i'r gweinyddiaethau datganoledig eraill, eto, fel y mae pethau, nid yw'r pwerau hyn ar gael mewn ystyr ymarferol i Weinidogion Cymru, gyda goblygiadau, fel y gwyddom, ar gyfer economi Cymru.

Last month's statement on funding reform, which we issued jointly with the UK Government, was an important step forward. In that statement, the UK Government accepted the principle that borrowing powers should be devolved to Wales once we have acquired a revenue stream that is separate

Roedd datganiad y mis diwethaf ar ddiwygio cyllid, a gyhoeddwyd gennym ar y cyd â Llywodraeth y DU, yn gam pwysig ymlaen. Yn y datganiad hwnnw, roedd Llywodraeth y DU yn derbyn yr egwyddor y dylai pwerau benthyca gael eu datganoli i Gymru unwaith y byddwn wedi cael ffrwd refeniw sydd ar

from the block grant. In addition, the statement contained a commitment to consider borrowing for specific projects ahead of any tax devolution, which, of course, would provide us with a revenue stream.

wahân i'r grant bloc. Yn ogystal, roedd y datganiad yn cynnwys ymrwymiad i ystyried benthyca ar gyfer prosiectau penodol o flaen unrhyw ddatganoli treth, a fyddai, wrth gwrs, yn darparu llif refeniw i ni.

I am pleased that the Silk commission is strongly in support of our being able to borrow to finance capital projects. The commission sees no case for delay and it argues that a new borrowing regime should be in place by April 2016 and that borrowing using our existing powers would be possible ahead of that date. There is no doubt that access to borrowing powers would enable us to boost investment and to support the economy.

Rwy'n falch fod comisiwn Silk yn cefnogi'n gryf ein gallu i fenthyca er mwyn ariannu prosiectau cyfalaf. Nid yw'r comisiwn yn gweld unrhyw achos dros oedi ac mae'n dadlau y dylai trefn fenthyca newydd fod ar waith erbyn Ebrill 2016 ac y byddai benthyca gan ddefnyddio ein pwerau presennol fod yn bosibl cyn y dyddiad hwnnw. Nid oes amheuaeth y byddai mynediad at bwerau benthyca yn ein galluogi i hybu buddsoddiad ac i gefnogi'r economi.

I will now turn to the issue of tax devolution. I have repeatedly argued for a pragmatic, case-by-case approach to this. Some taxes will be well suited to operating at an all-Wales level and others will not. To start with the taxes that are not recommended for devolution, the commission makes a persuasive case that value added tax, national insurance and corporation tax should not be devolved. In each case, I agree with the commission's conclusions, although, in the case of corporation tax, I note that the commission has made some interesting proposals on capital allowances that are worthy of further study and, of course, the commission comes to a certain view on whether corporation tax should be devolved more generally.

Trof yn awr at fater datganoli treth. Rwyf wedi dadlau droeon dros ymagwedd bragmataidd, achos wrth achos at hyn. Bydd rhai trethi yn addas iawn ar gyfer gweithredu ar lefel Cymru gyfan ac ni fydd eraill. I ddechrau gyda'r trethi nad ydynt wedi'u hargymell ar gyfer datganoli, mae'r comisiwn yn cyflwyno achos perswadiol na ddylai treth ar werth, yswiriant cenedlaethol a threth gorfforaeth gael eu datganoli. Ym mhob achos, rwy'n cytuno â chasgliadau'r comisiwn, er, yn achos y dreth gorfforaeth, nodaf fod y comisiwn wedi gwneud rhai cynigion diddorol ar lwfansau cyfalaf sy'n werth eu hastudio ymhellach ac, wrth gwrs, mae'r comisiwn yn dod i safbwynt penodol ar a ddylai treth gorfforaeth gael ei datganoli'n fwy cyffredinol.

The best place to start when looking for taxes that would be good candidates for devolution is to identify taxes that would fit well with the existing devolved responsibilities that we have and that would provide us with new policy levers to deliver better economic outcomes for the people of Wales. Therefore, I am glad that the commission has endorsed the devolution of stamp duty land tax, the aggregates levy and landfill tax to Wales. I support the devolution of all three of these taxes.

Y lle gorau i ddechrau wrth chwilio am drethi a fyddai'n rhai da ar gyfer datganoli yw nodi trethi a fyddai'n cyd-fynd yn dda â'r cyfrifoldebau datganoledig presennol sydd gennym ac a fyddai'n rhoi dulliau polisi newydd inni i sicrhau canlyniadau economaidd gwell i bobl Cymru. Felly, rwy'n falch fod y comisiwn wedi cymeradwyo datganoli treth tir y doll stamp, yr ardoll agregau a threth tirlenwi i Gymru. Rwy'n cefnogi datganoli pob un o'r tair treth.

Air passenger duty would also work well as a devolved tax, in my view. It is closely tied to a locality and would be relatively easy to

Byddai toll teithwyr awyr hefyd yn gweithio'n dda fel treth ddatganoledig, yn fy marn i. Mae wedi'i chysylltu'n agos i ardal a

collect from an administrative perspective. It would provide us with a potentially useful tool to develop Welsh airport capacity in both north and south Wales. We know that some powers over the tax have been devolved to Northern Ireland, so there is a clear level-playing-field argument for this policy lever to be made available to the other devolved administrations. It is right to say that the commission has not gone as far as I would have liked on air passenger duty. It has proposed that the power to vary long-haul rates should be devolved in the first instance, while leaving the door open for the devolution of powers over the remainder of the tax in due course. That is not ideal from the Government's point of view, but nevertheless we accept that it is a starting point for future discussions.

byddai'n gymharol hawdd i'w chasglu o safbwynt gweinyddol. Byddai'n rhoi i ni offeryn defnyddiol posibl i ddatblygu gallu maes awyr Cymru yng ngogledd a de Cymru. Gwyddom fod rhai pwerau dros y dreth wedi cael eu datganoli i Ogledd Iwerddon, felly mae dadl glir ar gyfer trin yn yr un modd o blaid sicrhau bod y dull polisi hwn ar gael i'r gweinyddiaethau datganoledig eraill. Mae'n iawn i ddweud nad yw'r comisiwn wedi mynd mor bell ag y byddwn wedi hoffi ar doll teithwyr awyr. Mae wedi cynnig y dylai'r pŵer i amrywio cyfraddau teithiau hir gael ei ddatganoli yn y lle cyntaf, a gadael y drws ar agor ar gyfer datganoli pwerau dros weddill y dreth maes o law. Nid yw hynny'n ddelfrydol o safbwynt y Llywodraeth, ond er hynny rydym yn derbyn ei fod yn fan cychwyn ar gyfer trafodaethau yn y dyfodol.

The most interesting part of the report for me, and, I expect, many of us in the Chamber, is the discussion of income tax. I have made no secret of the fact that there will be many practical challenges to overcome before rate-varying powers could be devolved. For that reason, we have not as a Government sought the devolution of powers over income tax. There is a constitutional obstacle that would need to be overcome, because, unlike Scotland, the people of Wales have never been asked to give their consent for the devolution of powers over such a major tax. The blunt truth is that a referendum would have to be held, in my view, and won before people in Wales would find themselves paying, potentially, a different rate of income tax from those in the rest of the UK.

Y rhan fwyaf diddorol o'r adroddiad i mi, ac, rwy'n meddwl, i lawer ohonom yn y Siambr, yw'r drafodaeth treth incwm. Nid wyf wedi gwneud unrhyw gyfrinach o'r ffaith y bydd llawer o heriau ymarferol i'w goresgyn cyn y gellid datganoli pwerau amrywio cyfraddau. Am y rheswm hwnnw, nid ydym fel Llywodraeth wedi ceisio datganoli pwerau dros dreth incwm. Mae rhwystr cyfansoddiadol y byddai angen ei oresgyn, oherwydd, yn wahanol i'r Alban, ni ofynnwyd i bobl Cymru erioed roi eu caniatâd dros ddatganoli pwerau ynghylch treth mor fawr. Y gwir plaen yw y byddai'n rhaid cynnal, yn fy marn i, ac ennill refferendwm cyn y byddai pobl yng Nghymru yn cael eu hunain yn talu, o bosibl, gyfradd wahanol o dreth incwm i bobl yng ngweddill y DU.

There is, of course, the matter of the budgetary risks that would be inherent in income tax devolution. We would want assurances that any new system that included an element of income tax devolution would provide a fair overall financial settlement for Wales. That is why I have argued that the problem of convergence in our block grant, the Barnett squeeze, would have to be resolved before income tax devolution could occur. Otherwise, the block grant would drop over time, income tax would have to fill the gap and we might face the nightmare scenario where the block grant drops and income tax

Ceir, wrth gwrs, y mater o risgiau cyllidebol a fyddai'n gynhenid mewn datganoli treth incwm. Byddem am gael sicrwydd y byddai unrhyw system newydd a oedd yn cynnwys elfen o ddatganoli treth incwm yn rhoi setliad ariannol teg cyffredinol i Gymru. Dyna pam yr wyf wedi dadlau y byddai'n rhaid datrys problem cydgyfeiriant yn ein grant bloc, gwasgfa Barnett, cyn y gallai datganoli treth incwm ddigwydd. Fel arall, byddai'r grant bloc yn gostwng dros amser, byddai'n rhaid i dreth incwm lenwi'r bwlch a gallem wynebu'r sefyllfa hunllefus lle mae'r grant bloc yn gostwng ac mae cyfraddau treth

rates rise in order to provide the same outcome. That is clearly not in Wales's interests. The hurdles are significant, but they are not, in principle, insurmountable. The commission has done a great deal to establish a way forward in dealing with each of these obstacles. It has provided detailed thinking on the practicalities of income tax devolution that we will need to consider carefully.

incwm yn codi er mwyn rhoi'r un canlyniad. Mae'n amlwg nad yw hynny er budd Cymru. Mae'r rhwystrau yn sylweddol, ond nid ydynt, mewn egwyddor, yn anorchfygol. Mae'r comisiwn wedi gwneud llawer iawn i sefydlu ffordd ymlaen wrth ymdrin â phob un o'r rhwystrau hyn. Mae wedi darparu syniadau manwl ar faterion ymarferol datganoli treth incwm y bydd angen i ni eu hystyried yn ofalus.

On the fundamental constitutional question, the commission agreed that a referendum would be necessary before rate-varying powers or income tax could be devolved. As far as the financial risks are concerned, the commission states clearly that the transfer of income tax powers to the Welsh Government should be conditional on resolving the issues of fair funding in a way that is agreed by both the UK and Welsh Governments. The commission's proposals are worthy of consideration, bearing in mind the steps along the way that would need to be taken before income tax devolution should, in my view, be considered.

O ran y cwestiwn cyfansoddiadol sylfaenol, cytunodd y comisiwn y byddai refferendwm yn angenrheidiol cyn y gellid datganoli pwerau amrywio cyfraddau neu dreth incwm. Cyn belled ag y mae'r risgiau ariannol yn y cwestiwn, mae'r comisiwn yn datgan yn glir y dylai trosglwyddo pwerau treth incwm i Lywodraeth Cymru fod yn amodol ar ddatrys materion ariannu teg mewn ffordd sy'n cael ei gytuno gan Lywodraethau'r DU a Chymru. Mae cynigion y comisiwn yn deilwng o ystyriaeth, gan gadw mewn cof y camau ar y ffordd y byddai angen eu cymryd cyn y dylid ystyried datganoli treth incwm, yn fy marn i.

Looking ahead, it is clear that cross-party support for reform in Wales, while vital, is insufficient in itself to deliver change. That would require legislation at a UK level, which, in turn, requires the support of the UK Government. Therefore, I propose today that the Welsh and UK Governments should establish a new inter-governmental working group to review the Silk commission's recommendations, with the aim of coming to a shared position on the way forward. If that offer is accepted and discussions are successful, I would expect the UK Government to publish a White Paper ahead of the summer recess to introduce legislation in the lifetime of the current UK Parliament.

Wrth edrych ymlaen, mae'n amlwg bod cefnogaeth drawsbleidiol ar gyfer diwygio yng Nghymru, tra ei fod yn hanfodol, yn annigonol ynddo'i hun i gyflawni newid. Byddai hynny'n gofyn am ddeddfwriaeth ar lefel y DU, sydd, yn ei dro, yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol cael cefnogaeth Llywodraeth y DU. Felly, rwy'n cynnig heddiw y dylai Llywodraethau Cymru a'r DU sefydlu gweithgor newydd rhynglywodraethol i adolygu argymhellion comisiwn Silk, gyda'r nod o ddod i sefyllfa gyffredin ar y ffordd ymlaen. Os yw'r cynnig yn cael ei dderbyn ac mae trafodaethau yn llwyddiannus, byddwn yn disgwyl i Lywodraeth y DU gyhoeddi Papur Gwyn cyn toriad yr haf i gyflwyno deddfwriaeth yn ystod oes Senedd bresennol y DU.

In conclusion, the Silk report is not the end of our journey, but it is an important staging post along the way. It is ambitious and radical, but it is also practical and realistic. It gives us a clear picture of what the next few years will hold for us. I have no doubt that some aspects of the Silk proposals will be more attractive than others, but the proposals and timetable for implementation provide us

I gloi, nid adroddiad Silk yw diwedd ein taith, ond mae'n fan aros pwysig ar hyd y ffordd. Mae'n uchelgeisiol ac yn radical, ond mae hefyd yn ymarferol ac yn realistig. Mae'n rhoi darlun clir i ni o'r hyn sy'n ein haros yn y blynyddoedd nesaf. Nid oes gennyf unrhyw amheuaeth y bydd rhai agweddau ar gynigion Silk yn fwy deniadol nag eraill, ond mae'r cynigion a'r amserlen ar gyfer gweithredu yn

with an effective way forward.

rhoi ffordd effeithiol ymlaen i ni.

Finally, I put on record that I am happy to accept the parameters of the commission's report as the basis on which future funding reform should be developed. There is much in the report that I welcome, and nothing with which I fundamentally disagree. We are now prepared as a Government to play a full and constructive role to secure lasting change, and we look forward to working with other parties and the UK Government in order to do that.

Yn olaf, hoffwn gofnodi fy mod yn hapus i dderbyn paramedrau adroddiad y comisiwn fel y sail ar gyfer datblygu diwygio ariannu yn y dyfodol. Mae llawer yn yr adroddiad yr wyf yn ei groesawu, ac nid oes dim yr wyf yn anghytuno'n llwyr ag ef. Rydym bellach yn barod fel Llywodraeth i chwarae rhan lawn ac adeiladol er mwyn sicrhau newid parhaol, ac rydym yn edrych ymlaen at weithio gyda phleidiau eraill a Llywodraeth y DU er mwyn gwneud hynny.

Paul Davies: I am pleased to take part in this debate this afternoon on behalf of the Welsh Conservatives, and to place on record our support for the UK Government's Silk commission report and its recommendations. I also thank Paul Silk and his team, and I pay tribute to the efforts of the commission in developing recommendations to reflect the needs of Wales.

Paul Davies: Rwy'n falch o gymryd rhan yn y ddadl hon y prynhawn yma ar ran y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig, ac i gofnodi ein cefnogaeth i adroddiad comisiwn Silk Llywodraeth y DU a'i argymhellion. Hoffwn ddiolch hefyd i Paul Silk a'i dîm, a thalaf deyrnged i ymdrechion y comisiwn mewn datblygu argymhellion i adlewyrchu anghenion Cymru.

I am pleased to say that the Silk commission has largely supported the views of the Welsh Conservatives Assembly group, as it reflects the paper that we submitted to the commission earlier this year. The title of the commission's report, 'Empowerment and Responsibility: Financial Powers to Strengthen Wales', is appropriate because it is essential that the Welsh Government bears responsibility for raising a proportion of the money that it spends to make it fully accountable to the people of Wales. The devolution of some taxation powers, together with the ability to borrow, would give the Welsh Government greater economic levers to make Wales a more attractive place to do business, and could give it the ability to fund major infrastructure projects.

Rwy'n falch o ddweud bod comisiwn Silk i raddau helaeth wedi cefnogi barn grŵp Cynulliad y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig, gan ei fod yn adlewyrchu'r papur a gyflwynwyd i'r comisiwn yn gynharach eleni. Mae teitl adroddiad y comisiwn, 'Grymuso a Chyfrifoldeb: Pwerau Ariannol i Gryfhau Cymru', yn briodol oherwydd mae'n hanfodol bod Llywodraeth Cymru yn dwyn cyfrifoldeb am godi cyfran o'r arian y mae'n ei wario i'w gwneud yn gwbl atebol i bobl Cymru. Byddai datganoli rhai pwerau trethu, ynghyd â'r gallu i fenthyca, yn rhoi cyfryngau economaidd gwell i Lywodraeth Cymru i wneud Cymru yn lle mwy deniadol i gynnal busnes, a gallai roi'r gallu i ariannu prosiectau seilwaith mawr.

The Silk commission has brought forward 33 recommendations that we on this side of Chamber believe, when implemented, will result in the Welsh Government becoming much more financially accountable to the people that it serves. While devolution has brought political representation closer to the people and allowed Wales to pursue policies more closely aligned with its economic and social needs, more than a decade on from the onset of devolution, Wales still faces

Mae comisiwn Silk wedi cyflwyno 33 o argymhellion yr ydym ni ar ochr hon y Siambr yn credu, pan gânt eu gweithredu, fydd yn arwain at weld Llywodraeth Cymru yn dod yn llawer mwy atebol yn ariannol i'r bobl y mae'n eu gwasanaethu. Tra bod datganoli wedi dod â chynrychiolaeth wleidyddol yn nes at y bobl a galluogi Cymru i ddilyn polisïau sy'n fwy cydnaws â'i hanghenion economaidd a chymdeithasol, fwy na degawd ers dechrau datganoli, mae

continued challenges, particularly in raising the educational achievements and economic prosperity of its people.

Cymru'n dal i wynebu heriau parhaus, yn enwedig wrth godi cyflawniadau addysgol a ffyniant economaidd ei phobl.

The recommendations around devolving smaller taxes such as stamp duty, land tax, landfill tax, the aggregates levy and air passenger duty for long-haul flights are something that I welcome. As the report correctly highlights, there are potential benefits to devolving some of these smaller taxes, such as economic incentives and accountability and empowerment. Certain taxes are strongly linked to the performance of the economy in Wales, and the devolution of powers over some taxes could enhance the incentives of the Welsh Government to encourage economic growth in Wales. I very much agree with the report when it states that the autonomy to vary a particular tax can be an effective policy lever to achieve a defined devolved policy outcome.

Mae'r argymhellion ynghylch datganoli trethi llai fel treth stamp, treth tir, treth tirlenwi, yr ardoll agregau a tholl teithwyr awyr am deithiau hir yn rhywbeth yr wyf yn eu croesawu. Fel y mae'r adroddiad yn dangos yn gywir, mae manteision posibl i ddatganoli rhai o'r trethi llai, fel cymhellion economaidd ac atebolrwydd a grymuso. Mae rhai trethi'n cael eu cysylltu'n gryf â pherfformiad yr economi yng Nghymru, a gallai datganoli pwerau dros rai trethi wella cymhellion Llywodraeth Cymru i annog twf economaidd yng Nghymru. Rwy'n cytuno â'r adroddiad pan ddywed y gall yr ymreolaeth i amrywio treth benodol fod yn gyfrwng polisi effeithiol i sicrhau canlyniad polisi datganoledig diffiniedig.

On the issue of income tax, I believe that the policy of partly devolving power over the setting of income tax to the National Assembly will ensure fiscal responsibility and accountability. In the Welsh Conservatives group submission, we argued that devolving responsibility for setting the level of income tax over and above a Westminster base, while subtracting a reduction from the block grant, would preserve the advantages of stability and predictability that characterise the present funding regime.

Ar y mater o dreth incwm, rwy'n credu y bydd y polisi o ddatganoli grym yn rhannol dros bennu treth incwm i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn sicrhau cyfrifoldeb ariannol ac atebolrwydd. Yng nghyflwyniad grŵp y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig, roeddem yn dadlau y gellid cadw manteision y sefydlogrwydd a'r sicrwydd sy'n nodweddu'r gyfundrefn gyllido bresennol trwy ddatganoli cyfrifoldeb am bennu lefel y dreth incwm uwchben sylfaen San Steffan, tra'n tynnu gostyngiad o'r grant bloc.

I accept that some will have difficulty with this particular recommendation, but it will be no surprise to you that I, as a former bank manager, believe in fiscal responsibility and accountability, and I therefore very much see the merits of this proposal. However, given that this is a fundamental proposed change, I accept that the devolution of varying income tax should be subject to a referendum in Wales.

Derbyniaf y bydd rhai yn cael anhawster gyda'r argymhelliad penodol hwn, ond ni fydd yn syndod i chi fy mod i, fel cyn reolwr banc, yn credu mewn cyfrifoldeb ac atebolrwydd ariannol, ac felly rwy'n gweld manteision y cynnig hwn yn iawn. Fodd bynnag, o ystyried bod hwn yn newid sylfaenol arfaethedig, rwy'n derbyn y dylai datganoli amrywio treth incwm fod yn agored i refferendwm yng Nghymru.

4.15 p.m.

Any steps to alter the fiscal arrangements of the National Assembly must carry the full support of the people of Wales. However, as politicians, we must be bold and courageous in putting forward robust and convincing arguments to the people of Wales. I hope that

Rhaid i unrhyw gamau i newid trefniadau cyllidol y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol gael cefnogaeth lawn pobl Cymru. Fodd bynnag, fel gwleidyddion, rhaid inni fod yn feiddgar ac yn ddewr wrth roi dadleuon cadarn ac argyhoeddiadol i bobl Cymru. Gobeithio bod

the Welsh Government is genuine in its desire to become more accountable and more responsible. I note that the First Minister suggested that the devolution of tax-varying powers will not be possible without reform of the Barnett formula. However, implementing the Silk recommendations is surely not wholly dependent on Barnett reform, and I hope that the Welsh Government will not use this as an excuse to delay taking on some of these responsibilities.

Llywodraeth Cymru yn ddiffuant yn ei hawydd i ddod yn fwy atebol ac yn fwy cyfrifol. Nodaf fod y Prif Weinidog wedi awgrymu na fydd datganoli pwerau amrywio trethi yn bosibl heb ddiwygio fformiwla Barnett. Fodd bynnag, nid yw gweithredu argymhellion Silk yn hollol ddibynnol ar ddiwygio Barnett, ac rwy’n gobeithio na fydd Llywodraeth Cymru yn defnyddio hyn fel esgus i oedi derbyn rhai o’r cyfrifoldebau hyn.

I understand the point that the First Minister has made, but delaying the implementation of some of the report’s recommendations could delay the funding of strategic infrastructure projects, which, in turn, could delay economic growth. The First Minister must accept that, even after devolution of the ability to vary income tax, substantial income to Wales will still be received through the block grant. Therefore, reform of the Barnett formula will still be essential, whether that is done beforehand or afterwards.

Rwy’n deall y pwynt y mae’r Prif Weinidog wedi’i wneud, ond gallai oedi gweithredu rhai o argymhellion yr adroddiad oedi ariannu prosiectau seilwaith strategol, a allai, yn ei dro, oedi twf economaidd. Mae’n rhaid i’r Prif Weinidog dderbyn, hyd yn oed ar ôl datganoli'r gallu i amrywio treth incwm, bydd incwm sylweddol i Gymru yn dal i gael ei dderbyn drwy’r grant bloc. Felly, bydd diwygio fformiwla Barnett yn dal yn hanfodol, boed hynny yn cael ei wneud ymlaen llaw neu ar ôl hynny.

In relation to the recommendations on borrowing powers, the Welsh Conservatives have been clear in their support for the Welsh Government’s accessing borrowing powers to finance capital projects. With the added weight of the Silk commission behind the principle of granting borrowing powers, I hope that work is now undertaken to implement this recommendation. Chapter 7 of the report, on further improving financial accountability, looks at improving the availability of information, which I believe is crucial in moving forward. Collating key economic information and forecasting data will be essential in future. It will be important in supporting the arguments put forward in the Silk commission report, and the collation of essential data will also inform future debates.

Mewn perthynas â’r argymhellion ar bwerau benthyca, mae’r Ceidwadwyr Cymreig wedi bod yn glir yn eu cefnogaeth i Lywodraeth Cymru gael mynediad at bwerau benthyca i ariannu prosiectau cyfalaf. Gyda phwysau ychwanegol comisiwn Silk y tu ôl i’r egwyddor o roi pwerau benthyca, rwy’n gobeithio y bydd y gwaith yn cael ei wneud yn awr i weithredu’r argymhelliad hwn. Mae pennod 7 yr adroddiad, ar wella atebolrwydd ariannol, yn edrych ar wella argaeledd gwybodaeth, sydd, rwy’n credu, yn hanfodol wrth symud ymlaen. Bydd coladu gwybodaeth allweddol economaidd a data rhagfynegi yn hanfodol yn y dyfodol. Bydd yn bwysig o ran cefnogi'r dadleuon a gyflwynwyd yn adroddiad comisiwn Silk, a bydd casglu data hanfodol hefyd yn llywio trafodaethau yn y dyfodol.

The report also recommends the creation of a Welsh treasury to manage the new powers, and I hope that the Welsh Government is confident that it has the necessary expertise and skills in place to establish and develop a Welsh treasury. Finally, I am grateful to have been able to take part in this debate and I very much hope that the Silk report recommendations will be taken forward in due course.

Mae’r adroddiad hefyd yn argymell y dylid creu trysorlys Cymru i reoli’r pwerau newydd, ac rwy’n gobeithio bod Llywodraeth Cymru yn hyderus bod ganddi’r arbenigedd a’r sgiliau angenrheidiol yn eu lle i sefydlu a datblygu trysorlys Cymru. Yn olaf, rwy’n ddiolchgar fy mod wedi gallu cymryd rhan yn y ddadl hon ac rwy’n mawr obeithio y bydd adroddiad argymhellion Silk yn cael eu datblygu maes o law.

Leanne Wood: I begin by thanking all those involved in producing the Silk commission report for their excellent and detailed work. I would particularly like to thank outgoing members Dyfrig John and Sue Essex for their efforts; I wish them well for the future. The Silk commission was created out of cross-party agreement here in Wales, and on that basis the recommendations should be accepted in full and pushed forward. Building on the previous work of the Richard and Holtham commissions, the report recognises the weaknesses within the current situation and aims to empower the Welsh Government, the National Assembly and the Welsh people. As the opinion poll carried out by the commission shows, there has been a major shift in public opinion in Wales in recent years. The people in Wales are now in favour of income tax-varying powers and increasingly so: 64% of those polled by ICM for the Silk commission back in the summer supported these powers being in the hands of the Welsh Government. There is a danger that, unless we act together, we will find ourselves here lagging behind public opinion. I want to see all political parties working together on this. I want to see civic society working with the people of Wales to deliver a successful referendum on income tax, which will empower and grow our democracy. The Silk commission is about Welsh politics developing and maturing. As a result of these developments, there would be real choices on offer for the Welsh electorate. In future, our decisions would not just be about how to cut the cake; there would be an opportunity for us to bake the cake as well.

Leanne Wood: Dechreuaf drwy ddiolch i bawb oedd yn ymwneud â chynhyrchu adroddiad comisiwn Silk am eu gwaith rhagorol a manwl. Yn benodol, hoffwn ddiolch i'r aelodau sy'n gadael, Dyfrig John a Sue Essex am eu hymdrechion; dymunaf yn dda iddynt ar gyfer y dyfodol. Crëwyd comisiwn Silk allan o gytundeb trawsbleidiol yma yng Nghymru, ac ar y sail honno dylai'r argymhellion gael eu derbyn yn llawn a'u gweithredu. Gan adeiladu ar waith blaenorol comisiynau Richard a Holtham, mae'r adroddiad yn cydnabod y gwendidau o fewn y sefyllfa bresennol ac yn anelu at rymuso Llywodraeth Cymru, y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a phobl Cymru. Fel y mae'r arolwg barn a wnaed gan y comisiwn yn dangos, bu newid mawr yn y farn gyhoeddus yng Nghymru yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf. Mae'r bobl yng Nghymru bellach o blaid pwerau amrywio treth incwm ac yn gynyddol felly: roedd 64% o'r rhai a holwyd gan ICM ar gyfer comisiwn Silk yn ôl yn yr haf yn cefnogi gweld y pwerau hyn yn nwylo Llywodraeth Cymru. Mae perygl, oni bai ein bod yn gweithredu ar y cyd, y byddwn yn cael ein hunain yn llusgo ar ôl y farn gyhoeddus. Rwyf am weld yr holl bleidiau gwleidyddol yn gweithio gyda'i gilydd ar hyn. Rwyf am weld cymdeithas ddinesig yn gweithio gyda phobl Cymru i gyflwyno refferendwm llwyddiannus ar dreth incwm, a fydd yn grymuso ac yn tyfu ein democratiaeth. Mae comisiwn Silk yn ymwneud â gweld gwleidyddiaeth Cymru yn datblygu ac yn aeddfedu. O ganlyniad i'r datblygiadau hyn, byddai dewisiadau go iawn ar gael ar gyfer etholwyr Cymru. Yn y dyfodol, nid mater o sut i dorri'r gacen fyddai ein penderfyniadau; byddai cyfle i ni i bobi'r gacen yn ogystal.

The Party of Wales believes that having these powers will lead to a better economic situation for Wales. We will have greater potential because the Welsh Government will be able to see the incentives for improving the Welsh economy. Increasing and improving employment prospects will directly benefit the Welsh Government with an increase in tax take. The more people who work and the better they are paid, the more money will come into the new Welsh treasury. The 1.4 million taxpayers in Wales

Mae Plaid Cymru – the Party of Wales yn credu y bydd cael y pwerau hyn yn arwain at sefyllfa economaidd well i Gymru. Bydd gennym fwy o botensial gan y bydd Llywodraeth Cymru yn gallu gweld y cymhellion ar gyfer gwella economi Cymru. Bydd cynyddu a gwella rhagolygon cyflogaeth o fudd uniongyrchol i Lywodraeth Cymru gyda chynnydd yn y derbyniadau treth. Po fwyaf o bobl sy'n gweithio a pho fwyaf y maent yn cael eu talu, mwya'n y byd o arian ddaw i mewn i drysorlys newydd

will have a new stake in the Welsh Government. There is no doubt that, in future, positions on tax will influence people's voting choices. This is bound to improve accountability, with around 25% of Welsh income being raised in Wales. There will be a need to have a more open and inclusive debate about spending priorities. We will move from being a spending agency to having to make choices based on the taxation choices our electorate supports.

Cymru. Bydd gan y 1.4 miliwn o drethdalwyr yng Nghymru gyfran newydd yn Llywodraeth Cymru. Nid oes unrhyw amheuaeth, yn y dyfodol, y bydd safbwyntiau ar dreth yn dylanwadu ar ddewisiadau pleidleisio pobl. Mae hyn yn sicr o wella atebolrwydd, gyda thua 25% o incwm Cymru yn cael ei godi yng Nghymru. Bydd angen cael trafodaeth fwy agored a chynhwysol am flaenoriaethau gwario. Byddwn yn symud o fod yn asiantaeth wario i orfod gwneud dewisiadau yn seiliedig ar ddewisiadau trethiant y mae ein hetholwyr yn eu cefnogi.

While we would like to see the Welsh Government have powers over income tax as quickly as is practicable, we accept that the people of Wales will be consulted on this issue. Plaid Cymru will, therefore, support a referendum within the timetable outlined by the Silk commission. That should include the setting out of the new terms of the referendum in a new piece of UK Parliament legislation. We want to see the building blocks put in place by 2015. By that, we mean that we want legislation on the tax powers and the reserved powers model.

Er y byddem yn hoffi gweld Llywodraeth Cymru yn cael pwerau dros dreth incwm cyn gynted ag y bo'n ymarferol, rydym yn derbyn y bydd pobl Cymru yn cael eu hymgynghori ar y mater hwn. Bydd Plaid Cymru, felly, yn cefnogi refferendwm o fewn yr amserlen a amlinellwyd gan gomisiwn Silk. Dylai hynny gynnwys pennu telerau newydd y refferendwm mewn darn newydd o ddeddfwriaeth Senedd y DU. Rydym yn awyddus i weld y blociau adeiladu yn cael eu sefydlu erbyn 2015. Erbyn hynny, rydym yn golygu ein bod am ddeddfwriaeth ar y pwerau treth a'r model pwerau neilltuedig.

We also want to see fair funding through the scrapping of the Barnett formula and the introduction of a needs-based block grant. Changes to the Barnett formula do not depend on legislation. Barnett can be changed straight away, as soon as the UK Government accepts that such a change is necessary. That can be done under this Government and it can be done under the next. For a realistic chance of achieving fair funding for Wales, all parties should now include a commitment to fair funding and to an income tax referendum in their manifestos for the 2015 UK Parliament election and the 2016 National Assembly election. In my view, that would ensure our continued cross-party co-operation and determination to get the best deal for Wales. I hope that all Members here this afternoon will agree.

Rydym hefyd yn awyddus i weld arian teg drwy gael gwared ar fformiwla Barnett a chyflwyno grant bloc seiliedig ar anghenion. Nid yw'r newidiadau i fformiwla Barnett yn dibynnu ar ddeddfwriaeth. Gellir newid Barnett yn syth, cyn gynted â bod Llywodraeth y DU yn derbyn bod newid o'r fath yn angenrheidiol. Gellir gwneud hynny dan y Llywodraeth hon a gellir ei wneud o dan y nesaf. I gael cyfle realistig o sicrhau cyllid teg i Gymru, dylai pob plaid bellach gynnwys ymrwymiad i ariannu teg ac i refferendwm treth incwm yn eu maniffestos ar gyfer etholiad Senedd y DU 2015 ac etholiad y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol 2016. Yn fy marn i, byddai'n sicrhau ein cydweithrediad a'n penderfyniad trawsbleidiol parhaus i gael y fargen orau i Gymru. Gobeithiaf y bydd yr holl Aelodau yma y prynhawn yma yn cytuno.

Mike Hedges: First, I welcome the debate. During the business statement two weeks ago, when this matter was scheduled to be discussed as a statement, with only 30

Mike Hedges: Yn gyntaf, croesawaf y ddadl. Yn ystod y datganiad busnes bythefnos yn ôl, pan oedd y mater hwn i fod i gael ei drafod fel datganiad, gyda dim ond 30 munud ar

minutes for questions, I asked whether it could be turned into an hour-long discussion, and I am very pleased that it has been turned into a full debate.

gyfer cwestiynau, gofynnais a allai gael ei droi i mewn i drafodaeth awr o hyd, ac rwy'n falch iawn ei fod wedi cael ei droi'n ddadl lawn.

I welcome the publication of the report by the UK Government's Silk commission. As I think that everyone has said, it is a very comprehensive and well-argued report. I am also pleased that the Silk report is unanimous in that all four political parties represented on the commission have been able to agree a common set of recommendations. Much of what it says mirrors what was in a pamphlet that I published in the summer.

Rwy'n croesawu cyhoeddiad yr adroddiad gan gomisiwn Silk Llywodraeth y DU. Fel yr wyf yn meddwl y mae pawb wedi dweud, mae'n adroddiad cynhwysfawr iawn a dadleuon da drosto. Rwyf hefyd yn falch bod adroddiad Silk yn unfrydol yn y ffaith bod y pedair plaid wleidyddol a gynrychiolir ar y comisiwn wedi gallu cytuno ar set gyffredin o argymhellion. Mae llawer o'r hyn y mae'n ei ddweud yn adlewyrchu'r hyn a oedd mewn pamffled a gyhoeddais yn yr haf.

I am pleased to see that the commission has endorsed the devolution of borrowing powers to help to finance investment. It is essential that we are given the power to boost the economy in Wales. I have raised the need for a borrowing power many times in the Chamber. It is a power that exists in Scotland and Northern Ireland that, until now, has not existed in Wales and has been denied to us in Wales. I was hoping that the Westminster Government would act quickly on this. There is no need for legislation; there is no need for anything other than a simply change to Treasury rules allowing expenditure on capital to an agreed value not to count against the Welsh capital allocation. It is simple, straightforward and could be done very quickly. It does not need legislation; it does not need anything apart from a Treasury decision. It is just a simple rule change.

Rwy'n falch o weld bod y comisiwn wedi cymeradwyo datganoli pwerau benthyca i helpu i ariannu buddsoddiad. Mae'n hanfodol ein bod yn cael y pŵer i roi hwb i'r economi yng Nghymru. Rwyf wedi codi'r angen am bŵer benthyca lawer gwaith yn y Siambr. Mae'n bŵer sy'n bodoli yn yr Alban a Gogledd Iwerddon sydd, tan nawr, heb fodoli yng Nghymru ac sydd wedi cael ei wrthod i ni yng Nghymru. Roeddwn yn gobeithio y byddai Llywodraeth San Steffan yn gweithredu'n gyflym ar hyn. Nid oes angen deddfwriaeth; nid oes angen dim heblaw am newid rheolau'r Trysorlys i ganiatáu i wariant ar gyfalaf at werth a gytunwyd beidio â chyfrif yn erbyn dyraniad cyfalaf Cymru. Mae'n syml, yn uniongyrchol a gellid ei wneud yn gyflym iawn. Nid oes angen deddfwriaeth; nid oes angen unrhyw beth ar wahân i benderfyniad y Trysorlys. Newid rheol yn unig ydyw.

I agree that business rates should be fully devolved to the Welsh Government in the same way as in Scotland and Northern Ireland, provided that the UK Government and the Welsh Government agree the appropriate adjustment to the Welsh block grant. I also welcome the proposals for Wales to gain control over certain minor taxes such as stamp duty, landfill tax, aggregate levy and the long-haul passenger transport duty. However, I must admit that, in the pamphlet that I published earlier this year, I talked about the passenger transport duty as a whole, and I am a bit bemused by the attempt to separate the duty for long-haul flights from

Rwy'n cytuno y dylai ardrethi busnes gael eu datganoli'n llwyr i Lywodraeth Cymru yn yr un modd ag yn yr Alban a Gogledd Iwerddon, ar yr amod bod Llywodraeth y DU a Llywodraeth Cymru yn cytuno ar yr addasiad priodol i grant bloc Cymru. Rwyf hefyd yn croesawu'r cynigion ar gyfer Cymru i ennill rheolaeth dros rai trethi mân megis treth stamp, treth tirlenwi, ardoll agregau a'r dreth drafnidiaeth i deithwyr teithiau hir. Fodd bynnag, rhaid imi gyfaddef, yn y pamffled a gyhoeddais yn gynharach y flwyddyn hon, soniais am y dreth drafnidiaeth yn ei chyfanrwydd, ac rwyf ychydig yn ddryslyd gan yr ymgais i wahanu'r dreth teithiau hir

that for internal flights; I think that that perhaps needs looking at again. These things could help Wales to give levers to support economic growth. While these taxes can show substantial variation in percentages each year, their size is so small that they should not affect the overall financial plans of the Government. In my pamphlet earlier this year, I called for these to be placed outside the block grant in order to partially make up for Wales's underfunding. Unfortunately, that was not a viewpoint shared by the commission.

oddi wrth yr un ar gyfer hedfan mewnol, rwy'n meddwl efallai bod angen edrych ar hyn eto. Gallai'r pethau hyn helpu Cymru i roi dulliau i gefnogi twf economaidd. Er y gall y trethi hyn ddangos amrywiad sylweddol mewn canrannau bob blwyddyn, mae eu maint yn fach iawn ac felly ni ddylent effeithio ar gynlluniau ariannol cyffredinol y Llywodraeth. Yn fy mhamffled yn gynharach eleni, rwy'n galw am i'r rhain gael eu gosod y tu allan i'r grant bloc er mwyn gwneud yn iawn yn rhannol am danariannu Cymru. Yn anffodus, nid oedd yn safbwynt a rannwyd gan y comisiwn.

On income tax, I am very happy about the double lock. I believe that the people of Wales should have the final say. The people of Scotland had the final say on tax-varying powers for Scotland and we in Wales deserve no less. I believe that the people of Wales will say 'yes', but they ought to have the chance to do so. Of course, the weakness with income tax is that it varies. The Silk report estimates that the total income tax raised in Wales was £5.15 billion in 2007-08, £4.85 billion in 2008-09, £4.71 billion in 2009-10 and £4.85 billion in 2010-11. There is a £400 million variation between the highest and the lowest amounts. Had taxation been devolved in 2007-08, the Welsh Government would have had £550 million less to spend over the last four years without the Barnett floor. Therefore, any devolution of taxation without the Barnett floor could have a serious effect on public services in Wales.

Ar dreth incwm, rwy'n hapus iawn am y clo dwbl. Rwy'n credu y dylai pobl Cymru gael y gair olaf. Cafodd pobl yr Alban y gair olaf ar y pwerau amrywio trethi ar gyfer yr Alban, ac rydym ni yng Nghymru yn haeddu dim llai. Credaf y bydd pobl Cymru yn dweud 'ie', ond dylent gael y cyfle i wneud hynny. Wrth gwrs, y gwendid â threth incwm yw ei bod yn amrywio. Mae adroddiad Silk yn amcangyfrif mai cyfanswm y dreth incwm a godwyd yng Nghymru oedd £5.15 biliwn yn 2007-08, £4.85 yn 2008-09, £4.71 biliwn yn 2009-10 a £4.85 biliwn yn 2010-11. Mae £400 miliwn o amrywiad rhwng y swm uchaf a'r isaf. Pe byddai trethiant wedi ei ddatganoli yn 2007-08, byddai Llywodraeth Cymru wedi cael £550 miliwn yn llai i'w wario dros y pedair blynedd diwethaf heb y terfyn Barnett. Felly, gallai unrhyw ddatganoli trethiant heb y terfyn Barnett fod wedi cael effaith ddifrifol ar wasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru.

In addition, there are many thousands of Welsh people who contract weekly, monthly or even longer in England, working mainly in the construction industry. While I have seen the attempts to define who qualifies as a Scottish taxpayer, I do not think that this matter has been addressed there, and I do not think that it has been addressed here. We seem to have a lot of people, certainly from west Wales, going to work on major construction sites in England. That is a matter that will need to be resolved, because these people who will have two addresses that they could use: the address where they are staying or their permanent address.

Yn ogystal, mae miloedd lawer o bobl Cymru sy'n contractio'n wythnosol, yn fisol neu hyd yn oed am fwy o amser yn Lloegr, sy'n gweithio'n bennaf yn y diwydiant adeiladu. Er fy mod wedi gweld yr ymdrechion i ddiffinio pwy sy'n gymwys fel trethdalwr yr Alban, nid wyf yn credu bod y mater hwn wedi cael sylw yno, ac nid wyf yn credu ei fod wedi cael sylw yma. Mae'n ymddangos bod gennym lawer o bobl, yn sicr o orllewin Cymru, yn mynd i weithio ar safleoedd adeiladu mawr yn Lloegr. Mae hynny'n fater y bydd angen ei ddatrys, oherwydd bydd gan y bobl hyn ddau gyfeiriad y gallent ei defnyddio: y cyfeiriad lle maent yn aros neu eu cyfeiriad parhaol.

I also do not think that income tax should be devolved until such time as all underspends can be carried over from year to year. We need to have that fitted in, otherwise we could end up in the situation where, if we have more income tax than we expect the Treasury could claw it back, but, if we have less, we could end up having to borrow to fund revenue expenditure in bad years.

Nid wyf yn credu chwaith y dylai treth incwm gael ei datganoli hyd nes y gall pob tanwariant gael ei gario drosodd o flwyddyn i flwyddyn. Mae angen i ni sicrhau cynnwys hynny, fel arall, gallem weld ein hunain mewn sefyllfa lle, os oes gennym fwy o dreth incwm nag yr oeddem yn ei disgwyl gallai'r Trysorlys ei adfachu, ond, os oes gennym lai, gallem orfod benthyca i ariannu gwariant refeniw yn y blynyddoedd gwael.

I really agree with the Silk commission on corporation tax. It is too complicated, it is too easy to move from country to country, and, to briefly quote the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development,

Rwy'n cytuno'n llawn gyda chomisiwn Silk ar dreth gorfforaeth. Mae'n rhy gymhleth, mae'n rhy hawdd symud o wlad i wlad, ac, i ddyfynnu'r Sefydliad ar gyfer Cydweithrediad a Datblygiad Economaidd yn gryno,

'Ireland's appeal has been based on the quality, price and availability of its labour, the welcoming attitude to foreign investors, the use of the English language and exploitation of "first-mover advantages"'

Mae apêl Iwerddon wedi cael ei seilio ar ansawdd, pris ac argaeledd ei lafur, yr agwedd groesawgar at fuddsoddwyr tramor, y defnydd o'r iaith Saesneg ac ymelwa ar fanteision symudwr cyntaf

rather than on the fact that it had corporation tax.

yn hytrach nag ar y ffaith bod ganddi dreth gorfforaeth.

In conclusion, I strongly welcome the report, but believe that more work needs to be done before we can consider income tax devolution.

I gloi, rwy'n croesawu'r adroddiad, ond credaf fod angen gwneud mwy cyn y gallwn ystyried datganoli treth incwm.

Kirsty Williams: I welcome the move by the Welsh Government to table this debate today. What is more important than anything is that we keep up the momentum following the publication of the commission's report. In the past, too many works of this kind have been published to great applause only to be left to languish on a shelf or a desk somewhere.

Kirsty Williams: Croesawaf y symudiad gan Lywodraeth Cymru i gynnig y ddadl hon heddiw. Beth sy'n fwy pwysig na dim yw ein bod yn cynnal y momentwm yn dilyn cyhoeddi adroddiad y comisiwn. Yn y gorffennol, mae gormod o weithiau o'r math hwn wedi cael eu cyhoeddi i gymeradwyaeth fawr dim ond iddynt i gael eu gadael i hel llwch ar silff neu ddesg yn rhywle.

Like the First Minister, I will begin by thanking Paul Silk and all the members of the commission for their hard work on our behalf. The commission has had a very complex piece of work to carry out. It has involved a great many individuals giving up their time in service to Wales as a country, and we should all be grateful for their contribution to that process.

Fel y Prif Weinidog, dechreuaf drwy ddiolch i Paul Silk a holl aelodau'r comisiwn am eu gwaith caled ar ein rhan. Mae'r comisiwn wedi cael darn cymhleth iawn o waith i'w wneud. Mae wedi ymwneud â nifer fawr o unigolion yn rhoi o'u hamser mewn gwasanaeth i Gymru fel gwlad, a dylem i gyd fod yn ddiolchgar am eu cyfraniad at y broses honno.

The full story of how this commitment found its way into the coalition document is perhaps

Mae'r stori lawn ar sut y mae'r ymrwymiad hwn wedi dod i mewn i'r ddogfen glymblaid,

one best left for me to bore my grandchildren with in years to come. However, I know that many people in London were not convinced that there would be a desire in this place for this commission to be formed and to take its work forward. Some people were genuinely surprised that the four party leaders in Cardiff could get together quickly, work constructively, agree the terms of reference and suggest suitable people to carry out this work. It was a genuine surprise to them that we could pull that off. I think that there were some people in Westminster, who shall remain nameless, who thought that, by kicking the ball back to Cardiff bay, they would see the end of this pesky little addition to the coalition document. We were able to prove them wrong, because we were able to put our political differences aside and to work together to achieve terms of reference that would allow the Silk commission to go forward. It has been gratifying, therefore, to see that the commission, as described, with differing views and expectations, has been able to come up with a unanimously agreed report. The principles of empowerment and responsibility, which are referenced in the title of report, are the cornerstones of how the Liberals, and, subsequently, the Liberal Democrats, have approached how devolution should develop in Wales. We are hugely heartened to see in the contents of this report principles that we can very much support.

o bosibl, yn un y byddai'n well i mi ddiflasu fy wyrion â hi yn y blynyddoedd i ddod. Fodd bynnag, gwn fod llawer o bobl yn Llundain nad oeddent yn argyhoeddedig y byddai awydd yn y lle hwn i'r comisiwn gael ei ffurfio ac i ddatblygu ei waith. Roedd rhai pobl yn wirioneddol synnu y gallai arweinyddion y pedair plaid yng Nghaerdydd ddod at ei gilydd yn gyflym, gweithio'n adeiladol, cytuno ar y cylch gorchwyl ac awgrymu pobl addas i wneud y gwaith hwn. Roedd yn syndod gwirioneddol iddynt ein bod wedi llwyddo i wneud hynny. Credaf fod rhai pobl yn San Steffan, a fydd yn aros yn ddienw, a oedd o'r farn y byddent, drwy gicio'r bêl yn ôl i fae Caerdydd, yn gweld diwedd ar yr ychwanegiad bach felltith hwn i'r ddogfen glymblaid. Roeddem yn gallu profi eu bod nhw'n anghywir, oherwydd ein bod yn gallu rhoi ein gwahaniaethau gwleidyddol o'r neilltu a gweithio gyda'n gilydd i gyflawni cylch gorchwyl a fyddai'n caniatáu i gomisiwn Silk symud ymlaen. Mae wedi bod yn braf, felly, gweld bod y comisiwn, fel y disgrifiwyd, gyda safbwyntiau a disgwyliadau gwahanol, wedi gallu cyflwyno adroddiad unfrydol. Yr egwyddorion grymuso a chyfrifoldeb, y cyfeirir atynt yn nheitl yr adroddiad, yw conglfeini sut y mae'r Rhyddfrydwyr, ac, wedi hynny, y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, wedi ymdrin â sut y dylai datganoli ddatblygu yng Nghymru. Rydym yn galonogol iawn i weld egwyddorion y gallwn eu cefnogi'n wirioneddol yng nghynnwys yr adroddiad hwn.

We have long argued for borrowing powers for the National Assembly and the Welsh Government. Mike Hedges talked about the Westminster Government denying us those powers. Mike, I do not want to give you a history lesson, but the settlement that we have here is courtesy of Peter Hain and your colleagues. If anyone has denied this institution and nation borrowing powers, it is Members on your own side. However, I am very glad that we now have a consensus on the real necessity for those borrowing powers to be here, to give the Welsh Government the levers that it needs to attract the infrastructure investment that we so badly want.

Rydym wedi dadlau ers tro am bwerau benthyg i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a Llywodraeth Cymru. Soniodd Mike Hedges am Lywodraeth San Steffan yn gwrthod y pwerau hynny inni. Mike, nid wyf am roi gwers hanes i chi, ond mae'r setliad sydd gennym yma trwy garedigrwydd Peter Hain a'ch cydweithwyr. Os oes unrhyw un wedi gwadu pwerau benthyca i'r sefydliad hwn ac i'r genedl, Aelodau ar eich ochr chi yw'r rheini. Fodd bynnag, rwy'n falch bellach bod gennym gonsensws ar yr angen go iawn ar gyfer gweld y pwerau benthyca hynny yma, i roi'r dulliau i Lywodraeth Cymru sydd eu hangen arni i ddenu'r buddsoddiad seilwaith yr ydym o ddifrif ei eisiau.

4.30 p.m.

Mike Hedges: I agree with you. I think that borrowing powers should have been in there. However, the position was that they were not needed then as they are now, because of the substantially larger capital programmes that were available.

Mike Hedges: Rwy'n cytuno â chi. Rwy'n credu y dylai pwerau benthyca fod wedi bod yno. Fodd bynnag, y sefyllfa oedd nad oedd eu hangen bryd hynny, fel y mae heddiw, oherwydd y rhaglenni cyfalaf sylweddol fwy oedd ar gael.

Kirsty Williams: As one of those who have been calling out for capital investment in our constituencies, I do not see the need being any greater now than it was when we got here 13 years ago. However, I am glad that there is now a consensus of opinion, both on this side of the M4 and on the London side, that, in principle, borrowing powers should be here. We now need to ensure that that moves forward as quickly as possible, so that those powers can be used.

Kirsty Williams: Fel un o'r rhai sydd wedi bod yn galw am fuddsoddiad cyfalaf yn ein hetholaethau, nid wyf yn gweld yr angen fymryn yn fwy yn awr nag yr oedd pan gyraeddasom yma 13 mlynedd yn ôl. Fodd bynnag, rwy'n falch erbyn hyn bod consenswS barn, ar yr ochr hon i'r M4 ac ar ochr Llundain, y dylai pwerau benthyca, mewn egwyddor, fod yma. Nawr mae angen inni sicrhau bod hynny'n symud ymlaen mor gyflym â phosibl, fel y gellir defnyddio'r pwerau hynny.

I do not think that there is any disagreement about the suitability of devolving the low-yield taxes that have been outlined, or about the fact that, though they are relatively low-yielding taxes, they are still a valuable tool for the Welsh Government in policy intervention terms here. The power over those taxes should rest with us.

Nid wyf yn credu bod unrhyw anghytundeb ynghylch addasrwydd datganoli'r trethi arenillion isel sydd wedi cael eu hamlinellu, neu am y ffaith, er eu bod yn drethi arenillion cymharol isel, eu bod yn dal i fod yn offeryn gwerthfawr ar gyfer Llywodraeth Cymru yn nhermau ymyriad polisi yma. Dylai'r pŵer dros y trethi hynny berthyn i ni.

Regarding the desirability of income tax powers coming here, I think that perhaps there is a greater degree of agreement on that. What has been useful in respect of the Silk commission is the more sophisticated approach that it has taken to income tax than we saw with the Calman commission in Scotland. It has been able to look at the Calman experience and the Holtham report, and it has been able to develop a system that is better suited to Wales and that would give us more flexibility. That is to be welcomed.

O ran pa mor ddymunol fyddai gweld pwerau treth incwm yn dod yma, rwy'n meddwl efallai bod mwy o gytundeb ar hynny. Beth sydd wedi bod yn ddefnyddiol o ran comisiwn Silk yw'r ymagwedd fwy soffistigedig y mae wedi'i chymryd at dreth incwm nag a welsom gyda chomisiwn Calman yn yr Alban. Mae wedi gallu edrych ar brofiad Calman ac adroddiad Holtham, ac mae wedi llwyddo i ddatblygu system sy'n gweddu'n well i Gymru a byddai hynny'n rhoi mwy o hyblygrwydd i ni. Mae hynny i'w groesawu.

I know that the issue of the referendum is exercising people greatly.

Gwn fod y mater o refferendwm yn peri pryder mawr i bobl.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Please conclude on this, quickly.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Os gwelwch yn dda gorffennwch ar hyn, yn gyflym.

Kirsty Williams: The Welsh Liberal Democrats accept the public's desire for a referendum to go ahead. Although we would rather not go through that process again, we

Kirsty Williams: Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn derbyn awydd y cyhoedd i weld refferendwm yn mynd yn ei flaen. Er y byddai'n well gennym beidio â

will be there campaigning alongside others for a ‘yes’ vote.

mynd drwy’r broses honno eto, byddwn yno ymgyrchu ochr yn ochr ag eraill am bleidlais ‘ie’.

Lastly, I agree with the First Minister that what we need now is an early legislative opportunity at Westminster to get legislation that underpins this. I am quite happy to take him up on his challenge to work co-operatively across the Chamber to achieve that legislative slot and those outcomes.

Yn olaf, cytunaf â’r Prif Weinidog mai’r hyn sydd ei angen arnom nawr yw cyfle deddfwriaethol cynnar yn San Steffan i gael deddfwriaeth a fydd yn sail i hyn. Rwy’n eithaf hapus i dderbyn ei her i weithio ar y cyd ar draws y Siambr i gyrraedd y slot deddfwriaethol hwnnw a’r canlyniadau hynny.

Andrew R.T. Davies: I welcome the opportunity to speak in this afternoon’s debate. I take the point raised by Kirsty Williams, leader of the Liberal Democrats, namely that it came as a bit of a surprise to certain colleagues that all four party leaders were able to agree on a consensual way forward when this report was put together.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Croesawaf y cyfle i siarad yn y Siambr y prynhawn yma. Derbyniaf y pwynt a godwyd gan Kirsty Williams, arweinydd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, sef ei bod yn dipyn o syndod i rai cydweithwyr bod arweinwyr y pedair plaid yn gallu cytuno ar ffordd gydsyniol ymlaen pan luniwyd yr adroddiad hwn.

I pay tribute to everyone who was involved in the drafting of the report. It has been vital for this report to be seen as a unanimous report, given that it has a timetable within it for politicians here, for those along the M4, and for wider civic society. Indeed, the leader of Plaid Cymru touched on the importance of taking everyone along with us on this, rather than its just being a bubble event in which we talk and get very excited among ourselves but do not take the wider population with us.

Talaf deyrnged i bawb a oedd yn rhan o’r gwaith o ddrafftio’r adroddiad. Mae wedi bod yn hanfodol i’r adroddiad hwn gael ei ystyried fel adroddiad unfrydol, o gofio bod amserlen ynddo ar gyfer gwleidyddion yma, ar gyfer y rhai ar hyd yr M4, ac ar gyfer y gymdeithas ddinesig ehangach. Yn wir, mae arweinydd Plaid Cymru wedi crybwyll pwysigrwydd cynnwys pawb yn hyn, yn hytrach na’i fod yn ddim ond digwyddiad mewn swigen yr ydym yn siarad ac yn teimlo’n angerddol iawn amdano ymysg ein gilydd, ond nad ydym yn dod â’r boblogaeth ehangach gyda ni.

I also welcome the report’s strong emphasis on the union, the ability of the union to continue to fund Wales, and the importance of that. It is in that context that I can fully support this report. It is important that greater responsibility and empowerment come to the Assembly and are transferred to the Government of the day, whoever that might be. It can then be held to account on the money that is raised here and the money that it spends. I think that that is a huge discrepancy in our current settlement. If you believe in this document and want to support it, and you come from a strong unionist background, the ability to support it is based on the premise that devolution is here to stay and it is accepted. Ten or 12 years ago, it was

Rwyf hefyd yn croesawu pwyslais cryf yr adroddiad ar yr undeb, gallu’r undeb i barhau i ariannu Cymru, a phwysigrwydd hynny. Yn y cyd-destun hwnnw gallaf lwyr gefnogi’r adroddiad hwn. Mae’n bwysig bod mwy o gyfrifoldeb a grymuso yn dod i’r Cynulliad ac yn cael eu trosglwyddo i Lywodraeth y dydd, pwy bynnag a allai fod. Gellir wedyn ei dwyn i gyfrif ar yr arian a godir yma a’r arian y mae’n ei wario. Credaf fod hynny’n anghysondeb mawr yn ein setliad presennol. Os ydych yn credu yn y ddogfen hon ac yn awyddus i’w chefnogi, ac yr ydych yn dod o gefndir unoliaethol cryf, mae’r gallu i’w chefnogi yn seiliedig ar y cynsail bod datganoli yma i aros ac mae’n cael ei dderbyn. Ddeg neu 12 mlynedd yn ôl, roedd

far more of a challenge for people to accept this institution and the Government that came from it. Based on the successive polls that have been undertaken—whether that refers to the referendum on primary powers, or the polls that the Silk commission has undertaken—there is clearly an appetite among the Welsh population for decisions within the devolved areas to be made in Wales. We should fully embrace that empowerment and that decision-making process.

hi’n llawer mwy o her i bobl dderbyn y sefydliad hwn a’r Llywodraeth a ddaeth ohono. Yn seiliedig ar y polau olynol sydd wedi eu cynnal—boed hynny yn cyfeirio at y refferendwm ar bwerau cynradd, neu'r polau y mae comisiwn Silk wedi’u cynnal—mae awydd yn amlwg ymysg poblogaeth Cymru ar gyfer gwneud penderfyniadau o fewn y meysydd datganoledig yng Nghymru. Dylem gofleidio’r broses rymuso a gwneud penderfyniadau honno’n llwyr.

I also welcome the First Minister’s establishment of a working group to take forward this proposal. I would be grateful if, in summing up, he could put a bit more meat on the bone of that working group, so that we can see whether there have been discussions with the Secretary of State and that there is Westminster buy-in. I note from the First Minister’s opening remarks the possibility of a White Paper by next summer. I assume that he is making that prediction on the basis that the Secretary of State is in support of the way forward that the First Minister has identified.

Rwyf hefyd yn croesawu sefydlu gweithgor gan y Prif Weinidog i fwrw ymlaen â’r cynnig. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar, wrth grynhoi, os gallai roi ychydig mwy o gig ar asgwrn y gweithgor hwnnw, fel y gallwn weld a fu trafodaethau gyda’r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol a bod cydsyniad gan San Steffan. Nodaf o sylwadau agoriadol y Prif Weinidog y posibilrwydd o Bapur Gwyn erbyn yr haf nesaf. Rwy’n tybio ei fod yn gwneud y broffwydoliaeth honno ar y sail bod yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol yn cefnogi’r ffordd ymlaen y mae’r Prif Weinidog wedi ei nodi.

There are areas that the Welsh Government can work on. For example, in chapter 7 about capacity building, and in particular recommendations 22, 23, 24 and 25, there are important areas that need to be worked up, so that people can have confidence that we have the infrastructure, the figures and the ability to determine where the journey towards financial responsibility will take us. I note that the First Minister did not touch on any of that. I think that some of those tools are already in your hands, First Minister, and you are able to work up some of those proposals, along with other colleagues.

Mae meysydd y gall Llywodraeth Cymru weithio arnynt. Er enghraifft, ym mhennod 7 am adeiladu gallu, ac yn benodol argymhellion 22, 23, 24 a 25, mae meysydd pwysig y mae angen eu datblygu, fel y gall pobl fod yn hyderus bod gennym y seilwaith, y ffigurau a’r gallu i benderfynu i ble y bydd y daith tuag at gyfrifoldeb ariannol yn mynd â ni. Nodaf na wnaeth y Prif Weinidog gyffwrdd â dim o hyn. Credaf fod rhai o’r offerynnau eisoes yn eich dwylo, Brif Weinidog, a’ch bod yn gallu datblygu rhai o’r cynigion, ynghyd â chydweithwyr eraill.

Those of us on this side of the Chamber fully support the issue on borrowing powers, and it is heartening to see how the Westminster Government has engaged with the Welsh Government to allow this to become a reality. It is important that those borrowing powers be used to grow the capacity of the Welsh economy rather than supplement revenue spending. Also, with income tax powers, instead of looking at our only option being to raise tax, as was touched on by the First Minister, I personally believe that, with the right thinking and the right attitude, we can

Mae’r rhai ohonom ar yr ochr hon i’r Siambr yn cefnogi’r mater ar bwerau benthyca, ac mae’n galonogol gweld sut y mae Llywodraeth San Steffan wedi ymgysylltu â Llywodraeth Cymru i ganiatáu i hyn ddod yn realiti. Mae’n bwysig bod y pwerau benthyca yn cael eu defnyddio i dyfu gallu economi Cymru yn hytrach nag ychwanegu at wariant refeniw. Hefyd, gyda phwerau treth incwm, yn hytrach nag edrych ar godi treth fel ein hunig opsiwn, fel y crybwyllodd y Prif Weinidog, rwy’n credu yn bersonol, gyda’r meddwl cywir a’r agwedd gywir, y gallwn

grow the tax base in Wales, so that we do not have to have those large increases that other Members have talked about, should the financial situation change.

dyfu'r sylfaen dreth yng Nghymru , fel nad oes raid i ni gael y cynnydd mawr y mae Aelodau eraill wedi sôn amdano, pe bai'r sefyllfa ariannol yn newid.

On a personal level, I think that the opportunity to look more extensively at the transfer of capital gains has been missed here. If you want to encourage entrepreneurs and the establishment of businesses, capital gains is a vital tax to get businesses to locate here and to allow entrepreneurs to establish and grow businesses and retain the proceeds, should they sell them. I accept what Silk has said about that, but on a personal note, I happen to think that that was a missed opportunity. We fully endorse the Silk commission and we look forward to working with the parties across the Chamber. It will be a joined-up approach that will see this Silk commission going forward, working with our colleagues at Westminster but, above all, with society in general, so that it sees the benefits of this report: empowerment and responsibility.

Ar lefel bersonol, credaf fod y cyfle i edrych yn fwy helaeth ar drosglwyddo enillion cyfalaf wedi cael ei golli yma. Os ydych chi eisiau annog entrepreneuriaid a sefydlu busnesau, mae enillion cyfalaf yn dreth hanfodol i gael busnesau i leoli yma, ac i ganiatáu i entrepreneuriaid sefydlu a thyfu busnesau a chadw'r elw, pe digwydd iddynt eu gwerthu. Derbyniaf yr hyn y mae Silk wedi ei ddweud am hynny, ond ar nodyn personol, rwy'n digwydd credu bod hwn yn gyfle a gollwyd. Rydym yn llwyr gefnogi comisiwn Silk ac rydym yn edrych ymlaen at weithio gyda'r pleidiau ar draws y Siambr. Dull cydgysylltiedig fydd yn gweld comisiwn Silk yn mynd ymlaen, gan weithio gyda'n cydweithwyr yn San Steffan, ond, yn anad dim, gyda chymdeithas yn gyffredinol, fel ei bod yn gweld buddiannau'r adroddiad hwn: grym a chyfrifoldeb.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Ategaf y diolchiadau haeddiannol iawn a roddwyd y prynhawn yma i'r comisiynwyr i gyd—Paul Silk a'r gweddill ohonynt. Gwnaed gwaith ardderchog. Ategaf hefyd sylwadau Kirsty Williams ac Andrew R.T. Davies am y ffordd y daeth y pedwar arweinydd yn y lle hwn at ei gilydd i gytuno cylch gorchwyl Silk. Credaf fod hynny'n dangos os ydym yn gallu cydweithio â'n gilydd, fel y gwnaethom yn refferendwm 2011, fel y gwnaethom wrth sefydlu comisiwn Silk, ac fel y gwnaethom wrth gytuno'r cylch gorchwyl—ac rydym wedi gweld y math hwn o gonsensws yn barod yn y Siambr y prynhawn yma—rwy'n siŵr y medrwn fynd â'r maen arbennig hwn i'r wal.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: I echo the thanks that have, deservedly, been given this afternoon to all the commissioners—Paul Silk and the others members of the commission. They have done excellent work. I also endorse the comments made by Kirsty Williams and Andrew R.T. Davies about how the four leaders in this place came together to agree the terms of reference for Silk. I think that that shows that if we can work together, as we did with the referendum in 2011, as we did in setting up the Silk commission, and as we did in agreeing on the terms of reference—and we have already seen that kind of consensus in the Chamber this afternoon—I am confident that we can manage to get this particular job done.

Er ein bod ni, fel plaid, wedi cyflwyno tystiolaeth yn gofyn am drosglwyddo'r cyfrifoldeb dros dreth gorfforaeth ac er bod y comisiwn wedi gwrthod hwnnw'n uniongyrchol, daethant gam o'r ffordd gyda ni, ac mae hynny'n bwysig. Maent wedi galw, fel y cyfeiriodd y Prif Weinidog ato, am gyfrifoldeb dros lwfansau cyfalaf, er enghraifft, sy'n bwysig. Pwysleisiwyd hefyd fod y cyfrifoldeb dros dreth gorfforaeth wedi

Although we, as a party, submitted evidence asking for the transfer of responsibility for corporation tax and although the commission rejected that outright, it did come to meet us part of the way, and that is important. As the First Minister referred, it has called for responsibility over capital allowances, for instance, which is important. It also emphasised that the responsibility for corporation tax has been transferred to

ei drosglwyddo i'r Alban a Gogledd Iwerddon, a disgwylir y byddai'r un cyfrifoldeb yn cael ei drosglwyddo i Gymru. Felly, mae cytundeb yn hynny o beth. Nid ydynt wedi dod bob cam o'r ffordd, ond yn sicr maent wedi dod gam o'r ffordd gyda ni.

Scotland and Northern Ireland, and one would expect the same responsibility to be transferred to Wales. Therefore, there is agreement on that. The commissioners did not come all the way to meet us on that, but they definitely took a step in our direction.

O edrych ar yr adroddiad yn ei gyfanrwydd, fel y mae'r Aelodau eisoes wedi cyfeirio ato, gwelwn fod sail gadarn ar gyfer symud ymlaen. Nid oedd y comisiwn—na finnau—wedi gallu dod ar draws unrhyw Lywodraeth ddemocrataidd yn unrhyw le nad oes ganddi ddim pwerau dros drethu o gwbl. Nid oes yr un sefydliad arall heb y pwerau hynny.

In looking at the report in its entirety, as Members have referred to, we see a firm basis on which to move forward. The commission was not able to find—and nor was I—a single democratic Government anywhere that does not have any powers over taxation at all. There is not a single other institution without those powers.

Fel y clywsom eisoes, mae rhesymau da dros symud yn fuan i drosglwyddo'r cyfrifoldeb dros drethu, ac nid y lleiaf ohonynt yw sicrhau mwy o atebolrwydd ar ran Llywodraeth Cymru am y ffordd y caiff arian ei wario—beth bynnag y bo *complexion* gwleidyddol y Llywodraeth honno, wrth gwrs. Felly, rhaid i bob plaid o hyn allan gyfiawnhau unrhyw wariant newydd i'r cyhoedd, gan y byddai'n effeithio'n uniongyrchol ar gyfradd y dreth y byddant yn ei thalu. Gan fod nifer o Aelodau wedi gwneud y pwyntiau hynny heddiw, rwyf am ganolbwyntio gweddill fy sylwadau am bwysigrwydd pwerau dros drethu ar yr angen i gryfhau'r economi.

As we have already heard, there are good reasons for moving forward quickly on the transfer of responsibility for taxation, not least of which is to ensure more accountability on the part of the Welsh Government for how money is spent—whatever the political complexion of that Government, naturally. Therefore, from here on in, every party must justify any new expenditure to the public, because that will have a direct impact on the tax rate that they have to pay. Given that several Members have made those points today, I will focus the remainder of my comments about the importance of taxation powers on the need to strengthen the economy.

Droeon, rydym wedi clywed y ddadl bod y sector preifat yng Nghymru yn rhy fach, bod lefelau GDP a chyflogau yn rhy isel, bod diffyg cwmnïau mawr â'u pencadlysoedd yng Nghymru, ac nid oes gennym ganolfan ariannol yn ein prifddinas. Mae pethau y gallem eu gwneud gyda'n pwerau presennol i wella hynny, wrth gwrs. Yn ein dogfen, 'Adnewyddu'r Economi: cyfeiriad newydd', bu inni ganolbwyntio ar yr angen i gefnogi sectorau twf, i symud oddi wrth ddiwylliant grantiau i fuddsoddiad, ac i sicrhau bod y drefn gynllunio yn fwy sensitif i anghenion busnes. Popeth yn dda am hynny—

Time and again, we have heard the argument that the private sector in Wales is too small, that GDP levels and wages are too low, that there are not enough major companies with their headquarters in Wales, and that we do not have a financial centre in our capital city. There are things that we could do within our current powers to improve that, of course. In our document, 'Economic Renewal: a new direction', we focused on the need to support growth sectors, to move away from a grants culture to one of investment, and to ensure that the planning process is more sensitive to the needs of business. All well and good—

Nick Ramsay: You have spoken at length about corporation tax, which has not been recommended for devolution, but do you accept that if corporation rates were dropped to the same level as they were in Ireland, that would leave quite a hole in the Assembly's budget without any immediate economic

Nick Ramsay: Rydych chi wedi siarad yn helaeth am dreth gorfforaeth, nad yw wedi cael ei hargymell ar gyfer datganoli, ond a ydych yn derbyn, pe byddai cyfraddau corfforaeth yn cael eu gollwng i'r un lefel ag yr oeddent yn Iwerddon, y byddai hynny'n gadael eithaf twll yng nghyllideb y Cynulliad

benefit in the short term?

heb unrhyw fudd economaidd uniongyrchol yn y tymor byr?

Ieuan Wyn Jones: I think that we can argue that point ad infinitum. The reality is that those countries that have reduced their rates of corporation tax have benefited substantially from doing so. That is undeniable. I accept that the hit would have to be taken from your block, and therefore you would have to prioritise the remainder of your spending. However, that is now an argument for another day, given that it has been rejected by Silk.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Rwy'n credu y gallwn ddadlau'r pwynt hwnnw hyd ddydd y farn. Y realiti yw bod y gwledydd hynny sydd wedi lleihau eu cyfraddau treth gorfforaeth wedi elwa'n sylweddol o wneud hynny. Ni ellir gwadu hynny. Derbyniaf y byddai'n rhaid cymryd yr ergyd o'ch bloc, ac felly byddai'n rhaid i chi flaenoriaethu gweddill eich gwariant. Fodd bynnag, dadl ar gyfer diwrnod arall yw hon, o ystyried ei bod wedi cael ei gwrthod gan Silk.

Fel yr oeddwn yn ei ddweud, popeth yn dda am hynny a'r holl bethau y gallem eu gwneud, ond gallaf ddweud wrthych, fel rhywun a oedd â chyfrifoldeb am yr economi fel Gweinidog am bedair blynedd—a hynny, gyda llaw, yn ystod y dirwasgiad mwyaf, dyfnaf a hiraf ers y 1930au—roedd rhwystredigaethau sylweddol yn wynebu'r Llywodraeth, ac os nad oes gennych bwerau dros y drefn ariannol a macroeconomaidd, prin iawn ac ymylol iawn fydd effaith yr hyn y medrwch ei wneud.

As I was saying, that is all well and good in relation to all the things that we could be doing, but let me tell you, as someone who had responsibility for the economy as Minister for four years—and that, by the way, was during the greatest, deepest and longest recession since the 1930s—there were substantial barriers facing the Government, and if you do not have powers over the fiscal and macroeconomic levers, the impact of what you can do will be very small and very marginal indeed.

Roeddem yn gallu tynnu cynlluniau cyfalaf ymlaen, ac yn gallu ailgyfeirio arian Ewropeaidd i helpu i gadw pobl mewn swyddi, fel gyda rhaglenni ProAct a ReAct. Rhaid cydnabod, fodd bynnag, mai ymylol oedd effeithiau'r rhain, er ein bod wedi gallu cadw lefelau diweithdra i lawr. Cymaint mwy y gallem fod wedi'i wneud pe bai pwerau trethu a benthyca gennym. O ran defnyddio pwerau trethu i hybu'r economi, mae trethi busnes yn enghraifft glasurol. Gallech leihau trethi busnes i helpu busnesau bach, yn arbennig yng nghanol ein trefi ac mewn pentrefi gwledig. Mae nifer yn dweud mai wrth godi trethi y mae cryfhau economi Cymru, ond nid yw hynny'n angenrheidiol o gwbl. Yr hyn yr ydym ni eisiau ei wneud, fel mae sawl person wedi'i ddweud, yw ehangu sylfaen y dreth y mae pobl yn ei thalu. Felly, pe bai unrhyw Lywodraeth yn dymuno codi trethi—

We were able to bring capital schemes forward, and we were able to redirect European funding to help to keep people in jobs, as with the ProAct and ReAct programmes, for example. However, we have to acknowledge that the effects of those were marginal even though we managed to keep unemployment levels down. We could have done so much more if only we had powers over taxation and borrowing. In respect of using taxation powers to boost the economy, business rates are a classic example. You could reduce business rates to help small businesses, particularly those in our town centres and rural villages. Many say that it is by raising taxes that we can strengthen the Welsh economy, but that is not necessary at all. What we want to do, as many have said, is expand the tax base that people pay. Therefore, if any Government wanted to raise taxes—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Gorffennwch, os gwelwch yn dda.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Conclude, please.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Byddai hynny'n ein

Ieuan Wyn Jones: That would make us less

gwneud yn llai cystadleuol.

competitive.

Fy mhwynt olaf, felly, yw mai'r peth gorau y gallem ni ei wneud heddiw yw dangos unoliaeth barn yng Nghymru a chonsensws clir o blaid sicrhau y gwelwn wireddu argymhellion Silk, a hynny'n fuan drwy gael Deddf yn San Steffan. Mater i'r lle hwn, wedyn, fyddai sbarduno refferendwm maes o law.

My final point, therefore, is that the best thing for us to do today is show that there is now unanimity of opinion in Wales and a clear consensus in favour of ensuring the realisation of Silk's recommendations, and to secure that quickly via an Act of Parliament. It would then be a matter for this place to trigger a referendum in due course.

Nick Ramsay: I also pay tribute to the hard work and thoroughness that has gone into this report by the Silk commission. It is also important that we recognise Gerry Holtham's previous work in this regard which, in many ways, along with Calman, paved the way for much of what has gone into this report. As Holtham and Silk both reported, the devolution of taxation powers is far from a straightforward process. There are things that are difficult for any of us to disagree on. I have heard a great deal of consensus in the Chamber today that there should, in principle, be greater fiscal responsibility for a legislative body. There has been agreement on that. Secondly, it would be wholly inappropriate for the Welsh Government to be expected to take risks beyond those that are as a direct result of the choices made by the Welsh Government. Therefore, any devolution of tax powers must have a proportionate risk associated with them. I think that Mike Hedges also made some of those points.

Nick Ramsay: Rwyf finnau'n talu teyrnged i'r gwaith caled a'r trylwyredd sydd wedi mynd i mewn i'r adroddiad hwn gan gomisiwn Silk. Mae hefyd yn bwysig ein bod yn cydnabod gwaith blaenorol Gerry Holtham yn hyn o beth a wnaeth, mewn llawer o ffyrdd, ynghyd â Calman, baratoi'r ffordd ar gyfer llawer o'r hyn sydd wedi mynd i mewn i'r adroddiad hwn. Fel mae Holtham a Silk yn adrodd, mae datganoli pwerau trethu yn bell o fod yn broses syml. Mae pethau sy'n anodd i unrhyw un ohonom anghytuno â nhw. Rwyf wedi clywed llawer iawn o gonsensws yn y Siambr heddiw y dylid, mewn egwyddor, bod mwy o gyfrifoldeb ariannol i gorff deddfwriaethol. Cafwyd cytundeb ar hynny. Yn ail, byddai'n gwbl amhriodol disgwyl i Lywodraeth Cymru gymryd risgiau tu hwnt i'r rhai sydd o ganlyniad uniongyrchol i'r dewisiadau a wnaed gan Lywodraeth Cymru. Felly, rhaid i unrhyw ddatganoli pwerau treth fod â risg gymesur yn gysylltiedig â hwy. Credaf fod Mike Hedges hefyd wedi gwneud rhai o'r pwyntiau hynny.

4.45 p.m.

Furthermore, this report has certainly not shied away from some of the key issues by going for the jugular in recommending the devolution of income tax. On the face of it, it seems that the previous concerns of Gerry Holtham about the method suggested, namely, and put simply—though nothing is simple in this regard—that if you were to reduce the rate of income tax in Wales 10p below the UK rate of income tax, the block grant would be reduced accordingly, and the Welsh Government would then be given the power to set the tax rate back up, beyond the lower rate to the level that it wants, were about possible risks that the Welsh Government might incur, and this is what he initially questioned. However, the index

Ar ben hynny, nid yw'r adroddiad hwn yn bendant wedi ymwrthod â rhai o'r materion allweddol drwy ymosod yn ffyrnig ac argymell datganoli treth incwm. Ar yr olwg gyntaf, mae'n ymddangos bod pryderon blaenorol Gerry Holtham am y dull a awgrymwyd, sef, a'i roi yn syml—er nad oes dim yn syml yn hyn o beth—os ydych yn lleihau cyfradd y dreth incwm yng Nghymru 10c yn is na chyfradd treth incwm y DU, byddai'r grant bloc yn cael ei ostwng yn unol â hynny, a byddai'r Llywodraeth Cymru wedyn yn cael y pŵer i osod cyfradd y dreth yn ôl i fyny, y tu hwnt i'r gyfradd is i lefel y mae eisiau, yn ymwneud â risgiau posibl allai wynebu Llywodraeth Cymru, a dyma'r hyn yr oedd yn ei gwestiynu ar y dechrau. Fodd

deduction method, to use the technical phrase, which has been proposed by Calman in Scotland and here in Wales, seems to mitigate that possibility.

bynnag, mae'n ymddangos bod y dull didynnu mynegai, i ddefnyddio'r ymadrodd technegol, sydd wedi ei gynnig gan Calman yn yr Alban ac yma yng Nghymru, yn lliniaru'r posibilrwydd hwnnw.

The fact is that income tax forms around 30% of the Welsh tax base, which is by far the biggest chunk. I have heard talk of other, smaller taxes being recommended for devolution to Wales, such as air passenger duty, stamp duty and the aggregates levy, and while all of these may be important, they form a tiny proportion of the Welsh tax base compared with income tax.

Y ffaith yw bod treth incwm yn ffurfio tua 30% o'r sylfaen dreth Cymru, y darn mwyaf o bell ffordd. Rwyf wedi clywed sôn am drethi eraill, llai'n cael eu hargymell ar gyfer eu datganoli i Gymru, fel toll teithwyr awyr, treth stamp a'r ardoll agregau, ac er y gall pob un o'r rhain fod yn bwysig, maent yn ffurfio cyfran fach iawn o'r sylfaen dreth yng Nghymru o'i gymharu â threth incwm.

It is interesting that Silk has not recommended that, for the smaller taxes, the same insulation should be given to the Welsh Government against economic shocks in any year. In the case of stamp duty, Silk has recommended that there be an agreement between the two Governments as to how much the block grant would be reduced by. I therefore urge great caution in what appears to be, on the face of it, an easy solution, which is to devolve some taxes before others. I think that the Silk commission has recommended that all of these taxes should go together for a reason, and I am not entirely sure that the cost benefit of devolving the smaller taxes without the large tax works out, particularly if you look at the recommendation for a Welsh treasury element within the Welsh Government, which would clearly cost money. We therefore need to make sure that the benefit of devolving these taxes outweighs the disadvantages.

Mae'n ddiddorol nad yw Silk wedi argymell, ar gyfer y trethi llai, y dylid rhoi'r un inswleiddio i Lywodraeth Cymru yn erbyn ergydion economaidd mewn unrhyw flwyddyn. Yn achos treth stamp, mae Silk wedi argymell y dylid cael cytundeb rhwng y ddwy Lywodraeth o ran o faint y byddai'r grant bloc yn cael ei leihau. Felly, pwysaf am ofal mawr yn yr hyn sy'n ymddangos i fod, ar yr wyneb, yn ateb hawdd, sef datganoli rhai trethi cyn eraill. Credaf fod comisiwn Silk wedi argymell y dylai pob un o'r trethi fynd gyda'i gilydd am reswm, ac nid wyf yn hollol siŵr bod budd cost datganoli trethi llai heb y dreth fawr yn gweithio allan, yn enwedig os ydych yn edrych ar yr argymhelliad am elfen trysorlys Cymru o fewn Llywodraeth Cymru, a fyddai'n amlwg yn costio arian. Felly, mae angen gwneud yn siŵr bod y budd o ddatganoli'r trethi hyn yn drech na'r anfanteision.

There are some other notes of caution. The issue of a referendum has been spoken about, and I fully agree with the First Minister that there has been no vote in Wales on this place having tax powers, and a referendum is therefore, in principle, something that I am sure many of us would agree to. That said, this is a matter of asking people not just about fiscal responsibility, but about paying tax. I think that we would have to be very clear about the exact form that such a referendum and its question would take. It is not simply a matter of an additional Assembly tax, but the devolution of tax and part of the tax base from the UK to the Welsh Government. I am

Mae rhai rhybuddion eraill. Mae'r mater o refferendwm wedi cael ei grybwyll, ac rwy'n cytuno'n llwyr â'r Prif Weinidog na fu unrhyw bleidlais yng Nghymru ar weld y lle hwn yn cael pwerau treth, ac mae refferendwm felly, mewn egwyddor, yn rhywbeth rwy'n siŵr y byddai llawer ohonom yn cytuno ag ef. Wedi dweud hynny, mae hwn yn fater o ofyn i bobl nid yn unig am gyfrifoldeb ariannol, ond am dalu treth. Credaf y byddai'n rhaid i ni fod yn glir iawn ynghylch union ffurf refferendwm o'r fath a'i gwestiwn. Nid yw'n fater syml o dreth ychwanegol gan y Cynulliad, ond o ddatganoli treth a rhan o'r sylfaen dreth o

not entirely convinced about how the argument could be made, and I know that other Members in the Chamber have similar concerns.

Lywodraeth y DU i Lywodraeth Cymru. Nid wyf yn gwbl argyhoeddedig ynghylch sut y gellid cyflwyno'r ddadl, a gwn fod gan Aelodau eraill yn y Siambr bryderon tebyg.

Kirsty Williams, though you did not refer to it by name, you talked about the Scots' lockstep model, which was referred to by the Calman commission. It means that the recommendation in Scotland is that if income tax is to be varied there, it would have to be done at both the basic rate and the upper rate. That has been chucked out by the Silk commission, and there has been cross-party agreement that, here, income tax rates can be varied independently. I think that that is where the consensus ended, because Gerry Holtham suggested that it would be suicidal in Wales to increase the upper rate. I am not entirely sure whether some members of the Welsh Government share that view. Nonetheless, Gerry Holtham pointed out the startling statistic that only 60,000 people in Wales pay the upper rate and that, of those, around 100 people are paying—I can see the First Minister laughing—a huge proportion of that rate. If we are to break that Scottish lockstep, we need to be pretty sure that there would be that sort of economic responsibility in Wales—Silk clearly believes that it is here, but I must admit that I am slightly more cynical, though the jury is out.

Kirsty Williams, er nad oeddech yn cyfeirio ato wrth ei enw, buoch yn sôn am fodel cam clòs yr Albanwyr y cyfeiriwyd ato gan gomisiwn Calman. Mae'n golygu mai'r argymhelliad yn yr Alban yw os yw treth incwm i gael ei hamrywio yno, byddai'n rhaid iddo gael ei wneud ar y gyfradd sylfaenol a'r gyfradd uwch. Mae hynny wedi cael ei wrthod gan gomisiwn Silk, a bu cytundeb trawsbleidiol y gall cyfraddau treth incwm, yma, gael eu hamrywio'n annibynnol. Rwy'n credu mai dyna lle daeth consensws i ben, gan fod Gerry Holtham wedi awgrymu y byddai ar ben arnom yng Nghymru i gynyddu'r gyfradd uchaf. Nid wyf yn hollol siŵr a yw rhai aelodau o Lywodraeth Cymru'n rhannu'r farn honno. Serch hynny, tynnodd Gerry Holtham sylw at yr ystadegyn syfrdanol mai dim ond 60,000 o bobl yng Nghymru sy'n talu'r gyfradd uchaf ac, o'r rheiny, mae tua 100 o bobl yn talu—gallaf weld y Prif Weinidog yn chwerthin—gyfran enfawr o'r gyfradd honno. Os ydym am dorri cam clos yr Alban, mae angen i ni fod yn eithaf sicr y byddai'r math hwnnw o gyfrifoldeb economaidd i'w gael yng Nghymru—mae Silk yn amlwg o'r farn ei fod i'w gael yma, ond rhaid imi gyfaddef fy mod ychydig yn fwy sinigaidd, er nad oes dyfarniad pendant wedi ei wneud.

The First Minister: There is not a huge amount that I can add to what has already been said by those in the Chamber, and I welcome the contributions that have been made. It is quite clear that there is consensus in the Chamber to take forward the whole of Silk.

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid oes llawer iawn y gallaf ei ychwanegu at yr hyn a ddywedwyd eisoes gan y rhai yn y Siambr, ac rwy'n croesawu'r cyfraniadau sydd wedi'u gwneud. Mae'n gwbl glir bod consensws yn y Siambr i fwrw ymlaen â holl argymhellion Silk.

I will deal first with two points raised by Paul Davies. Paul seemed to think that I was suggesting that there would have to be Barnett reform before any tax was devolved. That is not what I said; it is Barnett reform before income tax is devolved. We could clearly move forward with the devolution of what have been described as the smaller taxes well before then. However, with regard to income tax, there is a direct relationship between that and the Barnett block in a way

Deliaf yn gyntaf â dau bwynt a godwyd gan Paul Davies. Roedd yn ymddangos bod Paul yn meddwl fy mod yn awgrymu y byddai rhaid cael diwygio Barnett cyn i unrhyw dreth gael ei datganoli. Nid dyna a ddywedais; ond diwygio Barnett cyn datganoli treth incwm. Gallem yn amlwg symud ymlaen â datganoli yr hyn a ddisgrifiwyd fel y trethi llai ymhell cyn hynny. Fodd bynnag, o ran treth incwm, mae perthynas uniongyrchol rhwng hynny a'r bloc Barnett mewn ffordd nad yw'n bodoli'n

that does not quite exist with the smaller taxes.

hollol gyda'r trethi llai.

With regard to a Welsh treasury, it is true to say that we would have to put in place—particularly if income tax were devolved—a team of people who could predict the tax take from year to year. There is no question that that would require extra resources, and it is an expertise that we do not yet have. I do not believe that that would be necessary with regard to the smaller taxes, but it certainly would be with regard to income tax.

Gyda golwg ar drysorlys Cymru, mae'n wir dweud y byddai'n rhaid i ni sefydlu—yn enwedig os byddai treth incwm yn cael ei datganoli—tîm o bobl a allai ragweld derbyniadau'r dreth o flwyddyn i flwyddyn. Nid oes unrhyw gwestiwn y byddai hynny'n gofyn am adnoddau ychwanegol, ac mae'n arbenigedd nad yw gennym ni eto. Nid wyf yn credu y byddai hynny'n angenrheidiol o ran y trethi llai, ond byddai'n sicr o fod o ran treth incwm.

To deal with a point raised by the leader of Plaid Cymru, the key with income tax is to not take income tax powers based on a bad deal for Wales. It is absolutely crucial to make sure that Barnett is sorted first. Why? In looking at the Barnett squeeze, if Barnett spending drops when income tax powers are granted, it means that income tax would have to be increased simply to infill the drop in funding because of the Barnett squeeze. That has to be dealt with to provide a firm base before income tax powers can be devolved.

I ddelio â'r pwynt a godwyd gan arweinydd Plaid Cymru, yr allwedd gyda threth incwm yw peidio â chymryd pwerau treth incwm yn seiliedig ar fargen wael i Gymru. Mae'n gwbl hanfodol i wneud yn siŵr bod Barnett yn cael ei ddatrys yn gyntaf. Pam? Wrth edrych ar wasgfa Barnett, os yw gwariant Barnett yn disgyn pan fydd pwerau treth incwm yn cael eu caniatáu, mae'n golygu y byddai'n rhaid cynyddu treth incwm dim ond i wneud iawn am y gostyngiad mewn cyllid oherwydd gwasgfa Barnett. Rhaid ymdrin â hynny i ddarparu sylfaen gadarn cyn y gellir datganoli pwerau treth incwm.

I agree with what the leader of the Liberal Democrats said: it is crucial that this report should not gather dust on a shelf. It is a matter for the UK Government to take forward. We are happy to work with the UK Government. That leads to the point made by the leader of the opposition: the working group is our proposal. I see no reason why the UK Government would want to do anything else. There have been discussions as to how to take this issue forward. The Treasury is keen to move forward with Silk as quickly as possible, and I have heard nothing from the Wales Office that suggests otherwise. It makes sense—given the fact that there are some recommendations that directly affect the Welsh Government—to move forward consensually to take the recommendations—and I mean all the recommendations—of Silk forward.

Rwy'n cytuno â'r hyn y mae arweinydd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol wedi'i ddweud: mae'n hanfodol na ddylai'r adroddiad hwn hel llwch ar silff. Mae'n fater i Lywodraeth y DU ei ddatblygu. Rydym yn hapus i weithio gyda Llywodraeth y DU. Mae hynny'n arwain at y pwynt a wnaed gan arweinydd yr wrthblaid: ein cynnig ni yw'r gweithgor. Ni welaf unrhyw reswm pam y byddai Llywodraeth y DU am wneud unrhyw beth arall. Bu trafodaethau o ran sut i fynd â'r mater hwn yn ei flaen. Mae'r Trysorlys yn awyddus i symud ymlaen gyda Silk cyn gynted ag y bo modd, ac nid wyf wedi clywed dim gan Swyddfa Cymru sy'n awgrymu fel arall. Mae'n gwneud synnwyr—o ystyried y ffaith bod rhai argymhellion sy'n effeithio'n uniongyrchol ar Lywodraeth Cymru—i symud ymlaen yn gydsyniol i fynd ag argymhellion—ac rwy'n golygu holl argymhellion—Silk yn eu blaen.

I listened to Nick Ramsay, the Member for Monmouth. He seemed to be saying—and I

Gwrandewais ar Nick Ramsay, yr Aelod dros Fynwy. Roedd yn ymddangos i fod yn

am willing to be corrected if I am incorrect—that no tax devolution should take place at all unless it is an entire package, including income tax.

dweud—ac yr wyf yn barod i gael fy nghywiro os wyf yn anghywir—na ddylai unrhyw ddatganoli treth ddigwydd o gwbl oni bai ei fod yn becyn cyfan, gan gynnwys treth incwm.

Nick Ramsay: That is not exactly what I said. I said that this has been put together as one recommended report, and I think that if you are splitting off smaller taxes, such as air passenger duty, which do not have the insulation for your Government and budget against potential shocks, are you getting an advantage from those taxes, relative to their cost? You will get a big benefit from income tax at 30% if you get the power, but I am not sure whether you would get that sort of benefit with the smaller taxes to make devolving them worth while.

Nick Ramsay: Nid dyna'n union a ddywedais. Dywedais fod hyn wedi cael ei roi at ei gilydd fel un adroddiad a argymhellir, ac rwy'n meddwl os ydych yn gwahanu trethi llai, fel toll teithwyr awyr, nad oes ganddynt yr insiwleiddio ar gyfer eich Llywodraeth a'ch cyllideb yn erbyn siociau posibl, ydych chi'n cael mantais o'r trethi hynny, mewn perthynas â'u cost? Byddwch yn cael budd mawr o dreth incwm ar 30% os ydych yn cael y pŵer, ond nid wyf yn siŵr a fyddech yn cael y math yna o fudd gyda threthi llai i wneud eu datganoli werth chweil.

The First Minister: We fully accept that the devolution of tax would affect the block grant. We do not expect to be in a position where we could, for example, reduce taxes without any financial hit. That would not be reasonable. However, Silk says quite clearly that the smaller taxes and borrowing powers could be devolved reasonably quickly. It proposes a longer timetable with regard to income tax. Let us be clear: if the smaller taxes are not devolved, according to the Treasury, there are no borrowing powers. Given the timetable that is in the Silk commission report, it would be almost a decade before borrowing powers were available to the Government.

Y Prif Weinidog: Rydym yn derbyn yn llawn y byddai datganoli treth yn effeithio ar y grant bloc. Nid ydym yn disgwyl bod mewn sefyllfa lle gallem, er enghraifft, leihau trethi heb unrhyw ergyd ariannol. Ni fyddai hynny'n rhesymol. Fodd bynnag, mae Silk yn dweud yn eithaf clir y gallai'r trethi llai a phwerau benthyca gael eu datganoli'n weddol gyflym. Mae'n cynnig amserlen hwy mewn perthynas â threth incwm. Gadewch inni fod yn glir: os nad yw'r trethi llai yn cael eu datganoli, yn ôl y Trysorlys, nid oes unrhyw bwerau benthyca. O ystyried yr amserlen sydd yn adroddiad y comisiwn Silk, byddai bron yn ddegawd cyn y byddai pwerau benthyca ar gael i'r Llywodraeth.

Nick Ramsay: I was not including borrowing powers within the smaller taxes, like air passenger duty and aggregates tax. I fully recognise that borrowing is separated.

Nick Ramsay: Nid oeddwn yn cynnwys pwerau benthyca o fewn y trethi llai, fel toll teithwyr awyr a threthi agregau. Rwy'n cydnabod yn llawn bod benthyca yn cael ei wahanu.

The First Minister: The difficulty is that the Treasury takes the view that we must have a revenue stream before we can borrow, and the revenue stream is created by the smaller taxes. That is the issue. Even though we do not accept that, Northern Ireland, for example, has no—[*Interruption.*]

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr anhawster yw bod y Trysorlys yn cymryd y farn fod yn rhaid inni gael ffrwd refeniw cyn y gallwn fenthyca, ac mae'r ffrwd refeniw yn cael ei chreu gan y trethi llai. Dyna'r mater. Er nad ydym yn derbyn hynny, nid oes gan Ogledd Iwerddon, er enghraifft—*[Torri ar draws.]*

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. I think that the First Minister's patience is now exhausted.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Credaf fod amynedd y Prif Weinidog wedi dod i ben yn awr.

Nick Ramsay *rose*—

Nick Ramsay *a gododd –*

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. He is not giving way. Sit down.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Nid yw’n ildio. Eisteddwch.

The First Minister: He is going to say that borrowing does not necessarily have to rely on the devolution of taxes. That is our position as well. That is the position of Northern Ireland, which can borrow without tax-raising powers. However, the Treasury’s view is that we need to have a revenue stream before we can get general borrowing powers, or before we can use practically the powers that we have. On that basis, we need to have the smaller taxes devolved in order to create what the Treasury sees as a revenue stream and then be able to borrow. Without the devolution of the smaller taxes, there can be no borrowing in the view of the Treasury, even though that is not the view that we hold as a Government. Delaying the devolution of the smaller taxes until income taxes are devolved means that there would be no borrowing for a decade, according to what the Treasury is telling us. It would mean that we could not create the revenue stream; we could not use air passenger duty to assist Cardiff airport; and we could not use stamp duty to assist first-time buyers. I do not think that these things can wait. That is not what the Silk commission suggests. What Silk is saying is that the smaller taxes can be devolved relatively quickly—aside from the issue of borrowing—although income tax powers would take longer, and that there are some obstacles that need to be overcome before that happens.

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae’n mynd i ddweud nad yw benthyca o reidrwydd yn gorfod dibynnu ar ddatganoli trethi. Dyna ein safbwynt ni’n ogystal. Dyna sefyllfa Gogledd Iwerddon, a all fenthyca heb bwerau codi trethi. Fodd bynnag, safbwynt y Trysorlys yw bod angen i ni gael ffrwd refeniw cyn y gallwn gael pwerau benthyca cyffredinol, neu cyn y gallwn ddefnyddio’n ymarferol y pwerau sydd gennym. Ar y sail honno, mae angen i ni gael y trethi llai datganoledig er mwyn creu'r hyn y mae’r Trysorlys yn ei weld fel ffrwd refeniw ac yna gallu benthyca. Heb y datganoli trethi llai, ni ellir benthyca ym marn y Trysorlys, er nad dyna’r farn sydd gennym ni fel Llywodraeth. Mae oedi cyn datganoli trethi llai tan fydd trethi incwm yn cael eu datganoli yn golygu na fyddai unrhyw fenthyca am ddegawd, yn ôl yr hyn y mae’r Trysorlys yn ei ddweud wrthym. Byddai’n golygu nad fyddem yn gallu creu’r ffrwd refeniw; ni allem ddefnyddio toll teithwyr awyr i gynorthwyo maes awyr Caerdydd, ac ni allem ddefnyddio treth stamp i gynorthwyo prynwyr tro cyntaf. Nid wyf yn credu y gall y pethau hyn aros. Beth y mae Silk yn ei ddweud yw y gellir datganoli’r trethi llai yn gymharol gyflym—ar wahân i’r mater o fenthyca—er y byddai pwerau treth incwm yn cymryd mwy o amser, a bod rhai rhwystrau y mae angen eu goresgyn cyn i hynny ddigwydd.

Therefore, I cannot accept what the Member seems to be saying that nothing can happen until the next decade, which, in effect, based on what the Treasury is saying, is the implication of what he was saying. I do not think that people in Wales would find the devolution of smaller taxes controversial. I do not believe that it would require a referendum, because these, in the main, already sit firmly within devolved competencies. The issue with income tax, of course, is, admittedly, as a result of a precedent that was set by Scotland. In Scotland, the referendum was over a limited tax-varying power, but, nevertheless, the

Felly, ni allaf dderbyn yr hyn y mae’r Aelod yn ymddangos i fod yn ei ddweud na all dim ddigwydd tan y degawd nesaf, a dyma, i bob pwrpas, yn seiliedig ar yr hyn y mae’r Trysorlys yn ei ddweud, yw goblygiad yr hyn yr oedd yn ei ddweud. Nid wyf yn credu y byddai pobl yng Nghymru yn ystyried datganoli trethi llai yn ddadleuol. Nid wyf yn credu y byddai’n gofyn am refferendwm, gan fod y rhain, ar y cyfan, eisoes yn gorwedd yn gadarn o fewn cymwyseddau datganoledig. Mae’r broblem gyda threth incwm, wrth gwrs, yn ddiau, o ganlyniad i gynsail a osodwyd gan yr Alban. Yn yr Alban, roedd y refferendwm dros bŵer amrywio trethi

principle of the Scottish Government being able to vary income tax was established at that referendum.

cyfyngedig, ond, serch hynny, sefydlwyd yr egwyddor bod Llywodraeth yr Alban yn gallu amrywio treth incwm yn y refferendwm hwnnw.

There is no need for a delay now, these matters can be taken forward and the necessary legislation—

Nid oes angen oedi yn awr, gall y materion hyn gael eu datblygu a gall y ddeddfwriaeth angenrheidiol—

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Derbyniaf y pwynt a wneir gan y mae'r Prif Weinidog fod nifer o bethau y gellid eu gwneud yn fuan. Fodd bynnag, byddai angen deddfwriaeth ar gyfer rhai pethau. A yw'r Prif Weinidog yn derbyn yr hyn a ddywedodd Kirsty Williams, sef pe bai'r Llywodraeth yn San Steffan yn gallu cyflwyno Bil mor gynnar â 2014, a fuasai ef yn fodlon gwneud popeth yn ei allu i hyrwyddo hynny ac i sicrhau y byddai'r Bil hwnnw yn gallu mynd drwy'r Senedd gyda chefnogaeth y Blaid Lafur?

Ieuan Wyn Jones: I accept the point the First Minister makes that there are a number of things that could be done relatively swiftly. However, there are certain things that would require legislation. Does the First Minister accept the question put by Kirsty Williams, which is that if the Westminster Government could bring a Bill forward as soon as 2014, would he be willing to do everything in his power to promote it and to ensure that the Bill could go through Parliament with the support of the Labour Party?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'n bwysig dros ben bod Bil yn mynd trwy'r Senedd cyn diwedd tymor y Llywodraeth yn Llundain, erbyn 2015. Dyna yw ein barn gadarn ni. O ran benthyca, ym marn y Llywodraeth—a bydd yr Aelod yn ymwybodol o hyn—nid oes angen deddfwriaeth i greu pwerau benthyca. Mae'r pwerau yno, ond y broblem ar hyn o bryd yw hyn: am bob punt rydym yn ei benthyg, caiff y bunt honno ei thynnu yn ôl gan y Trysorlys. Mater gweinyddol, fwy neu lai, yw hynny, nid mater deddfwriaethol.

The First Minister: It is extremely important that a Bill should go through Parliament before the end of the Westminster parliamentary term in 2015. We are firmly of that view. In terms of borrowing, in the Government's view—and the Member will be aware of this—legislation is not needed in order to grant borrowing powers. The powers are in place, but the problem is that for every pound we borrow, a pound is clawed back by the Treasury. This, to all intents and purposes, is an administrative issue rather than a legislative issue.

O ran y trethi, rhaid ystyried ym mha ffordd y gallai'r rhain gael eu symud ymlaen yn weddol gyflym—efallai trwy Fil cyllid yn y Senedd neu drwy ryw Fil arall. Yr hyn sy'n bwysig yw eu bod yn cael eu symud ymlaen cyn gynted â phosibl.

In terms of taxation, we must consider how this can be taken forward relatively swiftly—perhaps through a finance Bill in Parliament or through another Bill. What is important is that it is taken forward as swiftly as possible.

Deputy Presiding Officer, I am looking at the time, therefore, given that I think that everyone is content and in agreement in this Chamber, and given that we stand ready to work with UK Government, let us get on with it.

Ddirprwy Lywydd, rwy'n edrych ar yr amser, felly, o ystyried fy mod yn credu bod pawb yn hapus ac yn cytuno yn y Siambr hon, ac o gofio ein bod yn barod i weithio gyda Llywodraeth y DU, gadewch inni fwrw ymlaen â'r gwaith.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The proposal is to agree the motion. Does any Member object? I see that there are no objections. The motion is, therefore, agreed in accordance with Standing Order No. 12.36.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Y cynnig yw cytuno ar y cynnig. A oes unrhyw Aelod yn gwrthwynebu? Gwelaf nad oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad. Mae'r cynnig, felly, wedi'i dderbyn, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif

12.36.

Motion agreed

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: It has been agreed that voting time will take place before the short debate. Are there three Members who wish for the bell to be rung? I see that there are not. Therefore, we will proceed to voting time.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Cytunwyd na fydd y cyfnod pleidleisio yn digwydd cyn y ddadl fer. A oes tri Aelod sy’n dymuno i’r gloch gael ei chanu? Gwelaf nad oes. Felly, byddwn yn symud ymlaen i’r cyfnod pleidleisio.

Cyfnod Pleidleisio
Voting Time

Gwelliant 6 i NDM5102: O blaid 18, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 33.
Amendment 6 to NDM5102: For 18, Abstain 0, Against 33.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Asghar, Mohammad
Black, Peter
Burns, Angela
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Byron
Davies, Paul
Davies, Suzy
Finch-Saunders, Janet
George, Russell
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Millar, Darren
Parrott, Eluned
Powell, William
Ramsay, Nick
Roberts, Aled
Sandbach, Antoinette
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Antoniw, Mick
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davies, Alun
Drakeford, Mark
Evans, Rebecca
Gething, Vaughan
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Gruffydd, Llyr Huws
Hedges, Mike
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lewis, Huw
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Julie
Neagle, Lynne
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Rees, David
Sargeant, Carl
Skates, Kenneth
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Simon
Watson, Joyce
Whittle, Lindsay
Wood, Leanne

Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment not agreed.

Gwelliant 7 i NDM5102: O blaid 26, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 26.
Amendment 7 to NDM5102: For 26, Abstain 0, Against 26.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:

The following Members voted for:

Asghar, Mohammad
Black, Peter
Burns, Angela
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Byron
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Paul
Davies, Suzy
Finch-Saunders, Janet
George, Russell
Graham, William
Gruffydd, Llyr Huws
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Millar, Darren
Parrott, Eluned
Powell, William
Ramsay, Nick
Roberts, Aled
Sandbach, Antoinette
Thomas, Simon
Whittle, Lindsay
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Antoniw, Mick
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davies, Alun
Drakeford, Mark
Evans, Rebecca
Gething, Vaughan
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hedges, Mike
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Julie
Neagle, Lynne
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Rees, David
Sargeant, Carl
Skates, Kenneth
Thomas, Gwenda
Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Dirprwy Lywydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.20(ii)
As there was an equality of votes, the Deputy Presiding Officer used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order No. 6.20(ii)

Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment not agreed.

Gwelliant 8 i NDM5102: O blaid 26, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 26.
Amendment 8 to NDM5102: For 26, Abstain 0, Against 26.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Asghar, Mohammad
Black, Peter
Burns, Angela
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Byron
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Paul
Davies, Suzy
Finch-Saunders, Janet
George, Russell
Graham, William
Gruffydd, Llyr Huws
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Millar, Darren
Parrott, Eluned
Powell, William
Ramsay, Nick
Roberts, Aled

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Antoniw, Mick
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davies, Alun
Drakeford, Mark
Evans, Rebecca
Gething, Vaughan
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hedges, Mike
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Julie
Neagle, Lynne
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny

Sandbach, Antoinette	Rees, David
Thomas, Simon	Sargeant, Carl
Whittle, Lindsay	Skates, Kenneth
Williams, Kirsty	Thomas, Gwenda
Wood, Leanne	Watson, Joyce

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Dirprwy Lywydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.20(ii)
As there was an equality of votes, the Deputy Presiding Officer used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order No. 6.20(ii)

Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment not agreed.

Gwelliant 9 i NDM5102: O blaid 19, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 33.
Amendment 9 to NDM5102: For 19, Abstain 0, Against 33.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid: The following Members voted for:	Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn: The following Members voted against:
Asghar, Mohammad	Andrews, Leighton
Black, Peter	Antoniw, Mick
Burns, Angela	Chapman, Christine
Davies, Andrew R.T.	Cuthbert, Jeff
Davies, Byron	Davies, Alun
Davies, Paul	Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Suzy	Drakeford, Mark
Finch-Saunders, Janet	Evans, Rebecca
George, Russell	Gething, Vaughan
Graham, William	Gregory, Janice
Isherwood, Mark	Griffiths, John
Jones, Elin	Griffiths, Lesley
Millar, Darren	Gruffydd, Llyr Huws
Parrott, Eluned	Hedges, Mike
Powell, William	Hutt, Jane
Ramsay, Nick	Jones, Alun Ffred
Roberts, Aled	Jones, Ann
Sandbach, Antoinette	Jones, Carwyn
Williams, Kirsty	Jones, Ieuan Wyn
	Lewis, Huw
	Mewies, Sandy
	Morgan, Julie
	Neagle, Lynne
	Price, Gwyn R.
	Rathbone, Jenny
	Rees, David
	Sargeant, Carl
	Skates, Kenneth
	Thomas, Gwenda
	Thomas, Simon
	Watson, Joyce
	Whittle, Lindsay
	Wood, Leanne

Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment not agreed.

5.00 p.m.

Gwelliant 10 i NDM5102: O blaid 52, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 10 to NDM5102: For 52, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Antoniw, Mick
Asghar, Mohammad
Black, Peter
Burns, Angela
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davies, Alun
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Byron
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Paul
Davies, Suzy
Drakeford, Mark
Evans, Rebecca
Finch-Saunders, Janet
George, Russell
Gething, Vaughan
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Gruffydd, Llyr Huws
Hedges, Mike
Hutt, Jane
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lewis, Huw
Mewies, Sandy
Millar, Darren
Morgan, Julie
Neagle, Lynne
Parrott, Eluned
Powell, William
Price, Gwyn R.
Ramsay, Nick
Rathbone, Jenny
Rees, David
Roberts, Aled
Sandbach, Antoinette
Sargeant, Carl
Skates, Kenneth
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Simon
Watson, Joyce
Whittle, Lindsay
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment agreed.

Gwelliant 11 i NDM5102: O blaid 52, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 11 to NDM5102: For 52, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Antoniw, Mick
Asghar, Mohammad
Black, Peter
Burns, Angela
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davies, Alun
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Byron
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Paul
Davies, Suzy
Drakeford, Mark
Evans, Rebecca
Finch-Saunders, Janet
George, Russell
Gething, Vaughan
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Gruffydd, Llyr Huws
Hedges, Mike
Hutt, Jane
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lewis, Huw
Mewies, Sandy
Millar, Darren
Morgan, Julie
Neagle, Lynne
Parrott, Eluned
Powell, William
Price, Gwyn R.
Ramsay, Nick
Rathbone, Jenny
Rees, David
Roberts, Aled
Sandbach, Antoinette
Sargeant, Carl
Skates, Kenneth
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Simon
Watson, Joyce
Whittle, Lindsay
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment agreed.

Cynnig NDM5102 fel y'i diwygiwyd:	*Motion NDM5102 as amended:*
Cynnig bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:	*To propose that the National Assembly for Wales:*
Yn nodi cynnydd a wnaed mewn perthynas â datblygu cynaliadwy yn 2011-12, fel yr amlinellir yn Adroddiad Blynyddol	*Notes the progress made on sustainable development in 2011-12, as set out in the Welsh Government's Annual Report of the*

Llywodraeth Cymru ar y Cynllun Datblygu Cynaliadwy, a osodwyd gerbron Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru ar 20 Tachwedd 2012.

Sustainable Development Scheme, which was laid before the National Assembly for Wales on 20 November 2012.

Yn croesawu'r ffaith bod Adroddiad Blynyddol y Cynllun Datblygu Cynaliadwy wedi'i gyhoeddi, ac yn arbennig sylwadau'r Comisiynydd Dyfodol Cynaliadwy.

Welcomes the publication of the Annual Report of the Sustainable Development Scheme, in particular the commentary by the Sustainable Futures Commissioner.

Yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i roi argymhellion y Comisiynydd Dyfodol Cynaliadwy ar waith, er mwyn sicrhau y rhoddir digon o sylw i feysydd fel amaethyddiaeth, diogelu'r cyflenwad bwyd a thwristiaeth yn y dyfodol.

Calls on the Welsh Government to enact the recommendations of the Sustainable Futures Commissioner to ensure that sufficient attention is given to areas such as agriculture, food security and tourism in the future.

Yn nodi beirniadaeth y Comisiynydd Dyfodol Cynaliadwy fod 'rhai rhannau o'r adroddiad i'w gweld yn hyrwyddo arian a ddyrennir ac a werir ar gynlluniau yn hytrach na hyrwyddo'r canlyniadau a'r manteision i gynaliadwyedd sy'n deillio o'r cynlluniau hynny', ac yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i ailystyried y modd y mae'n asesu llwyddiant rhaglenni Llywodraeth Cymru ar draws pob adran, yn seiliedig ar ganlyniadau yn hytrach nag ar fewnbwn.

Notes the criticism of the Sustainable Futures Commissioner 'that the report, seems to be championing money allocated and spent on initiatives, rather than championing the sustainable outcomes and benefits derived from those initiatives' and calls on the Welsh Government to reconsider the way it assesses the success of Welsh Government programmes across all departments, based on outcomes rather than inputs.

Yn credu y bydd Llywodraeth Cymru yn gwneud mwy o gynnydd at Gymru gynaliadwy os gwnaiff sicrhau bod mwy o'r canlynol ar gael:

Believes the Welsh Government will make further progress towards a sustainable Wales if it increases the availability of:

a) rhaglenni effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref fel Arbed;

a) home energy efficiency programmes such as Arbed;

b) rhaglenni sy'n annog cymunedau i fuddsoddi mewn prosiectau ynni adnewyddadwy graddfa fach fel trydan dŵr; ac

b) programmes to encourage communities to invest in small-scale renewable energy projects such as hydro-electricity; and

c) trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus integredig.

c) integrated public transport.

Yn croesawu ymrwymiad Llywodraeth y DU i drydanu, a'r effaith gadarnhaol y bydd hyn yn ei chael ar leihau allyriadau CO2 Cymru.

Welcomes the UK Government's commitment to electrification and the positive effect this will have on reducing Wales' CO2 emissions.

Yn nodi pryderon parhaus y Comisiynydd Dyfodol Cynaliadwy ynghylch elfennau o strwythur a chynnwys yr adroddiad.

Notes the continued concerns from the Sustainable Futures Commissioner regarding aspects of the structure and content of the report.

Yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i roi'r argymhellion a wneir yn yr adroddiad gan y Comisiynydd Dyfodol Cynaliadwy ar waith

Calls on the Welsh Government to implement fully the recommendations made in the report by the Sustainable Futures Commissioner.

yn llawn.

Cynnig NDM5102 fel y'i diwygiwyd: O blaid 39, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 13.
Motion NDM5102 as amended: For 39, Abstain 0, Against 13.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Antoniw, Mick
Black, Peter
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davies, Alun
Davies, Jocelyn
Drakeford, Mark
Evans, Rebecca
Gething, Vaughan
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Gruffydd, Llyr Huws
Hedges, Mike
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lewis, Huw
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Julie
Neagle, Lynne
Parrott, Eluned
Powell, William
Price, Gwyn R.
Rathbone, Jenny
Rees, David
Roberts, Aled
Sargeant, Carl
Skates, Kenneth
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Simon
Watson, Joyce
Whittle, Lindsay
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Asghar, Mohammad
Burns, Angela
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Byron
Davies, Paul
Davies, Suzy
Finch-Saunders, Janet
George, Russell
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Millar, Darren
Ramsay, Nick
Sandbach, Antoinette

Derbyniwyd cynnig NDM5012 fel y'i diwygiwyd.
Motion NDM5012 as amended agreed.

Dadl Fer
Short Debate

Asbestos Mewn Ysgolion—Datgelu'r Wybodaeth yn Hytrach nag Atal Hawl Rhieni i Gael Gwybod Amdani
Asbestos in Schools—Revealing not Concealing Parents' Right to Know

Dangoswyd cyflwyniad PowerPoint i gyd-fynd â'r drafodaeth. Mae'r cyflwyniad ar gael drwy ddilyn y linc hon: cyflwyniad PowerPoint.
A PowerPoint presentation was shown to accompany the debate. The presentation can be accessed by following this link: PowerPoint presentation.

Nick Ramsay: This is the second short debate that I have secured concerning asbestos since becoming an Assembly Member, and I intend to focus in this debate on the problem of asbestos in schools. I have agreed to give Aled Roberts, Kirsty Williams and Mick Antinow a minute each of my time. I take this opportunity to pay tribute to the work that Mick has done on asbestos, both before and since his election.

Nick Ramsay: Dyma'r ail ddadl fer am asbestos i mi ei sicrhau ers dod yn Aelod o'r Cynulliad, ac rwyf yn bwriadu canolbwyntio’r ddadl hon ar broblem asbestos mewn ysgolion. Rwyf wedi cytuno i roi munud yr un o fy amser i Aled Roberts, Kirsty Williams a Mick Antinow. Cymeraf y cyfle hwn i dalu teyrnged i'r gwaith y mae Mick wedi'i wneud ar asbestos, cyn ei ethol ac ers hynny.

I have been happy to back the Right to Know Asbestos in Schools Wales campaign, which calls for a register of asbestos in school buildings to be made publicly available to teachers and parents. It is something that I and many others have asked questions about already in this Chamber, but an issue that I feel is important enough to pursue again with the Welsh Government. The matter is especially pertinent at the moment with the recent closure of Cwmcarn High School in Caerphilly, because of concerns about how safe the asbestos that existed there was to teachers and pupils working and studying in the school.

Rwyf wedi bod yn hapus i gefnogi’r ymgyrch Hawl i Wybod am Asbestos yn Ysgolion Cymru, sy'n galw am i gofrestr o asbestos mewn adeiladau ysgol fod ar gael yn gyhoeddus i athrawon a rhieni. Mae’n rhywbeth yr wyf fi a llawer o rai eraill eisoes wedi gofyn cwestiynau amdano yn y Siambr hon, ond yn fater y teimlaf ei fod yn ddigon pwysig i fynd ar ei drywydd eto gyda Llywodraeth Cymru. Mae’r mater yn arbennig o berthnasol ar hyn o bryd gyda'r newyddion diweddar am gau Ysgol Uwchradd Cwmcarn yng Nghaerffili, oherwydd pryderon am ba mor ddiogel oedd yr asbestos a oedd yn bodoli yno i’r athrawon a’r disgyblion a oedd yn gweithio ac yn astudio yn yr ysgol.

I will give some historical context to explain why asbestos became so widely used in buildings during the last century, which we may not always understand in this day and age. While many people have heard of asbestos, few people know what it is. Asbestos is a naturally occurring mineral that has been mined for over 4,000 years. There are a number of different types of asbestos, including white, brown and blue, all of which have slightly different uses. When first discovered, it was identified as being an excellent absorber of sound and its resistance to fire, heat, electrical and chemical damage made it a much sought-after product among builders and manufacturers. It was the industrial revolution that saw its use grow and demand hit a peak in the twentieth century before the severe health risks associated with exposure to it became apparent. Figures show that, in 2009, Russia was the largest producer of asbestos, mining over 1 million tonnes of it, which is 50% of the world’s output.

Rwyf am roi rhywfaint o gyd-destun hanesyddol i esbonio pam y cafodd cymaint o asbestos ei ddefnyddio mewn adeiladau yn ystod y ganrif ddiwethaf, rhywbeth na fyddwn o reidrwydd yn ei ddeall yn yr oes sydd ohoni. Er bod llawer o bobl wedi clywed am asbestos, nid oes llawer yn gwybod beth ydyw. Mae asbestos yn fwyn sy’n bodoli’n naturiol sydd wedi cael ei gloddio ers dros 4,000 o flynyddoedd. Ceir nifer o wahanol fathau o asbestos, gan gynnwys gwyn, brown a glas, ac mae pob un ohonynt yn ddefnyddiol mewn ffyrdd ychydig yn wahanol. Pan gafodd ei ddarganfod am y tro cyntaf, nodwyd ei fod yn amsugno sain yn ardderchog ac roedd yn gynnyrch poblogaidd iawn ymysg adeiladwyr a gweithgynhyrchwyr oherwydd ei allu i wrthsefyll tân, gwres, difrod trydanol a difrod cemegol. Cafodd ei ddefnyddio fwy a mwy yn ystod y chwyldro diwydiannol a daeth brig y galw amdano yn yr ugeinfed ganrif cyn i’r risgiau iechyd difrifol sy'n gysylltiedig ag ef ddod i’r amlwg. Mae

ffigurau'n dangos mai Rwsia oedd y cynhyrchydd asbestos mwyaf yn 2009, gan gloddio dros 1 miliwn o dunelli metrig ohono, sef 50% o allbwn y byd.

My last short debate was entitled ‘The Hidden Killer’ and that is a very accurate way of describing the health risks that exposure to even a small amount of asbestos can cause. It is a major contributor to lung disease, especially among people who have prolonged, high concentration exposure to it. The incubation period of between 12 and 20 years means that the harm is often done by the time that it becomes evident. The first recorded death proven to be caused by asbestos was noted in 1906. In 2009, over 2,000 British people died of mesothelioma—the cancer of the lungs usually caused by exposure to asbestos. Of these, 151 worked in the education sector. In 2010, the last year for which statistics are available, 29 teachers or school workers from mesothelioma. We do not know for a fact when or where the exposure took place, but this is a worryingly high number of people working in the education sector. Furthermore, this figure is expected to rise for a number of years into the future. Worryingly, the UK has the highest incidence of this type of cancer in the world—more than twice that of France, Germany or the USA.

Teitl fy nadl fer ddiwethaf oedd ‘Y Llofrudd Cudd’ ac mae hynny’n ffordd gywir iawn o ddisgrifio’r risgiau posibl i iechyd yn sgil dod i gysylltiad â hyd yn oed ychydig bach o asbestos. Mae’n gyfrannwr mawr at glefyd yr ysgyfaint, yn enwedig ymhlith pobl sydd wedi dod i gysylltiad â chrynodiadau uchel ohono am gyfnodau hir. Mae'r cyfnod magu o rhwng 12 a 20 mlynedd yn golygu bod y niwed yn aml wedi’i wneud cyn iddo ddod i’r amlwg. Nodwyd y farwolaeth gyntaf y profwyd iddi gael ei hachosi gan asbestos ym 1906. Yn 2009, bu farw 2,000 o bobl Prydain o fesothelioma—y canser yn yr ysgyfaint a achosir fel rheol trwy ddod i gysylltiad ag asbestos. O'r rhain, roedd 151 yn gweithio yn y sector addysg. Yn 2010, y flwyddyn ddiwethaf y mae ystadegau ar gael ar ei chyfer, bu farw 29 o athrawon neu weithwyr ysgol o fesothelioma. Nid ydym yn gwybod fel ffaith pryd neu lle y daethant i gysylltiad ag asbestos, ond mae hwn yn nifer uchel iawn o bobl sy'n gweithio yn y sector addysg. Ar ben hynny, mae disgwyl i’r ffigur hwn godi am nifer o flynyddoedd yn y dyfodol. Yr hyn sy’n peri pryder yw mai yn y DU y ceir y nifer uchaf o achosion o’r math hwn o ganser yn y byd—yn fwy na dwywaith nifer Ffrainc, yr Almaen neu’r Unol Daleithiau.

I am being careful not to scaremonger. I know that the term ‘scaremongering’ is often used when people like me want to talk about the issue of asbestos, but it is important that all of those who are aware of some of these problems remind people of the serious threat that asbestos can pose. Luckily, in Wales, like many other western countries, the use of asbestos has been banned since the mid 1980s, although certain materials were still manufactured and used until 1999. We are all aware that asbestos was used in the construction of many public buildings during the middle part of the last century, for a variety of purposes—most commonly, ceiling tiles, insulation, guttering and partition walls. Worryingly, it is estimated that at least 50% of all asbestos ever used in the construction of buildings in the UK is still present. Despite

Rwyf yn bod yn ofalus i beidio â chodi bwganod. Gwn fod y term ‘codi bwganod’ yn cael ei ddefnyddio’n aml pan fydd pobl fel fi’n dewis siarad am asbestos, ond mae'n bwysig bod pawb sy’n ymwybodol o rai o’r problemau hyn yn atgoffa pobl o’r bygythiad difrifol y gall asbestos ei achosi. Yn ffodus, yng Nghymru, fel llawer o wledydd gorllewinol eraill, mae gwaharddiad ar ddefnyddio asbestos ers canol yr 1980au, er bod rhai defnyddiau penodol yn dal i gael eu cynhyrchu a’u defnyddio tan 1999. Rydym i gyd yn ymwybodol bod asbestos wedi cael ei ddefnyddio wrth adeiladu nifer o adeiladau cyhoeddus yn ystod canol y ganrif ddiwethaf, ar gyfer amrywiaeth o ddibenion—teils nenfwd, inswleiddio, gwteri a waliau pared yn fwyaf cyffredin. Mae’n destun pryder yr amcangyfrifir bod o leiaf 50% o'r holl

the banning of the substance, the number of deaths from the material continues to increase. The key point to make is that there is no safe level for asbestos, and the potential effects of exposure to even the smallest amount can be horrific.

asbestos a ddefnyddiwyd erioed wrth adeiladu yn y DU yn dal yn bresennol. Er i’r sylwedd gael ei wahardd, mae nifer y marwolaethau o’i herwydd yn parhau i gynyddu. Y pwynt allweddol i’w wneud yw nad oes lefel ddiogel ar gyfer asbestos, a gall yr effeithiau posibl yn sgil dod i gysylltiad â hyd yn oed y swm lleiaf fod yn erchyll.

While in other debates I have called for action by both the Welsh Government and the Westminster Government to speed up the process of removing and safely disposing of asbestos, I understand that the cost of undertaking this, particularly in the current economic climate, would be prohibitive. Given this, I believe that it is essential that people working, studying or sending their children to learn in school buildings are made aware of its existence and are informed of the plans that their local council has in place for managing it. That is what the Right to Know Asbestos in Schools Wales campaign is all about: giving parents a publicly accessible way to find the information that they need to ensure that their children are being protected from this hidden killer and to put their minds at rest. Specifically, it is campaigning for a comprehensive online database that will provide the full picture on the presence and management of asbestos in our schools.

Er fy mod, mewn dadleuon eraill, wedi galw am weithredu gan Lywodraeth Cymru a Llywodraeth San Steffan i gyflymu’r broses o gael gwared ar asbestos yn ddiogel, rwyf yn deall y byddai cost cyflawni hyn, yn enwedig yn yr hinsawdd economaidd bresennol, yn afresymol. O ystyried hyn, credaf ei bod yn hanfodol i bobl sy’n gweithio, yn astudio neu’n anfon eu plant i ddysgu mewn adeiladau ysgol gael gwybod am ei fodolaeth ac am gynlluniau eu cyngor lleol i’w reoli. Dyna beth yw pwrpas yr ymgyrch Hawl i Wybod am Asbestos yn Ysgolion Cymru: rhoi ffordd gyhoeddus i rieni ddod o hyd i'r wybodaeth sydd ei hangen arnynt i sicrhau bod eu plant yn cael eu gwarchod rhag y llofrudd cudd hwn a rhoi tawelwch meddwl iddynt. Yn benodol, mae'n ymgyrchu dros gronfa ddata gynhwysfawr ar-lein a fydd yn rhoi’r darlun llawn o ran presenoldeb asbestos a’r dulliau o’i reoli yn ein hysgolion.

Let us look at some facts specifically affecting schools across Wales. A BBC Wales survey for *Week In Week Out* carried out among local authorities found that 1,514 schools—85% of the education stock—contained some level of asbestos. General wear and tear on a school building can lead to the disturbance of asbestos fibres; that includes simple things such as the slamming of doors or pinning things into walls that contain asbestos. That is where things have really changed since the 1980s and earlier, when the approach that was taken was to manage asbestos, and it was felt that it would be okay if the asbestos was left in place. Increasingly, the evidence suggests that that is not the case. As we know, Cwmcarn High School was shut suddenly in October when workmen identified that it had airborne fibres 10 times higher than the accepted levels. While the Minister demanded that local authorities report back to him with all asbestos levels in schools, there remains a

Dewch inni edrych ar rai ffeithiau sy'n effeithio’n benodol ar ysgolion ledled Cymru. Mae arolwg BBC Cymru ar gyfer *Week In Week Out* a gynhaliwyd ymysg awdurdodau lleol wedi canfod bod 1,514 o ysgolion—85% o’r stoc addysg—yn cynnwys rhyw lefel o asbestos. Gall traul a defnydd cyffredin ar adeilad yr ysgol arwain at aflonyddu ar ffibrau asbestos; mae hynny’n cynnwys pethau syml fel clepian drysau neu binio pethau ar waliau sy’n cynnwys asbestos. Dyna lle mae pethau wedi newid mewn gwirionedd ers yr 1980au ac yn gynharach. Yr agwedd bryd hynny oedd y byddai’n iawn pe câi’r asbestos ei adael yn ei le. Yn gynyddol, mae'r dystiolaeth yn awgrymu nad yw hynny’n wir. Fel y gwyddom, caewyd Ysgol Uwchradd Cwmcarn yn sydyn ym mis Hydref pan ganfu gweithwyr fod yno 10 gwaith yn fwy o ffibrau na’r lefelau derbyniol yn yr aer. Er i’r Gweinidog fynnu bod awdurdodau lleol yn ei hysbysu ynglŷn â phob lefel asbestos mewn ysgolion, ceir

reluctance to make these reports and findings publicly available.

amharodrwydd o hyd i sicrhau bod yr adroddiadau a'r canfyddiadau hyn ar gael yn gyhoeddus.

I want to stress the fact that asbestos, undisturbed and managed correctly, should not present a health risk, although there are issues with regard to the extent to which it can be left undisturbed. The current regulations mean that councils have a duty to manage asbestos and should have duty holders in place who undertake asbestos surveys, keep an asbestos register and maintain a management plan that details the location and state of the substance in the school. This record has to be accessible to workmen carrying out repairs or maintenance in the school and these duty holders have an obligation to provide information and instruction to any employee who may come into contact with asbestos and explain how such exposure may occur. However, in many cases, this duty—like it or not—is not being honoured, and with all the other tasks that headteachers or school managers have to undertake, I think that, to a certain extent, you can understand that.

Hoffwn bwysleisio'r ffaith na ddylai asbestos beri risg i iechyd os caiff ei reoli'n gywir ac os na therfir arno, er y ceir cwestiynau o ran y graddau y gellir ei adael heb ei gyffwrdd. Mae'r rheoliadau presennol yn golygu bod gan gynghorau ddyletswydd i reoli asbestos ac y dylai fod ganddynt ddeiliaid dyletswydd sy'n cynnal arolygon asbestos, yn cadw cofrestr asbestos ac yn cynnal cynllun rheoli sy'n rhoi manylion lleoliad a chyflwr y sylwedd yn yr ysgol. Rhaid i'r cofnod hwn fod ar gael i weithwyr sy'n gwneud gwaith atgyweirio neu gynnal a chadw yn yr ysgol ac mae'r deiliaid dyletswydd o dan rwymedigaeth i ddarparu gwybodaeth a chyfarwyddyd i unrhyw weithiwr a all ddod i gysylltiad ag asbestos ac esbonio sut y gallai hynny ddigwydd. Fodd bynnag, mewn llawer o achosion, nid yw'r ddyletswydd hon—ni waeth beth a feddyliwn am hynny—yn cael ei hanrhydeddu. O ystyried yr holl dasgau eraill sydd gan benaethiaid neu reolwyr ysgolion i'w gwneud, credaf, i ryw raddau, y gallwch ddeall hynny.

I am pleased that, today, in his written statement, the Minister has acknowledged this problem. He states:

Rwyf yn falch bod y Gweinidog, heddiw, yn ei ddatganiad ysgrifenedig, wedi cydnabod y broblem hon. Mae'n dweud:

'As a consequence, and based upon, the responses received I do not feel sufficiently assured at this stage that local authorities are discharging their statutory duties to manage asbestos and have sufficient plans in place.'

'O ganlyniad, ac ar sail yr ymatebion a dderbyniwyd, nid wyf wedi fy sicrhau'n ddigonol ar hyn o bryd bod awdurdodau lleol yn cyflawni eu dyletswyddau statudol o ran rheoli asbestos nac yn sicrhau bod cynlluniau digonol yn eu lle.'

It is interesting to see that you share these concerns, which makes it even more of an imperative that we ensure that local authorities adhere to the specified guidelines, and that those failing to fulfil their statutory duties are exposed.

Mae'n ddiddorol gweld eich bod yn rhannu'r pryderon hyn, sy'n golygu ei bod hyd yn oed yn bwysicach inni sicrhau bod awdurdodau lleol yn cadw at y canllawiau penodedig, a bod y rhai nad ydynt yn cyflawni eu dyletswyddau statudol yn cael eu henwi.

The UK Department for Education recently published updated guidance on asbestos management for schools in England. However, it is unclear whether such guidelines will be introduced or implemented in Wales, although I appreciate today's statement and would hope that the Minister

Yn ddiweddar, cyhoeddodd Adran Addysg y DU ganllawiau wedi'u diweddaru i ysgolion yn Lloegr ar reoli asbestos. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'n glir a gaiff canllawiau o'r fath eu cyflwyno neu eu gweithredu yng Nghymru, er fy mod yn gwerthfawrogi datganiad heddiw ac yn gobeithio y bydd y Gweinidog

will give us an indication as to whether he intends to issue similar guidance to that published in England.

yn rhoi syniad i ni a yw’n bwriadu cyhoeddi canllawiau tebyg i’r rhai a gyhoeddwyd yn Lloegr.

Despite all this, it strikes me that current legislation sets out a certain level of protection for school employees. Is there a good reason why parents and pupils should not have the same right to information on asbestos in our schools? After all, we live in the age of freedom of information. The right to know campaign is calling for just this. It is backed by a number of cancer charities, such as Tenovus, trade unions, NewLaw Solicitors in Cardiff and a number of us here in the Chamber. An online petition has been launched and my local authority in Monmouthshire became the first local authority to back the campaign by committing to release its data on asbestos to the general public. I am sure that other councils throughout Wales will make a similar commitment over the coming months, as the campaign gathers impetus.

Er gwaethaf hyn oll, mae'n fy nharo bod y ddeddfwriaeth bresennol yn nodi lefel benodol o warchodaeth i weithwyr ysgol. A oes rheswm da pam na ddylai rhieni a disgyblion gael yr un hawl i wybodaeth am asbestos yn ein hysgolion? Wedi'r cyfan, rydym yn byw yn oes rhyddid gwybodaeth. Dyma’n union y mae’r ymgyrch hawl i wybod yn galw amdano. Caiff ei chefnogi gan nifer o elusennau canser, megis Tenovus, undebau llafur, Cyfreithwyr NewLaw yng Nghaerdydd a nifer ohonom yma yn y Siambr. Mae deiseb ar-lein wedi cael ei lansio a’m hawdurdod lleol i yn Sir Fynwy oedd yr awdurdod lleol cyntaf i gefnogi’r ymgyrch drwy ymrwymo i ryddhau eu data ar asbestos i’r cyhoedd yn gyffredinol. Rwyf yn siŵr y gwnaiff cynghorau eraill ledled Cymru ymrwymiad tebyg dros y misoedd nesaf, wrth i'r ymgyrch gryfhau.

As I said, in this age of freedom of information, which has made public bodies and Government much more accountable and transparent, it seems unacceptable that parents do not have access to information about schools that have asbestos present, the type of asbestos, its level, its danger and whether it is being managed responsibly. I call on the Minister and the Welsh Government to right this wrong. We are not scaremongering—we merely want accountability. We feel that parents and pupils should be fully aware of the risks that schools throughout Wales potentially pose to the very people they are entrusted to look after.

Fel y dywedais, yn yr oes hon o ryddid gwybodaeth, sydd wedi gwneud cyrff cyhoeddus a’r Llywodraeth yn llawer mwy atebol a thryloyw, mae'n ymddangos yn annerbyniol nad oes gwybodaeth ar gael i rieni am ysgolion lle ceir asbestos, y math o asbestos, ei lefel, ei berygl ac a yw’n cael ei reoli’n gyfrifol. Galwaf ar y Gweinidog a Llywodraeth Cymru i unioni’r cam hwn. Nid codi bwganod yr ydym—ond gofyn am atebolrwydd. Teimlwn y dylai rhieni a disgyblion fod yn llwyr ymwybodol o'r risgiau y gallai ysgolion ledled Cymru fod yn eu peri i’r union bobl y maent yno i ofalu amdanynt.

As I have previously said, in an ideal world I would want all asbestos removed, but I am realistic—I realise that the huge sum of money that would be required to extract asbestos is simply not there at the moment. I am pleased by the action that the Minister has already taken in respect of Cwmcarn High School, but it should not take events like this to bring the issue to public consciousness, and to drive this issue forward. The Minister, at very little cost, could ensure that parents are fully in possession of the facts

Fel y dywedais eisoes, mewn byd delfrydol byddwn o blaid cael gwared â’r holl asbestos, ond rwyf yn realistig—sylweddolaf nad yw’r swm enfawr o arian y byddai ei angen i dynnu’r asbestos ar gael ar hyn o bryd. Rwyf yn falch o’r camau y mae’r Gweinidog eisoes wedi’u cymryd yn Ysgol Uwchradd Cwmcarn, ond ni ddylai fod angen digwyddiadau fel hyn i dynnu sylw’r cyhoedd at y mater, ac i’w yrru yn ei flaen. Gallai’r Gweinidog, heb lawer o gost o gwbl, sicrhau bod gan rieni’r ffeithiau llawn am

surrounding asbestos, and, along with schools, educate children as to the dangers of exposure.

asbestos, ac, ynghyd ag ysgolion, addysgu plant am beryglon dod i gysylltiad ag ef.

Let us not waste this opportunity to give parents the right to know. I look forward to hearing the Minister's response as well as the comments of other Members who have asked to speak in this debate. I hope that, together, we can provide reassurance that we will give this issue the consideration that it deserves. Wales could lead the way in the UK and Europe on transparency on this issue, something that all of us in this Chamber would be very proud of.

Dewch inni beidio â gwastraffu'r cyfle hwn i roi'r hawl i wybod i rieni. Edrychaf ymlaen at glywed ymateb y Gweinidog yn ogystal â sylwadau Aelodau eraill sydd wedi gofyn am gael siarad yn y ddadl hon. Gobeithiaf y gallwn, gyda'n gilydd, ddarparu sicrwydd y rhoddwn sylw haeddiannol i'r mater hwn. Gallai Cymru arwain y ffordd yn y DU ac yn Ewrop o ran tryloywder ar y mater hwn, rhywbeth y byddai pob un ohonom yn y Siambr hon yn falch iawn ohono.

Aled Roberts: I thank Nick Ramsay for bringing this matter before the Assembly this afternoon, and not for the first time, as he said.

Aled Roberts: Diolch i Nick Ramsay am ddod â'r mater gerbron y Cynulliad brynhawn heddiw, ac nid am y tro cyntaf, fel y dywedodd.

This is an important issue, where a lack of transparency can lead to greater anxiety as far as the public is concerned, and I speak as a former councillor, as a current governor and as a parent. I share the Minister's lack of confidence as to whether the processes are currently properly put in place. There were discussions in my local authority regarding glazing dangers, but I do not recall a discussion regarding asbestos.

Mae hwn yn fater pwysig, lle y gall diffyg tryloywder arwain at fwy o bryder i'r cyhoedd, ac rwyf yn siarad fel cyn-gynghorydd, fel llywodraethwr presennol ac fel rhiant. Rwy'n rhannu diffyg hyder y Gweinidog y caiff y prosesau eu gweithredu'n briodol ar hyn o bryd. Cafwyd trafodaethau yn fy awdurdod lleol ynghylch peryglon gwydr, ond ni chofiaf drafodaeth ynghylch asbestos.

I would also ask the Minister to advise us as to whether he has any intention to update the regulations in Wales. The English regulations are much more detailed and require intrusive surveys rather than visual surveys, which I understand are still carried out by some local authorities. We recognise that there are costs involved in putting this issue right, but we need some transparency on the issue.

Byddwn hefyd yn gofyn i'r Gweinidog ddweud wrthym a oes ganddo unrhyw fwriad i ddiweddaru'r rheoliadau yng Nghymru. Mae'r rheoliadau yn Lloegr yn llawer mwy manwl ac yn gofyn am arolygon ymwthiol yn hytrach nag arolygon gweledol; deallaf fod rhai awdurdodau lleol yn dal i gynnal y rhai olaf hyn. Rydym yn cydnabod bod costau ynghlwm wrth unioni'r mater hwn, ond mae angen rhywfaint o dryloywder ar y mater.

I also refer the Minister to the Health and Safety Executive survey in 2010-11 on schools in England, Scotland and Wales, which made it clear that, despite requirements in the 2006 legislation, 31% of schools surveyed had no written plan in place.

Rwyf hefyd yn cyfeirio'r Gweinidog at arolwg yr Awdurdod Gweithredol Iechyd a Diogelwch yn 2010-11 ar ysgolion yng Nghymru, Lloegr a'r Alban. Roedd yn ei gwneud yn glir nad oedd gan 31% o'r ysgolion a arolygwyd gynllun ysgrifenedig ar waith, er gwaethaf gofynion yn neddfwriaeth 2006.

Kirsty Williams: I thank Nick Ramsay for his efforts in this particular area. The need for

Kirsty Williams: Diolchaf i Nick Ramsay am ei ymdrechion yn y maes arbennig hwn.

a campaign and the need for change in this regard was brought home to me only last week, when I wrote to every local authority in Wales asking for details of asbestos levels in their schools, only for my own local authority to refuse to give me that information, saying that people would not understand it and that they might be frightened.

Tynnwyd fy sylw yr wythnos ddiwethaf at yr angen am ymgyrch a'r angen am newid yn hyn o beth, pan ysgrifennais at bob awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru i ofyn am fanylion lefelau asbestos yn eu hysgolion. Gwrthododd fy awdurdod lleol fy hun roi'r wybodaeth honno, gan ddweud na fyddai pobl yn ei deall, ac y gallent gael eu dychryn.

5.15 p.m.

As the Assembly Member for Brecon and Radnorshire and as a parent who has three children in a Powys school—including one child who is about to enter a high school that everyone agrees needs to be bulldozed and that is falling apart around people's ears—I believe that I have a right to know what is in that building, as do other parents in the area and the people who work there. The Minister needs to look carefully at whether councils can legitimately withhold this information from individuals. They have a right to know what they are dealing with so that they can act accordingly on the basis of that information. In the case of Powys, the authority is failing miserably.

Fel yr Aelod Cynulliad dros Frycheiniog a Sir Faesyfed ac fel rhiant sydd â thri o blant mewn ysgol ym Mhowys—gan gynnwys un plentyn sydd ar fin mynd i ysgol uwchradd y mae pawb yn cytuno bod angen ei dymchwel ac sy'n adfeilio o gwmpas pobl—credaf fod gennyf hawl i wybod beth sydd yn yr adeilad hwnnw, yn yr un modd â rhieni eraill yn yr ardal a'r bobl sy'n gweithio yno. Mae angen i'r Gweinidog ystyried yn ofalus a yw'n gyfreithlon i gynghorau gadw'r wybodaeth hon oddi wrth unigolion. Mae ganddynt hawl i wybod beth y maent yn ei wynebu er mwyn gallu gweithredu ar sail y wybodaeth honno. Yn achos Powys, mae'r awdurdod yn methu'n druenus.

Mick Antoniw: I thank Nick Ramsay for giving me the opportunity to speak in this debate. In response to Kirsty's comments, welcome to the world of the workplace, where, for decades, we have been battling to get the full free flow of this sort of information. Asbestos is a European and worldwide issue that relates to all public and private buildings that were built up until the 1980s, certainly in this country. So, it is an extensive issue that affects people across the board and it is important that we do not limit the debate. However, focusing particularly on the schools issue, I would like to draw the Minister's attention to something that I think is a very constructive contribution to the debate, and that is the recent publication of documentation by the NASUWT that sets out how to practically manage and monitor this. It identifies a number of core areas: proper assessment and planning; proper and competent monitoring; clear ownership and responsibility—factors that the Minister identified in his own statement; and access to and transparency of information, which are important. If I may make one final plug: to

Mick Antoniw: Diolch i Nick Ramsay am roi cyfle imi i siarad yn y ddadl hon. I ymateb i sylwadau Kirsty, croeso i fyd y gweithle, lle'r ydym wedi bod yn brwydro ers degawdau i gael y math hwn o wybodaeth i lifo'n rhydd. Mae asbestos yn fater Ewropeaidd a byd-eang sy'n ymwneud â'r holl adeiladau cyhoeddus a phreifat a adeiladwyd hyd at yr 1980au, yn sicr yn y wlad hon. Felly, mae'n fater eang sy'n effeithio ar bob math o bobl ac mae'n bwysig nad ydym yn cyfyngu ar y ddadl. Fodd bynnag, gan ganolbwyntio'n benodol ar ysgolion, hoffwn dynnu sylw'r Gweinidog at rywbeth sydd, yn fy marn i, yn gyfraniad adeiladol iawn at y ddadl, sef y dogfennau a gyhoeddwyd yn ddiweddar gan NASUWT sy'n nodi sut i reoli a monitro hyn mewn modd ymarferol. Mae'n nodi nifer o feysydd craidd: gwaith asesu a chynllunio priodol; monitro priodol a chymwys; perchnogaeth a chyfrifoldeb clir—ffactorau a nododd y Gweinidog yn ei ddatganiad ei hun; a mynediad at wybodaeth a thryloywder, sy'n bwysig. Os caf wneud un sylw terfynol: i'r rhai sy'n dibrisio iechyd a diogelwch, rhaid i

those who downgrade health and safety, we must recognise the importance of health and safety because that is what enables us and empowers us to deal with some of these important and hazardous issues.

ni gydnabod pwysigrwydd iechyd a diogelwch oherwydd mai dyna sy'n ein galluogi ac yn ein grymuso i ymdrin â rhai o'r materion pwysig a pheryglus hyn.

The Minister for Education and Skills (Leighton Andrews): I welcome the debate that the Member for Monmouth has initiated. I also thank him for the tone he adopted in taking this forward because it is important that we avoid alarmism and that we avoid any sense of making the situation more difficult for people who are trying to manage the system in their locality. As Members will be aware, I issued a written statement on this issue earlier today. I recognise the very serious nature of recent events, culminating in the closure of Cwmcarn High School as a consequence of the discovery of asbestos materials in the school and the action taken by Caerphilly County Borough Council in closing the school to ensure the safety of staff and pupils.

Y Gweinidog Addysg a Sgiliau (Leighton Andrews): Croesawaf y ddadl y mae’r Aelod dros Fynwy wedi’i chychwyn. Diolchaf iddo hefyd am y cywair a fabwysiadodd wrth fwrw ymlaen â hyn oherwydd ei bod yn bwysig inni osgoi codi bwganod ac osgoi unrhyw ymdeimlad o wneud y sefyllfa'n fwy anodd i bobl sy'n ceisio rheoli'r system yn eu hardal. Fel y bydd Aelodau'n gwybod, cyhoeddais ddatganiad ysgrifenedig ar y mater hwn yn gynharach heddiw. Rwyf yn cydnabod natur ddifrifol iawn y digwyddiadau diweddar, a arweiniodd at gau Ysgol Uwchradd Cwmcarn o ganlyniad i ddarganfod defnyddiau asbestos yn yr ysgol a'r camau a gymerwyd gan Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Caerffili i gau'r ysgol er mwyn sicrhau diogelwch staff a disgyblion.

As the Member for Monmouth said, asbestos is a naturally occurring fibrous mineral that has been used commercially for about 150 years. Its versatility meant that it was ideal to use as a fireproofing and insulation material. As a result, asbestos was used extensively as a building material in Great Britain from the 1950s through to the mid-1980s, as the Member said. Most Assembly Members probably attended schools where asbestos was present at times when far less was known about asbestos than is known now. Therefore, as I said, it is important not to be alarmist about this. Most of us will suffer no effects. We know that if the rules laid down by the health and safety executive are followed, asbestos can be safely managed.

Fel y dywedodd yr Aelod dros Fynwy, mae asbestos yn fwyn ffibrog sy'n bodoli’n naturiol ac sydd wedi cael ei ddefnyddio'n fasnachol ers tua 150 mlynedd. Roedd yn ddelfrydol i'w ddefnyddio fel deunydd atal tân ac inswleiddio oherwydd ei nodweddion amrywiol. O ganlyniad, defnyddiwyd asbestos yn helaeth fel defnydd adeiladu ym Mhrydain o’r 1950au hyd at ganol yr 1980au, fel y dywedodd yr Aelod. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn ôl pob tebyg wedi mynychu ysgolion lle’r oedd asbestos yn bresennol ar adegau pan oeddem yn gwybod llawer llai am asbestos nag a wyddom heddiw. Felly, fel y dywedais, mae'n bwysig peidio â chodi bwganod ynglŷn â hyn. Ni fydd y rhan fwyaf ohonom yn dioddef unrhyw effeithiau. Rydym yn gwybod y gellir rheoli asbestos yn ddiogel drwy ddilyn y rheolau a osodwyd gan yr Awdurdod Gweithredol Iechyd a Diogelwch.

Any building built before 2000—including houses, factories, offices, schools and hospitals—can contain asbestos. Most people are exposed to low amounts of asbestos present in the atmosphere with no ill effects. It is important to note that asbestos materials in good condition are safe as long as they are

Gallai unrhyw adeilad a godwyd cyn 2000—gan gynnwys tai, ffatrïoedd, swyddfeydd, ysgolion ac ysbytai—gynnwys asbestos. Mae’r rhan fwyaf o bobl yn dod i gysylltiad â symiau bach o asbestos sy'n bresennol yn yr atmosffer heb unrhyw effeithiau gwael. Mae'n bwysig nodi bod defnyddiau asbestos

undamaged. It is important to recognise that, because of the health risks, it is safer to leave undamaged asbestos in situ and subject to regular assessment than it is to create additional fibre or dust disturbance through its removal. Asbestos fibres and dust are potentially very dangerous if inhaled in higher concentrations over a period of time. Due to the serious and often fatal diseases that have already been referred to in this debate, such as mesothelioma, asbestosis, lung cancer and diffuse pleural thickening, which can be caused when asbestos fibres are released from material and become airborne and are inhaled, all asbestos use was prohibited in 1999. There are very stringent statutory controls over the use of or interference with asbestos or materials containing it. There is a whole regime of legislation in place in relation to asbestos.

sydd mewn cyflwr da yn ddiogel ar yr amod na chânt eu difrodi. Mae'n bwysig cydnabod, oherwydd y peryglon iechyd, ei bod yn fwy diogel gadael yr asbestos fel y mae a'i asesu'n rheolaidd na chreu mwy o ffibrau neu lwch drwy gael gwared ag ef. Gall ffibrau a llwch asbestos fod yn beryglus iawn os cânt eu hanadlu mewn crynodiadau uchel dros gyfnod. Oherwydd y clefydau difrifol sy'n aml yn angheuol y cyfeiriwyd atynt eisoes yn y ddadl hon, megis mesothelioma, asbestosis, canser yr ysgyfaint a thewychu pliwraidd gwasgaredig, a all gael eu hachosi pan gaiff ffibrau asbestos eu rhyddhau o ddefnydd i'r aer a'u hanadlu, gwaharddwyd defnyddio asbestos yn gyfan gwbl ym 1999. Ceir mesurau statudol llym iawn i roi'r modd y defnyddir neu yr ymyrrir ag asbestos neu ddefnyddiau sy'n ei gynnwys. Ceir cyfundrefn gyfan o ddeddfwriaeth mewn perthynas ag asbestos.

In briefing my department, the Health and Safety Executive stated that there is no evidence to show that rates of asbestos-related cancer among teachers are significantly greater than in the Great Britain population as a whole. A research study commissioned jointly by Cancer Research UK and the HSE, and led by an independent leading academic, looked at a range of jobs that individuals did during their working lives, rather than just the last job. This study reinforced the view that teachers do not stand out as a high-risk group. The HSE has been undertaking inspections of local authorities in relation to their duty to manage asbestos in all their premises, including schools and housing stock, and, where appropriate, the HSE has taken enforcement action against them in relation to their duty to manage. The HSE has issued guidance relating to the management of asbestos with the intention of assisting duty holders in pursuance of the statutory duties, for example 'Managing Asbestos in Buildings' in 2012, aimed at those with the duty to manage.

Wrth friffio fy adran, dywedodd yr Awdurdod Gweithredol Iechyd a Diogelwch nad oes dim tystiolaeth i ddangos bod cyfraddau canser sy'n gysylltiedig ag asbestos ymysg athrawon yn sylweddol uwch nag ym mhoblogaeth Prydain yn ei chyfanrwydd. Mae astudiaeth ymchwil a gomisiynwyd ar y cyd gan Cancer Research UK a'r Awdurdod Gweithredol Iechyd a Diogelwch, ac a arweiniwyd gan academydd annibynnol blaenllaw, wedi edrych ar ystod o swyddi y mae unigolion wedi'u gwneud yn ystod eu bywydau gwaith, yn hytrach na dim ond y swydd ddiwethaf. Mae'r astudiaeth hon yn atgyfnerthu'r farn nad yw athrawon yn amlwg yn grŵp risg uchel. Mae'r Awdurdod Gweithredol Iechyd a Diogelwch wedi cynnal arolygiadau o awdurdodau lleol gan edrych yn benodol ar eu dyletswydd i reoli asbestos ym mhob un o'u safleoedd, gan gynnwys ysgolion a'r stoc tai. Lle bo'n briodol, mae'r Awdurdod Gweithredol Iechyd a Diogelwch wedi cymryd camau gorfodi yn eu herbyn mewn cysylltiad â'u dyletswydd i reoli. Mae'r Awdurdod Gweithredol Iechyd a Diogelwch wedi cyhoeddi canllawiau ar reoli asbestos gyda'r bwriad o gynorthwyo deiliaid dyletswydd i gyflawni'r dyletswyddau statudol, er enghraifft 'Managing Asbestos in Buildings' yn 2012, sydd wedi'i anelu at y rhai sydd â dyletswydd i'w reoli.

The Liberal Democrat Member for north

Siaradodd Aelod y Democratiaid

Wales, himself a former local government leader, spoke about the issues that are faced by local authorities. I understand that the Welsh Local Government Association, local authorities and the HSE meet regularly and work collaboratively to ensure understanding of the legal requirements and implementation of a risk-based approach for the management of asbestos. Locating and dealing with asbestos in schools, including removal, if deemed appropriate, is a health and safety matter for local authorities and schools. All local authorities in Wales are recommended to have asbestos surveys undertaken on all premises, including schools, and to implement an asbestos management plan.

Rhyddfrydol ar gyfer Gogledd Cymru, sydd ei hun yn gyn-arweinydd llywodraeth leol, am y materion a wynebir gan awdurdodau lleol. Deallaf fod Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, awdurdodau lleol a'r Awdurdod Gweithredol Iechyd a Diogelwch yn cyfarfod yn rheolaidd ac yn cydweithio i sicrhau eu bod yn deall y gofynion cyfreithiol ac yn gweithredu dull seiliedig ar risg ar gyfer rheoli asbestos. Mater iechyd a diogelwch i awdurdodau lleol ac ysgolion yw nodi lleoliad asbestos ac ymdrin ag ef mewn ysgolion, gan gynnwys cael gwared ag ef, os ystyrir hynny'n briodol. Argymhellir bod pob awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru’n cael cynnal arolygon asbestos o bob adeilad, gan gynnwys ysgolion, ac yn gweithredu cynllun rheoli asbestos.

A number of Members spoke about the need for transparency. The leader of the Liberal Democrats and the Member for Pontypridd, as well as the Member for Monmouth, mentioned this. The Member for Pontypridd also referred to the guidance on practical management of asbestos produced by the NASUWT. In respect of transparency, I asked all local authorities to confirm that they were undertaking their statutory duties in accordance with the legislation and to supply copies of their asbestos management plans. Further to a review conducted by a Welsh Government health and safety consultant, responses were deemed varied. As a consequence, and based upon the responses received, I do not feel sufficiently assured at this stage that local authorities are discharging their statutory duties to manage asbestos or have sufficient plans in place. I intend to ask local authorities to ensure that headteachers and governing bodies know and understand their obligations and duties, including insurance responsibilities, in relation to the legal requirements, and that they are following guidance.

Siaradodd nifer o Aelodau am yr angen am dryloywder. Soniodd arweinydd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a'r Aelod dros Bontypridd, yn ogystal â'r Aelod dros Fynwy, am hyn. Cyfeiriodd yr Aelod dros Bontypridd hefyd at y canllawiau ar reoli asbestos yn ymarferol a gynhyrchwyd gan y NASUWT. O ran tryloywder, gofynnais i bob awdurdod lleol gadarnhau eu bod yn ymgymryd â'u dyletswyddau statudol yn unol â'r ddeddfwriaeth a darparu copïau o'u cynlluniau rheoli asbestos. Yn dilyn adolygiad a gynhaliwyd gan ymgynghorydd iechyd a diogelwch i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, ystyriwyd bod yr ymatebion yn amrywio. O ganlyniad, ac yn seiliedig ar yr ymatebion a gafwyd, nid wyf yn teimlo’n ddigon sicr ar hyn o bryd bod awdurdodau lleol yn cyflawni eu dyletswyddau statudol i reoli asbestos neu fod ganddynt gynlluniau digonol ar waith. Rwyf yn bwriadu gofyn i awdurdodau lleol sicrhau bod penaethiaid a chyrff llywodraethu’n gyfarwydd â’u rhwymedigaethau a’u dyletswyddau ac yn eu deall, gan gynnwys cyfrifoldebau yswiriant, mewn cysylltiad â'r gofynion cyfreithiol, a’u bod yn dilyn arweiniad.

Since the closure of Cwmcarn High School, there has, quite rightly, been debate around the issue of asbestos in schools in Wales and there have been a number of calls asking, for example, for the removal of asbestos from all schools in Wales. I fully understand the concerns that Assembly Members have and,

Ers cau Ysgol Uwchradd Cwmcarn, bu dadl, yn gwbl briodol, ynghylch asbestos mewn ysgolion yng Nghymru a chafwyd nifer o alwadau, er enghraifft, am gael gwared ar asbestos o bob ysgol yng Nghymru. Rwyf yn deall pryderon Aelodau’r Cynulliad ac, yn wir, y pryderon a godwyd gan rieni a'r rhai

indeed, those raised by parents and those working in our schools. It is important that teachers and governing bodies are aware of the location and condition of asbestos within their schools. However, it is not practicable to remove asbestos from every school in Wales on a blanket basis. As indicated, asbestos is safe if undisturbed and schools should work closely with their respective local authority to ensure that appropriate health and safety plans are in place for staff, pupils and visitors.

sy'n gweithio yn ein hysgolion. Mae'n bwysig bod athrawon a chyrff llywodraethu'n ymwybodol o leoliad a chyflwr asbestos yn eu hysgolion. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'n ymarferol cael gwared ar asbestos yn llwyr o bob ysgol yng Nghymru. Fel y nodwyd, mae asbestos yn ddiogel os na therfir arno a dylai ysgolion gydweithio'n agos â'u hawdurdod lleol i sicrhau bod cynlluniau iechyd a diogelwch priodol ar waith ar gyfer staff, disgyblion ac ymwelwyr.

The Welsh Government's twenty-first century schools capital programme will see significant capital investment in the schools infrastructure across Wales, with the first wave of investment targeting those schools in poorest condition and where there is surplus capacity in the system. This will take time. In the meantime, we need to ensure that rigorous management of asbestos is undertaken by local authorities. There is significant guidance and information available to local authorities and duty holders—which may include headteachers and school governing bodies—on discharging their legal obligations regarding asbestos management through the HSE website. However, the most important element of preventing any release of asbestos fibres is action taken at the schools.

Bydd rhaglen gyfalaf Llywodraeth Cymru ar gyfer ysgolion 21ain ganrif yn buddsoddi symiau cyfalaf sylweddol mewn seilwaith ysgolion ledled Cymru, gyda cham cyntaf y buddsoddiad yn targedu'r ysgolion hynny yn y cyflwr gwaethaf a lle ceir gallu dros ben yn y system. Bydd hyn yn cymryd amser. Yn y cyfamser, mae angen inni sicrhau bod awdurdodau lleol yn rheoli asbestos yn drwyadl. Mae llawer iawn o arweiniad a gwybodaeth ar gael i awdurdodau lleol a deiliaid dyletswydd—gall y rhain gynnwys penaethiaid a chyrff llywodraethu ysgolion—ar gyflawni eu hymrwymiadau cyfreithiol o ran rheoli asbestos drwy wefan yr Awdurdod Gweithredol Iechyd a Diogelwch. Fodd bynnag, yr elfen bwysicaf o ran atal unrhyw ffibrau asbestos rhag cael eu rhyddhau yw'r camau a gymerir yn yr ysgolion.

Even with the best asbestos management plans and qualified asbestos staff at local authorities, if the procedures at the school itself are not followed, problems can occur. Awareness of asbestos and its management is paramount. Training of all school staff and governing bodies is vital so that when, for example, works are carried out at schools, the right procedures are followed. It is therefore important that the duty holder or nominated person at the school is clearly identified, so that there is no doubt as to who has the responsibility at the school to ensure that legal requirements and guidance are followed. Clear lines of responsibility and duties need to be known at each and every level in the school system.

Hyd yn oed gyda'r cynlluniau gorau i reoli asbestos a staff asbestos cymwysedig mewn awdurdodau lleol, os nad yw'r gweithdrefnau yn yr ysgol ei hun yn cael eu dilyn, gall problemau godi. Mae ymwybyddiaeth o asbestos ac o'r dull o'i reoli yn hollbwysig. Mae'n hanfodol hyfforddi holl staff yr ysgol a chyrff llywodraethu er mwyn sicrhau, er enghraifft y caiff y gweithdrefnau cywir eu dilyn pan gaiff gwaith ei wneud mewn ysgolion. Felly, mae'n bwysig bod y deiliad dyletswydd neu'r unigolyn a enwebwyd yn yr ysgol yn cael ei enwi'n glir, fel nad oes unrhyw amheuaeth ynglŷn â phwy sy'n gyfrifol yn yr ysgol am sicrhau bod y gofynion cyfreithiol a'r canllawiau yn cael eu dilyn. Mae angen i linellau cyfrifoldeb a dyletswyddau clir fod yn hysbys ar bob un lefel yn y system ysgolion.

I have requested that my officials work with

Rwyf wedi gofyn i'm swyddogion

all those concerned in the management of our schools, from the WLGA, local authorities, the teachers' unions to teaching staff, to ensure that guidance and procedures in relation to asbestos are being rigorously followed to ensure that the staff and pupils in our schools are not exposed to harmful materials. Awareness of the legislation and guidance on asbestos needs to be raised, including asbestos management plans for each school building to be in place for use by the schools. I will give further consideration to guidance issued elsewhere and to the issues raised by the Member for Monmouth in his speech.

gydweithio â phawb sy'n ymwneud â rheoli ein hysgolion, o Gymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru i awdurdodau lleol, undebau'r athrawon a staff addysgu, i sicrhau bod canllawiau a gweithdrefnau sy'n ymwneud ag asbestos yn cael eu dilyn yn drwyadl er mwyn sicrhau nad yw staff a disgyblion ein hysgolion yn dod i gysylltiad â defnyddiau niweidiol. Mae angen codi ymwybyddiaeth o ddeddfwriaeth ac arweiniad ar asbestos, gan gynnwys yr angen i gynlluniau rheoli asbestos ar gyfer pob adeilad ysgol fod ar gael i'r ysgolion eu defnyddio. Rhoddaf ystyriaeth bellach i ganllawiau a gyhoeddwyd mewn mannau eraill ac i'r materion a godwyd gan yr Aelod dros Fynwy yn ei araith.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That brings today's proceedings to a close.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Daw hynny â thrafodion heddiw i ben.

Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.26 p.m.
The meeting ended at 5.26 p.m.

Aelodau a'u Pleidiau
Members and their Parties

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)
Antoniw, Mick (Llafur – Labour)
Asghar, Mohammad (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Burns, Angela (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)
Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)
Davies, Alun (Llafur – Labour)
Davies, Andrew R.T. (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Davies, Byron (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Davies, Keith (Llafur – Labour)
Davies, Paul (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Davies, Suzy (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Drakeford, Mark (Llafur – Labour)
Elis-Thomas, Yr Arglwydd/Lord (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Evans, Rebecca (Llafur – Labour)
Finch-Saunders, Janet (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
George, Russell (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Gething, Vaughan (Llafur – Labour)
Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)
Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)
Griffiths, Lesley (Llafur – Labour)
Gruffydd, Llyr Huws (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)
Hedges, Mike (Llafur – Labour)
Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
James, Julie (Llafur – Labour)
Jenkins, Bethan (Plaid Cymru Annibynnol – Independent Plaid Cymru)
Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)

Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)
Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)
Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)
Millar, Darren (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Morgan, Julie (Llafur – Labour)
Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)
Parrott, Eluned (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Powell, William (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Price, Gwyn R. (Llafur – Labour)
Ramsay, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Rathbone, Jenny (Llafur – Labour)
Rees, David (Llafur – Labour)
Roberts, Aled (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Sandbach, Antoinette (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)
Skates, Kenneth (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Thomas, Simon (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Watson, Joyce (Llafur – Labour)
Whittle, Lindsay (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)